Attachment Theory, Foster Parents and Diversity Tolerance

Michael Kenny1 & Dr Ted Fleming2

Keywords: Attachment Theory, Foster Parents, Diversity, Tolerance; Foster Care Association

Subjects: Social Sciences > Adult & Community Education

ID Code: 

Deposited By: Mr. Michael Kenny

Deposited On: 

Publisher: 

Refereed: Yes

Abstract

Informed Foster parents are well acquainted with attachment theory because of its relevance to attachment within the biological and foster family. Yet every foster parent has a childhood attachment history that influences their interpersonal relationships in adulthood. The primary concern of the foster parent and their supports is with the foster child. But as a result the foster parent may distract or block reflection on their own attachment history.

This presentation will focus on attachment theory and the adult, with particular reference to the foster parent. The presentation will firstly explore attributes of attachment theory relating to adulthood. The presentation will then explore how the interpretation of attachment in adulthood may influence tolerance of foster parents for diversity.

The presentation will draw on literature on attachment theory and its projection onto adulthood. The presentation will then drawn the experience of foster parents and their struggles in attachment building relationships with the significant others who exhibit diversity.

1 Michael Kenny is a foster parent in Trim, County Meath (Ireland) for approx 20 years. Margaret & Michael Kenny have also three biological children. The family spent time in development work in Africa in the 1980s/90s. Michael is a lecturer in the Department of Adult & Community Education at NUI, Maynooth and Margaret is active in Home and child care.

(See: http://adulteducation.nuim.ie/department_staff/MichaelKennyPersonalPage.shtml)

2 Dr Ted Fleming is a senior Lecturer in the Department of Adult & Community education at NUI, Maynooth. Dr Fleming has written on adulthood, early school leaving, children with emotional and behavioural difficulties, and attachment.

(See: http://adulteducation.nuim.ie/department_staff/TedFlemingPersonalPage.shtml)
Section 1: Introduction

This paper aims to address some aspects of the missing body of knowledge and illustrate how attachment theory is of profound and neglected importance for understanding how carers relate to fostered children. The paper was delivered to the International Foster Care Organisation (IFCO) International Conference titled: Linking Global Foster Care, University College Dublin, Dublin, 12th - 17th July, 2009.

Section 2: Attachment Theory

Introduction

This section outlines attachment theory as proposed by John Bowlby and suggest that that part of the missing dimension to its application is a critical investigation of the import of lived attachment experience for the foster parent/carer. It may be because this attachment application has a psychoanalytical dimension that it is relatively ignored. Bowlby offers a theory that attempts to integrate biology, a psychoanalytic analysis of early childhood experiences and some aspects of socio-cultural reproduction. This section outlines Bowlby's main ideas.

John Bowlby and Attachment Theory

John Bowlby's (1907-1991) work as a child psychiatrist with children from poor backgrounds convinced him that family life was important for their emotional development and that the separation of a young child from mother was detrimental to the child’s development (Bowlby, 1951). Bowlby (1944), in trying to understand a) the causes of delinquency, b) the nature of the child's ties to mother (1958), c) the meaning of separation anxiety (1960a) and d) the significance of grief and mourning for young children (1960b); outlined a theory in three volumes of Attachment & Loss (1969; 1973; 1980).

Bowlby saw social deprivation as detrimental to the child’s psychological development. This social concern runs through his work which found that; “… early separations are recognised as inherently dangerous for children …(but) his greatest influence is where

---

6 A term widely used in 1944.
we would wish it to be, on the social arrangements that are made for children...in hospitals, in nursery schools, in care and...at home”. (Gomez, 1997, p. 53)

Bowlby's attachment theory is based on a number of understandings. First, children in orphanages, who suffered from maternal deprivation, the absence of fathers and a family environment, were liable to negative cognitive and affective consequences. Second, in observing animal behaviour the developmental importance of 'imprinting' was established and this highlighted the importance of early contact between mother and infant in the animal world (Bowlby, 1969, pp. 184-190). The image of Konrad Lorenz (1952) being followed by a line of goslings who had 'imprinted' Lorenz as their surrogate parent comes to mind. These experiments show that early contact between mother and infant has important biological functions that contribute to the enhancement of psychological and social development. Both adults and children have inbuilt biological and evolutionary-based predispositions that contribute to the survival and development of the child (Bowlby, 1979, p. 37).

Attachment is an enduring tie with a person who provides security. Bowlby observed that the child's attachment figure provides a secure base from which the infant can safely explore his/her environment and to which they can return if he/she experiences or perceives danger. The comforting actions of the carer provide security for the infant and interactions involving play, baby talk, making close eye contact and the excitement of these engagements are the initial ventures of the child into the world (Bowlby, 1969, p. 304).

However, this emphasis on poor family relationships is easily and incorrectly interpreted in terms of parental blame, often in relation to the mother. Feminists object that Bowlby using biology to justify what is essentially a cultural product of our own 'patriarchal but father-absent' society (Holmes, 1993, p. 47). This division of labour fits modern society, leaving men free and women fettered. There is little doubt that Bowlby took a dim view of day-care and indeed of anything that kept a mother away from her infant. This lends fuel to the feminist critique. However, Bowlby was clear, even in early work that, “the role of a child's principal attachment-figure can be filled by others (other) than the natural mother” The view that only the natural mother could provide mothering he dismissed by saying, "no such views have been expressed by me” (1969, p. 303-304). Later research has concluded that it need not be the mother, it could be the father, who provides a secure bases for the child. If blame for the insecurity of the child is placed on the mother, this allows society to abdicate its responsibility for its role in shaping the child and also allows fathers to be absent.

Secure and Insecure Attachments

Children introject their experience of being cared for and as a result have a model of themselves as valued, have a greater sense of 'felt security' and more optimistic views of

---

social relationships. Such children are securely attached (Bowlby, 1969, p. 339\textsuperscript{17}). The secure child is happy to explore his/her environment whether or not the carer is present. This security is a result of the carer being sensitive and responsive to the needs of the child for security and sensitive/responsive to the child’s signals. Insecure attachments have been categorised as avoidant, anxious and disorganised. These attachments are defensive strategies that are the child’s attempt to maintain contact with inconsistent or rejecting carers. See also Ainsworth, et al. 1978\textsuperscript{18} for detailed exploration of the strange Situation

**Internal Working Models**

Attachment operates by each child developing an internal representation of their experience of relationships and social relating, like an architect’s model representing the individual’s perception of the world of relationships and social interactions (Bowlby, 1969, p. 80; 1973, p. 237\textsuperscript{19}). A securely attached child will have internal working models that see the world as a safe place and themselves as responsive, caring and reliable. An insecurely attached child is more likely to be cautious towards others and see themselves as less worthy of attention and love (Holmes, 1993, p. 79\textsuperscript{20}).

Although internal working models can be revised in the light of experience, they are not always or easily, accessible to conscious examination and change because they are laid down unconsciously in early life (Bowlby, 1973, p. 367\textsuperscript{21}).

Importantly for the purposes of this paper parents’ relationships with their children are influenced by their own internal working models and, in this way, working models are transmitted across generations (Bowlby, 1969, p. 348\textsuperscript{22}).

**Mind-mindedness**

Recent research has developed the important concept of ‘mind-mindedness’ to describe the ability of a parent to understand and respond not only to the infant’s feelings but also to their thinking (Meins et al., 2002\textsuperscript{23}). Mind-mindedness is an indicator of a relationship that is more likely to produce secure attachments. Mind-mindedness reframes Bowlby’s concept of maternal sensitivity and involves the carer being “willing to change her focus of attention in response to cues from the infant” (Meins et al., 2001, p. 638\textsuperscript{24}).

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{17}Bowlby, J. (1969).ibid
\bibitem{19}Bowlby, J. (1969 &1973) ibid
\bibitem{20}Holmes, J. (1993) ibid
\bibitem{21}Bowlby, J. (1973) ibid
\bibitem{22}Bowlby, J. (1969) ibid
\end{thebibliography}
Through this paper I suggest that mind-mindedness may be important in enabling foster parents to be tolerant to the diversity of the range of children entering their care. I suggest that it is the case that the internal resources that carers bring to foster parenting can compromise the attachments they would like to forge with foster children.

**Attachment Styles and Engagement**

One’s attachment style plays an important role in how one reacts to the interpersonal engagements that are involved in human encounters. Engaging with foster children, adapting to their previous experiences (in or out of care) and tolerating the diversity of their behavioural and attitudinal responses is a great challenge for all foster carers. But the foster parent’s or attachment style will strongly influence how each responds to this challenge. Securely attached foster parents are more likely to accept, engage with, and indeed welcome what the fostered child brings to the carer’s family. But foster parents with insecure attachment styles may have increased levels of anxiety to such an extent that they may struggle to overcome that anxiety or opt out as a strategy for avoiding the challenges of such situations. See figure 1: Adult Attachment Format (Shaver, & Fraley, 2004) for a tight dramatic representation of the challenges to the foster errant with their attachment insecurity. Low avoidance and low anxiety indicate a secure attachment and the other three possibilities are dismissing avoidant, fearful avoidant and preoccupied anxious attachments.

A note of caution is appropriate here. The claim is not being made that these extrapolations from attachment theory explain all challenges in foster parenting. Other emotional, cognitive and social issues may also contribute such as one’s education (especially schooling), ones experience, social class, gender and other factors also contribute. This is an area crying out for research.

---

Goleman’s popular work on Social Intelligence acknowledges the importance of a secure base for human relationships and devotes a chapter to attachment theory (2006, pp. 162-172\(^{26}\)). In researching the connection between attachment and adult relationships Goleman (2006, p. 194\(^{27}\)) found that the secure adult is confident of a partner’s love and regularly turns to the partner for support, especially when upset. Secure adults have internalised ‘rules’ and strategies that allow them to be aware of when they are distressed and when to actively seek comfort from others. They are also able to engage with emotions, neither fearing them nor avoiding them. Moreover, they are not preoccupied with them (Goleman, 2006, p. 194\(^{28}\)).

This paper suggests that foster parents with secure attachments will be better able to cope with and embrace new experiences, new ideas and even the learning supports offered. Insecure foster parents who are anxious tend to be preoccupied with the anxiety brought on by new experiences. For the foster parent these experiences include new foster child placements, disruptive behaviour, disclosures, different lived experiences, which come on top of the challenging experiences of any personal and family life. They are more likely to be overwhelmed with feelings, they are more likely to be disoriented and unable to avail of support from colleagues or support workers. Anxious attached foster parents are likely to worry and tend to be unable to turn off the worry.

In the foster parenting/caring setting it is reasonable to extrapolate from these findings that secure individuals are optimistic about coping with stress, likely to relate better to others, have greater capacity for concentration and cooperation and are more confident and resilient. They can express emotions openly and appropriately, acknowledge and control the physiological signs of anger (Belsky, 2002\(^{29}\)). Secure individuals appraise stressful situations as less threatening than do those who are less secure (Belsky, 2002, p. 167\(^{30}\)). They are optimistic about their ability to cope and are more likely to seek support as a strategy for regulating their feelings. They are more open to compromise in resolving conflict and openly discuss problems. Secure adults integrate cognitive and emotional responses and are not dominated by one or the other. They may be in fact the kind of foster parent that takes to foster caring relatively easily and grows/develops within this role. However, insecure attachment experience produce a defensive focus on avoiding negative outcomes.

In sum, research in this area by Eliot and Reis (2003\(^{31}\)) supports the general view that secure attachments in adulthood assist in achieving one’s goals and insecure attachments interfere with exploration and in achieving one’s goals by evoking avoidance or anxiety.

---

30 Belsky, J. (2002). ibid
Section 3 Transactional Analysis

"The unit of social intercourse is called a transaction. If two or more people encounter each other... sooner or later one of them will speak, or give some other indication of acknowledging the presence of the others. This is called transactional stimulus. Another person will then say or do something which is in some way related to the stimulus, and that is called the transactional response."

At its simplest level, Transactional Analysis is the method for studying interactions between individuals. Dr. Thomas Harris stated in I'm OK - You're OK that in Transactional Analysis, "we have found a new language of psychology." Berne ultimately defined the three ego states as: Parent, Adult, and Child. "It will be demonstrated that Parent, Adult, and Child are ... phenomenological realities."

Parent - The parent represents a massive collection of recordings in the brain of external events experienced or perceived in approx the first five years of life. As such the child has no way to filter the data. The events are recorded without question or analysis.

Child - The Child represents the recordings of internal the emotions or feelings that accompanied external events.

Adult - Berne describes the Adult as being "principally concerned with transforming stimuli into pieces of information, … processing … filing … on the basis of previous experience."

When two people communicate one person initiates the transaction with the transactional stimulus. The person at whom the stimulus is directed responds with the transactional response. Transactional Analysis involves identifying which state directed the stimulus and which state in the other person made the response.

In a complementary transaction, the response moves from the receiving state to the sending ego state at the same level and "communication will proceed as long as transactions are complementary." According to Berne, these transactions are healthy normal human interactions.

However, not all transactions are healthy. In an unhealthy or crossed transaction, sending state is changes from the phenomenological level that that received the stimuli. When analysing transactions, one must look at what is being said but also how the words are being delivered and the non-verbal signals accompanying the words because;

34 Berne, 1964, ibid.
35 Berne, 1964, ibid.
• Words are 7% of a transaction,
• The Way words are delivered (tone, accents on certain words, etc.) are 38%, and
• Facial expressions are 55%. (Source Mehrabian, A. 1972 \(^\text{36}\))

Eric Berne further defines the concept of stroke as the "fundamental unit of social action"\(^\text{37}\) when one person recognises another person either verbally or non verbally. Berne noted that infants deprived of strokes (such as cuddling, touching, and other appropriate handling) were more prone to emotional and physical difficulties.

Berne further developed theories about adult’s need for strokes. Berne postulated that while adults need physical contact just like infants, they have learned to substitute other types of recognition (such as smiles, a wink, a hand gesture, etc) as a stroke. Berne defined the term ‘recognition-hunger’ for the adult requirement for strokes.

For a youtube visual introduction to Transactional Analysis See http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7y4mBqG_iQ&videos=jVCER5tLI4Q&playnext_from=TL&playnext=1

For a really interesting review of games we play in our relationships see; http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BsPbFB8wVUc&feature=PlayList&p=A0CB83B506D088BF&index=7

Section 4: The Phenomenological Concept of Lifeworld

Edmund Husserl introduced the concept of the lifeworld in his Crisis of European Sciences (1936 \(^\text{38}\)). Influences on Husserl's formulation of the lifeworld include Wilhelm Dilthey's "life-nexus" (German: Lebenszusammenhang) and Martin Heidegger's Being-in-the-world (German: In-der-Welt-Sein). The concept was further developed by students of Husserl such as Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Jan Patočka, and Alfred Schütz. The lifeworld can be thought of as the horizon of all our experiences, in the sense that it is that background on which all things appear as themselves and meaningful. The lifeworld cannot, however, be understood in a purely static manner; it isn't an unchangeable background, but rather a dynamic horizon in which we live, and which "lives with us" in the sense that nothing can appear in our lifeworld except as lived.

Even if a person's historicity is intimately tied up with his lifeworld, and each person thus has a lifeworld, this doesn't necessarily mean that the lifeworld is a purely individual phenomenon. In keeping with the phenomenological notion of intersubjectivity, the lifeworld can be intersubjective even though each individual necessarily carries his own

---


\(^{37}\) Berne, 1964, ibid.

"personal" lifeworld ("homeworld"); meaning is intersubjectively accessible, and can be communicated (shared by one's "homecomrades"). However, a homeworld is also always limited by an alienworld. The internal "meanings" of this alienworld can be communicated, but can never be apprehended as alien; the alien can only be appropriated or assimilated into the lifeworld, and only understood on the background of the lifeworld.

Jürgen Habermas has further developed the concept of the lifeworld\(^{39}\) in his social theory. For Habermas, the lifeworld is more or less the "background" environment of competences, practices, and attitudes representable in terms of one's cognitive horizon.

Phenomenology is a philosophical method developed in the early years of the twentieth century by Edmund Husserl Munich in Germany. Subsequently, phenomenological themes were taken up by philosophers in France, the United States, and elsewhere, often in contexts far removed from Husserl's work.

"Phenomenology" comes from the Greek words phainómenon, meaning "that which appears", and lógos, meaning "study". In Husserl's conception, phenomenology is primarily concerned with making the structures of consciousness, and the phenomena which appear in acts of consciousness, objects of systematic reflection and analysis. Such reflection was to take place from a highly modified "first person" viewpoint, studying phenomena not as they appear to "my" consciousness, but to any consciousness whatsoever. Husserl believed that phenomenology could thus provide a firm basis for all human knowledge, including scientific knowledge, and could establish philosophy as a "rigorous science".

In its most basic form, phenomenology attempts to create conditions for the objective study of topics usually regarded as subjective: consciousness and the content of conscious experiences such as judgments, perceptions and emotions. Although phenomenology seeks to be scientific, it does not attempt to study consciousness from the perspective of clinical psychology or neurology. Instead, it seeks through systematic reflection to determine the essential properties and structures of consciousness and conscious experience.

Husserl derived many important concepts central to phenomenology from the works and lectures of his teachers, the philosophers and psychologists Franz Brentano and Carl Stumpf. An important element of phenomenology that Husserl borrowed from Brentano was intentionality (often described as "aboutness"), the notion that consciousness is always consciousness of something. The object of consciousness is called the intentionaial object, and this object is constituted for consciousness in many different ways, through for instance perception, memory, retention and protention, signification, etc. Throughout these different intentionalities, though they have different structures and different ways of being "about" the object, an object is still constituted as the same identical object; consciousness is directed at the same intentional object in direct perception as it is in the immediately following retention of this object and the eventual remembering of it.

\(^{39}\) "By the lifeworld Habermas means the shared common understandings, including values, that develop through face to face contacts over time in various social groups, from families to communities." See Notes on Habermas: Lifeworld and System, http://www.ucalgary.ca/~frank/habermas.html, retrieved on July 05, 2009.
Section 5: Mezirow’s Transformative Learning

Mezirow’s work alerts us to one of the most significant kinds of change that he describes as transformative. The theory of transformative learning states that the most significant adult learning involves becoming aware of the ways in which unquestioned assumptions, that act as taken-for-granted beliefs, constrain and distort the ways in which we make sense of the world. Frequently, these assumptions originate in childhood experiences. These unquestioned assumptions and frames of reference have two dimensions. One involves habits of expectation (meaning perspectives) that serve as filters or codes to shape, constrain or on occasion distort our meaning making. The other involves our points of view (meaning scheme) or individual beliefs, judgements, attitudes, etc (Mezirow, 2007, p. 1140). Attachment styles and internal working models are good examples of psychological filters or codes that continue to influence ways of feeling and acting in adulthood. These internal working models are an example of the frames of reference described by Mezirow (2007, p.11). A transformed frame of reference is “more inclusive, differentiating, more open to alternative perspectives and more integrative of experience” (Mezirow, 2007, p. 11).

Attachment styles and internal working models get transformed in transformative learning and the understanding of transformation theory can be expanded and enhanced in a number of ways. According to Mezirow, the process of transforming a frame of reference commences with a disorienting dilemma and concludes with a reintegration into community with a new set of assumptions. This is suggestive of a process of altering or transforming ones attachment style and internal working models. Mezirow’s disorienting dilemma is reminiscent of the strange situation (Ainsworth). They have in common an experience that what was taken for granted does not hold anymore.

By inference, we can further enhance our understanding of transformative learning by proposing that if one has transformed one’s frames of reference it is suggested that a better frame of reference, using Mezirow’s language, involves the move in one’s attachment style towards a style that is more secure or less anxious and less avoidant. This also gives a useful way of framing the by now familiar comment that involvement in adult education enhanced one’s self-confidence. It ought to also enhance one’s attachment style making one more secure to engage with new situations, new learnings and relationships.

One’s attachment style and more importantly one’s internal working models are, as previously suggested, psychological dimensions of meaning schemes. In transformation theory it is these meaning schemes or frames of reference that get transformed (Mezirow, 2007). The internal working models are exactly what Mezirow means by psychological filters or codes “that shape and delimit and often distort our experience” (Mezirow, 2007, p. 1141). It is implied in these explorations that we can associate the process of transformation with the development of new internal working models. It is also consistent with attachment theory to see the creation of perplexity as a prompt for transformative learning. In addition, we come to understand how a changed internal working model may be an improvement on a previous one. We know it is better if it meets Mezirow’s criteria that it be more inclusive, more discriminating and more open to future experiences.

change. This may also be a good set of criteria for judging a ‘better’ internal working model. It is at least a real possibility that development and growth are best supported by more secure attachment styles.

As one’s attachment style informs one’s way of relating to others it is suggested here that a significant kind of adult learning involves the developmental task of moving toward more secure attachments. Human development is being redefined here as the transformation of attachment styles and internal working models. Bowlby (1973, p. 368; 1988, p. 126) did envisage attachment as a lifelong learning project.

This The work of Daloz on mentoring is positive about the possibilities offered by mentoring and he is also aware that some may not be easily supported. For example, the aptly titled article ‘Gladys who refused to grow’ (Daloz, 1988) shows that every learner may not be in a position to avail of the mentor’s support. In any classroom of adults or in a mentoring situation it is useful to understand that one’s attachment style enhances or hinders, frees or constrains one to learn and engage with the opportunities provided.

Our ability to ‘go it alone’ or be a self-directed learner may also be influenced by our attachment style as a preference for a particular way of learning is likely to be consistent with one’s attachment style.

Mind-mindedness for adults too is what is being proposed.

42 ibid
Exercise

The Process of Transition

Can I cope?  What impact will this have?  How will it affect me?

At last something’s going to change!

This is bigger than I thought!

Denial

Change? What Change?

I can see myself in the future

Moving Forward

Gradual Acceptance

Who am I?

Did I really do that?

Gradual Acceptance

Depression

Guilt

Threat

Fear

Happiness

Anxiety

I’ll make this work if it kills me!!

© J M Friber 2000

(Source http://humanourb.tripod.com/sitebuildercontent/sitebuilderpictures/transition.jpg)

How can you relate this to:

Foster Parents and Diversity Tolerance