

# **La Villa de las Tres Cuturas: A Study of a New Tourist Festival in Frigiliana, al-Ándalus**

Robert Power

PhD

**National University of Ireland, Maynooth**

Faculty of Social Sciences: Department of Anthropology  
Faculty of Arts, Celtic Studies & Philosophy: Department of Spanish

**October 2013**

Head of Department of Anthropology: Dr Mark Maguire

Head of Department of Spanish: Dr Catherine Leen

## **Supervisors**

Dr. Chandana Mathur

Dr Catherine O'Leary

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgement .....	i
Abstract .....	ii
Introduction .....	1
0.1 The Recuperation of Historical Memory .....	8
0.2 The “Idea” of Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas.....	14
0.3 The Origins of Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas .....	16
0.4 Subverting the Dominant Narrative during <i>Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas</i> .....	19
0.5 Commercial Tourism and Ethnicity.....	21
0.6 Thesis Questions .....	23
0.7 Chapter Outline.....	24
0.8 Questions of Spanishness.....	30
Chapter One: The Marks of Local History on a Village.....	34
1.1 The “Local” Population .....	36
1.2 Main Economic Activity.....	39
1.3 Politics in the Village.....	44
1.4 Tourism in Frigiliana .....	46
1.5 Plan of the Village .....	49
1.6 Local Monuments: Sites of Memory .....	50
1.7 Twelve Ceramic Panels.....	56
1.8 Naming and Renaming the Village.....	60
Chapter Two: Peace and Conflict in the Axarquía and Frigiliana .....	70
2.1 Frigiliana: Cambios y Permanencias .....	72
2.2 Visigoth Spain (409-711).....	73
2.3 Muslim Spain 711-1492.....	74
2.4 Christian Reconquista (722-1492) .....	76
2.5 The End of Islamic Rule, 1492 .....	78
2.6 Nineteenth and Early Twentieth-Century Frigiliana.....	79
2.7 The Second Republic .....	83
2.8 The Spanish Civil War (1936-1939 .....	89
2.9 Frigiliana after the Civil War.....	91
2.10 Remembering to Forget and Forgetting to Remember .....	94
Chapter Three: The Politics of Festivals. Social Containment and Social Change .....	97
3.1 Festivals in Spain .....	105
3.2 Interpretations of Festivals.....	109
3.3 The “Social Cohesion” Approach: A Break from Superego .....	111
3.4The “Social Protest” Approach.....	115
3.5 Festivals outside Everyday Time? Liminal to Liminoid.....	119
3.6 Other Festivals in Frigiliana.....	128
3.6.1 Festival Danza Oriental .....	128
3.6.2 Carnaval .....	129

3.6.3 El Día de las Cruces de Mayo .....	130
3.6.4 El Día de San Sebastián .....	132
3.6.5 Semana Santa .....	133
3.6.6 Feria de San Antonio de Padua .....	134
3.6.7 Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas .....	137
Chapter Four: Tarrying with the Positive “Other” .....	140
4.1 Ruta de la Tapa .....	145
4.2 Mojitos: The Medieval Drink?.....	148
4.3 Food and Festival.....	151
4.4 “We are all al-Ándalus”: The Overt Transcript of the Festival .....	154
4.5 The Music of the Festival .....	162
4.6 The End of the First Day.....	166
4.7 Opposing Spanishness.....	169
Chapter Five: <i>Al-Ándalus</i> Ethnicity? A Historical Term <i>par Excellence</i> .....	175
5.2 The Body as the Foundation of <i>al-Ándalus</i> ?.....	181
5.3 The Things Colours Do.....	187
5.4 Sounds of the Street .....	190
5.5 Un Beso, un Abrazo: Touch.....	194
5.6 Sensing Something New: Common Sense to Good Sense .....	197
Chapter Six: The Unquestioning Tourist is <i>the</i> Agent of Social Change .....	203
6.1 Tourism in Spain.....	212
6.2 Inequality and the Price of Tourism.....	217
6.3 It’s Just a Commercial Event .....	222
6.4 <i>Al-Ándalus, Inc.</i> .....	225
6.5 The Role of the Witness.....	233
Chapter Seven: The Hidden Transcript of <i>Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas</i> .....	235
7.1 Contemporary Muslims in Frigiliana.....	237
7.2 The Contemporary Hidden Transcript.....	242
7.3 “Photos of Family and Friends”.....	246
7.4 The Spanish Civil War and the Franco Regime.....	249
7.5 Francoist Control of Culture .....	250
7.6 Historical Memory “¡Presente!” .....	255
7.7 The Festival as Cultural Activism.....	266
Conclusion .....	269
Bibliography.....	283
Appendix A: Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas Mission Statement .....	a
Appendix B: Rules of the Festival.....	2

## **Acknowledgement**

I wish to acknowledge the support of my wife, Marion, and children, Ross and Hayley, without whom this project would not have been completed. During my eighteen months of fieldwork in Frigiliana, I missed many birthdays, anniversaries and family events. I thank them for their support and understanding. I wish to thank the villagers in Frigiliana for their constant help. They welcomed me into their lives, and I was never refused access to people or information. They taught me about their village and are responsible for the content of this thesis, but I am responsible for any errors within my interpretation of Frigiliana. I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Chandana Mathur and Dr Catherine O’Leary, for their patience and constant support. I would also like to thank Dr A. Jaime Saris for always making the time to discuss my research and progress. The research was funded by a John and Pat Hume Scholarship (2009-2011), and an Irish Research Council post-graduate scholarship (2011-2013).

## Abstract

*This study focuses on a new tourist festival in the southern Andalusian village of Frigiliana. The festival began in 2006 and celebrates the village's plural Jewish, Christian and Muslim past. The thesis argues that a recent tourist invention has moved beyond the confines of a four-day commercial event and into the everyday lives of the population. It argues that through the sustained management of culture, the organisers of the festival have consciously defined and configured an emergent local ethnicity. Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas is a considered political move framed within national discourse relating to the recuperation of lost historical memories. The festival was created within this discursive field, but it is more than a symbolic gesture. It is a form of cultural activism that counters a dominant monocultural narrative in a somatic manner. Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas playfully conjures up the past during a tourist event. Yet in doing so, it is playing with new myths and legends in the present. Within a festival atmosphere, locals claim ownership of their public space in order to express their myths and legends. The festival constructs a medieval sensorium through which the body encounters lost histories. Thus, the festival moves beyond symbolic constructions and creates a space where the internal organs of the body validate a recent notion of local identity, tradition and culture. The thesis argues that the internal organs of the body work in communion with reconfigured symbols. It argues that the inner body actively engages with the festival and attains the level of discourse required to transform "pure" blood into "plural" blood. It contends that the kitsch plastic realm of proletarian tourism realises the potential for social change. During this commercial process, Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas creates a new ethnicity called al-Ándalus and it is the commercial component within the event that allows locals to claim ownership of their public space.*

# Introduction

Javier looked up at the concert stage in the Plaza de las tres culturas, Frigiliana. The Québécois folk group, Les Tireux d'Roques, launched into an instrumental solo and their accordionist whipped the audience into a festival frenzy. Javier's eyes welled up with tears as he looked back over the dancing, laughing and smiling throng. "You know the history of this place?" he said. It was a rhetorical question and a familiar form of ambiguous references to the past that I had become accustomed to during the previous 18 months. I nodded in the affirmative aware that no other response would suffice. "That instrument," he said, "the accordion," as he glanced up at the stage, "reminds me of my youth here. It was one of the only instruments that I ever heard," he said. "Look over there," pointing to a group of people hugging each other and dancing in a circle. "It's fun music," I said. "It's fun," he said emphatically. "There is a guy at the back who came from Canada and an American up there who came here just for the festival." In a more affirmative tone and this time as a statement of fact, he looked at me and again said, "You know the history of this place." Following a short pause he turned back towards the crowd. "Look at them," he said, with his voice now full of joy and emotion. "They are all smiling, all dancing and all having fun. They have all come here to enjoy our village. Look at what we have done."

What they have done is create a playful new tourist festival, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, that celebrates medieval tolerance and harmony and is enjoyed by locals and up to 30,000 visitors each August since 2006. The streets surrounding the Plaza de las tres culturas are full of colourful festival events. As tourists survey the many artisan goods on sale, street performers encourage the

crowds to join in. Singing troubadours, belly dancers, face-painters and a diverse mix of tourists happily participate in *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Approximately 100 locals are seated in front of the stage in Plaza de las tres culturas, but their privileged position is under threat from the encroaching dancing horde. As rows of chairs are being hurriedly pulled out of the way, the once comfortably seated locals stand up and begin to join in with the dance. Make shift cafés and bars, lit by low light and stylised as medieval, surround the stage and the Plaza. In and amongst hotdog stalls, mojito stands and a *halal* kebab stall, vendors dressed in turbans, skull caps and kaftans quench the thirst and appetite of the festival audience. “Medieval” costumes come in many forms, are not prescribed and may simply mean tying a not in a t-shirt in order to expose one’s midriff. In the surrounding makeshift artisan market place, full legs of pork and full sides of beef roast over open fires, and the pungent aroma of herbs, spices and handmade soaps waft in and out of the Plaza. Thus, in an idiosyncratic and individualist manner, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* fashions the village and the audience as “medieval.”

What they have done is construct a space for families to enjoy Frigiliana. As the Québécois folk group pound out “ethnic” music, the crowd dance in unison. Groups of local youths dressed in homemade medieval “styled” clothing link arms with tourists dressed in faux belly dancing costumes. Some of the tourists have brought their own costumes to Frigiliana for this festival. Dressed in what appears to be a traditional Chinese/Han black silk costume topped off with a “dunces” hat, Juanito pulls a group of tourists into the wonderful chaos that is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. For the locals, the festival is for “everyone” and a space for family fun.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> “*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is for everyone” was repeated to me many times. With respect to other festivals in the village, I was often told that they were “not for everyone.”

For the tourists, it may be just another event within their annual holiday to Spain, it may be a traditional Spanish festival or they may have come to Frigiliana specifically for the festival. Regardless of why, or how, the tourists came to the village, they become part of the event as the lines between local and visitor, guest or host, blur into a collective experience of merriment.

The town hall in Frigiliana has created a very successful tourist event. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is the most successful tourist festival in the village. Part cultural festival and part food festival, attendance at this event significantly outnumbers “traditional” festivals in the village. Its closest rival in the village’s festival calendar, *Feria de San Antonio de Padua*, attracts 2,000 visitors. As the locals say, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* “is for everyone” and everyone appears to be enjoying this eclectic fun-filled event. “Everyone” appears to be playfully engaging with the theme of harmony and tolerance as tourists and locals put their own personal stamp on their interpretation of the past. Without question, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a tourist event infused with kitsch plastic interpretations of the past. Without question, it is a market driven event that must be commercially successful in order for it to be reproduced each year. Although it is a local invention, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is inextricably linked to, and dependent upon, international tourism. But how could a mere tourist event that was consciously constructed for the market move Javier to tears? Javier has been mayor of the village and leader of Partido Andalucista since 1995. What have hotdogs, belly dancing and tourists jumping up and down to Canadian folk music got to do with the history of a Spanish village?

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a fun event where everyone is playing with distinctive, eccentric and, for the most part, a peculiar touristic version of the past.

The commercial component of the festival creates a ludic space where participants can engage in voluntary and unscripted merriment. In short, the organisers, the musicians, the actors and the audience are “playing” during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, but there is a lot more than commercial concerns “at play” during this recently invented tourist event. “All play means something,” (Huizinga 1950:1), and there is something significant at play in Frigiliana.

When Javier said, “you know the history of this place,” he could have been referring to the death of 4,000 Muslim men, women and children who died at the Battle of the Rock of Frigiliana in 1569 (*La batalla del Peñón de Frigiliana*). After all, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a celebration of the village’s plural medieval heritage. But it is unlikely that the memory of this battle brought the mayor to tears, indeed the battle is never mentioned during this festival. The accordion player initiated Javier’s emotional response to the dancing crowd. While I was aware that a travelling accordion player used to come to the village during the 1960s, it is unlikely that Javier was referring to such an individual and personal memory. Besides, when he said, “look what we have done,” he was referring to something recent that had changed in the village. Javier was deftly skipping over the details but referring to the history of Frigiliana since 9 February 1937 when Nationalist forces entered *el pueblo*. He was referring to the violent and intolerant history of the village during the early years of the Franco dictatorship when the leaders of the democratically elected council “died as a result of gunfire.” He was referring to an almost indelible stain left on the history, tradition, heritage and culture of Frigiliana by a pervasive dictatorship that ended in 1975. He was referring to the public silence relating to memories that have endured beyond the regime. In the very space that

was dominated by a Nationalist narrative, Javier was brought to tears in 2012 because *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is rewriting the “culture” of the village.

Given that Frigiliana is but one small village in an Andalusia that has experienced similar histories, it would be reasonable to assume that other villages in the region celebrate their plural past or their Jewish/Muslim heritage. However, this is not the case. New *moros y cristianos* festivals, that reinforce Christian dominance, have been increasing steadily throughout the region. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a unique example of a culture-building program that is specific and peculiar to this village. The theme of this event radically reconfigures a local understanding of history and identity. Public conferences held during the festival overtly outline its political subversion of a monocultural Spain. Yet, this is a very recent event. It only began in 2006 and it is only beginning to impact upon a local sense of history and identity.

It is a bold claim to make that this festival is reconfiguring local identity, but later chapters will argue that, although this is a slow process, the festival has moved beyond a four-day performance and engendered change in the fabric of the village. Due principally to the festival’s commercial success and fundamentally due to the “playful” opportunities of commerce, 30,000 visitors endorse the theme of the event. Their unquestioning validation of the event ensures that it is reproduced each year. Moreover, the more commercially successful the event becomes the more playful and ludic it becomes. This playful ludic element is an essential component within a process that is transforming streets, places and people beyond the actual event. It is the ironic and ambiguous use of contemporary objects and history that permits the festival to strengthen its message relating to a reconfiguration of local identity. In short, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* has created a new myth, dressed up in touristic

terms, where cultural entrepreneurs are taking advantage of the festival's commercial success. This study argues that myth and legend, dressed up in touristic terms, are a more powerful force for cultural change than the truth or the facts of history. It argues that because of its inauthentic and commercial components *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is reconfiguring local ethnicity. It argues that this ludic, market-oriented venture has rapidly opened up a space for symbolic and political expression which exceeds its touristic utilitarian origins. Albeit unconsciously, they are using an imagined or real idea of medieval *convivencia* to suggest a *convivencia* of Right and Left in the present.

For all intents and purposes *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a superficial tourist event that has been consciously invented to attract revenue to the village. The town hall employs a festival management company to dress up the village as medieval and maintain the "three cultural theme" throughout the event. Yet, the festival claims to be enhancing the social and cultural development of the village (appendix B). It attempts to diffuse cultural differences that currently exist in the village and use them as a basis to develop tourism. And most importantly, the festival seeks to present Frigiliana as model for integration on and international stage thus "proving that local action can now achieve global recognition" (Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas 2006). This is a mere tourist event that has been cynically invented for the tourist market, yet it moved Javier to tears. This festival is really about building a new culture-building, emphasising local identity and reclaiming public spaces in order to articulate local accounts of recent history. Yet the recent history of the village is never mentioned. I suggest that this form of silence is a conscious attempt to disengage with the memory of dictatorship, and a conscious attempt to disenfranchise "Spanish2 cultural performances that continue to exist in

the village. While the consequences of this festival may be intended and unintended, market driven and tourist events, that might otherwise be dismissed as inauthentic, may be accomplishing significant processes of change in this rural Andalusian village.

This study examines the politics of history, memory and identity as they intersect on the streets of the Spanish village of Frigiliana, Andalusia. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* was created in 2006 to increase tourism in the village. It celebrates Frigiliana's medieval architecture and the village's shared Jewish, Christian and Muslim past. In the process, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* reifies a specific reading of Spanish history that articulates a new local culture. During the last weekend of August each year, the streets of the village are transformed into a medieval culture park full of a contemporary interpretation of Sephardic, Andalusí and Arabic "culture".<sup>2</sup> *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* rejoices in and enjoys Frigiliana's plural history and articulates the past as a near interfaith utopia, *convivencia*. Based around a central artisan market hub where modern commodities, such as iPad holders, hotdogs and mojitos are stylised and rebranded as medieval artisan goods, the streets of the village stage a four-day event full of themed food, dance, music, film, street theatre and festival merriment. Locals and visitors dress up in everyday medieval styled clothes, consume "three cultural" menus and celebrate their plural heritage. As locals greet each other with variations of the Arabic salutation, *as-salam alaykum* or *wa alaikum assalaam*, touch their foreheads and bow while stressing the "Allah" within the Spanish term for "I wish" or "hopefully,"

---

<sup>2</sup>Although *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is themed as a celebration of Jewish, Christian and Muslim people, there is no religious component within the festival.

*ojalá* (O-ha-lAAH), the theme of the event moves beyond its staged components and appears to blend seamlessly within *el pueblo*, the people and the village.<sup>3</sup>

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a tourist event that plays with the past and creates a public space for the expression of an ostensible medieval tolerance and harmony. Myth, history, fact and farce all combine during the festival to construct a totalising cultural theme park where locals embrace their plural heritage. As the village is transformed into a festival sphere, values extracted from an interpretation of the medieval past become contemporary values performed for an ever-increasing tourist audience.<sup>4</sup> Yet as superficial and commercially motivated as this performance of the past may appear to be, it plays with contested versions of history and with notions of Spanish identity. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* subverts a dominant reading of “pure” Spanish ethnicity and disrupts a pervasive monocultural interpretation of Spanish history.

### **The Recuperation of Historical Memory**

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* emerged within national discourse relating to the recuperation of Civil War (1936-1939) memories and social activist calls to compensate victims of the Franco regime (1939-1975). In 2006, “the Congress of Deputies endorsed a bill proclaiming the ‘Year of Historical Memory’” (Boyd 2008:144). Amid the unearthing of mass graves and calls for a legal framework to decriminalise victims of the regime, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* creates a cultural space that recuperates lost local medieval history.<sup>5</sup> Social activist demands for

---

<sup>3</sup> While *ojalá* can be translated as “I wish” or “hopefully,” it is derived from the Arabic phrase “*Insha’Allah*” meaning “god willing” or “with the help of god”.

<sup>4</sup> 25,000 to 30,000 visitors come to the festival each year.

<sup>5</sup> The *Asociación para la Recuperación de la Memoria Histórica* (Association for the Recuperation of Historical Memory) was founded in 2000 by Emilio Silva and Santiago Macias. As well as digging up mass graves and identifying victims of the regime, they collect oral and written testimonies about the oppression suffered by the population.

condemnation of the Francoist dictatorship and public recognition of its victims culminated in the passage of the Law of Historical Memory in 2007. Georgina Blakeley (2005:50) argues that the Law of Historical Memory (2007) is the beginning of Spain's transition to "real" democracy.<sup>6</sup> She argues that this discursive framework permits public articulations of conflict and consent, and argues that this is an essential ingredient within contemporary democracies. While acknowledging some of the positive benefits relating to the construction of a discursive field, Lorraine Ryan (2009:133) argues that the Law of Historical Memory has not gone far enough to reproach the contemporary remnants of the pro-Francoist state. Despite calls from the UN Human Rights Committee for Spain "to comply with their international obligations" (Amnesty International 2008), the 1977 Amnesty Law continues to prohibit criminal investigations into the actions of the regime.<sup>7</sup> Jean and John L. Comaroff (2012:137) note that the "return to memory" discourse in Spain is "held by social activists to be the *sine qua non* of 'real' democracy". They note that the "juridification of the past" through quasi-judicial investigations forms part of a global process that requires the legal validation of personal and collective traumatic memories. They argue that the legal and "forensic reproduction of the past" (ibid.) appears to underwrite personal memories and constructs a hierarchical framework through which "truth" and memories are being valued, authenticated and validated.

---

<sup>6</sup> 22296 LAW 52/2007, *La Ley por la que se reconocen y amplían derechos y se establecen medidas en favor de quienes padecieron persecución o violencia durante la Guerra Civil y la Dictadura* (Jefatura del Estado 2007). (22296 LAW 52/2007, of December 26th, to recognise and broaden rights and to establish measures in favour of those who suffered persecution or violence during the Civil War and the Dictatorship).

<sup>7</sup> The 1977 Amnesty Law was enacted two years after the dictator's death and shields any Franco era crime from being put under trial. In 2010, the 1977 Amnesty Law was used to remove Judge Baltasar Garzón Real from the bench for investigating Spanish Civil War crimes. The Amnesty Law is still in force and prohibits the investigation of human rights violations committed during the regime. In 2009, the UN Human Rights Committee informed Spain that it should repeal its Amnesty Law which contravenes international human rights law. In 2012, Spanish Judge Baltasar Garzón Real was disbarred by the Spanish Supreme Court for investigating Franco era crimes. Rupert Colville, spokesperson for the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, told a press conference in Geneva that, "Judges should not be subject to criminal prosecution for doing their job" (United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights 2012).

The development and emergence of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* must be contextualised within a national discursive field that has created a public space for expressing conflict and consent. Although locals deny any connection between the organisation of a festival and the introduction of the Law of Historical Memory, the timing of the festival corresponds closely with national debates relating to the recuperation of lost and hidden histories and events. However, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is more than a verbal event; it is a non-verbal process that reifies a local version of lost memories beyond this discursive field. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* moves beyond social activists' calls for the construction of a public discursive space. It moves beyond national frameworks that continue to be determined by the state. It appropriates the cultural space of the village in order to redefine local identity, heritage, history and culture. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* places the means of producing culture in the hands of the local population. In effect, the festival dispossesses the state and reclaims an ontological space that moves beyond symbolic discursive action. The festival creates a new way-of-being-in-the-world. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an ongoing event that realises distinct interpretations of history in the heart and the gut of the local population.

Distinct interpretations of Spain's medieval past are encapsulated in two oppositional Spanish terms, *convivencia* and *coexistencia*. Both of these terms may be translated as synonyms in English, but they index a different interpretation of Spanish history. *Convivencia* is a term coined by Spanish historian Américo Castro (1971:ix) based on the idea that no significant distinctions existed between the people inhabiting Spain before the thirteenth-century.<sup>8</sup> Castro's *convivencia* is awkwardly translated in the original text as "living-togetherness" (1971:ix). The

---

<sup>8</sup>Américo Castro Quesada (1885–1972) was a prominent cultural historian and the Spanish Republic's first ambassador to Germany in 1931.

term conjures up a past Castro describes as a “near interfaith utopia” (ibid.). Castro cites the court and *scriptora* of Alfonso X (1252-1284) as an example of the harmonious everyday interconnections between Jews, Christians and Muslims in medieval Spain. Importantly, Castro identifies shared economic activity as an index of a shared and tolerant cultural past. However, at the end of the thirteenth-century *convivencia* disintegrated and three religious groups emerged in opposition to each other. Where once favourable circumstances existed between these three religious communities, society descended into confrontation based upon religious affiliation and the politicisation of religion, “not on battlefields, but in silent anger and revenge” (ibid: ix). As a result of religious intolerance, three separate oppositional “castes” emerged. Before the thirteenth-century, “no name existed other than that of *cristianos* to designate that totality of peoples who began to be called *españoles*” (ibid.).

In contrast, Sánchez Albornoz (1975)<sup>9</sup> suggests an antagonistic *coexistencia* between medieval Jews, Christians and Muslims. *Coexistencia* suggests that “*españoles*” originated in Visigoth Spain (409-711).<sup>10</sup> For Sánchez-Albornoz, the fundamental elements of “Spanishness” preceded the arrival of the “Moors” in 711 and Spanish Christian culture regained its pre-eminence following the expulsion of Jews in 1492. The process concluded with the expulsion of *moriscos* in 1609.<sup>11</sup> In this narrative, twelve centuries of Jewish culture and eight centuries of Muslim rule were just an “anomalous hiccup” (Labayni 2010:11) because a latent Spanish

---

<sup>9</sup> Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz Menduïña (1893–1984) was a prominent medieval historian, Minister for Education during the Spanish Republic, Spanish ambassador to Portugal during the Spanish Civil War and Leader of the Republican Government in exile during the Franco Regime.

<sup>10</sup> The origin of the Visigoths is contested. Some accounts suggest that they were a compound of Scandinavian tribes while other accounts suggest they were Eastern European (Collins 2006). Either way, they were a compound of multiple ethnicities and probably the last remnants of the Roman Legions.

<sup>11</sup> *Moriscos* (little Muslims) is a pejorative term used to describe Muslims who were forced to convert to Christianity following 1492 (Harvey 1992).

Christian identity predated the arrival of Islam. *Coexistencia* suggests that economic activity is a separate sphere of society and is not an index of social tolerance. It suggests that medieval Spain was a hierarchical society dominated by Muslims who subordinated Jews and Christians. It was a society based on antagonistic *coexistencia* in the economic sphere and does not suggest social harmony.

From the perspective of *coexistencia*, uncontaminated Christians “led Spain through the centuries-long *Reconquista* towards the fulfillment of its manifest destiny of reunification” (Soifer 2009:20).<sup>12</sup> While Visigoth rule of the peninsula ended with a Muslim invasion in 711, Sánchez-Albornoz argues that the Visigoths created a new, uniquely Hispanic, civilisation which defines Spanish history and contemporary Spanishness.<sup>13</sup> His approach to history could be called perennial and primordial where although individual forms of administration may have come and gone, “the nation as a category and historical community was eternal” (Smith 2009:3). The Visigoth’s contribution to culture, legal institutions, the monarchy and the adoption of the Nicene Creed in 635 unified the peninsula for the first time in its history. 711 and 1492 recur within the contemporary Spanish collective memory and are continuously being defined and redefined as a mark of Spanishness

---

<sup>12</sup> *Reconquista* is a contested term in Spanish history. From the perspective of *coexistencia*, the *Reconquista* began in 722 when Visigoth noble Pelagius of Asturias defeated a Muslim army at the Battle of Covadonga. The medieval *Reconquista* ended in 1492 in Granada but Franco was apparently carrying on the work of the *Reconquista* by ridding Spain of its foreign ideologies. There is no evidence to suggest that the Battle of Covadonga was motivated by a desire to reclaim a Christian kingdom. Yet from the perspective of *coexistencia*, the battle of Covadonga in 722 is cited as evidence of a coordinated Spanish Christian campaign to rid Spain of Islam. From the perspective of *convivencia*, such a coordinated Spanish Christian group did not emerge until the end of the thirteenth century. Leonard Patrick Harvey (1992) notes how presenting Spanish history in terms of Christian versus Muslim Spain is very misleading. He notes numerous battles where Christians were fighting against Muslims, but he also notes numerous battles where Christians and Muslims fought side by side against Christians and against Muslims. Therefore, battles in medieval Spain were not always coordinated based on religious affiliation. Furthermore, Harvey (1992) notes that the religion of the population in different regions of medieval Spain was not always the same as the religion of their rulers.

<sup>13</sup> In 1967, General Francisco Franco, Spanish dictator from 1939-1975, praised the Visigoths for giving Spaniards their “national love of law and order” (Collins 2006:5).

“uncontaminated by the Islamic invasion and by centuries of interaction with the Jews” (Soifer 2009:20).<sup>14</sup> This turns history into a moral success story that extracts contemporary values from historical facts. History is therefore “converted into a tale about the furtherance of virtue, about how the virtuous win out over the bad guys” (Wolf 2010:5).

While Castro (1971) viewed 711 as momentous in the birth of Spain’s hybridity, “Sanchez-Albornoz saw the Moorish invasion as a national disaster and the principal cause of his homeland’s entrapment in despotism and economic backwardness” (Aidi 2006:70). The apparent distinctions between *convivencia* and *coexistencia* are contemporary distinctions. They dress up current identity discourse in historical terms. This thesis is not concerned with discovering the “truth” about memories or the mental state of the medieval population. It is concerned with discovering why current memory and identity discourse in Spain continues to draw upon these earlier as well as contemporary conceptions of history. *Convivencia* and *coexistencia* are divisive topics in discourse surrounding notions of identity, culture and history in Spain. The former suggests a plural heritage that evolved as a result of contact. The latter suggests the existence of a pure and primordial Spanish ethnicity that has avoided contact. By publicly celebrating *convivencia* during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, a new set of tolerant and harmonious virtues are being transmitted from the past, but they are the virtues of the “losers,” and the virtues of the “bad guys”. A monocultural image of contemporary Spanish identity is problematized in Frigiliana because the very notion of a primordial, perennial or

---

<sup>14</sup> Roger Collins (2006:2) notes that Visigoth kings were the first to create a monarchy that was purely Spanish in its geographical extent, “and which at least in theory controlled the whole land mass of the peninsula.”

ethnically pure Spain is contested during a tourist celebration of the “other” within the local population.

### **The “Idea” of Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas**

The village of Frigiliana is in pristine condition for the festival with freshly painted whitewashed houses intensified by blue undercoats glistening in the August heat. Colourful flowers adorn every nook and cranny throughout the narrow streets and alleyways. While the town hall pays for the staged medievalisation of the village, the background decoration is provided by the locals. In a turn of phrase that suggests that I am feeding my informants lines, Rafael notes in a true Durkheimian sense that the voluntary beautification of the village in preparation for the forthcoming festival is a public display of “our collective consciousness” (Interview 2010). Rafael goes on to explain why there is a festival here that celebrates a shared past, and why it might articulate the villagers’ “collective consciousness”:

In the end of the fifteenth-century, at the time of the discovery of America, there used to be, in these little corridors, these little narrow streets of the old part of this village, Christians, Muslims and Jews living in perfect harmony. After five centuries with so much so called civilisation, that we are supposed to have—they [Jews, Muslims and Christians] used to live in perfect harmony without any problems (interview with Rafael 2010).

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a recent invention, but one through which thousands of years of national history intersect with a tourist festival. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* suggests that Jews, Christians and Muslims used to “live-together” in Frigiliana in a state of *convivencia*. The festival suggests that the heterogeneous medieval community was not divided based upon religious affiliation, and the homogenous nature of contemporary society has distorted the realities of the past. This sense of harmony and plural heritage has moved beyond the confines of a four-day tourist event. The tagline *la villa de las tres culturas* was added to the

village's name in 2006, and a program to associate new buildings in the village with *convivencia* has been progressing steadily ever since. New streets and shopping areas are being inscribed with a variety of compound designs featuring the name “*tres culturas*,” *al-Ándalus* or symbols containing a Star of David, Christian Cross and Crescent Moon. This runs counter to calls to dismiss the term *convivencia* as an analytical tool because it “is not so often heard in the land” (Burns 2000:108) or because it “was an idealist construct that aspired to describe mental processes taking place in the collective consciousness of the three cultures” (Soifer 2009:20). Although discourse surrounding medieval memory in Frigiliana is the result of current interpretations of the past, it can be heard in the land. Indeed, it is being rewritten on the land as an idealist construct that describes mental processes taking place within contemporary collective consciousness. But, this recent festival has not emerged in an isolated political vacuum. It is firmly fixed within a decade of national calls for the recuperation of lost historical memories. Social activist led calls for acknowledging the atrocities of the Spanish Civil War and the Franco regime coincide with the creation of a tourist event in Frigiliana. However, the regime and the Civil War are being deftly sidestepped during the festival in favour of a utopian recreation of local tradition wrapped up in a tourist package. The commercial idea to highlight three cultures as a means to increase tourism came from David Riordan, an American living in the village, but he played no part in the political “idea” to create a festival.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> For Susanna Narotzky and Gavin Smith's informants (2002:202), there is a negative connotation associated with “having ideas” because it “means having a public political position, but it also means being on the left” thereby “being *politico*” and opposing Francoist nationalist-Catholic politics.

## The Origins of Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas

David Riordan was sitting outside a local bar in the central thoroughfare of the village watching the world go by when he noticed that tourists arriving on the bus appeared confused. “As a public service,” he says, David decided to offer walking tours of the village and as they became more popular, he decided to write a guidebook to accompany them. The final stop on his walking tour was in a small enclosed courtyard in the historic section of the village opposite the town hall. A large ceramic olive oil pot dating from the thirteenth-century stands in the corner of the courtyard, and it is now being used as a decorative flowerpot. A symbol containing the Star of David, Christian Cross and Crescent Moon is moulded into the corner of the olive oil pot, and this compound of the three Abrahamic religions was the inspiration for the subtitle of David’s 2004 guide book: *Frigiliana: the Village of Three Cultures*. He redesigned the symbol and copyrighted it.

David came up with the idea of privileging “three cultures” in order to generate a personal income. In this sense, David’s idea was strictly entrepreneurial. During the same period, the town hall held a number of meetings to discuss creating a new festival in the village to attract tourists. Initially, they thought about a food festival that celebrated the village’s local cuisine. Following a number of formal meetings, they decided to incorporate the theme of “three cultures” within a gastronomic event. Together with two locally based musicians, Javier Paxariño and his then spouse Maruchy Suárez, the *concejal de festejos* Domingo Guerrero began the process of combining a food festival with a medieval stylised version of a tourist

festival.<sup>16</sup> David had no official involvement in the festival and no involvement with the political “idea” to promote a tolerant reading of history, although his contribution was recognised during a ceremony at the unveiling of a new sculpture that was to become the new symbol of the village.

Those involved in the official organisation of the festival imply a slightly different set of motivations. As Maria José says:

There are two different themes in the festival. One is food; the other is a cultural theme, of course, because we have things from Moorish and things from Judaism. For example, we have Toledo, which is the city of three cultures, so it could be a good marketing theme. But, we needed something pretty special in Frigiliana. There was a couple living here for a year, Maruchy, and they were really friendly with Francisco, and had a drink together and talked about culture while she was organising different things around Spain. So, she said, ‘why don’t we try to do it here,’ taking the three cultures, the old quarter and the panels we have, ‘it could be easy. Why don’t we try it for a year?’

David says that he was involved in another festival in Velez de Benaudalla as an advisor for a BBC documentary (2005), yet the other festival is a “traditional” *moros y cristianos* event that recreates a medieval victory over the “Moors” and glorifies Spain’s Christian past. As such, the *moros y cristianos* festival is the polar opposite to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. David goes on to say that the town hall in Frigiliana approached him and asked if they could use *his* copyrighted symbol to promote a new festival in the village. David says he agreed to let them use it, but the town hall decided to commission a new sculpture to be used as the official symbol of the festival and the village. “Maybe they didn’t trust me,” he says laughing, and

---

<sup>16</sup> Maruchy Suárez is the director of Mirmidón Producciones responsible for the stylisation of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. ‘Mirmidón es una empresa...dedicada a la producción de ideas, creación de proyectos culturales multidisciplinares, gestión de festivales y representación de artistas’ (Mirmidón Producciones 2010) (Mirmidón is a company...dedicated to the production of ideas, creating multidisciplinary cultural projects, festival management and representing artists). Maruchy holds an MBA Empresas Culturales, Universidad de Salamanca.

maybe it was just dumb luck on David's part that he copyrighted a symbol that had been sitting on an olive oil pot for over seven hundred years. Maybe it was fortuitous for the town hall to incorporate his idea within their "idea" of a festival. Or, maybe the town hall realised that if they did not claim ownership of their medieval symbols, other entrepreneurs may beat them to it. Similar to global tourism strategies theorised by John L. and Jean Comaroff in *Ethnicity, Inc.* (2009), the town hall in Frigiliana are engaging in entrepreneurial capitalism by claiming ownership of their medieval symbols, constructing an ethnic identity and selling them to international tourists. However, later chapters will show that the particular context of Spanish history renders *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* as a considered political move.

The town hall held the first *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* in 2006 and began a process that would lead to a claim for the recuperation of a lost, authentic and culturally different heritage framed in historical terms and marketed through a tourist event. While "tourists and anthropologists alike may talk of travel to distant lands in terms of visits to our own past" (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:1), *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is firmly fixed in the present. Yet the festival imagines the past as a time that tolerated religious difference. It imagines a time where the character of the population was heterogeneous and has been corrupted by the homogenous character of the present. As much as the festival is created for tourists, it is a form of cultural activism that establishes a legitimate space to contest a dominant version of history, tradition and culture.

The introduction of a tourist event symbolically disrupts an existing history in Frigiliana. That is, it is an idea that began in the imagination of one individual which resonated with "ideas" in the imagination of local politicians. They created a symbolic cultural performance that transmits a different reading of Spanish identity.

David suggests that the image of “three cultures” came from his imagination or, as he puts it, “I invented it completely out of whole cloth, from nothing, or out of thin air”. Yet his idea has had far reaching effects, and while he may not be aware of the historical or contemporary circumstances through which his copyrighted image reverberates, “images are not simply constructed out of thin air. They must connect with, and seem to arise from, “history” and tradition” (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:15-16). The dominant image that connects contemporary Frigiliana to the past is the thirteenth-century symbol moulded into a ceramic olive pot that arises from local concerns relating to their history and their tradition. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is the local institution through which their concerns are articulated.

### **Subverting the Dominant Narrative during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas***

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a point of intersection where contested ideas about Spanish purity and Spanish ethnicity meet. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* challenges the ideology of whiteness and a mythologized version of values extracted from the known fact that the Christians always win. It presents its version of the past through farcical, superficial and commercial tourist performances. The festival plays with the past and it plays with the present. It is a medium through which locals reclaim ownership of their public spaces in order to express their local myths and their local legends. As later chapters will argue, the kitsch plastic realm of proletarian tourism is a powerful force that realises dramatic social change. In opposition to the ideology articulated during *moros y cristianos* festivals, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a celebration of the “other” within and a notable example of a culture-building programme where the relationship between political and economic concerns is mediated through a cultural performance. Thousands of years of contested history,

culture and heritage become realised in the present during a cultural performance of plurality that disrupts a dominant monocultural narrative by appropriating an existing institution of the state “in order to press claims of a limited and partial character... which assert the autonomy of the subaltern groups, but within the old framework” (Gramsci 1971:194). *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* articulates the “autonomy of the subaltern group” as it attempts to recuperate lost and silenced history by appropriating an old framework and institution of the state. Similar to contemporary interpretations of history that seek “legitimacy by assigning its opposition to a discredited past” (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:12), *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* discredits a primordialist view of history. These ideas are framed within global, national and regional versions of contested history combined with local historical particularisms that all connect on the streets of a village during a festival.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* dresses up the present in the costumes of the past. The physical space of Frigiliana is both defined and redefined during a festival that conjures up “the spirits of the past to their service, borrowing from them names, battle slogans, and costumes in order to present this new scene in world history in time-honored disguise and borrowed language” (Marx 1913:9). Borrowed names, slogans, and costumes are “[a] naturalised and archaic set of symbols” (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:12) imposed upon contemporary social relations. During *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, names and slogans naturalise the buildings, streets, visitors and locals in Frigiliana’s present day festival sensorium. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not concerned with what really happened. It is concerned with reclaiming a space to articulate contested histories.

The festival is bound together with contested and shifting social, political and cultural relationships of power that meander back and forth between the recent and medieval past. Sidney G. Tarrow (2011:18) describes these kinds of shifting relationships as the “political opportunity structure” that either encourages or discourages people from creating new forms of collective action. From this perspective, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a form of cultural activism that capitalises upon the opportunity available within contemporary shifting political structures in Spain. In short, the festival takes advantage of national discourse surrounding the recuperation of historical memories. Yet this is also a tourist event. Tourism is often presented as kitsch, untraditional and spurious. In the eyes of its detractors, commerce and tourism appear to diminish *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* to something less than an “authentic” original performance of tradition. These polar pairs, such as “original/copy and authentic/inauthentic” (Bruner 1994:397) are misleading models of cultural constructs and “such models represent deductive constructs intended to present historical change from one abstract pole to the other” (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:2).

### **Commercial Tourism and Ethnicity**

While commerce appears to be the ultimate mark of the untraditional and tourism is often regarded as the most inauthentic form of commerce, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* not only constructs a new plural heritage, it attempts to construct a new ethnicity based upon a reconfiguration of the blood within the population.<sup>17</sup> Anthony D. Smith (2009) notes how groups use an imagined or constructed essential ethnic/natural kernel within the construction of national identities configured beyond discursive and invented traditions. He highlights the component of blood, *ethnie*,

---

<sup>17</sup> Anthony Smith (1988; 2008; 2009) uses the term *ethnie* in order to distinguish it from culturally constructed ethnicity.

which forms the basis through which imagined constructions take hold within populations in contrast to ethnic geo-political models of nations created by the bureaucratic state, laws, institutions and a common culture. While “[t]he ethnic genealogical model of nations occupies a position of special prominence in the history of Spain” (Green 2011:199), fear about exposing the true character of contaminated blood is the motivation behind contemporary *moros y cristianos* festivals (Flesler 2008:3-5). Spanishness, as an ethnic group, is held to exist because it is believed that its members are of shared descent. Current concerns relating to “pure” blood also relate to Spain’s desire to maintain its “white” place within the European Union, “the unofficial international club of white countries” (Fra-Molinero 2009:149). Blood is being cast and recast in the present as a prerequisite for the elusive category of “Spanishness that deny those not of immediate Spanish origin access to this status and the opportunities contingent upon it” (Green 2011:197). The natural component of *ethnie* is the result of shifting political, social, historic, economic and cultural considerations as much as the culturally loaded term ethnicity is contingent upon similar sets of contemporary processes.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an explicitly political festival that opposes the purity of blood and Spanishness and realises an ethnic identity incorporated into an unnatural, kitsch and commercial sphere. Yet, the performance of cultural plurality has been realised solely because it is a tourist event. This is an example of “*Ethnicity, Inc.*” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009) where the action of performing difference has been reinforced as a direct result of the tourist witness. In other words, an apparently natural object, blood, has been reconfigured because of contact with an apparently unnatural group of people, tourists. Thus, not only do contested versions of history, politics, identity and tradition intersect during *Festival Frigiliana 3*

*Culturas*, local and global political economies also merge during and after the event. The festival questions the past and the present. It questions the dynamic processes that construct spurious or genuine cultures. It questions the politics of history, the politics of memory and the politics of festivals as they collide with the dynamics of shifting global and local economic and cultural strategies. It questions the natural qualities of blood.

### **Thesis Questions**

This is an ethnographic study based in a small Andalusian village. It seeks to address the following questions. What are the earlier and current histories that shape a celebration of Jewish or Muslim ethnicity in southern Spain? How can a tourist festival that began in the imagination of a few reconfigure the collective biological character of something as natural as blood? Why choose the medieval epoch to dress up the present? Is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* a form of social protest or a form of social cohesion dressed up in historical terms? Is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* a political struggle that appropriates an existing institution of the state to assert the autonomy of a subaltern group? Is this festival a form of “the *shaping* of taste” (Roseberry 1996:763) through market driven strategies that re-imagines a new class structure in the village? Is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* a genuine example of culture building or should it be regarded as spurious and tainted because of its explicitly commercial character? Is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* an example of the politicisation of history, memory and identity?

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* contains both true and new things. For many locals, the problem is that the true things are not new, and the new things are not true. “There are two things that people don’t like to read about themselves. One of

them is lies, and the other's the truth" (John Moloney quoted in Taylor 1995:ix). Yet discovering the truth about what really happened may only expose, "a fictitious past which occupies in our memories the place of another, a past of which we know nothing with certainty — not even that it is false" (Borges 1965:33). The fictitious past is constructed as a farce during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* as history repeats itself in the form of such modern commodities as iPad covers, hotdogs and mojitos.<sup>18</sup> Yet by dressing up contemporary commodities in farcical terms, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* realises something "modern" as something "traditional". While the cultural performance of difference in Frigiliana may not be traditional, it appears as though the practice of redefining the past through cultural performances is traditional. That is, there is a history of appropriating public performances of culture in Spain for political ends. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* reconfigures local identity, challenges a deeply ingrained Francoist image of Spanishness and questions the virtue of a past where the losers are always considered to be the "bad guys". In Frigiliana, the good and the bad guys are bound tightly together in a set of social, political and cultural processes that have produced the present.

### **Chapter Outline**

In order to understand what might have brought the Mayor of Frigiliana to tears at a recently invented tourist event, a description of some historical events and the people who conquered Spain is essential. Medieval history, that predates the arrival of Islam on the peninsula, significantly influences discourse relating to contemporary Spanish identity. Interpretations of Visigoth Spain, the arrival of Islam, the Reconquista and 1492 fundamentally inform contemporary Spanishness. Indeed, these dates fundamentally influence propaganda leading up to, during and following the Spanish

---

<sup>18</sup> "Hegel remarks somewhere that all great world-historic facts and personages appear, so to speak, twice. He forgot to add: the first time as tragedy, the second time as farce" (Marx 1913:9).

Civil War. Beyond the Civil War and the Franco dictatorship, certain events from the past may appear distant and unconnected, yet they combine in the present and shape two distinct versions of history, heritage culture and tradition. In short, medieval history is the basis for continued debate relating to the “purity” of Spanishness. Thus while I mentioned that Javier was probably not getting emotional about the death of 4,000 Spanish Muslims at the Battle of the Rock in 1569, his memories of recent repression during the Franco dictatorship are informed by such distant events.

Contemporary versions of the past in Spain are divided based on interpretations of the mental state of the medieval population. But as an informant, Jose Maria said, “we don’t get along today, so what makes you think we ever got along in the past.” That is not to suggest that contemporary Spaniards do not get along today, it is to suggest that medieval Spain was probably a mixture of *convivencia* and *coexistencia* in much the same way that contemporary Spain is today. The distinction between *convivencia* and *coexistencia* hinges on a distinction being made between the commercial and the cultural sphere. Throughout this study I am stressing the point that the market is not separate from culture. I am stressing that the kitsch tourist marketplace means something significant, and I am arguing that commerce is not inauthentic or unimportant.

Discourse relating to *convivencia* and *coexistencia* suggest contradictory versions of medieval Spain but these arguments cannot be reduced to left or right-wing politics. More specifically, arguments relating to *convivencia* and *coexistencia* cannot be reduced to Francoist or Civil War politics. Different interpretations of Spanish history are frequently contradictory, ignore well-documented accounts of the past and use historic details as propaganda in the present. Similar to my encounter with individual informants in Frigiliana who often expressed contradictory accounts

of the past in one conversation, political discourse in Spain often uses contradictory versions of the past for political gain. While Franco was apparently continuing on the work of *Los Reyes Católicos* and purging Spain of its Muslim “other,” he simultaneously deployed Muslim troops to conquer an apparently pluralist Republican Spain during the Civil War. Inspired by Spain’s Moorish past, African-American volunteers fighting with the International Brigades for the pluralist Republic were stunned “by the rabid anti-Muslim racism of the Republican forces” (Aidi 2006:67). Although ridding Spain of a “foreign” threat was the basis for domestic Francoist propaganda, Franco courted the Muslim world by emphasising Spain’s plural past. Following the United Nations 1946 economic boycott, an isolated Franco adopted a policy of amity toward the Arab world “and embraced Moorish culture” (ibid.71). According to Daniela Flesler (2008:28-34), the “purity” of Spanishness argument is frequently presented by both left and right-wing politics in order to maintain Spain’s position amongst the elites of the European Union. Post 9/11 and the 3/11 Madrid bombings, Spain’s “oriental question” raises concerns relating to “what it means to be so close to the Arab world, and Europe’s “shield” against Islam” (Aidi 2006:68). These arguments about the past appear to be firmly fixed in the present, but they are ambiguous enough to accommodate contradictions, depending on the political mood, context or intended audience. This study is organised with these contradictory histories in mind, and it attempts to unpack the complexities within contested histories that brought Javier to tears at a tourist event.

Chapter One is an introduction to the physical space and geography of the village, and an introduction to the symbols dotted throughout Frigiliana. It describes the landscape of the village, local economic activity and local political parties. Its aim is to take a journey through the streets of Frigiliana and point out the numerous

sites that have been remaking this place since the introduction of the festival in 2006. While recent monuments in Frigiliana refer to the three cultures, the chapter discusses twelve ceramic panels installed in 1982 as part of a previous drive to attract tourists to the village. New monuments in the village memorialise the “idea” of three cultures, but *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* takes this process a little further. Streets, parks and commercial centres have been named with reference to the three cultures since 2006. Thus, the theme of the event has moved beyond festival time and into the everyday fabric of the village. The chapter explores how this version of history becomes reified in everyday language as a result of renaming the village.

Chapter Two explores the history of the people who have populated this region. A primordial Spanish Catholic identity formed one of the ideological foundations of Nationalist ideology. The myths created by the Nationalists were used to justify their illegal military coup, yet they continue long after the regime has ended. While southern Spain has been populated by numerous people, such as Phoenicians, Romans and Carthaginians, the Nationalist narrative presents Visigoth Spain (409-711) as being the harbinger for a pure uncontaminated Spanish population.<sup>19</sup> From 711 much of the peninsula was controlled by Muslim leaders until the battle for Granada in 1492. This chapter describes the impact of the end of Islamic rule in Frigiliana and nineteenth-century history in the region. The chapter discusses the coming of the Second Republic to the village and the arrival of Nationalist forces in 1937.

---

<sup>19</sup> Daniela Flesler (2008:9-13) notes that 711 is one of the foundational myths articulated by both Christian and Muslim chronicles which conjures up the idea that Spain was invaded by Muslims. The “lost Spain myth” presents 711 as a traumatic disaster that saw the Visigoths, as a result of their immoral sexual mores, lose Spain to invading Muslims. While the invasion force may have been Muslim, Flesler suggests that religion was not a significant mark of identity during the eighth century. She suggests that as a result of commercial exchange, Muslims were present in Spain since the inception of the religion. More importantly, she argues that Spain and North Africa have had centuries of contact, both commercial and cultural, long before Muslim Berbers entered the peninsula.

Chapter Three explores different approaches to the interpretation of festivals. It focuses on interpretations of festivals that place them within a national system or “cycle of fiestas,” and the manner in which the concept of social cohesion or social change applies to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. It explores the idea that festival time exists in a liminal sphere at the edge of the social, mindful of the fact that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is *in* the social rather than *about* the social. The chapter explores whether *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* occurs inside or outside everyday time and explores the limitations of a comparative method when applied to interpretations of festivals.

Chapter Four is a detailed discussion of some of the significant elements within the festival. The Chapter discusses the manner in which present day commodities are fashioned to reflect the theme of the event, and how iPad covers and mojitos become medievalised as a result of stylisation. The chapter discusses food as one of the central components within the festival and how introducing new food to locals begins a process that transforms the village and the villagers. This chapter also discusses the content of public conferences held at 6pm each evening. These conferences pedagogically introduce locals to their hidden histories but are delivered by politicians. It is through these conferences that the political components of the festival organise, transform and redefine a local sense of ethnicity. It is through these conferences that an uncoordinated “common sense” notion of local identity becomes an organised politically motivated “good sense” version of local identity.

Chapter Five is a discussion of the background sensorial experience of the festival. Regardless of the staged expression of difference performed during the festival, it is the background sights, sounds, smells, textures and tastes that authorise *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* as being a local cultural form. The chapter extends the

arguments presented in Chapter One and Four with respect to the manner in which banal names and staged performances of differences require something more than an ideological articulation. It explores local ideas about the construction of a sensorium during the festival and the role that the inner organs of the body play during the construction of identity, tradition and heritage. It explores the place of the bowel, the heart, the stomach and the gut as a site for the processes that validate belonging.

Chapter Six is a discussion of the role that the tourist plays in authorising the festival as traditional culture. Moreover, it suggests that tourism is *the* agent for social change. The chapter outlines the recent history of tourism in Spain and anthropological approaches to tourism. Tourism can be an exploitive and destructive force that promises financial rewards but may actually maintain inequality. It can have a significant impact on a society that ranges from bolstering right-wing regimes to human exploitation. This chapter explores the role of the tourist during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. It explores how the unquestioning character of international tourists transforms a recently invented cultural performance into a traditional event. The chapter argues that the commercial component of the event is the essential element within a process that transforms local ethnicity.

Chapter Seven asks why *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* was created in 2006. If the festival is redefining a Francoist version of history, why has it emerged more than thirty years after the regime has ended? The festival seeks to integrate three apparently disparate communities in the village into one tolerant community. Yet, there are no medieval Jews or medieval Muslims here. Therefore, who is this festival talking to and, most importantly, who is it talking for? This chapter explores discourse surrounding the 2007 Law of Historical Memory and discusses the emergence of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* within this discourse. It argues that the

festival is not really about medieval history. Rather it is about claiming the right to celebrate a different version of history on a stage that has always been controlled by Nationalist themed cultural performances. While firmly embedded within a national discursive field that seeks the recuperation of historical memory, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* reifies a local version of history, culture heritage and tradition in a bottom up manner.

### Questions of Spanishness

Although this study moves back and forth through multiple histories, in and out of apparent distinctions between the economy and culture, and Left and Right through political ideologies, the central concern here focuses on the construction of collective identity, and *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* exposes the intriguing and unexpectedly important role that market tourism and unintended consequences might have in such a process. Taking a cue from Jean Comaroff (1982:1), this study explores the population of Frigiliana “as determined, yet determining in their own history”. This study explores who is being included and excluded from participating in the festival. It explores who shares in the festival, who shares in the mechanisms that construct new traditions and who does not. The theme of an event infused with notions of tolerance, consent and inclusion appears to exclude the local small migrant Muslim population from participating. All of the events during the festival are lubricated with alcohol and seasoned with pork, which is more of a condiment in Spain than a food item.<sup>20</sup> While very little in the event is *halal*, nothing about it is *kosher*. If there were any Jews here, they could not participate. Is this Civil War “politics as usual” (Blakeley 2008:316) in Spain? Or is this something Edward Bruner (1994:398) calls an “authentic reproduction,” an intriguing oxymoron, as we are not sure if it is an

---

<sup>20</sup> In 2010 there were 32 migrants from Morocco living in Frigiliana.

original or a copy”? So, what is really going on here? Who is being celebrated, included and/or excluded? Is the Jewish, Christian and Muslim theme just about not being Spanish? Is it about being North African? Is *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* “a view of historical reproduction based on a constructivist position that sees all culture as continually invented and reinvented” (ibid.)?

A brief note on terminology: what follows is a discussion of festivals in Spain. I am using the term “festival” to include fiestas, carnivals, ferias, public celebrations, public religious rituals and, indeed, all public celebrations. This is in keeping with Mikhail Bakhtin’s (1984:122) sense of the “sum total of all diverse, festivities, rituals and forms of a carnival type... [of] syncretic pageantry of a ritualistic sort.” There are significant differences between religious celebrations and “traditional” fiestas in Spain. However these celebrations frequently appear similar during their performance and fiestas often form part of a religious celebration. “Fiesta” can signify an organised public event, and/or private party. It may be used to refer to a religious celebration and/or a secular event, although it is common for secular fiestas to coincide with religious celebrations. When the term “carnival” is used, it specifically refers to a secular performance where the reversal of social norms is heightened and carnival time is a “topsy turvy” version of normative time. The term “festival” is uncommon when referring to public performances in Spain — the terms fiesta, carnival or feria are more common. I am using the term festival to categorise all public performances in Spain because it does not imply a specific set of prescribed practices that are associated with either religious or “traditional” public performances. In keeping with the overall theme of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, “festival” is a new and encompassing term that negates distinctions between multiple public celebrations.

However, this study is concerned with the transformative force within public performances of culture. Therefore, despite the lack of a religious component during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, I am suggesting that it accomplishes a similar, if not more powerful, reconfiguration of society. Thus, there is a ritual component during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* which is akin to a religious ritual, such as a harvest ritual, that acts to reinforce community bonds. While religious rituals contain an obligatory element that may be seen as the “work” of gods or society, participation in *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is voluntary. In keeping with Brian Sutton-Smith’s (1977:18-19) augmentation of the Victor Turners (1970:93) “interstructural” aspects of a religious ritual transformation, I am arguing that the commercial character of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* constructs powerful playful and ludic potentials that realise a proto-culture. I am arguing that the multiple and often chaotic component parts within the festival act to reconfigure a local sense of ethnicity.

Ethnicity oscillates around ideas relating to culture and identity. Throughout this study, the term ethnicity is used to denote membership of a group based upon their biological similarities. That is to say, ethnicity refers to a shared lineage and local ethnicity refers to an extended kinship group. In addition to sharing descent, ethnicity is contingent upon a shared history and a shared culture that has been transmitted, uncorrupted, from generation to generation. While this primordialist view may form the basis everyday accounts of ethnicity, I am arguing that ethnicity is situational and subject to shifting political discourse. The ethnic category “Spanish” may be dependent upon common blood and common culture, but ethnicity is an on-going negotiation of identity and culture set at the boundaries between groups of people Fredrik Barth (Barth 1998:13). Therefore, the invention and reinvention of a shared history, identity and culture naturalises the social

construction of ethnicity and discourse presents ethnicity in biological terms. While I am arguing that the presentation of ethnicity in biological terms is a fluid and contextual process, the idea that ethnicity resides within the inner body continues to be a significant feature of ethnic identity. I am suggesting that a tourist festival accomplishes a reconfiguration of the apparently natural characteristics of blood, thereby transforming local ethnicity because the festival reinvents local history and local culture

“Welcome to Frigiliana, the Village of Three Cultures, where men and women of different faiths lived in harmony for hundreds of years, and continue to do so today” (Riordan 2004:3).<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> This is the opening line of David Riordan’s guidebook to Frigiliana. He used to close his walking tours of the village with the same line.

# Chapter One: The Marks of Local History on a Village

Commemorative street names provide for the intersection of hegemonic ideological structures with the spatial practices of everyday life. (Azaryahu 1996:311)

As the bus rounds the final steep bend from the nearby coastal town of Nerja, the village of Frigiliana comes into full view. Nestling in the foothills of the Sierra Almirajara, the village follows the contours of the landscape as slender streets meander up and down this mountainous terrain. Whitewashed buildings glisten in the penetrating afternoon heat set against a luscious green canopy and clear blue sky. Look south, and an olive grove filled valley leads six kilometres down to the Mediterranean Sea. Look north, and the formidable peaks of the Sierra dwarf, frame and buttress this two-story *pueblo blanco*. Not much has changed in the landscape of Frigiliana through the centuries since the sixteenth-century Christian chronicler Luis de Mármol y Carvajal (1897:44) noted:

*Toda esta tierra es fragosísima, aunque fértil, poblada de muchas arboledas, abundante de fuentes frías y saludables* (Although this is rough and difficult terrain, it is fertile, populated with many trees and an abundance of fresh water fountains and clear streams).

The landscape is uneven, hilly and divided into small individual plots that maximise as much of this fertile and arable land as possible. The fields surrounding the village are evenly peppered with houses ranging from a few derelict *cortijos* (small farmhouses) to grand haciendas developed during the property boom over the previous twenty years. The houses follow near invisible country lanes that zigzag up and down the valley. The reflection from the afternoon sun on striking blue

swimming pools identify the newer and predominantly foreign properties owned in *el campo* (countryside).<sup>22</sup>

The village sits 320 meters above sea level and has a population of 3,360 (1,672 female and 1,688 male).<sup>23</sup> It is located at the eastern edge of the Axarquía region of Málaga province within the Autonomous community of Andalusia, 56 kilometres east of Málaga city and just within the limits of the tourist catchment region of the Costa del Sol. The Sierra Almirajara provides a natural frontier between Frigiliana and the neighbouring Andalusian province of Granada. Organised walking tours continue to use the old trade routes through the Sierra, which take about 15 hours to walk.

The bus turns into the relatively newer section of the village and travels up Avenida de Andalucía. The newer section of the village was developed during the 1980s and the bus passes a small park/playground, Parque de Andalucía. A lone green and white Andalusian flag stands at the corner of the park atop a plinth engraved with the words of *El himno de Andalucía* (The Andalusian Anthem). Spanish flags adorn many of the windows and balconies on both sides of Calle San Sebastián, named in honour of the patron saint of the village.<sup>24</sup> The Spanish national football team are steadily progressing through the early stages of the World Cup in South Africa.<sup>25</sup> Football dominates everyday life in Spain, but World Cup football intensifies participation in the spectacle as each and every game becomes a more enthusiastic cause for public celebration in the streets of the village. Tourists on the bus get their bearings. There is a *farmacia* (chemist) to the left, a café to the right, a

---

<sup>22</sup> Locals refer to the fields that immediately surround the perimeter of the village as “*el campo*”.

<sup>23</sup> Information received from the town hall in 2012.

<sup>24</sup> San Sebastián was a third-century officer in the Roman army beatified for encouraging two prisoners, Marcus and Marcellinus, not to waver from their faith and to die for Christ. “He was not a priest nor a religious, but a soldier” (Butler 1894:43).

<sup>25</sup> The Spanish national team eventually won the 2010 World Cup.

bar to the left. All notice what appears to be a small Church, La Ermita de San Sebastián, behind the main street, while the bus skilfully negotiates the narrowly constructed thoroughfare.

### **The “Local” Population**

The total population of the village and the surrounding countryside is 3,360 (see table 1). Of this total, 1,294 residents are foreign and approximately half of these foreign residents come from the United Kingdom. Throughout this study the term “local” is applied to the total population of Frigiliana. The majority of foreign residents of the village consider themselves to be “locals” and frequently refer to Frigiliana as being “home.” While the population of the village could be categorised by their nationalities, a significant level of integration between foreign and Spanish residents makes national categories a little redundant. Many foreign residents have lived in the village for over 30 years. Many are involved in long-term relationships with natives and many foreign couples have raised families in the village. The most significant distinction that can be drawn between separate communities in the village is their ability, or willingness, to speak Spanish. For the most part, speaking or attempting to speak Spanish qualifies members of the community as being “local.” This is regardless of the level of Spanish one speaks, as native speakers appreciate even the slightest attempt at communicating in Spanish. Moreover, they particularly enjoy attempts made by foreign residents to speak in a clipped and swallowed Andalusian accent.

Of course, there are a small number of foreign long-term residents that never attempt to speak Spanish. Notwithstanding the fact that they may have lived in the village for over ten years, they order drinks in English, expect to be spoken to in

English and make remarks, such as, “you don’t need to speak Spanish here.” Within this small monoglot group, learning to speak Spanish is seen as being negative and unnecessary. Indeed, one of the first questions they ask is, “do you speak Spanish.” My affirmative response somewhat excluded me from this group. On another occasion I witnessed an Irish student being put to the test when she stated that she spoke a little Spanish. Cajoled in to ordering a drink in Spanish, she feigned a heavy Irish accent. She explained to me later that “speaking Spanish with any level of fluency would have excluded her from this group.” Thus putting on an Irish accent, while speaking Spanish, maintained her insider status within this group.

Attaining a high level of fluency in Spanish augments one’s status as an insider within the Spanish speakers in the village. Most social occasions, regardless of the nationalities of those present, require speaking Spanish. Thus, when a drunken Spanish tourist insulted some English tourists in a small café one evening, the owner apologised, quietly and individually, to all “local” Spanish speakers present. He did not apologise to the English tourists or non-Spanish speakers present because “they did not understand the insults,” he said laughing. Many of the “local” Spanish speakers needed to have the conversation and insults translated, but as stated before, their attempt or willingness to communicate in Spanish means they are considered to be “local.” Thus, they deserved to be included in the café owner’s apology and were almost automatically ascribed the category of “local” or insider.

Assimilation into the local population is achieved quite quickly and new residents make an insider outsider distinction within a relatively short period of time as recent Irish migrants to the village explain.

So we’ve been coming here regularly now for, I suppose, six or seven years, a few times a year. We decided to look at properties here and last year [2009] we

just stumbled upon where we bought and we weren't even seriously thinking about buying... I like the location. It's a long way from the airport and difficult to get to. With added expense. But all that considered I just feel at very at home here. Ad it would be the kind of place that I would come here just with my daughter, and I just feel so welcomed and just kind of safe walking around and just so settled in. Whereas, a lot of places I'm just kind of wary going out with just girlfriends, but here I'm quite happy to come out. I feel Frigiliana ticks all the boxes. I'm happy at home reading or sitting out and Shay gets up and out and he's gone. And that's possible here. Just go wandering around the village, have a chat with whoever. Our neighbours are mostly Spanish. Nerja is beautiful, but to buy a place there you would be living outside the village. At night time you nearly have the village back to yourself because the tourists are gone (laughing) which is great, really. And it's very quite on Sundays. (Paula 2010)

The categories of insider/outsider exist in Frigiliana, but more often than not they are reserved for day-trippers and tourists who breeze through the village. However, many of these day-trippers are Spanish and the terms host/guest best describes these transient encounters rather than national categories. The lines between local and non-local are blurred in Frigiliana as personal relationships overlap considerably amongst residents of the village. And while a minority of foreign residents prefer not to integrate into everyday village life, most foreign residents embrace the village's hospitality and are similarly embraced by villagers. This includes the small Muslim migrant community who can be seen chatting with villagers throughout the year, but who are particularly noticeable during the warm summer months as they sit and chat with other residents of the village. It also includes a small gay community who are fully integrated within everyday life in the village. It may be best to say that Frigiliana is an integrated village that accommodates all those who are prepared to assimilate within "local" culture. Therefore, while there may be many nationalities within this fluid category, due to their willingness to speak Spanish the majority of residents in the village can be considered as being "locals."

## **Main Economic Activity**

Where once subsistence farming and local agriculture were a predominant economic activity, national and international tourism are now the major revenue source in the village. As a result of a concerted national effort during the 1960s to increase foreign currency reserves and correct a trade deficit, the World Bank identified foreign tourism as a potential revenue stream within isolated communities along the eastern and southern coast of Spain. This was despite the fact that “foreign” was frequently used as code for the external threat to the notion of Spanish purity and unity within Nationalist propaganda leading up to and following the Spanish Civil War (Preston 2012). Although opening up Spain to foreigners was resisted by the more conservative members of the Franco regime, the rapid influx of foreign tourists and the subsequent economic miracle silenced opposition. During the 1960s, a program to rejuvenate Frigiliana as a potential tourist destination identified the possibility of beautifying the village by conserving its medieval architecture.

Tourism, tourism rentals, house maintenance and service industries are the significant source of income in the village, and the influx of northern Europeans fuels much of the economic life of Frigiliana. The categories listing economic activity in the village separate wholesale, retail and repairs from hospitality, real estate, construction and professional services (see Table 1). Yet retail, construction and real estate overlap significantly with tourism. Defining the tourist “industry” in the village is difficult because there is a significant amount of overlap between local businesses and tourism. Moreover, locating the tourism “industry” in the village is also difficult. Due to the flexibility of internet payment systems, rental payments for properties available in the village are completed online and outside Spain. Tourism may indicate direct local rentals to tourists where cleaning, airport collection and

welcome services are provided by foreign residents in the village. It may indicate foreign-owned properties where no income is derived from rental, but apartments are used by various family members throughout the year. In short, the tourism “industry” operates at a formal and significantly informal level in the village. Although difficult to define, it is entirely interconnected with all other economic activity.

Cafés and restaurants rely on the constant stream of tourists throughout the summer months, and queues of tourists frequently form outside some of the more popular restaurants during the early evenings. The privately operated coach that arrives from Nerja approximately every hour is often full to capacity during the summer afternoons. The majority of the cafés and restaurants are locally owned and spread throughout Frigiliana, but there is one British-owned restaurant and one British-operated pool-side café. The restaurant employs British staff and, while some of the clientele are locals, the majority are British tourists.<sup>26</sup> There is a German-owned pizzeria and a Polish café in the recently constructed Plaza de las Tres Culturas and a small Dutch-owned coffee/cake shop beside the Church, but while these foreign-owned businesses employ foreign staff, their clientele are a mixture of locals and tourists.

Maintenance and construction services relating to tourism also provide an additional income stream. Many local property owners prefer to contract an English-speaking employee to welcome tourists and ensure a smooth transition between different groups of guests. The economic crisis has seen construction in the village

---

<sup>26</sup> One British resident in the village commutes from Frigiliana to London every second week. Working in the financial services sector in London City, he says it is cost effective for him to live in Frigiliana and travel to meet clients in the UK. Once a resident of Newcastle, he says, the time he spends in the air is productive. He avoids traffic jams and the journey from Newcastle to London used to take eight hours, whereas the journey from Frigiliana takes four hours.

come to a halt, and although most new buildings in the village are all completed, many apartments and retail outlets are vacant. While it was once common for locals to rent business outlets to foreigners, the cost of rent has forced a few locals to run their businesses for themselves thus providing employment for their families.

The 1,294 foreign residents in the village also provide an income stream that ranges from house maintenance, to home improvements and regular gardening contracts.<sup>27</sup> Although the demand for small home improvements in Frigiliana has diminished recently, it has been replaced by small construction jobs in the surrounding area. Many locals own small parcels of land dotted around the village, and while there is an abundance of crops, harvesting them for sale is not cost effective as labour costs could not be recuperated. Instead of selling local produce to the market, many share their surplus crops with friends and families.

---

<sup>27</sup> See Table 1.

**Table 1****Population** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Population Total 2012 (including the surrounding countryside)	3,360
Males	1,672
Females	1,688
Village Population (within the village and excluding the countryside)	2,699
Percentage Under 20 Years	18.07%
Percentage Over 65 Years	21.43%
Foreign Residents	1,294
Principal Origin of Foreign Residents	UK
Emigrants 2011	84
Immigrants 2011	108

**Main Economic Activity** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Wholesale and retail trade, repair of motor vehicles and motorcycles	62
Hospitality	48
Real Estate	28
Construction	25
Professional Services	17

**Main Agricultural Crops** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Potato	48 Hectares
Avocado	626 Hectares
Olive Oil	265 Hectares

**Tourism** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Hotels Capacity	146 <sup>28</sup>
Hostels Capacity	13

**Employment** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Females Unemployed 2012	146
Males Unemployed 2012	178
Females Employed 2012	470
Males Employed 2012	598
Female Subsidised Agricultural Employees	16
Male Subsidised Agricultural Employees	5

**Income Tax Returns 2012** (Junta de Andalucía 2013)

Total Returns Submitted	1,140
Employment Income	€8,758,901.50
Employee Income	€905,015.60
Net Direct Income	€980,776.60
Other Income (arising from real estate and/or investment income)	€965,224.60
Average Income Declared	€10,184.10

<sup>28</sup> This figure includes hotels in the surrounding countryside. The principal hotel in Frigiliana closed in 2012.

When Domingo, a local construction worker, found it difficult to find work as a result of the deepening economic crisis, he explained how it is possible to live in Frigiliana without a significant income. He never remembers having to pay for fruit and vegetables whether he was in or out of employment. His neighbours have always given him oranges, avocados and a regular supply of various fruits. In return, he is available for small repair or construction work and does not charge for his services. “I’ll fix a window or repair a step,” he says. On another occasion sitting in a café he says: “I bet if we could not pay for our meal we could work off the debt tomorrow—working in the kitchen.” And as I began to laugh, he says, “I’m not joking. I would win the bet.”

This system of sharing surplus produce extends throughout the village as the lines between economic activity and social relations get blurred. In return for helping to harvest her small olive holding, Charo provides food, drinks and a party. In part to recreate a memory of harvest celebrations and in part as a means to supplement her income, Charo likes the idea of involving friends in her small entrepreneurial endeavour. However she is not sure if she makes a profit. Charo exemplifies the multiple nationalities within the category “local.” She is an American who has lived in the village since the early 1980s. Those involved with her small endeavour are a mixture of nationalities, yet all of them are subsumed within the category “local” because they all speak Spanish. Juan regularly gives away slightly over ripened oranges that he says, “are too sweet to eat and good for juice.” He never expects any form of payment in return. This very informal system of giving sometimes requires a reciprocal exchange, but the value of that exchange is not calculated in terms of equivalence. It extends throughout the village as local wine is regularly given away. Many cafés maintain a supply of tobacco or cigarettes left behind by tourists. If

locals ask for a cigarette paper or filter, they are directed to a small supply at the end of the counter. As Manolo points out with respect to the possibility of living in the village without a significant income stream, “I’m not sure how people in the city can live. See, you can always eat here.”

### **Politics in the Village**

There are three main political parties in Frigiliana: Partido Andalucista Espacio Plural Andaluz (PA EP-AND formerly Partido Andalucista), Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE), and Partido Popular (PP). Both the PP and PSOE are the principal national parties in Spain and the PP are the current national government party. The local government in Frigiliana is a coalition of two political parties: PA EP-AND who hold four seats and PP who hold two seats. PA EP-AND began as a clandestine organisation during the 1960s under the name Compromiso Político de Andalucía. They advocate the decentralisation of Spanish politics, left leaning socio-economic policies, the recognition of a distinct Andalusian identity, Andalusian independence and claim equality with Cataluña and the Basque Country (Partido Andalucista 2012).

Partido Popular (formerly Partido Unido de Alianza Popular and Coalición Democrática) is a right-wing conservative party founded by a former the Francoist minister, Manuel Fraga. Although the party has had a significant number of name changes, its origins can be traced back to Partido Unido de Alianza Popular, a union of several conservative political parties formed from amongst Franco’s government in the 1970s. During Spain’s 1982 national elections, Alianza Popular won 105 seats and emerged as the main opposition party to the PSOE. The name Partido Popular was adopted in 1989. While PP have distanced themselves from their Francoist

politics and moved towards being a centrist party, they continue to be seen as a pro-nationalist party. Partido Andalucista and the current mayor have held an overall majority and control of the town council in Frigiliana since 1995. Since post-dictatorship democratic elections began, Frigiliana has had seven socialist or left of centre town councils. The socialist party, Partido Socialista Obrero Español, won five seats and the majority vote in 2010, but the PA/PP coalition pact excluded them from taking control of the council. This unlikely coalition between a Left and Right-wing political party is the first time a right-wing party has held a political position in Frigiliana since the transition to democracy.

Partido Andalucista and Partido Socialista Obrero Español may appear to be ideologically similar; however, their relationship in Frigiliana is acrimonious, and often results in personal mud-slinging and non-political insults. Politicians in Frigiliana are frequently judged on their personalities, affable nature or approachable character. When it comes to politics an informant, David, says that, “PA have no ideology”, and “they no longer represent the majority population. “They are the builder’s party,” says David, “I don’t think they have an ideology,” he says. The PA’s decision to enter into a coalition with Partido Popular is viewed by many in the village as a betrayal of election promises. The PA have been accused of selling water rights for profit, ignoring infrastructural issues in the village, such as car parking, and misappropriating council funds. However, public political debates in the village are rarely about politics and often premised on hearsay and rumour.

### Municipal Election Results 2011 (El Páís 2011)

Political Party	Council Seats	Votes	Percent
PSOE	5	741	44.91 %
PA EP-AND	4	533	32.3 %
PP	2	296	17.94 %
VERDES <sup>29</sup>	0	69	4.18 %
IULV-CA <sup>30</sup>	0	3	0.18 %

### Municipal Elections Results 2007 (El Páís 2007)

Political Party	Council Seats	Votes	Percent
PA	6	648	44.38 %
PSOE	4	508	34.79 %
PP	1	195	13.36 %
LV07 <sup>31</sup>	0	91	6.23 %
IULV-CA	0	12	0.82 %

### Political Parties in Power since 1979 (El Páís 2011)

Date	Mayor	Political Party
1979–1983	Antonio Navas Acosta	UCD <sup>32</sup>
1983–1987	José Manuel Acosta Pérez	PSA <sup>33</sup>
1987–1991	Antonio Fernández Vera	PSOE-A <sup>34</sup>
1991–1995	Antonio Fernández Vera	PSOE-A
1995–1999	Javier López Ruiz	PA
1999–2003	Javier López Ruiz	PA
2003–2007	Javier López Ruiz	PA
2007–2011	Javier López Ruiz	PA
2011–Date	Javier López Ruiz	PA EP-AND +PP

## Tourism in Frigiliana

Tourism in the village takes a number of forms—the most noticeable of which is the continuous flow of day-trippers disembarking from organised coach trips throughout the early morning and afternoon. These groups tend to be on a strict schedule and are described by one local English woman as the “tea and pee brigade”—denoting the

<sup>29</sup> Los Verdes de Andalucía

<sup>30</sup> Izquierda Unida Los Verdes-Convocatoria por Andalucía

<sup>31</sup> Los Verdes de Andalucía

<sup>32</sup> Unión de Centro Democrático, 1979-1983, (Largest political party following the end of dictatorship)

<sup>33</sup> Partido Socialista de Andalucía (Name changed to Partido Andalucista)

<sup>34</sup> Partido Socialista Obrero Español de Andalucía (Name changed back to PSOE)

speed with which hordes of day-trippers rush through the village, briefly if ever stopping, for more than a few moments to order a quick drink and to avail of café services. Unlike other groups of tourists, the day-trippers on organised coach trips visit the village throughout the year and are therefore seen as a valuable revenue stream during the low season. The sunny climate attracts many tourists to Spain, but these organised day-trippers are often Spanish pensioners travelling throughout the region who are not particularly interested in sunbathing.

The second category of tourists is the independent day-tripper. They arrive in the village from the nearby town of Nerja, which is a large coastal town with approximately 20,000 residents and a thriving international tourism industry. During the early 1980s, a Spanish television show called *Verano Azul* (Blue Summer) was set in Nerja and won a national award for Best National Series and Best Actor in 1982. The show was produced by Televisión Española (TVE now RTVE) which was the only television network available in Spain until 1983. The nineteen shows are about the adventures of a group of youths and adolescents, ranging from 9-17 years, on summer vacation in Nerja. In keeping with the themes of television programming during the end of the transition to democracy, the series dealt with such nationally sensitive issues as coming of age, the generation gap, the right to protest and ethical values. Apart from acknowledging issues surrounding divorce and family relations through the lens of a teenage summer vacation, *Verano Azul* captured the imagination of the Spanish population and turned Nerja into an enduring nationally renowned family holiday destination. The show has been re-broadcast nationally every summer since 1982, distributed internationally and the full nineteen episodes are available through RTVE's website.

Frigiliana thoroughly depends upon Nerja for its tourists and most importantly for the type of “family” tourist who visits Nerja. The privately operated bus from Nerja provides an efficient and cheap way for tourists to visit Frigiliana.<sup>35</sup> Most people experience Frigiliana for the first time as independent day-trippers from Nerja and subsequently take their summer holidays in the village. Nerja attracts high-spending family tourists from outside Spain as well. Restrictions imposed on building practices, noise levels and public order maintain Nerja’s reputation as a tranquil destination.<sup>36</sup> From amongst this category of tourists, Frigiliana attracts the elusive and much sought after “cultural tourist” who comes to the village in order to experience the “real Spain,” the *pueblo blanco* of traditional Spain. With its narrow streets, glistening whitewashed buildings and sleepy ambience, Frigiliana instantly delivers an experience of “real Spain”. Less organised than the coach trips, day-trippers from Nerja use local transport— and I am sitting amongst them on the local bus. The bus runs approximately every hour until 9pm and does not operate during festivals or on Sundays.<sup>37</sup>

The third and the most significant group of tourists in the village are tourists who rent or own private accommodation in the region. These visitors spend most of their holidays in the village and the surrounding countryside and contribute most of the tourist spending directly into the local economy in the form of rental income and entertainment. There are many rental properties owned by both locals and non-locals in the village, and while they charge rent, it is usually family and friends rather than

---

<sup>35</sup> A return journey from Nerja to Frigiliana costs €2.

<sup>36</sup> Apart from a designated “nightclub” section of Nerja, all outdoor seating areas in cafés and bars close at midnight in both Nerja and Frigiliana.

<sup>37</sup> In 2010 the town hall asked the bus operator to provide services during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The normal service ends at 9pm each evening, but during the festival the last bus leaves Frigiliana at 2am. The introduction of the bus service during the festival has had a dramatic effect on visitor numbers. Over 2,000 visitors used the festival bus service in 2010. The best way to commute to the village during the festival is by bus.

organised package-trip tourists who stay in this type of accommodation. Of course, the internet is a valuable resource for locals and non-locals alike who want to advertise their rental properties, and the tourists attracted are a mixture of Spaniards, northern Europeans and the occasional non-European visitor. The presence of these tourists is noticeable during the late summer evenings as they fill local restaurants.

The most distinguishing feature of tourists who come to the village is not that they are organised day-trippers, independent day-trippers or tourists renting local properties; it is that they are not hedonistic pleasure seekers. For the most part, tourists who come to Frigiliana possess the lofty status of the high-spending “cultural tourists,” and they cannot be categorised within the general framework of “four S tourism: sun, sand, sea and sex tourism” (Matthews 1977:14).<sup>38</sup>

### **Plan of the Village**

The village can be divided into four interconnected sections. (1) The medieval streets leading up to and around the Church square in the Barribarto neighbourhood.<sup>39</sup> (2) The new section of the village (3) Plaza de las Tres Culturas, which is a new commercial centre full of cafés and shops that circumvent the historic section of the village and is situated on a recently constructed bypass, Carretera de Circunvalación. (4) La Plaza de Ingenio, the central thoroughfare that joins the old and new sections of the village. In addition to these connected areas of the village, apartment buildings and shops were constructed along the Carretera de Circunvalación. All of the

---

<sup>38</sup> Attempts at conceptual clarification that endeavour to address the question of “who is a tourist” (Cohen 2004) are inherently problematic and frequently rely on overlapping classifications, such as “fuzzy sets” (ibid:18) to delineate the jumble of people and roles that make up international tourists. “Tourism is a fuzzy concept— the boundaries between the universe of tourist and non-tourist roles are vague and there exist many intermediate categories” (ibid:34). Yet, there exists an intuitive framework for categorising tourists. Cohen (ibid) points out that we all know one and, mainly due the difficulty of categorisation, we all probably are one. From the perspective of anthropology, the study of tourism “was generally critical and moralistic from the outset” (Douglass and Lacy 2005:119).

<sup>39</sup> Barribarto is the local pronunciation of Barrio Alto (The High Neighbourhood)

commercial accommodation available in the village is located in the new section, referred to locally as *la Punta* (the Point). There is a small hotel at the top of Calle San Sebastián; a modern hostel close to the graveyard; and a neatly tucked away apartment complex offering nightly, weekly and monthly accommodation. Many of the locals sold their houses in the historic section of the village and moved into modern houses in this area during the 1990s.<sup>40</sup>

### **Local Monuments: Sites of Memory**

As the bus pulls into Plaza del Ingenio that divides the old and new part of the village, locals purposefully disembark leaving tourists to search confusedly for the town. There is no signpost directing tourists to the tourism information office and no signpost that clearly points to a village centre.<sup>41</sup> Unsure of which way to walk, some head over to the horse and carriage tour guide and travel back out of the village in a southerly direction. Some perplexed tourists follow this route only to find it goes back to Nerja. Others discuss the Church they spotted on the bus as though it were the centre of the village. Meandering up Calle Real (formerly Calle Generalísimo Franco) in a northerly path is the most direct way to get to the old part of the village, but as it is uphill, full of steps and exposed to the afternoon sun, it is the least desirable route to take. An outdoor café with a large seating area is the preferred point of orientation for independent day-trippers. It was while sitting in this café that David Riordan decided to start guided tours of the village.

For those day-trippers who walk back along the route that the local bus took, they find a graveyard in the place where they thought there was a Church. It is well-

---

<sup>40</sup> There is a large hotel in the village, but it appears to be the latest victim of the global economic crisis. It has had three or four owners and/or tenants during the last few years. It closed for business in August 2012.

<sup>41</sup> Cafés, shops and businesses are spread out along Calle San Sebastián and Calle Real. While there is a plaza opposite the church in Calle Real, there is no village centre.

maintained and most of the tombs display fresh flowers indicating recent activity. Some of the older headstones simply contain the names of the deceased and have no religious symbols. Many of the headstones are encased behind glass frames and decorated with artificial flowers, photographs and religious symbols. The inscriptions etched into the tombs read like most headstones in any Western Christian graveyard. One, however, stands out. It reads:

*Manuel AGUDO Martin  
Murió por Dios y España  
En el Frente de Córdoba  
El 27 de Enero 1937 a los 19 años r i p  
Tus padres y hermanos no te olvidan  
(Manuel Agudo Martin  
Died for God and Spain  
In the front at Córdoba  
27 January 1937 aged 19.*

RIP. Your parents, brothers and sisters will never forget you)

Back in the bus arrival/departure zone, the surface of the street changes noticeably underfoot. From the smooth tarmac of Calle San Sebastián, the surface changes to decoratively patterned cobbled stones in la Plaza del Ingenio that lead upwards towards the historic section of the village. An unpainted seventeenth-century building, El Ingenio, stands above the Plaza del Ingenio. In the past, this was the residence of the Count of Frigiliana, Inigo Manrique de Lara, and it is now a working sugar cane factory. It produces local *miel* (honey) made from locally grown sugar cane that is sold throughout the village to tourists. Just past the combined Policía Local and Guardia Civil office, a ceramic plaque tells the history of the El Ingenio, mentions the fact that the “*los moros*” brought sugar cultivation to the village as a form of medicine, and contends that this is the last working sugarcane factory in Europe.

Another ceramic plaque stands out. It begins to interrupt the fully fledged Spanish flavour of the village. It reads, “Conjunto Morisco Mudéjar”.<sup>42</sup> As Calle Real leads up through the village, another signpost points the way up steps towards the medieval section of the village. It reads “Barribarto” and “Barrio Morisco Mudéjar”. Infused with language ideologies that “always seem to involve...hierarchical distinction [and] put people in their place” (Peterson 2003:20), there are a couple of things going on with this sign. Firstly, it is relatively new. Secondly, it privileges the local accent rather than the correct Castilian Barrio Alto. Finally, it is clearly stating that Muslims once lived here within the perimeter of this village and were either forced to convert to Christianity (*morisco*) or forced to be subservient to Christian rulers (*mudéjar*). Yet, although Muslim architecture and the presence of Jews in Spain are denoted through tourist monuments, such as the Alhambra Palace in Granada or the Synagogue in Toledo, the fact that Jewish or Muslim people may have lived within Spanish villages is rarely mentioned.<sup>43</sup> Thus, there is a subtle but significant distinction between naming a building that was once Jewish or Muslim as a monument from the past and naming the people that were once Jewish or Muslim who lived within an existing town.

While there are numerous architectural sites throughout Spain that indicate the presence of Jews and Muslims, the dominant narrative suggests little or no contact between the people who inhabited these places. This reinforces the idea that the contemporary population is ethnically, religiously and culturally Spanish. As Conchita notes:

---

<sup>42</sup> Morisco is a pejorative term that refers to Medieval Spanish Muslims who were forced to convert to Christianity. Mudéjar is a pejorative term that refers to Muslims who remained Muslims but were subservient to a Christian ruler (Harvey 1992:3).

<sup>43</sup> Daniela Flesler and Adrián Pérez Melgosa (2008) note an awkward lack of people and an abundance of empty monuments within national tourist drives in Spain that promote *convivencia* and seek to “discover” Spain’s Sephardic past.

If you want to know how people lived in Spain, you only have to look at Toledo. Yes, there were Jews. Yes, there were Muslims. But, they lived in separate quarters of the city. They were there together, but they lived in their own sections of the city. (Interview 2010)<sup>44</sup>

Flesler and Pérez Melgosa (2003:153-154) note similar segregating accounts of the past in Alcoy with respect to *moros y cristianos* festivals. Although the organisers of the festival admit that the name Alcoy is of Arabic origin, they suggest that Muslims did not live within the town limits, even though there is a Muslim section in the town. Flesler (2008:15) argues that this form of denial and silence is a key feature of contemporary Spanish identity, but one that is ambiguous enough to allow for a festival where the Christians expel the Muslims (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:154). The fact that a section of Frigiliana is named as a Muslim quarter is not enough to suggest a near interfaith utopia. However, *morisco* and *mudéjar* are categories of people and not categories of places. When combined with a festival that celebrates a plural past, the fact that people with a plural heritage are situated in the very centre of a village disrupts the idea that the contemporary population are of exclusively Spanish origin.

The decorative cobbled streets in the village of Frigiliana lead onwards through Calle Real, past the local town hall and down towards the Plaza de la Iglesia de San Antonio de Padua (formerly Plaza de José Antonio Primo de Rivera).<sup>45</sup> A curious symbol is etched into the notice board outside the town hall that reads, “Frigiliana: la

---

<sup>44</sup> Toledo is known as the City of Three Cultures. The city has been directly controlled by Christian rulers since 1085. While there are no festivals in Toledo that celebrate “three cultures,” the local town hall markets the city as an example of medieval tolerance. However, much like other heritage sites in Spain, Toledo articulates its medieval history through empty monuments to the past.

<sup>45</sup>St. Anthony of Padua was born in Lisbon in 1195 and entered the Augustine Order at the age of 15. He followed the footsteps of Franciscan martyrs whose relics had been brought to Lisbon from Morocco. He left Portugal in order to preach Christianity to the Moors, but returned to Spain due to his failing health. He died on 13 June 1231 and was buried in Padua, Italy, and was canonised the following year. “[T]he church-bells of Lisbon rang [on the first anniversary of his death] without ringers, while at Rome one of its sons [San Antonio de Padua] was inscribed among the Saints of God” (Butler 1894:237).

villa de las tres culturas”. The symbol is a Star of David, with a Christian Cross in the middle and dotted with a Crescent Moon at each point of the Star. The Andalusian flag, Spanish flag and European flag hang limply outside the town hall in the breezeless afternoon heat.

Narrow streets and steps meander throughout this section of the village. Restaurants and cafés appear from nowhere in this criss-crossing labyrinth of medieval dwellings. Small archways lead up and down to covered streets roofed with olive wood ceilings, a preferred medieval architectural feature. Calle Real leads down to the Church square. The main restaurant in this small square is closed during the afternoons, and most tourists seek shelter from the afternoon sun by going into the Church. A small cake shop always appears to lure weary tourists away from the square to the relative coolness of the side streets. Oddly, the square is frequently full of international wedding guests during Saturday afternoons. To say that they stand out is a slight understatement. Formal clothing purchased in northern European cities is not suitable for the August heat that sometimes reaches forty degrees. An entrepreneurial wedding planner in Nerja recently began to advertise an all-inclusive wedding service where the ceremony is held in Frigiliana, and the wedding party is held in a marquee outside a hotel in Nerja. More oddly, most of these wedding parties appear to be Irish, which seriously impacts upon my minority status in the village.

Symbols seem to appear in the least likely places in the village. Down a narrow street at the back of the Church, up a few steps and around a corner, water flows from three pipes. Three tiles etched with a Star of David, Christian Cross and reverse

Crescent Moon are mounted above the water pipes.<sup>46</sup> Past the Church and further down Calle Real the historic section of the village comes to an abrupt end. A monument, and the newly adopted symbol of the village, marks the end of El Barrio Morisco Mudéjar. It is a compound sculpture of a Star of David, Christian Cross and reverse Crescent Moon. A plaque below the monument reads: “*Tres Culturas, Dos Escultores y un Dios*” (Three Cultures, Two Sculptors and One God).

The end of the old town marks the beginning of newer developments in the village that straddle each side of Calle de Churruelo. The street turns sharply around the corner on the new Avenida Carlos Cano leading back to the new commercial centre in Plaza de las Tres Culturas.<sup>47</sup> On the right hand side, just before a Polish café, steps lead up to a lookout over the valley leading down to the Mediterranean Sea. A lone Andalusian flag is draped on a single flagpole. A small plaque at the base of the flagpole says:

*Del pueblo de Frigiliana y su gente a quienes sufrieron, a los que nunca  
volvieron a casa  
Homenaje y reconocimiento a todos los hombres y mujeres de Frigiliana que  
fueron víctimas de la guerra civil y del régimen Franquista  
En Frigiliana, a 22 de abril 2010*

For the village of Frigiliana and its people who suffered and never came home.  
A monument and acknowledgement to all of the men and women that were  
victims of the Civil War and Franco’s regime.  
In Frigiliana, 22 April 2010

Avenida Carlos Cano heads towards the main pedestrian entrance, where this journey began, to the Plaza de las Tres Culturas overlooked by the Plaza del Ingenio. In 2010, a new sculpture in the form of a bronze pyramid was erected in the centre of the roundabout that directs traffic out of the village. Etched into its three sides are the

---

<sup>46</sup> There is no local significance attached to the reversal of the Crescent Moon.

<sup>47</sup> Carlos Cano was a singer and poet who revived a traditional Andalusian style of performance. He proposed that Granada’s “traditional” public performances that celebrate Christian dominance should “be turned into a ceremony celebrating Granada’s Christian, Muslim, and Jewish cultures to breathe life into the city’s historic *convivencia*” (Aidi 2006:80).

Star of David, a Christian Cross and the Crescent Moon. Set in the main entrance for all buses, this bronze pyramid welcomes most of the visitors to the village. It sits in the middle of a water fountain and lights up the entrance to the village at night. The landscape of this place has changed little since the fifteenth-century, but this new addition, in such a prominent position, is rewriting *el pueblo*.

### **Twelve Ceramic Panels**

As the village reaches its peak, Barribarto, the buildings appear to get smaller and smaller. Twelve ceramic panels, installed in 1982, are dotted throughout the older stepped section of the village. They recount the history of a battle between Muslims and Christians at *la Batalla del Peñón* (The Battle of the Rock) in 1569. The panels describe the people, land and customs in the region leading up to a Muslim rebellion. They detail the presence of Muslims in the surrounding region and recount their journey to Frigiliana, which was seen as a secure fortress. The texts from ten out of the twelve panels are extracts from medieval chroniclers all of whom were Christians and all were employed by the Crown. Yet there is a clear sense of discomfort on the behalf of these authors to fully embrace the horrors of War or the expulsion of people who could have been classified as Spanish.

The local tourist office offers free guided tours of the ceramic panels, but there are no formal commemorative ceremonies celebrated at the panels. The panels are “sacred” insofar as visitors perform a near pilgrimage by climbing to each panel and contemplating their inscriptions, similar to the Catholic practice of attending the twelve Stations of the Cross at Easter. Yet, they are profane insofar as locals tend to pass them by, and it is only the tourists who appear to stop and read the panels.

The panels are situated somewhere between “hot” and “banal” varieties of locals symbols. Yet they flag a distinct version of history, identity and culture every day. The twelve ceramic panels fall somewhere between commemorative monuments and banal decorations. Michael Billig (1995:44) suggests the term “nationalism” is often reserved for “outbreaks of “hot” nationalist passion, which arise in times of social disruption.” Billig (ibid: 93) notes that national identity “is continually being flagged” on a daily basis. For the tourist, the panels are a “hot” point of crisis during the sixteenth-century. For the locals, they are a set of banal accounts of the medieval history of the village that they pass by daily. Tourists elevate the importance of the panels to something beyond daily routine, and locals witness the tourists’ appreciation for “their” medieval history. Thus the panels are situated somewhere between sacred and profane symbols because they mean different things to different sets of people.

The panels were installed as part of the “beautification” of the village initiated in the mid 1960s and part of a national plan to encourage tourism to isolated regions of Spain. While many were involved in the project, former *Unión de Centro Democrático* (UCD) Mayor Antonio Navas Acosta is frequently given credit for coordinating the rejuvenation of the village, initiating the installation of the panels and beginning a programme to conserve Frigiliana’s medieval architecture.<sup>48</sup> Thus it was a process that began as part of a national tourist plan during the Franco years, and was finalised during the transition to democracy, that initiated the unearthing of Frigiliana’s Jewish and Muslim heritage. This

---

<sup>48</sup> UCD were a right-wing party formed in 1977 and comprised of conservative politicians from within the Franco regime. They won 166 of the 350 seats in the 1977 elections and 168 seats in the 1979 elections. They formed minority governments on both occasions but only gained 6% of the vote in 1982. The party disbanded in 1983 (Hooper 1995:65).

eventually led to the celebration of plural identity during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* framed within national discourse relating to the recuperation of historical memory.

The texts within the ceramic panels explain Frigiliana's medieval history but, more importantly, they connect a contemporary and earlier practice of inscribing histories on public spaces. The installation of the panels coincides with Spain's transition to democracy. The twelve ceramic panels point to the manner in which a tradition of redefining history "emerges at particular conjunctures, within particular fields of power, and within particular complex and uneven sedimentations of the past and the present" (Roseberry and O'Brien 1991:10). The newer symbols installed in the village may be seen as complementary to the twelve ceramic panels because they highlight a particular point of conjuncture during shifting relations of power at the end of the dictatorship. They both engender something Pierre Nora (1989:7) terms a "*lieux de memoire*" (site of memory) where past events become reified and appear to fit naturally onto the landscape of the village.

The final ceramic panel, entitled *holocosto* (holocaust), depicts the barren and now deserted land around Frigiliana. While all of the previous panels cite a selection of recent and medieval chronicles of the land, people, identity and events leading up to the final battle on 11 June 1569, this last panel introduces the voice of a remaining Muslim. As with all of the other panels, the titles were devised in 1982. The title of this final panel, "Holocaust" is clearly an emotive term and, in the context of the end of the dictatorship and the transition to democracy, it is a bold statement about atrocities in Spain's Christian past. The text reads:

An anguished silence enveloped Frigiliana. All that remains is the deserted mountain, the dead bodies and the living voice of Martin Alguacil: "In

defending our freedom we died fighting. Our motherland will regain what she produced. Those who do not have graves will have the sky to cover them. Let God prohibit anyone from saying that the men of Bentomiz were not prepared to die for their homeland.” (Navas Acosta 1999)

Navas Acosta (1999) notes a prying question that is yet to be answered, and one that is of central concern with respect to history, tradition and notions of identity in contemporary Frigiliana and Spain. Did all the Muslims leave? Or maybe it is better to ask, is there a footprint of Islam, of a Berber heritage or of mixed people left in Frigiliana? The dominant monocultural narrative takes the view that all the Muslims were forced out of Spain in the early seventeenth-century. Therefore, all that remains is a pure Spanish Christian people. Most, if not all, of the Christians and Muslims who fought and died at the Battle of the Rock in 1569 came from somewhere else, yet the question remains and directly relates to ideas surrounding tradition, heritage, ethnicity and culture.

The Battle of the Rock in Frigiliana (1569) brought 800 years of Islam to an end in Spain. Yet, the “idea” to memorialise the battle began as part of a commercial strategy during the end of the Franco regime and initiated a quest to celebrate the village’s plural heritage that culminated in the invention of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The events of the battle are primarily based on the accounts of medieval Christian chroniclers, some of whom were present while others remained in Granada. This was a horrific battle and heavy casualties were inflicted upon all participants, but as Navas Acosta suggests, rather than a battle fought between two distinct peoples or two distinct nations, this was just one battle amongst many other civil wars within Spain. Navas Acosta was a mayor in Frigiliana during the transition, and a member of the right-wing, essentially Francoist, UCD. But, he counters the “idea” that a pure Christian Spanish people rid Spain of a “foreign” people and suggests that Muslims could have been classified as Spaniards.

If Franco was carrying on the work of *los Reyes Católicos* and their immediate heirs, the empathy and compassion expressed in the panels opposes the notion that medieval Spain dispassionately dispensed its brutal expulsion of Muslims. As James C. Scott (1990:3) suggests, while the hidden transcript within forms of domination may mask a menacing power, it is one that never quite controls all aspects of everyday life. The twelve panels are evidence of contradictions within the structures of the Franco regime and demonstrate a struggle between dominant and subordinate ideologies. This contradictory nature of a hidden transcript articulated through history may be interpreted as “the small arms fire” of resistance (Scott 1987:1). It points to the manner in which “the frontier between the public and the hidden transcript is a zone of constant struggle between dominant and subordinate—not a solid wall” (Scott 1990:14). Thus, Frigiliana’s twelve ceramic panels highlight a struggle for the control of dominant and subordinate transcripts that emerged initially from within the ranks of the dictatorship. The frontier between public and the hidden transcripts is firmly fixed onto the solid walls of the village.

### **Naming and Renaming the Village**

Following the arrival of Nationalists in 1937, the streets of the village were rebranded with suitable reminders of dominance, such as Calle Generalísimo Franco and Plaza de José Antonio. They were renamed again in 1986 as Calle Real and Plaza de la Iglesia. While specific monuments to past conquests may become soulless reminders of events, street names are lived everyday as a “powerful mechanism for the legitimation of socio-political order” (Azaryahu 1996:311). They are an instrument of transformation that renders the official version of history onto

social settings.<sup>49</sup> Possessing the “ability to control the meanings of such settings is an important expression of power” (Entrikin 1991:52). Monuments may be a focal point for orchestrated annual commemorative occasions, but street names introduce ideologies into everyday language (Azaryahu 1996:311). With respect to ancient historical monuments that appear to fuse with the landscape, Smith (1988:186) suggests that they have “grown into nature” and become “indispensable components of our imaginative landscapes and therefore essential ‘foundations’ for the revived life of the *ethnie*.” However, renaming streets not only elevates particular historical acts to the status of events that “embody our deepest and most fundamental values” (Schwartz 1982:377), it is a manifestation of values lived through everyday encounters with banal symbols. Benedict Anderson (1991:252) notes that censuses create “identity categories,” maps give shape to “imagined communities” and “museums, and the museumizing imagination, are both profoundly political.” While essential, these components within nation building projects remain an idealised abstraction in the imagination of non-face-to-face communities. Street names introduce historical terms directly into face-to-face vernacular activities and “[r]enaming streets (and other public spaces) has an immediate effect on daily life, on language, and on space” (Azaryahu 1996:318).

The various symbols, signs and place names identified in this description of Frigiliana relate to the impact that shifting global forces have had on the changing face of the village. Moreover, they have introduced a new vocabulary into the local language that not only symbolises versions of histories, but reifies and articulates a new version of culture. The most recent changes to the village are the new apartment

---

<sup>49</sup> “Madrid alone is home to some 360 streets bearing the names of people or acts associated with the Franco regime” (Encarnación 2008:48).

buildings and Plaza de las Tres Culturas, built during the property boom predicated on a non-stop growth in tourist numbers and property values. The use of names and renaming public places “is instrumental in the transformation of the urban environment into a virtual political setting” (Azaryahu 1996:311). Accordingly, the multiple compounds of the Star of David, Christian Cross and Crescent Moon symbols redefine and transform the environment of Frigiliana into a virtual three cultural setting.

When framed in historical terms, that which appears to be contemporary depends on moments in various cycles of shifting national politics, global economics and shifting local definitions of history. Frigiliana is a symbolic transmission system where the streets of the village carry contested messages from the past. The point where tourism, local symbols and history converge is not just a contradictory situation, nor is it just a mutually beneficial relationship. Rather, it is essential to the formation and reformation, definition and redefinition of symbols in the village through which history is concretised in a literal sense in plaques, cement, ceramic tiles, steel and bronze.

Messages from the past are being redefined and contextualised in the present in Frigiliana and culture, tradition, heritage and identity are being rewritten onto the walls of the village. The numerous new symbols placed on the streets of the village since 2006 combined with a political programme to name new constructions Parque de Andalucía, Plaza de las Tres Cuturas and Avenida de Andalucía, culminated in 2012 with the installation of a monument engraved with the words of *El himno de*

*Andalucía* penned by Blas Infante.<sup>50</sup> Redefinitions of place are being transmitted through the landscape in a process that augments, validates and inscribes the new name, *la villa de las tres culturas* upon the village. Most importantly, the introduction of new names into everyday speech reifies a particular version of the past.

It could be suggested that there was a natural progression of events in this place, a kind of inert evolution of things that has realigned symbols in keeping with continuously shifting attitudes. It could be suggested that the baton in the relay race of civilisation is being passed between groups as the “bad guys” are being redefined as “good guys”. By redefining the “villains” as the “heroes,” the streets of Frigiliana reconfigure Nationalist-Catholic propaganda that endures into the present.<sup>51</sup> As part of a process to capture a new tourist market, Frigiliana chose the only logical option available and began to preserve its medieval heritage and recuperate its forgotten history.

While this appears to follow a logical path which began at the end of the dictatorship, the same cannot be said for other villages in the region. Indeed, it is fair to suggest that the very idea of incorporating the “other” within festivals is completely at odds with public performances of culture that have emerged since the end of the dictatorship. New *moros y cristianos* festivals have been increasing steadily since the end of the dictatorship (Harris 1994:45) and are essentially a “dehistoricized performative classification [of] (winners and losers, insiders and

---

<sup>50</sup> Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas Infante (1885-1936) is the “Father” of Andalusian nationalism. A convert to Islam, Infante designed the current Andalusian flag, penned the lyrics to their national anthem and lobbied for Andalusian independence during the Second Spanish Republic. He was summarily executed in 1936 when Seville fell to the Nationalists at the beginning of the Spanish Civil War.

<sup>51</sup> Nationalist-Catholicism was the preferred Nationalist ideological label for Spanish fascism.

outsiders, etc” (Narotzky and Smith 2006:29). While Frigiliana uniquely recasts its contemporary identity as it uncovers its plural past, other regions continue to reinvent public celebrations that either demonise or orientalise the “other” during elaborate re-enactments of medieval battles (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:151) or recreate regionalist festivals that celebrate primordial and exclusively local identity (Noyes 2003:2-8).

The particular realities of contested histories in Frigiliana explicitly shape the manner in which the symbols in the village are constructed. Although the twelve ceramic panels began the initial process of inscribing a local version of history onto the streets of the village, the more recent symbols are an altogether more banal component of everyday life. Roundabouts, car parks, shopping centres and unwaved flags move the construction of local monuments from a memorialised past into an everyday sense of local identity which “is at least as important as the memorable moments of flag waving” (Billig 1995:10). With respect to tombs of the unknown soldier, monuments to the past are often viewed as “objects deprived of their living soul” (Žižek 1989:x) celebrated principally because of the unknown character of their heroes (Anderson 1991:10). On the other hand, the power of commemorative roundabouts, car parks, shopping centres and street names memorialises living in the everyday (Azaryahu 1996:313-316; Nora 1989:7). This distinction between unknown monuments and known streets points to the management of “a common material and meaningful framework for living through ...that sets out the central terms around which and in terms of which contestation and struggle can occur” (Roseberry 1994:361).

By renaming streets in the village, the town hall has brought the language of three cultures into everyday conversation. As Domingo says, “we’ve always known that we were Jews, Christians or Muslims”, but expressing these views publically countered the known facts that all Jews and Muslims were expelled from Spain by 1609. In a rather odd game that Domingo plays, he identifies a person’s nationality or origin from the briefest glance. “See Juan over there,” Domingo says, “with his narrow features and long nose. He is a Jew.” He played this game continuously whenever we spoke. When I mentioned Eduardo, Domingo quickly interrupted with a single word interjection, “*moro*,” often reiterating stereotypical facial features, such as dark skin, round-faces or stocky builds. If I mentioned Paco, Domingo interrupted with “*es blanco, cristiano*” (he is white, Christian). Domingo stressed on numerous occasions that, “we always knew that we were Jews, Christians or Muslims,” and sometimes emphasised that “after all, it’s common sense.” But, as a result of bringing the language of the three cultures into everyday street names and roundabouts since 2006, a “common sense” uncoordinated notion relating to the village’s plural past has been transformed into a coordinated “good sense” idea about the present. Domingo’s playful game does not cause the offence that it once may have. In fact, in the context of the festival, his ability to apply stereotypical labels is welcomed by those who receive them. Mari asks Domingo “tell me where I’m from.” As Domingo pauses, he stares at Mari and to her delight says, “You are a mixture. More Jew than Christian. You are from Frigiliana.” With respect to himself he says, “*por supuesto, soy moro*,” (but of course, I’m a Moor), laughing as he points to his round face and rotund physic.

In everyday language, ethnicity describes a minority group which is culturally distinguishable from the majority. The term encompasses many different

groups in situations that range from “New York Jews to the Yanomamö in Brazil” (Eriksen 2001:262). Within anthropology, ethnicity may be used to describe majority groups and the relationship between groups “whose members consider each other culturally distinctive” (ibid.). A primordialist view suggests that ethnicity is based upon a deep primordial attachment to a group or culture. This view of ethnicity asserts that society is an extension of kinship groups and, as such, ethnicity is both kinship and culture. From this perspective, ethnicity is a natural genealogical component of a people.

In a Spanish national context, ethnicity, or “Spanishness,” refers to a people presumed to belong to the same society and who share the same culture that has been transmitted unchanged from generation to generation. From this perspective, Spanish ethnicity is seen as a form of extended kinship that is coeval with culture. Even though social structures may have emerged or declined, and were subject to change, the ethnic kernel of the Spanish nation is recurrent, trans-historical and impervious to external corruption. This view of ethnicity asserts that there is some real and tangible biological foundation to “Spanishness” that can be found in both the culture and the blood of contemporary Spaniards. Spanish ethnicity is both determined and limited by both genetic and geographical factors. Furthermore, this suggests that “Spanishness” is rooted in a genetic predisposition which becomes manifest in Spanish culture. As such, cultural performances, religion, language and identity are predetermined by biological factors. Strongly influenced by notions of evolutionism, primordial ethnicity can be conceptualized as based in biology and determined by genetic factors and kinship connections which continue “to be present even in the most industrialised mass societies of today” (van den Berghe 1981:35). This objectivist approach to ethnicity asserts that there is a tangible biological foundation

to ethnic identification which is a product of a shared history. This approach defines ethnicity structurally in terms of the geographical, linguistic, religious and racial characteristics of a given society.

However as Baltasar Fra-Moliner (2009:147-148) points out, the “pure” blood component within contemporary Spanish ethnicity is the product of a state sponsored political program of “whitening” which began following forced conversions to Christianity in 1492. As a result of the *Limpieza de Sangre* laws, Spanish ethnicity was naturalised the past was manipulated in order to justify a particular view of the present. Similar to all acts of historical erasure, the construction an uninterrupted creation myth that links contemporary ethnic identity in Spain with medieval Visigoth identity has had “lasting social consequences” (Fra-Moliner 2009:147).

With respect to conscious construction of a shared Spanish culture, collective identity, shared heritage and an affinity to the fatherland, the Spanish “state employed a variety of instruments, such as patronage of the arts, the work of the academies and the establishment of archaeological and historical museums” (Manzano Moreno and Sisinio Perez Garzon 2002:262) throughout the nineteenth century. In process that led to extensive artistic output, public space was inundated with marks of “Spanishness” which can be seen in the statues in public squares and gardens in cities and towns. Carlos Reyero (1999:393) notes that the monuments erected during this period exclusively depict Spanish figures, thus emphasising the historical value of ethnic membership. Similarly, paintings depicting historical themes commemorating glorious moments in the nation’s history “covered the walls of buildings that housed the offices of the new state” (Manzano Moreno and Sisinio Perez Garzon 2002:263). These paintings depict the conversion of the Visigoth king

to Catholicism, the surrender of Granada, the Christian assault on Constantinople and themes relating to Columbus and the Catholic Kings (Reyero 1992:50). They were valued “not only for their artistic qualities but also for their historical accuracy” (Manzano Moreno and Sisinio Perez Garzon 2002:263).

Fredrik Barth (1998:13) notes that ethnicity is an on-going negotiation of boundaries between groups of people. Emphasising the ethnic groups are not isolated, Barth (ibid: 10) notes that boundary maintenance and ethnic categories are most prolific amongst plural ethnic populations. Barth shifts the focus away from distinctive cultural content and cultural objects toward the social organization of culture difference emphasising that ethnic groups are situational rather than primordial. He notes that the emergence and persistence of such systems depends on a “high degree or rigidity in the interactional boundaries”, yet ethnic interrelations entail a variety of processes which “effect changes in individual and group identity” (ibid.:21). Thus, while relying upon genealogical assumptions, ethnicity is malleable and can be acquired as a result of both cultural and economic considerations. Moreover, ascription and self-ascription are key components within ethnic identity formation. As Anthony P. Cohen (1985:69) notes, “people become aware of their culture when they stand at its boundaries: when they encounter other cultures, or when they become aware of other ways of doing things, or merely of contradictions to their own culture.”

Unpacking the contradictions and contested histories upon which these notions of ethnicity are contingent is the focus of the following chapter, but while it is never mentioned locally in these terms, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not really about the recuperation of a hidden past or the recollection of forgotten memories. Nor is it about the revision of history in order to take account of the facts that have

been silenced by “successive regimes”.<sup>52</sup> Rather, the festival is about creating a public space to contest history. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* skips over the transition to democracy, sidesteps the Franco regime, bypasses the Civil War and heads straight for the recuperation of a medieval memory that was not experienced by the contemporary villagers. In doing so, arguments relating to “who we are, and where do we come from” emerge. The identity, tradition, heritage and culture being expressed during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* seeks to reshape contemporary allegiances, loyalties and local identities. It seeks to distance Frigiliana from a national cultural framework and highlight the combined population of the village as a distinct compound of people with a unique heritage. Unusually, the festival seeks to incorporate the people on the shore with those who arrived from afar.

---

<sup>52</sup> During the festival, "Successive regimes" is code for the Franco regime and the regimes promulgated myth that it was carrying on the work of *Los Reyes Católicos*.

# Chapter Two: Peace and Conflict in the Axarquía and Frigiliana

Spanish ethnicity is premised on the notion that a pure Christian people have endured in Spain since before the arrival of Islam in 711. Culture and identity oscillate around this apparently natural thing called ethnicity. Since the inception of the Spanish nation, the dominant ethnicity was the Castilian aristocracy (Smith 1988:139), and their pure blood, *ethnie*, forms the basis for the assertion that a monocultural people have occupied Spain through the ages. Smith (1998:194) notes how groups emphasise a racial component that lies at the heart of the “ethnic-genealogical” model of a nation which emerges when “*ethnie* [blood] is transformed largely under the aegis of an indigenous intelligentsia into an ethnic nation.” This ethnic-genealogical model of the nation “occupies a position of special prominence in the history of Spain” (Green 2011:199). It forms the basis for access to the contemporary category “Spanishness” and underscores Spain’s place within the European Union. Longstanding Jewish and Moorish influence in Spain questions the purity of Spanish blood and raise the “equally uncomfortable questions of Spain’s position in Europe and the role of Islamic Spain in the formation of Europe and the rise of Western civilization” (Aidi 2006:69).

In 1992, the Spanish state signed a cooperation agreement with Muslim communities in Spain that appears to provide an intrinsic place for Islam within contemporary Spanish identity (El Estado Español 2011). The agreement became *La Ley Orgánica de Libertad Religiosa Law 26/92* (The Religious Freedom Law). The agreement states that Islam has a “*tradición secular en nuestro país, con relevante importancia en la formación de la identidad española*” (secular tradition in our

country, with considerable importance for the formation of Spanish identity) (El Estado Español 2011). Flesler (2008:1) notes that this “matter-of-fact affirmation” appears to describe an uncontested version of history which most people would agree with. Nobody would deny that there were Muslims in Spain during the middle ages however vague contemporary understandings of the past may be. Yet, this statement causes significant division in contemporary Spain because “there is quite a distance from the idea that there were Muslims in Spain to the idea that Islam is an inextricable part of Spanish identity” (ibid.). Notwithstanding the sentiment within the agreement, Spanish school texts continue to deny the significant role of Islam in Spanish history (Herbert 1997:12). Herbert (ibid.) notes, “*la enorme distancia que existe entre la ley y el contenido de los textos enseñanza*” (the enormous distance that exists between the Law and the content of textbooks. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* attempts to reduce the enormity of this distance, reconfigure local understandings of history and teach the locals about their silenced heritage. It attempts to reconfigure local identity based upon a plural reading of the past which opposes foundational myths and primordial nationalisms that locate the origin of Spanish identity in Christian Visigoth Spain (409-711).

Visigoth rule is considered to be significant with respect to contemporary notions of Spanish identity. Notwithstanding the many different peoples who lived in Spain, the year 711 stands out as a landmark date in Spanish history. Christian rule of the peninsula ends abruptly with the arrival of Islam in 711, and a substantial but ever-receding part of Spain was controlled by Muslim rulers until 1492. These two dates frame contemporary discourse relating to Spanishness and identity, and while the arrival of Islam and the 1492 Christian re-conquest are not contested, different interpretations of the past inform different interpretations of contemporary identity.

The “purity” of Spanish blood relies on the assumption that a “pure” white Christian people once lived on the peninsula. It relies on the assumption that Jews, Christians and Muslims did not marry each other or produce interfaith offspring. Contemporary Spanishness assumes the foundational idea that the entire Jewish and Muslim population was expelled from the peninsula. Moreover, these notions of “purity” “ceased to be a socio-political prerequisite in Spain only in 1869” (Fra-Molinero 2009:148).

### **Frigiliana: Cambios y Permanencias**

The tagline “*Frigiliana: cambios y permanencias*” (changes and continuities) welcomes visitors to the archaeological display in Casa de Apero, Frigiliana. The display begins with artefacts from Late Palaeolithic nomads living and working in the Sierra surrounding the village. These artefacts connect the village with cave drawings, dating from 25,000 years ago, that were discovered in la Cueva de Nerja (Nerja Caves) in 1959. There is evidence of Phoenician settlers in the region dating from 800BC, evidence of Iberians living in the region and some evidence of contact with North Africa. Very little is known about the region at the end of the Roman Empire, except to say that Jews and Carthaginians settled along the eastern and southern coast of the peninsula. The last glass cabinet in Frigiliana’s archaeology museum displays some coins and states that the “Moors” were the final medieval invaders in the region. The text accompanying the last display notes that many people have travelled through or lived in this region for millennia, and tourists may be considered a continuation of the hordes of invaders that Frigiliana has experienced.

While Frigiliana and Spain have seen many different people and rulers come and go through the centuries, some key periods echo back and forth to the past when discussing contemporary Spanishness and identity in Frigiliana: Visigoth Spain (409-711); (Muslim Spain 711-1492); the Christian *Reconquista* (722-1492); the Battle of the Rock of Frigiliana in 1569; loss of the Spanish empire in 1898; the Second Republic 1931-1939); the Spanish Civil War (1936-1939); and the Franco regime (1939-1975). These historic events and dates frame contemporary performances of culture in Spain. They shape and inform Spanishness, yet they are the very dates and events that are contested in Frigiliana.

### **Visigoth Spain (409-711)**

The Christian Visigoths ruled Spain before the arrival of a Berber force from North Africa in April 711. Visigoth Spain was a violent and intolerant society that persecuted the minority Jewish population.<sup>53</sup> Visigoths refused to adopt the Nicene Creed until 589, and it was not until 635 that all Visigoth bishops accepted a unified Roman Catholic creed.<sup>54</sup> While the Visigoths managed to hold on to the control of the entire state and religion, they never “managed to endow her [Spain] with

---

<sup>53</sup> The adoption of the Nicene Creed by the Visigoths initiated a process of forced conversions and forced extractions of professions of faith from Jews, backed up in the first instance by the threat of death. A complex set of everyday controls were imposed on the minority Jewish population that included the prohibition of food and language (Halsall 1998). Jews were forced to integrate and marry within the Christian population and Jewish children had to be raised as Christian.

<sup>54</sup> Visigoths followed an Arian or semi-Arian creed which differed from Roman Catholicism with respect to the status of Jesus Christ. Visigoth Christianity derived from the teachings of the Egyptian Christian Arius and did not conform to the first ecumenical council’s Nicene Creed adopted in 325. Arianism and semi-Arianism taught that Jesus was not quite divine but not quite human. Although Christian, Visigoths refusal to accept the Nicene Creed caused distrust amongst Spain’s clerics. In 589 at the Third Council of Toledo, Visigoth King Reccard I adopted the Nicene Creed “motivated by genuine faith, political savvy, or more likely a combination of both” (Lowney 2006:24). This eventually led to all Visigoth Arian bishops professing Jesus to be both a true god and a true man, thus geographically unifying Roman Catholicism as the religion of the state for the first time between 635 and 711.

prosperity” (Lowney 2006:25).<sup>55</sup> Although the Visigoths practiced Roman Catholicism for just seventy six years, they are seen as being the harbinger for a latent and primordial “pure” Spanish ethnicity. Indeed, Sánchez Albornoz’ (1975) argument with respect to *coexistencia* is premised on the notion that Visigoth Spain was a homogenous proto-nation and the prototype for contemporary Spanishness. Contemporary interpretations of *convivencia* and *coexistencia* imagine different accounts of Visigoth Spain that fundamentally inform the significance of the arrival of a Berber force in 711.

### **Muslim Spain 711-1492**

In 711, Christian rule of the peninsula ends abruptly with the arrival of Islam.<sup>56</sup> Jack Goody (2005: 33-45) contends that Muslims lived in, traded with and mixed with people in Spain from the inception of Islam as a religion in 635. Furthermore, he argues that religion was not a defining mark of identity within medieval North Africa or Europe. In keeping with the argument presented by Américo Castro (1971), Goody (2005: 38) suggests that the commercial and political concerns of the ruling classes were veiled in religious terms which led to the construction of artificial

---

<sup>55</sup> During 710 and early 711, Visigoth King Roderic and his army were busy suppressing a Basque rebellion in northern Iberia. Seventh century chronicler Isidorus Hispalensis closes his encyclopaedic history of the Visigoth kings by saying, “in the arts of war they are quite spectacular” (quoted in Lowney 2006:27). Lowney asks, “What army could ever conquer such a people?” And he notes that in 711, “Spain would find out soon enough” (ibid.).

<sup>56</sup> In late April 711 Tariq crossed the Mediterranean Sea and arrived in the Iberian Peninsula. Tariq defeated Visigoth King Roderic on 19 July and assisted by the local Jewish community, who had been suffering years of oppression at the hands of their Visigoth rulers, the Berber force laid siege to the city of Córdoba. Jewish guards of the city “rejoiced at being linked to their co-religionists in the East, including Jerusalem itself” (Goody 2005:20). The swift conquest of the Peninsula and the generous treaties negotiated between Tariq and Spanish nobles suggests a potential era of stable government. However, the new rulers succumbed to similar political infighting that had plagued the Visigoths. Musa Ibn Nosseyr arrived in *al-Ándalus* in 712 and was unhappy with Tariq’s lofty ambitions. He promptly “thrashed Tariq with his riding crop, rebuked him for overstepping his authority, and demoted him” (Lowney 2006:38). Similarly, Musa Ibn Nosseyr was summoned to Damascus and “deemed an overreacher and paraded around...with a noose around his neck” (ibid: 39). His son, Abd al-Aziz Ibn Nosseyr, remained in *al-Ándalus* as its first governor and took King Roderic’s widow as his wife. Abd al-Aziz either converted to Christianity or began to behave as if he were a European noble—wearing a crown and asking people to bow when they entered his presence. Regardless of which account is true, Abd al-Aziz’s lieutenants were incensed by his behaviour, and they promptly murdered him (Lowney 2006).

differences between Jews, Christians and Muslims. Daniela Flesler (2008:59) suggests that the apparent “invasion” of the “Moors” “represents for the Spanish nation one of its most important foundational myths.” As part of a process that politicised religion, she suggests that the “basic story of national loss” (ibid.) has been written and rewritten by medieval Christian and Muslim chroniclers and contemporary Spanish authors, such as Juan Goytisolo’s *Reivindicación del conde don Julián* (1999). She argues that the “lost Spain myth” is deeply ingrained within the contemporary Spanish imaginary, but it is based upon the false assumption that an invasion force unified under the banner of Islam attacked a unified Christian Spain. Although a Berber force arrived in Spain in 711, they were invited to defend the honour of the Christian lord of Ceuta in North Africa, and this was not a religious war.<sup>57</sup> In short, Flesler (2008:59-60) argues that there was social and cultural contact between Muslims and Christians before 711.

In the early eight-century, the political and religious landscape of medieval Iberia was in continuous flux and cannot be described as either Muslim or Christian. Although this was a hierarchical society, Jews and Christians held prominent political, commercial and military positions. For the everyday people, Jewish or Christian, the Islamic conquerors introduced a level of political stability during the middle of the eight-century and introduced a material culture laden with art, literature, mathematics, science and fashion. Muslims introduced “cotton, figs, spinach and watermelon” (Lowney 2006:5) and new irrigation systems that maximised agricultural production. Christians under Muslim control relished in hot

---

<sup>57</sup> According to the ninth century chronicler Abd-el-Hakem (ca.860), Ilyan Lord of Septa began communicating with a Berber Musa Ibn Nosseyr’s military commander Tariq ibn Ziyad. Ilyan had sent his daughter to be educated in the court of Roderic, and she became pregnant for him. Having heard the news Ilyan said: “I see for him no other punishment or recompense, than that I should bring the Arabs against him” (Ibn el-Hakem ca.860). Ilyan contracted Tariq ibn Ziyad to seek recompense and, following some negotiations, vessels and a landing site were supplied.

water public baths and dressed in colourful fashions (Goody 2005:15). The Emir's capital of Córdoba, with some hundred thousand residents dwarfed every other city in Europe. An expansive library, Hindu-Arabic numerals, philosophy and new medical techniques transformed everyday life.

### **Christian Reconquista (722-1492)**

In 722, the *Reconquista* begins when the Visigoth noble Pelagius of Asturias wins the Battle of Covadonga, yet there is no evidence to suggest that this was an attempt to resuscitate the Visigoth Kingdom. Both Goody (2005) and Harvey (1992) argue that while Islamic principalities were being pushed back to Andalusia between 722 and 1492, battle lines were not initially drawn based upon religious affiliation.<sup>58</sup> Yet this single event in 722 is often presented as evidence that a primordial Christian people battled through the centuries to recapture Spain from its foreign rulers. This is despite the fact that Pelagius of Asturias' plural ethnic origins would preclude him from obtaining contemporary "Spanish" status. Use of the term *Reconquista* with respect to 722 is contentious. From the perspective of *coexistencia* and the Nationalist version of history, the term *Reconquista* connects their illegal military coup in 1936 to a medieval battle to rid Spain of "foreign" invaders. Yet there is no evidence to suggest that the battle in 722 was connected to a religiously motivated desire to re-conquer Spain. Propaganda leading up to the Spanish Civil War drew upon medieval myths in order to win the support of the population. Religion was consciously conflated with Spanishness and the Nationalists labelled the legitimate Republic anti-religious, thereby labelling it "anti-Spanish".

---

<sup>58</sup> Charles Martel's son, Pepin the Short, recaptured Narbonne, France, from its Muslim rulers in 759. While contemporary battle lines and affiliations appear to be based on the label Muslim and Christian, these categories do not accurately define warring factions during the late eight century. Charlemagne, son of Pepin the Short, militarily supported the Abbasid Muslim faction in Spain. Following a trade mission to Muslim Barcelona in 788, Charlemagne's Christian army was attacked and defeated by a Christian Basque army at the Battle of Roncevaux Pass (Goody 2005).

In keeping with Castro's notion of the politicisation of religion, 1492 is probably the most seminal date in Spanish medieval history. As Castro (1971) argues, religion became a significant political concern at the end of the thirteenth-century and united under the banner of Christianity, *los Reyes Católicos* conquered the last remaining Muslim Kingdom in Granada. Frigiliana was part of the receding Muslim Kingdom of Granada. A truce between the Kingdoms of Castile and Granada, drawn up in 1475, was extended by the Reyes Católicos in 1476 formally stabilising somewhat relations between the two kingdoms until 1481 (González Jiménez 2002). At best, peace on the frontier was described by de Mata Carriazo (2002: 130) as "diminished warfare". War was not the organised action of the whole of one group against another, and violence in one geographic region of the frontier was "perfectly compatible with peaceful and even harmonious relations in another" (ibid.). Neither were these local and regional outbreaks of violence matters of the state or monarchs, as disputes in particular frontier zones were resolved by parties on both sides at a micro rather than a macro level. Following the Christian conquest of Málaga in 1487, Frigiliana was administered by the city of Vélez-Málaga.

The fall of the Kingdom of Granada to *los Reyes Católicos* in 1492 radically altered politics and religion in Frigiliana. Forced religious conversions to Christianity began when the Alhambra Decree ordered the expulsion of Jews from the Kingdom of Spain by 31 July of that year. All Muslims were forced to convert to Christianity<sup>59</sup>. In Frigiliana, the full extent of forced conversions was not experienced until the middle of the next century as restrictions imposed by the Real Pragmática de Felipe II in 1567 prohibited *moriscos* from carrying arms, speaking or writing in Arabic or wearing their traditional clothing.

---

<sup>59</sup> Converts to Christianity, above the age of five, were eventually expelled from Spain in 1609.

## The End of Islamic Rule, 1492

The fall of the Kingdom of Granada to *los Reyes Católicos* in 1492 radically altered politics and religion in Frigiliana. Forced religious conversions to Christianity began when the Alhambra Decree ordered the expulsion of Jews from the Kingdom of Spain by 31 July of that year. In Frigiliana, the full extent of forced conversions was not experienced until the middle of the next century as restrictions imposed by the Real Pragmática de Felipe II in 1567 prohibited *moriscos* from carrying arms, speaking or writing in Arabic or wearing their traditional clothing.

The *moriscos* of the Alpujarras rebelled against these punitive laws and the rebellion spread throughout eastern Andalusia arriving in Frigiliana in June 1569. Chronicler Don Diego Hurtado de Mendoza (1627) describes the tranquil pastoral life enjoyed in Frigiliana and highlights some of the initial causes of the rebellion. Hurtado de Mendoza (1627), a Christian chronicler, notes the religiously motivated harassment suffered by the local population at the hands of the Spanish Inquisition for almost 80 years. This included the confiscation of land, fiscal pressure and the prohibition of traditional customs and religious practice. It is worth mentioning that Don Diego Hurtado de Mendoza was born in Christian Granada in 1503 and became governor of the city. Yet, his account of the rebellion appears to be sympathetic to the plight of people he considers to be “Spanish” Jews and “Spanish” Muslims although he simultaneously glorifies the Christian victory.

A local descendant of the governors of Frigiliana, Hernando El Darra, led the morisco uprising in Axarquía in 1569. They gathered at the Rock of Frigiliana and successfully defended against attempts by Royal troops under the command of the Mayor of Vélez Arevalo Zuazo to crush the rebellion. Reinforcements from Felipe II’s army led by the Commander of Castile, Luis de Zúñiga y Requesens, arrived in

Frigiliana to end the revolt. 5,000 Royal soldiers encountered 4,000 *moriscos* in Frigiliana. According to Luis de Marmol y Caraval (1897), approximately 800 Royal troops were killed during the battle and 2,000 *moriscos*, including women and children, lost their lives. The remainder fled throughout the region and were branded bandits and criminals. El Darra continued to resist the Royal troops in the mountainous area of the Sierra Almirajara surrounding Frigiliana but, outnumbered by Royal troops, his campaign of rebellion did not succeed. The skeletal remains of the 2,000 Spanish Muslims killed in 1569 are said to be the foundations of Calle San Sebastián in contemporary Frigiliana.

### **Nineteenth and Early Twentieth-Century Frigiliana**

Spain was occupied by Napoleon Bonaparte between 1808 and 1814, and Frigiliana was occupied in 1810. The formidable peaks of the Sierra Almirajara were the ideal launching pad for a guerrilla war against the unwelcome French invaders. The disappearance of some French soldiers and the discovery of their dead bodies buried in a basement in the village resulted in several hangings perpetrated by the furious French invaders. The place where they died is known to this day as *La Horca* (the gallows).

Wars, political instability, anarchism and an economic crisis caused by a phylloxera plague (vine disease) characterised nineteenth-century Frigiliana. In 1884, earthquakes destroyed many parts of Málaga and Granada and several houses collapsed in the village. Bandits terrorised the local countryside, and an oligarchic system of landowners (*latifundistas*) compounded the poverty and injustices meted out against the local population. A lack of health and education facilities contributed

to the poverty suffered in the region and at the beginning of the twentieth-century life expectancy “was a little more than 30 years” (Baird 2008:5).

At the turn of the century, the “Spanish colonies of Cuba, Puerto Rico and the Philippines were all lost to the United States” (Forrest 2000:1), and the loss of its empire in 1898 had an immediate and dramatic effect on the internal Spanish economy. Spain was instantly deprived of its external markets which initiated “an intermittent and acrimonious debate” (Graham 2005:2) about how the Spanish economy should be modernised and who should pay for it. Spain’s progressive industrial elites, particularly the Catalan-based textile sector, “resented the hold on political power of the reactionary landowners” (Forrest 2000:1). Captains of industry clashed with the more powerful interests of the agrarian sector who dominated southern Spain. The majority of Spain’s people lived in rural villages and small towns.

The bulk of the population in central and northern regions were small landholders and peasant subsistence farmers. The relationship between the population and the Church was principally pastoral and rigidly bound to custom and tradition. Yet in northern Spain, the Church often provided practical support in the form of rural credit banks. The monarchy was seen as the most desirable form of government that would protect society from encroaching notions of political liberalism in northern communities that cherished the “traditional” socio-cultural order. The Catholic Church had little authority amongst urban classes, but it had long lost its support amongst the poor of the rural south. Agriculture in southern Spain was dominated by large estates worked by landless day-workers who constantly struggled against starvation. Local priests aligned themselves with *latifundistas* and the police— thus, the Church was viewed as a perpetuator of an oppressive landed

oligarchy. The *latifundistas*' practice of growing single crops meant that labourers relied on seasonal work and a single source of income. Denied financial assistance from the state, labourers' dependency on a single seasonal source of income turned them into "virtual slaves at the disposal of landlords and estate bailiffs" (Graham 2005:4). Landless labourers "hated the conservative-minded smallholders, the Catholic favourites and potential allies of the landowners" (Forrest 2000:1). Brutalised by *latifundistas*, estate supervisors, local police and the Guardia Civil, the rural poor became ardently anti-clerical. Religion was turned into a vicious and divisive issue based on politics and invented distinctions relating to class. In short, the small holding peasants aligned themselves with the state and the *latifundistas* in opposition to the interests of the landless proletariat.<sup>60</sup>

As a result of the loss of empire, the now overcrowded officer corps of the army was deprived of any significant external military role. Outraged at attempts to reform their privileged position, they were determined at all costs to maintain their income and prestige. Moreover, the swelling ranks of Spain's dominant military elite had bred a generation of officer cadets who saw themselves as the defenders of Spain's unity and hierarchy "and of its cultural and political homogeneity" (Graham 2005:5). Within the officer corps, a powerful myth emerged that civilian politicians were responsible for the loss of empire. When a 15-year-old Francisco Franco entered the military academy in 1907, this myth was already deeply ingrained within the officer corps. By 1917, the army officer corps established their own unions, "still blaming the politicians for the defeats of 1898" (Forrest 2000:1).

---

<sup>60</sup> Much like France of the 1850s, the great mass of the Spanish nation during the early twentieth-century was also "formed by the simple addition of homonymous magnitudes, much as potatoes in a sack form a sack of potatoes" (Marx 1913:145).

News of the Spanish military defeat in Morocco in 1921 deepened national anxieties. Pilloried by the subsequent report of the defeat, the reputation of the army's elite officer corps diminished and "the King's role in the campaign was investigated by parliament" (Forrest 2000:2). With the Church under threat from liberalising government policies and *latifundistas* undermined by potential land reforms, the flashpoint for General Primo de Rivera's coup d'état in 1923 came in Málaga (Preston 1994:11). A non-commissioned officer was murdered, but when his suspected killer, a corporal, was pardoned by the King, "the officer corps felt doubly humiliated. The corrupt state had to be seized" (ibid.).

In an attempt to restore order and quell civil unrest, General Primo de Rivera's "soft" military coup d'état was welcomed by King Alfonso XIII. The economic boom of the 1920s eased the early years of the dictatorship, but demands for political reform from amongst special interest groups continued throughout the dictatorship. While political parties were illegal, professional associations spread profusely during the 1920s as teachers, clerks and doctors began a process that saw "sectors of Spain's middle classes republicanize themselves" (Graham 2005:5). Accelerated migration to the cities and the increased access to radios in urban centres amplified the cultural and social distance between cities and rural Spain. Despite the dictatorship's initial impetus to restore conservative order, contradictory policies that attempted to reform the army and address labour rights created social unrest. *Latifundistas* in southern Spain thwarted any extension of the 1928 urban labour rights when they resisted the introduction into the countryside "of compulsory wages and conditions arbitration committees" (Forrest 2000:4).

Social and economic reform was an essential element of national regeneration as the regime initiated public works programmes and great hydro-

electric schemes which “led for a time to near-full employment: new roads were built and old ones tarmacked” (ibid.). In 1929, both the Ibero-American Exposition in Seville and the Barcelona International Exhibition promoted tourism in Spain and celebrated national regeneration and Spain’s past and present achievements. Electric street lighting came to Frigiliana in the early twentieth-century and work began on a road to the nearby coastal town of Nerja. By 1929 the village of Frigiliana boasted “four olive oil mills, three flour mills, one perfume factory, four apiarists, one sugar refinery, one electricity works, one vet, two barbers, one shoemaker and a doctor” (Baird 2008:6). The population of the village was 2,238. Despite minor social and economic improvements in the village, dramatic events during the 1930s would engender long-standing divisions and abruptly affect the lives of locals.

### **The Second Republic**

Due to a loss of support from the army and the King, the seven-year dictatorship of Miguel Primo de Rivera ended in January 1930 when he resigned and withdrew from politics. Primo de Rivera’s policy of promotion through merit in the army was supported by the officers in Spain’s elite Army of Africa (*Africanistas*) but was bitterly opposed by the traditionalist artillery corps, “who went on strike in 1926 and were involved in a coup attempt in 1928” (Forrest 2000:6). Opposition to the system based on seniority within the officer corps, a reduction in personnel and a reduction in pension entitlements, eventually brought the dictatorship to a whimpering end in January 1930. Primo de Rivera resigned and went into self-imposed exile in France. Primo de Rivera’s successor, General Berenguer, led a divided government that could not cope with the cacophony of demands for reform. Political parties were restored in 1930, but the restoration of the parliament (*Cortes*) was delayed until early 1931. Municipal elections in 1931 “were in effect a referendum on the

monarchy” (ibid: 2) and highlighted overwhelming popular support for Republicans and Socialists.

Following the municipal elections, the Second Spanish Republic established a government on 14 April 1931. “Four days after the municipal elections of April 1931, and two days after the provisional government inaugurated the Second Republic” (Forrest 2000:6), the reigning monarch King Alfonso XIII published his farewell speech. He declared that he was suspending his royal powers in order to allow “the nation decide his future: he hoped (in vain) to be recalled to the throne” (ibid.).<sup>61</sup> Although the middle class and urban proletariat votes gave the Republic their majorities in the cities, “the collapse of the monarchy was less the work of any single class than a result of the weakening of support for Alfonso in practically every segment of society” (Malefakis 1971:162). The new Republican government seized his property, “exiled him for life and launched a ferocious attack on the Church” (Forrest 2000:6).<sup>62</sup> When Alfonso XIII bid his farewell in 1931, the Second Republic was born.<sup>63</sup>

1930’s Spain was a backward agricultural country divided by brutal economic inequalities where “both leftist and rightist considerations of social organisation centred on the land” (Preston 1994:3). Seventy percent of the working population in the 1930’s census “described themselves as *jornaleros* (day laborers)” (Narotzky and Smith 2006:47). The Republic was seen by many as an opportunity to

---

<sup>61</sup> In exile in Italy during the Civil War, he financially supported the Nationalists and used his political influence with the Italian state to secure arms for the Nationalists.

<sup>62</sup> Alfonso XIII did not formally abdicate until 1941.

<sup>63</sup> While united in their disdain for the atheist Republic, the King’s exile reopened bitter historic divisions between two monarchist factions, each loyal to rival ascendancy lines within the Borbón dynasty: Alfonsists and Carlists. In 1932, the Alfonsists formed *Renovación Española* and courting military die-hards, they sent delegations to Italy to lobby the Duce and the Pope. The same year, Carlist supporters, *Comunión Tradicionalista*, formed paramilitary units (*requetés*) and, supported by militant Catholic priests, “drilled for the coming conflict” (Forrest 2000:9). Both factions cooperated as extra-parliamentary groups, “hatching plots to destroy the Republic” (ibid.).

reform Spain's outdated social structures but generated significant apprehension amongst the middle and upper classes. The monarchy symbolised the hierarchical nature of Spanish society from which the upper classes directly benefited. The Church reinforced the moral authority of the monarchy and maintained class divisions in Spain. However, the economic interests of the upper classes had always enjoyed the protection of the army during times of social tension. The coming of the reformist Second Republic significantly threatened the prevailing "traditional" and conservative order in Spain. It ousted the monarchy, separated Church and state and restructured the overmanned army within the first two years of its existence.

In contrast to the fears of the elite, "the expectations of the Left exploded in April 1931 in an atmosphere of popular fiesta ...in the workers' taverns of southern villages" (Preston 1994:1). Frigiliana, along with numerous municipal governments throughout Spain, was declared a Republican council. Locals who were considered to be wealthy were harassed by armed men demanding money. All the religious symbols and statues were tossed out onto the streets, gathered together and set alight. Farm animals were confiscated from farmers and taken for slaughter. Communists in the village prepared banquets for everybody to eat free of charge. During the first two years of the Republic, *bienio reformista* (two reformist years), Socialist members of a Republican coalition pushed for land reforms aimed specifically at alleviating the misery of the southern landless labourers. Wage and land reform disrupted the interests of the *latifundistas* who depended on the exploitation of day labourers working for a pittance during harvest times. The Socialists' reforms included improving working conditions and basic pay and "necessarily implied a redistribution of wealth" (Preston 1994:1).

Economic reform challenged the existing balance of power in Spain. Preston (ibid.) notes that the consolidation of the moderate and extreme right-wing factions in Spain was fundamentally a response to “these reforming ambitions of the Left.” In the midst of the global Great Depression, demands for improved labour conditions in Spain could not be sustained by higher profits. The Republic was established in a peaceful manner thus leaving the land-owning oligarchies and the industrialists’ traditional economic power base intact. As a result, the *latifundistas* in the south and industrialists in the north began to organise to block the Socialist’s labour and land reforms. Prominent right-wing organisations, such as the elite Jesuit-influenced Asociación Católica Nacional de Propagandistas (ACNP) and the mass political organisation of smallholding peasantry, Confederación Nacional Católico Agraria (CNCA), existed prior to the establishment of the Republic. However, these once disparate right-wing organisations began to consolidate under the banner of Nationalism, religion and monarchism.<sup>64</sup> Their consolidation proved so successful that they completely shattered the hopes of Socialists because they turned the Republic’s economic reforms into an argument about “foreign” ideologies, the Church and Spanish identity.

The Republic’s attempt at social reform and the separation of Church and state were presented by the ACNP and CNCA as anti-religious, thus garnering right-wing mass popular support. The Republic reversed Primo de Rivera’s policy of promotion in the army through merit which further deepened divisions between the *Africanistas* and the artillery corps, the two opposing sides of the army who would later clash during the Civil War. The Republic’s reform of the army secured the backing of the elite *Africanistas* for the Right. From its inception, the Republic was

---

<sup>64</sup> The monarchist dimension within right-wing organisations was frequently silenced in a cynical attempt to undermine the Republic from within (Preston 1994).

anti-monarchist and, when combined with its stated aims to concede regional autonomy, the Right presented “the Republic as unpatriotic and ready to divide Spain in the interests of foreign enemies” (Preston 1994:1). From a right-wing perspective, Catholic identity was Spanish identity, and the Republic was a threat to the three pillars of Spain: the Church, the Monarchy and the Army.

Prior to 1931, Spain had been divided into two antagonistic social blocs. In short, the Left was an amalgam of the industrial urban proletarians and rural landless proletarians, who were bitterly split between socialism and anarchism. On the Right, stood the Church, the army, the *latifundistas*, the industrial and mercantile bourgeoisie, and the Catholic conservative peasants and smallholding farmers. Following the establishment of the Republic, existing right-wing factions began to organise based upon class divisions. However, the Right masked the protection of their economic interests in propaganda that demonised the proletariat as anti-Catholic and “foreign” which in turn cast the Republic as anti-Spanish. The Right’s determined resistance to reform, reinforced in the first instance by violence, significantly contributed to the disruption of democracy in Spain. At the same time, the Left’s part ideology and rank and file aspirations saw them drift away from reform to “self destructive rhetorical revolutionism” (Preston 1994:2).

Generalísimo Francisco Franco’s celebrity status predated the Second Republic. As the youngest general in the elite *Africanistas* corps, he enjoyed popular notoriety, was courted by the right-wing media and regularly dined within the elite royal and upper class circles of 1920’s Spanish society. King Alfonso III was Franco’s best man, by proxy, in 1923 (Preston 1993). His reputation as an adept military strategist was forged, and overstated, from his military career in Morocco and his leadership of the *Fuerzas Regulares Indígenas* (Indigenous Regular Force)

during the Rif War.<sup>65</sup> Franco enjoyed rapid promotion in the *Africanistas* corps as a direct result of Primo de Rivera's policy of promotion through battlefield merit. During the first two reformist years of the Second Republic (*bienio reformista*), Franco in particular, and *Africanistas* in general, were sidestepped in favour of the Artillery officers and regiments within the Spanish army. During 1933 and 1935, when the Republic was controlled by a right-wing government, Franco's overzealous and violent role in crushing the 1934 miner's strike in Asturias reinforced his celebrated status as the defender of the unity of Spain. Deploying troops, aircraft and warships to crush miners who were armed only with dynamite, Franco said: "this war is a frontier war and its fronts are socialism, communism and whatever attacks civilization in order to replace it with barbarism" (quoted in (Preston 2010:47).

The Frente Popular (Popular Front) victory in municipal elections of 16 February 1936 marked a dramatic change in local and national politics. The triumph of the left-wing coalition provoked a mixture delight and turmoil throughout Spain. Amid all of this popular fervour, the town hall in Frigiliana was seized by members of the local Frente Popular. On 18 July 1936 a Nationalist-led military revolt drove the two oppositional notions of Spain into a bloody and long-lasting Civil War. There was violent reaction to the outbreak of Civil War in Frigiliana. It suffered serious direct effects during the initial stages of the Civil War with the perpetration of killings, harassment and violence from both the Nationalist and Republican sides of the conflict. Although there were atrocities committed by both sides during the Civil War, Preston (2012:65-71) notes that the Nationalists overstated Republican

---

<sup>65</sup> *Fuerzas Regulares Indígenas*, known as *Regulares*, were Moroccan volunteers who were officered by Spaniards. Similar to the French Foreign Legion, the *Regulares* were a mercenary force. They gained a scarring reputation during the Rif Wars for "taking no prisoners" which was employed to full effect during the Spanish Civil War (Preston 1994). The contemporary Spanish Army retains two *Regulares* regiments although current members are recruited solely from amongst Spanish citizens.

attacks on the clergy and the rich. While such attacks were perpetrated in the name of the Republic, they did not have the official support of the Republic. When the local commander of the Guardia Civil in Frigiliana publicly declared his support for the legitimate Republican government, “the barracks were sacked and the town council decided to install two classrooms in it” (Baird 2008:7). The parish priest fled the village seeking refuge amongst Nationalist troops.

### **The Spanish Civil War (1936-1939)**

Despite widespread right-wing media and military calls, Franco was the last of the military leaders to take up arms against the legitimate Republican government in 1936. As Preston (1994:7) notes, “Spanish army officers who took up arms in 1936 had a variety of grievances.” They were outraged at the Republic’s attempts to bring an end to their privileged position within civilian society and “infuriated by the Republic’s programme of conceding regional autonomy to the historic nationalities of Spain, Catalonia, the Basque country and Galicia” (ibid.).<sup>66</sup> *Africanistas* officers were obsessed with the idea of maintaining national integrity framed within propaganda cultivated by the right-wing press.

On 9 February 1937, rebel Nationalist soldiers assisted by Italian troops and Air Force entered Frigiliana. According to Norman Bethune, a Canadian doctor and member of the communist Mackenzie–Papineau Battalion (quoted in Baird 2008:9), refugees from Frigiliana joined the thousands of families, children and militiamen fleeing Málaga from the encroaching Nationalists. They were bombarded by Italian planes and warships on the road from Málaga, and “an estimated 3,000 to 5,000 people died on the road to Almería” (ibid: 9). Amid cheers of the nationalist chant

---

<sup>66</sup> Partido Andalucista seeks to include Andalusia within the category of “the historic nationalities” and seek constitutional parity with Catalonia, the Basque country and Galicia.

“*Arriba España*”, a Falange militia was formed in the village.<sup>67</sup> All weapons had to be handed in, and all refugees had to return to their homes. On 19 February 1937, the streets in Frigiliana were renamed: Generalísimo Franco, Queipo de Llano, José Antonio and 8 de Febrero.<sup>68</sup>

Anybody connected with the legitimate Republican regime was rounded up. Men were forced to drink castor oil until they vomited and women’s heads were shaved in a form of ritual humiliation that dehumanised the defeated population and publicly marked the body of the perceived enemy. Others, not so fortunate, were loaded onto trucks and driven to Torrox. Most of these were never seen again. Ad-hoc military courts imposed life sentences on those accused of being rebels, union members and so called “Reds”. On 21 May 1937 fourteen men died in the cemetery in Torrox. The registry record notes their cause of death as being “due to the discharge of firearms”. Eight of those who died that day were residents of Frigiliana (González López 2008:135):

1. Baldomero Cerezo Iranzo, Frigiliana Republican Mayor, 21/05/1937
2. Sebastián Conejero Espada, Frigiliana, Deputy Mayor, 21/05/1937
3. Eduardo García Platero, Frigiliana, Council member, 21/05/1937
4. Antonio Gutiérrez García, Frigiliana, Council member, 21/05/1937
5. Francisco García Martín, Frigiliana, Council member, 21/05/1937
6. José García Ramírez, Frigiliana, Council member, 21/05/1937
7. José Pérez Castillo, Frigiliana, Council member, 21/05/1937
8. Francisco Rojas Ramírez, Frigiliana, 21/05/1937

The 1930s ended in much the same manner as the 1560s, as troops motivated by religious fundamentalism and nationalism entered the village of Frigiliana. The

---

<sup>67</sup> The Spanish Francoist Party, *Falange Española de las Juntas de Ofensiva*.

<sup>68</sup> General Gonzalo Queipo de Llano y Serra was one of the initial leaders during the 1936 coup d’état. 8 de Febrero (8 February) was the day Málaga fell to Nationalist troops. A veteran of the Spanish American War (1898) and the Rif Wars in Morocco, Queipo de Llano played a central role in initiating the rebellion and according to Ian Gibson (1997:483) ordered the execution of Spanish poet and dramatist Federico García Lorca.

new political order had similar intentions to the invading troops during 1560: to unify Catholic identity and rid Spain of the presence of the “other”. Franco explicitly connected the Nationalist-Catholic agenda with carrying on the purging role of the *Reyes Católicos*. The faith of the losers in the Civil War became institutionalised within Nationalist propaganda and the organisation of the Francoist state (Móreno Gómez 1999). Religion and the purity of blood became the principal contemporary mark of Spanishness.

### **Frigiliana after the Civil War**

The Spanish Civil War ended when Generalísimo Francisco Franco proclaimed a Nationalist victory during a radio speech on 1 April 1939. A few months earlier, on 9 February, Franco proclaimed the Law of Political Responsibilities which retrospectively defined as criminal all Republican political activity and collaboration with the legitimate Republican government from 1934 onwards.<sup>69</sup> Although the last non-negotiable condition for a Republican ceasefire was a guarantee of no reprisals against the defeated Republican population, Franco responded by publishing the terms of the scarifying Law “which would allow the regime to implement blanket repression, and whose publication at this point [February 1939] was itself an act of war” (Graham 2005:111).

In Frigiliana, repression was swift, violent and constant during the 1940s and 1950s. So called “Reds” were tried for military rebellion and either sentenced to prison or sent to forced labour camps. The Sierra Almijara had provided a natural refuge for resistance and guerrilla warfare throughout Frigiliana’s history and, in the midst of this latest round of oppression, the Sierra was to act as a formidable fortress

---

<sup>69</sup> “It was not until 1969 that Franco decreed the ending of war crimes” (Narotzky and Smith 2002:205). However, the term “war crimes” only applied to Republicans.

for opponents to the Francoist regime— *Maquis* or guerrilla fighters, who continued the struggle after the end of the war.<sup>70</sup> While access to food was a constant struggle following the Civil War, Frigiliana’s small land holdings allowed the population to cultivate some crops.<sup>71</sup> Their plight was not as arduous as other villages in the region. Most of the arable land in the surrounding area was used for the large-scale production of sugar cane, and “hungry people from Nerja trudged up to Frigiliana to beg for food” (Baird 2008:11). Frigiliana’s mountainous terrain was not suitable for farming on an industrial scale.

On 20 November every year during the Franco dictatorship, a public ceremony was held to commemorate the anniversary of the death of the founder of the Falange José Antonio Primo de Rivera. The entire population of the village were walked in a procession from the Church to the front of the sugar factory where a large cross had been erected. “One by one the mayor called out the names of the villagers who had died [for “*Dios y la patria*” for God and the nation] in the Guerra Civil” (Baird 2008:14):

Antonio Julio Jiménez Navas,  
Antonio Cañedo Sánchez,  
Antonio Rodríguez Sánchez,  
Placido Ramos Platero,  
Manuel Aguado Martín,  
José Jaime Castillo,  
Bautista Cerezo Álvarez. (ibid.)

After each name was called out, the crowd responded “*presente*”. Finally, the name of José Antonio Primo de Rivera was called out. Fists raised up in the air in a Francoist salute, the Falange anthem *Cara al Sol* was sung by the entire crowd. The

---

<sup>70</sup> The name “*Maquis*” was borrowed from France and referred to the PCE (Communist Party of Spain) efforts to formally organise an anti-Franco campaign.

<sup>71</sup> Known as *Los años del hambre* (the hunger years), the early 1940s introduced starvation and disease on a scale “not seen in the Mediterranean since Biblical times” (Preston 1993:343).

Republicans who had died during the Civil War were not mentioned. “About them there was only silence, which continues to this day” (Baird 2008:14).<sup>72</sup> Republican sympathisers and their families who were not imprisoned or executed were constantly harassed by the Nationalists. Many locals note, almost nonchalantly, “my father was beaten with a stick everyday for years by the Guardia Civil,” (Domingo 2012) or “my grandfather was shot twice in the head with a pistol” (Juan 2012). Those who were remained in Spain were denied work and their families denied government jobs for the duration of the dictatorship. Food and access to work became a principal concern for those the regime labelled “Reds” and it “eclipsed politics as the universal topic of conversation” (Richards 1998:143). Richards argues that controlling access to food on an everyday basis was a method employed by Franco to control political opposition. Anyone who was considered to be a subversive by the regime had to report frequently to their local police station. Many took refuge in the Sierra, and many of those who fought on the losing side were criminalised as a result of the retrospective Law of Political Responsibilities. Others were often referred to as “common delinquents”.

An organised campaign of guerrilla resistance took place in the Sierra Almirajara during the late 1940s and the early 1950s. The resistance was funded by the Partido Comunista de España (PCE). Although directed against the forces of Francoism, the *Maquis* appropriated goods and monies from the local *latifundistas*, and kidnapped local “*ricos*” (rich) for ransom.<sup>73</sup> Numerous attacks were carried out by the *Maquis* against the Guardia Civil, and their legitimate campaign that sought to

---

<sup>72</sup> Susanna Narotzky and Gavin Smith (2002:203) highlight the present-day self-imposed silences in Spain with respect to speaking about politics in public. “During the Franco regime being *político* was not only bad (and sinful) but also dangerous, which is still vividly remembered.”

<sup>73</sup> While “*ricos*” is a relative term, *Maquis* kidnapped family members from amongst the landowners in the village.

restore the democratically elected government in Spain was classified “delinquent”, criminal and influenced by foreign ideologies. While the Guardia Civil coordinated the campaign against the *Maquis*, Fuerzas Regulares Indígenas established a base in Frigiliana in order to control the resistance. There are numerous documented accounts of “death by the discharge of firearms” in the village and surrounding regions (Baird 2008).

### **Remembering to Forget and Forgetting to Remember**

The Nationalists justified the Civil War by claiming they were defending the purity and unity of Spain and its people. This “purity” is based on the false assumption that seventy six years of Christian Visigoth Spain had continued uninterrupted through to the twentieth-century. They garnered mass popular support by labelling the Republic as anti-Catholic. They identified the Republic as a “foreign” ideology that was interrupting the natural order in Spain. The Visigoths, a mix of uncountable ethnicities from unknown origins, were presented as the harbinger of Christian Spain. By ignoring the fact that resistance against Muslim invaders was not motivated by either religion or a desire to resurrect a Visigoth Kingdom, the Francoist rewriting of history was able to connect the 722 and the 1492 Reconquista with the work of an imaginary primordial Spanish ethnic group. The regime conflated the Republic with a demonised representation of the “Moor” and dismissed the facts of history.

Education was one of the key ideological state apparatuses through which the Catholic Church validated the Francoist version of history. Moreover, the Church maintained the notion of a unified primordial Christian population on the peninsula through their control of religious ritual and public performances. The Franco regime

trumpeted an ideology in which *patria* (nation) and *catolicismo* were one and the same thing. They maintained a myth that “the basis of Spanish identity was—and always had been—a pure and orthodox Catholicism” (Bowes and Kulikowski 2005:3).<sup>74</sup>

“When discussing memory in Spain, historians are really addressing their appraisal of the successive political regimes in the country since 1931” (Cazorla-Sánchez 2010:Abstract). When discussing the events that make up the history of Frigiliana and the horrific experiences of the recent past, it appears reasonable to suggest that the identity of the villagers has been filtered through the lens of a violent and repressive dictatorship and the failures of contemporary democracy to institute change beyond the political sphere. The Nationalist and Francoist falsification of history in Spain has continued long after the regime has ended “as the official partisan history of Spain, promulgated in schools and universities during the Franco era...was not altered during the democratic period” (Ryan 2009:122). As historical memory discourse swirls all about Spain, it remains silent in Frigiliana. In its place, identity discourse skips back to a utopian version of the medieval past. John R Gillis (1994:5) contends that “[t]he core meaning of any individual or group identity, namely a sense of sameness over time is sustained by remembering; and what is remembered is defined by the assumed identity.” The core meaning of any individual or group identity in Frigiliana is a superimposed and institutionalised Francoist one. The sense of sameness being remembered during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an assumed medieval one that was never experienced by the contemporary population of the village.

---

<sup>74</sup> *Murió por Dios y España* on the headstone in the graveyard in Frigiliana mirrors the notion of *patria* and *catolicismo*. The headstone contains a ceramic photograph of the deceased, Manuel Agudo Martin, yet the technology to engrave a photograph in ceramic did not exist until late in the twentieth century. Thus, a medieval “idea” of god and Spain has endured in the present day.

“[P]ublic memory was just one of the conduits by which the Franco Regime perpetuated the schism of the Civil War on an ideological terrain for the duration of its rule” (Ryan 2009:121), and the management and possession of public performances ensured that memory remained controlled by the regime. Silence is the preferred expression of Civil War difference in Frigiliana and cultural performance is the battlefield upon which arguments are being played out. It is through the management of history and culture that these arguments become compelling and everyday. The management of public memory through cultural performances in Frigiliana appears to float away from recent political history as a tourist festival tells a different account of the past. However, it is not the contradictions amongst the historical facts that appear to be contested. Rather, it is the manner in which these silences and contradictions are applied to contemporary identity that is a cause for continued contestation. Silence may be seen as a more effective form of resistance; namely a consciousness “estrangement from Fascism greater in scope and depth than the political dissent” (Passerini 2009:198).

# Chapter Three: The Politics of Festivals. Social Containment and Social Change

Rites of passage are rituals that mark the transformation from one stage of life and entry into another. For example birth ceremonies, marriage rites and funeral ceremonies. Rites of passage may denote transformation for a single individual, a group of individuals or an entire community. Arnold van Gennep (1960:1–13) distinguishes three kinds of rites of passage: separation, which removes initiands from the everyday world; transition, which takes place in a kind of limbo or transitional space; and incorporation, or a return to the everyday world transformed. He notes that rites of separation are prominent in funeral ceremonies, transition rites are prominent in birthing ceremonies and that rites of incorporation feature significantly during marriage ceremonies. Notwithstanding an emphasis on specific rites within individual ceremonies, separation, transition, incorporation are viewed as three elements which form phases within a single rite. Van Gennep (*ibid.*) saw rites of separation as ‘preliminal’ transition rites as ‘liminal’ and rites and rites of incorporation are ‘postliminal’. The liminal phase of a ritual occurs at the threshold of society and facilitates a transformation. It is here that social roles may be reversed. During the liminal phase, “the young people can steal and pillage at will or feed and adorn themselves at the expense of the community” (*ibid.*: 114), men may act as women, the elderly may act as young and normative social hierarchies are challenged.

Victor Turner (1969:13) emphasises the implications of ritual rites of passage for resolving conflict in society where the contradiction “between norms is resolved

by rituals rich in symbolism and pregnant with meaning.” For Turner (1970:93), normative society is regarded as a structure of positions, and the margin or liminal phase of a ritual is regarded as “interstructural”. Thus rituals ease tensions in society, and the ritual process facilitates a structured reincorporation. Historically, carnival and festivals are a classic example where the lower orders were able to enjoy a brief, but bounded, moment of licence, and the poor could mock and laugh at the rich. Religious rituals and public festival performances contain distinct, but overlapping, components. In its simplest form, a religious ritual transforms or reinforces the status of an individual, group of individuals or an entire community. The transformative force within a religious ritual is performed in a demarcated sacred space. During the separation process, initiands are removed from profane space by way of physical movement or the utterance of a set of prescribed words. Once within a sacred space, initiands possess a liminal status that is “betwixt and between” (Turner 1970:93) normative social roles. Initiands perform prescribed elevated or subordinated roles during the liminal stage of a ritual process that invert social norms. Finally, initiands are reincorporated into society, but their status has changed somewhat. Thus, rituals mark points of transformation, rites of passage, which alter the status of individuals from inept to adept members of society. In the case of harvest or annual religious festivals, rites of passage may apply to an entire group and reinforce social bonds amongst all members of a community.

A wedding ceremony offers a contemporary example of a religious rite of passage. Two initiands come to a sacred space and the religious rite is opened up with the prescribed words, “dearly beloved, we are gathered here today. During the ritual process, initiands utter “I do” and perform sets of symbolic actions, such as exchanging wedding rings. The transformation and rite of passage are completed

with the utterance, “you may now kiss the bride.” The activities surrounding the wedding ceremony, the attendance of guests, the costumes worn and the celebrations following the religious ritual may strengthen the public performance of a change in status, but they are ultimately secondary to the religious ritual and often performed as a result of secular traditions.

Many public ceremonies can be considered as being rites of passage that involve similar sets of prescribed utterances, acts or traditions. Indeed, many public ceremonies mimic the content of religious ritual processes. Thus, a university graduation ceremony appears similar to a religious rite of passage. Initiands gather in a sacred space that is beyond secular time. The ceremony is opened up with a prescribed set of utterances where the status of initiands is publically transformed from student to graduate or inept to adept. Formal clothing, public celebrations and formal utterances mark this public reaffirmation of a shift in status, however, there is one notable distinction. Whether present at the ceremony or not, students still graduate. That is to say, in order for students to be transformed into graduates, they do not have to attend the ceremony, and the transformative force of the ceremony is not the actual words, deeds or actions within the official graduation process.

Thus, metaphorically, the three stages of a religious ritual process may be applied to non-religious rituals. However, this metaphorical application must be mindful of one overriding consideration. Religious ritual rites of passage are “work”. This may be the work of the gods or the work of society, but they are prescribed obligatory work. In contrast, non-religious ritual processes are voluntary, and while they may have the appearance of a religious ritual, there is a leisure component inherent within them. The distinction between work and leisure is essential when

viewing festivals as a transformative process. Rather than limit the potential transformation within a prescribed set of rules, non-religious festivals contain a limitless potential for play. This playful component within non-religious festivals permits the organisers and participants to conjure up individual, unconventional and unorthodox performances that are liberated, unconstrained and unfettered by rules and regulation.

Festivals, *fiestas*, carnivals, *ferias*, public celebrations and public religious rituals have an established and traditional presence within the Iberian Peninsula. In Spain, “festivals...are considered important markers and celebrations of ethnic/cultural identity” (Douglass 1991:126). Celebrated throughout Spain, festivals publicly articulate a variety of national religious feasts, national days of commemoration, provincial celebrations and local expressions of regional characteristics. Festivals punctuate the calendar of urban and rural lives as all public offices, banks and many commercial establishments close for one, sometimes two, often three or more days during festival celebrations. Flamenco dance and song, bullfighting and *gitano* cultural performances are emphasised throughout the southern Andalusian region.<sup>75</sup> *Las Fallas* (The Fires) festival in eastern Spain’s Valencia region commemorates the Roman Catholic feast of Saint Joseph during a five-day incineration of gigantic elaborate wooden *muñecas* (dolls) (Costa 1998). Large processions commemorate the Roman Catholic feast of *Corpus Christi* in Toledo, central Spain, in a restrained midnight display of national religious unity and prayer. Pamplona, in the northern Navarra region, hosts the San Fermín bull running festival in early July each year (Ebersole 1963). The world’s biggest tomato fight (*La*

---

<sup>75</sup> Flesler and Pérez Melgosa (2008:66) note that the Francoist construction of Spain as a tourist destination encapsulated in the 1960’s slogan “Spain is different,” silenced “Spain’s internal regional and political differences” and promoted a folkloric backward image of Spain.

*Tomatina*) that takes place in Buñol on the last Wednesday of August each year represents a similarly iconic international image of Spain (Freeman and Teplica 1999).

These festivals take many different forms and derive from many different local, regional and national origins. During *Semana Santa* in Seville, hooded members of the *Hermandades y Cofradías de Penitencia* perform public acts of religious observance “celebrated officially in Church and unofficially in the streets” (Schrauf 1997:423). Continuing a carnival rather than religious theme, rural communities in Seville perform public parodies of gender roles as male villagers masquerade as females and subvert traditional gender relationships “mainly through the vehicle of the carnival *copla*” (Gilmore 1999:3).<sup>76</sup> Along the eastern seaboard, numerous towns re-enact historic or mythical battles under the generic banner of *moros y cristianos* festivals (Harris 1994:45) that emphasise the orientalist exotic “Moor” in lavish public performances in tandem with the marauding invading “Moor” (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003). *Moros y cristianos* festivals often combine with religious processions and secular parades during impressive street theatre. The performances are “alternately raucous and solemn” (Harris 1994:45). According to Harris (ibid.), sixty two towns and villages in Alicante, Valencia, Albacete and Murcia celebrate *moros y cristianos fiestas* as “the year’s major festival”.

During the 1960s, in a period known as *la apertura* (the opening up), Spain began to open its borders and encourage tourism. Since this period *moros y cristianos* festivals have “experienced continuous growth in their size, showiness and popularity, together with a gradual increase in the number of towns celebrating

---

<sup>76</sup> A *copla* is a narrative poem or song.

them” (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:151). As part of the construction of a tourist industry, economic factors drove the definition and redefinition of apparently “traditionally” themed festivals. According to Narotzky and Smith (2002:218), these festivals are “of recent introduction locally, but referring to a more “traditional” local culture”. That is, festivals in Spain are recent, but they are dressed up in the folkloric and the traditional. The same processes that shaped *moros y cristianos* festivals as local culture throughout Spain also shaped *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Carrie B. Douglass (1991: 126-128) points out that the particular themes which communicated the political agenda of the Franco regime were promoted during some festivals, such as bull running and medieval battles. Narotzky and Smith (2002:218) point out that “those on the “right” became involved in the *Moros y Cristianos*” festivals in the aftermath of the Franco regime. It is fair to suggest that regardless of the similarity of form that public performances may or may not adopt, certain groups appear to be vying for the control of public space. Likewise, their sense of identity, history, culture and tradition is communicated on the streets of their villages. Thus “virtual culture” (ibid: 178), in the form of festival and farce, is substituted for historically accurate themes.

*Moros y cristianos* festivals tend to be celebrated in conjunction with a Roman Catholic feast day. The presence of both Muslim and Christian symbols during *moros y cristianos* festivals highlights the contested and contrasting nature of Spanish festivals. During such festivals in Castalla, Max Harris (1994:48) suggests that participants suspend contemporary political realities and imagine that the “Moors” become the dominant group in power during mock dramatisations. Thus, “festival time” appears to exist outside the everyday realities of village life and allows for the construction of an imagined alternative reality. “Moors have the more

spectacular costumes and the more stirring music” (ibid: 47) and to be a “Moor” is “considered more desirable than to be a Christian” (Foster 1960:224). According to Harris (1994), tension and accommodation point to the presence of tolerance within festivals in Castalla. Although this is situated within the festival, for Harris (1994:48), it indicates *convivencia* outside festival time.

Harris (ibid.) suggests that the total transfer of authority to the “Moors,” during a festival demonstrates a mindset of harmonious *convivencia* amongst the local population. For Harris, festival *convivencia* transgresses festival time. Playing the role of a “Moor” during these public events is more desirable than playing the role of a Christian. Flamboyant and exotic “Moorish” costumes allow for greater scope and splendour, but this is not the principal reason that a majority opt for playing this role. Following the chronology of historic events, the “Moors” win the first mock battle at the beginning of festivities, and while the Christians win the second battle at the end of the festival, the “Moors” rule throughout the public event. This festive reign of the “Moors” represents, according to Harris (1994: 48-52), the temporary resurgence of a historically repressed minority that reinforces tolerance and harmony. When the Christians win the final battle at the end of the festival, both groups are reincorporated into a reaffirmed society that is mindful of its historic identity contradictions.

Conversely, Flesler and Pérez Melgosa (2003:151-152) argue that *moro y cristianos* festivals perpetuate a racist and monocultural Spanish past and present. They suggest that the image of the “Moor” within the festival has been eroticised, romanticised and indeed orientalised (Said 1979). Exotic representations of the historic “Moor” point to a distinction between history and the present. The symbol of the “Moor” is set apart from the realities of contemporary North African Muslim

migration into Spain. The festival organisers play on these similarities and distinctions between the heroic “Moor” in order to evoke present day invasions by undocumented North Africans. “When today’s Moroccan immigrants are called “*moros*” instead of “*marroquíes*,” their identity becomes symbolically collapsed with the concept of that invading enemy” (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:166 ). As one informant in Granada pointed out to me in 2010, “if they are rich, they are Arabs: if they are poor, they are Moors.” For Flesler and Pérez Melgosa, the duality of symbols within festivals represents divisions in contemporary Spain and *moros y cristianos* festivals represent the dominance of a monocultural Spain of Christian heritage.

Representations of the “Moor” as an exotic, sensual being that is admired for his war-craft, science and artistic creativity contrasts with depictions of the treacherous “Moor” as a violent figure intent on seizing Spain away from Christians during festivals. Moreover, as the orientalist representation of the “Moor” appears during festivals, the treacherous “Moor” is invoked in current conflicts of racial discrimination and religious intolerance towards Moroccan migrants. Media discourse surrounding immigration in Spain frequently invokes and reproduces the opposing categories of “Moor” versus Christian in an attempt to highlight the potential threat to Spanish unity in the midst of a new wave of Moroccan “invaders” (Flesler 2008:3).

*Moros y cristianos* festivals are explicitly linked to but significantly different from *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Both festivals draw on medieval Spain as the inspiration for a public event. They are both recent constructions specifically created in order to attract tourists and both present an imagined sense of the present shrouded in historical terms. While *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not presented as a

“traditional” event, *moros y cristianos* festivals appear to be “traditional”. Moreover, the apparent “traditional” component within *moros y cristianos* festivals connects them with a Francoist image of Spain. They take the form of processions infused with quasi-military displays and culminate in the recreation of a battle where the Christians always win. As Narotzky and Smith point out (2002:217), the processes “that recaptured public space in democratic Spain...focused on styles of consumption for the production of some form of collective identity”. For right-wing town halls, the style of *moros y cristianos* festivities connects to a more “traditional” collective identity. For the Left, the style of “public high culture film sessions and theatre” (ibid: 218) were the preferred choice as they connected Spain to “modern” European cultural performances. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is situated somewhere between these two poles of “traditional” and “modern” interpretations of local public celebrations. It is “traditional” insofar as it draws from the past to articulate a local version of heritage that has been hidden by successive regimes; it is “modern” because it privileges a local version of “high culture” in the form of North African themed dance, music, theatre and art. As distinct as the overall themes expressed by *moros y cristianos* and *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* may be, they both reify different interpretations of medieval Spain. They both skip over recent history, yet they are inextricably linked to contemporary oppositional ideologies.

### **Festivals in Spain**

Comparative representations of public cultural performances in Spain assume that festivals have developed everywhere in a similar manner. When comparative methods are applied to cultural performances, the evident similarities are often misinterpreted because, “its opinions and its actions have many fundamental traits in common” (Boas 1966:271). Apparently, the rules that govern the development of

public festivals are applicable to contemporary festivals as well as those of distant times and distant lands.

There are seven significant festivals in Frigiliana and, superficially, they appear to be similar. They are all performed on the street, they all involve music and, to some extent, they all involve dancing and merriment, and the same people participate in all of these festivals. Public cultural performances may look similar: they may adhere to the same rules but, if this point is elaborated a little further, when studying the culture of any one tribe, single traits may be found with a great level of diversity amongst each member of the tribe. And when studying the culture of any one member of a tribe, single traits may be found with a great level of diversity within each individual. It therefore follows that similarities within public festivals throughout Spain, or indeed within one village, are not an indication of a common historical source, rather cultural practices have arisen independently in specific and concrete historical circumstances.

During his study of *The People of the Sierra* in the 1940s, Julian Pitt-Rivers notes that festivals have not been seen in their pre-Civil War guise in the Grazalmea township. Festivals “had the character of a time of special licence and of the reversal of the social order” (1977:176). Festivals had an anti-clerical and political character in the years before the Civil War, and the Nationalist government banned festivals “on the grounds that if people were allowed to wear disguise they would take advantage of the occasion to pay off old scores” (ibid.). Festival time also gave authority to shameless immoral behaviour linked with sexual innuendo and empowerment for women in a reversal of the values espoused by the Francoist Catholic regime. During the *Festival of Women*, “it was the girls who invited the boys to dance” (ibid.). Many such encounters during festivals resulted in marriage,

but others disapproved of the “ugly things” (ibid.) enacted during festival time stating that these people, “had little shame in normal time and put the special licence which carnival offered to exaggerated use” (ibid.).

A different reading of the changes in festivals following the Civil War is suggested by Julio Caro Baroja (1965:21). Carnival is dead but neither “the vogue of religious spirit nor actions from the “Left,” killed the carnival.” Neither the pious members of Spanish society nor the rationalists have much sympathy for the “last remnant of paganism” (ibid: 21-22). Secularisation and notions of modern living purged festivals of their “pretentious clubhouse amusement” (ibid: 22). Thus, the raucous, immoral value-inverting elements within festivals were sanitised by the consent of the majority of the population, according to Caro Baroja, and not exclusively as a result of political sensibilities, either Left or Right. Festivals became public expressions of the “traditional” aspects of Spanish culture and, as such, permitted the majority of the population to participate.

While unabated, licentious and colourful festival celebrations diminished in many parts of Spain during the 1940s, “the traditions of carnival are still strong in certain localities” (Gilmore 1999:12) albeit in a watered-down version mindful of government supervision. In the years following the Spanish Civil War, many local government officials turned a blind eye to festivals that were relatively peaceful celebrations. In some Spanish towns “the people took to the streets in defiance of the Franco prohibition...despite occasional police harassment” (ibid:13). Furthermore, some municipal authorities ignored the prohibition of festivals and actually joined in as “one of the earliest indications of manifestations of official disenchantment with the Franco dictatorship that eventually eased Spain’s transition to democracy” (ibid.).

According to Gilmore (ibid: 13), village festivals in rural areas stubbornly resisted interference or management by “official meddlers” and continued to be the spontaneous, uninhibited and mass action that “we have come to expect as part of proletarian activities.” Costumes and masks continued to be a central element of the village festival where half the villagers were dressed in street clothes, while the other half of the village were dressed in festival costumes. The two sets “of celebrants intermingling and changing places at various times” (ibid.) without any formal rules that dictated which celebrants masquerade or when they changed costumes. Strolling bands, clowns and transvestites were central features of festivals as they performed “minidramas victimizing deviants or lampooning the authorities” (ibid.). During the early years of the dictatorship, some festivals continued to be a shameless time of carnivalesque behaviour where “anything goes” (Pitt-Rivers 1977:176). They were a time of licence or “limbo that can turn vindictive or chaotic” (Gilmore 1999:14) — a time of aggression, “*los agravios*” (Caro Baroja 1965:83).

Yet, aggression was controlled in this time of limbo. While there were numerous accounts of festivals throughout Europe that turned into full-blown violent revolution (Le Roy Ladurie 2003), the lyrics of the carnival song or poem acted as a form of “symbolic violence” (Gilmore 1999:14) during festivals and displaced the tensions within a community. Accordingly, the festival in Spain has served many purposes, “one of which is social and political protest, usually in the form of leftist mass action” (Pitt-Rivers 1977:176). Many songs and public poets attacked the rich, the Church and other perceived enemies but protest was not always “confined to the rhetorical realm” (Gilmore 1999: 15). The aggression within festivals was unleashed in two different directions: “vertically against the authorities and horizontally against peer-group deviance” (ibid: 16). Thus Spanish festivals were simultaneously

provocative and “culturally conservative or collaborative” (ibid.) as the aggression of the festival was equally directed at the poor as much as the rich. Conversely, “The carnival *coplas* and the songs of the *Carnaval* are recognized by some to have been the guardian of marital and premarital fidelity” (Pitt-Rivers 1977:177). Thus, festivals simultaneously uplift the “common folk and, wielding a repressive Catholic morality, keeps them down” (Gilmore 1999:15).

### **Interpretations of Festivals**

As numerous and varied as the forms that festivals may take, interpretations of their historical origins, their cultural significance, political meanings and “symbolic functions” (Hobsbawm 1992:3) are equally numerous and varied. Carrie B. Douglass (1991:130) suggests that six major festivals in Spain form a simultaneously cohesive and contested notion of a national “fiesta cycle”.<sup>77</sup> When viewed from a micro perspective, regional festivals may express regional identity that is independent from Spain. When viewed from a macro perspective, they form part of a cycle of festivals at a national level, reinforce a national festival system and fit within a network of festivals. A systems or network approach to festivals assumes that regardless of difference, the national cycle of festivals suggests a cohesive, but contested, “Spanish Culture” (Douglass 1991).<sup>78</sup> The interrelated nature of festival participants, audience members and local and national media coverage combine to articulate the plural heritage of regional separatist Spain. The annual cycle of festivals throughout Spain “articulates various parts of the nation-state, while at the same time evoking

---

<sup>77</sup> “The cycle consists of six fiestas in six important Spanish cities... It begins March 15-19 with *Fallas* in Valencia, and winds its way clockwise around Spain: April 21-28 (in 1986) for *Feria de Abril* in Sevilla; May 15-22 for *San Isidro* in Madrid; July 7-14 for *San Fermin* in Pamplona; August 17-24 for *Semana Grande* in Bilbao; and October 9-16 for the *Virgin del Pilar* in Zaragoza” (Douglass 1991:128-129).

<sup>78</sup> As Beth Preston (2000) notes, systems or actor network theory is ahistorical and does not account for malfunctioning components that do not quite fit within a contemporary model. Systems approaches to cultural practice attempt to shoehorn difference within a contemporary abstract model, ignoring history in the process.

the plural version of the symbolic category Spain” (ibid: 128). Thus while regional festivals may express difference, there appears to be no distinction expressed at national level. During the *Feria* in Seville, “towns connect themselves to the past” (ibid.) in an attempt to reconstruct the present through festival. While individual villages may differentiate themselves from neighbouring villages “by emphasizing a unique identity” (ibid.), they simultaneously self-identify as members of a larger regional community, “*nacionalidad*, or culture” (ibid.). Within this kind of framework, difference is negated and national histories appear to supersede local histories. Accordingly, the myth of national unity is maintained through state systems as “the historical unity of the ruling classes is realised in the State” (Gramsci 1971:202). Thus, local historical particularisms are lost within a similarity of festival forms at a national level, despite the multiple oppositional motives being articulated.

The non-coincidence of festival (Velasco 1982:19) allows for neighbouring villagers to attend all local, regional and national festivals (Fernandez and Fernandez 1976). Festivals are therefore more than the stories people tell themselves about themselves (Geertz 1973); they are the stories that they tell others about themselves (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009). In this context, according to Douglass (1991:129), festivals define the local and distinguish the other, yet the local and the other appear to be the same thing. The cycle of fiestas presupposes that all participants are familiar with “the symbols evoked and rituals used throughout the cycle” (Rodriguez Becerra 1982:32) thus establishing the boundaries of the community. Yet in Frigiliana, despite enthusiastic participation in the festivals, many of the participants are unclear about the symbolic meaning of the specific events. According to Douglass (1991:138), potential contradictions within each local festival mimic contradictions within a plural Spain at a national level as they create the “illusion of

community” and these contradictions within festivals are a metaphor for a plural Spain.

Interpretations of festivals in Spain appear to take a number of distinct and contradictory approaches. Some interpretations of festivals highlight plural cultural practices encompassed within, but subordinate to, a single national culture. Others view the transfer of power from Christian to Muslim during *moros y cristianos* festivals as an example of *convivencia* and tolerance in the present. Consequently, *moros y cristianos* festivals mimic a desire to accommodate migrants outside festival time. An alternative view suggests that *moros y cristianos* festivals conflate the image of the marauding “Moor” with contemporary migrants thereby indicating intolerance during both festival and non-festival time. These approaches could be narrowed down a little further and classified within one of two overarching frames: social cohesion or social change.

### **The “Social Cohesion” Approach: A Break from Superego**

Festivals are a break from the normal everyday routine and “the people’s second life, organized on the basis of laughter” (Bakhtin 1984:8). They are a secular event, and while they may coincide with religious feasts, they are “not condoned by the Church, but condemned by its hierarchy as pagan” (Gilmore 1999:9-10). Festivals are a time of surreal liberation, of debauchery and defilement, “a capitulation before the resurgent id” (ibid.) and “a holiday from superego” (Kris 2000:182). They are a release from the strict self-controls of everyday life and belong to a “class of ‘time-out’ behaviors that overturn the rules of the workday world and provide a psychological relief to the masses” (Gilmore 1999:10). The licentious gaiety of festival will always be replaced by the seriousness of everyday life or the solemn

sacrifice of Lent. Festivals are an inversion of social norms and moral sensibilities that reverse the normal order and set free the emotions of the masses. They are a time to shed established notions of gender, sexuality and identity and masquerade as the imagined “other” in public.

Fundamentally, festivals are proletarian in character and there is an ever-present potential for them to erupt into violence (Linger 1992). Festivals are not just about intoxication, sexual horseplay, transvestites and pleasure, but “mock trials, status reversals, anti-clerical tirades, staged uprising, violent abuse of lords and masters, and all manner of revolutionary theatre” (Gilmore 1999:11). They are a time when the rich brace themselves for mischief and disorder. A time to let off steam infused with danger and full of political implications. As the sixteenth-century French Lawyer Claude de Ruby once said, “It is sometimes expedient to allow the people to play the fool... lest by holding them in with too great a rigour, we put them in despair” (quoted in Zemon Davis 1971:51).

Festivals act like a “safety-valve” that allow the population to let off steam in a controlled and specific space. The notion of the safety-valve model tends to represent people in terms of homogenous bounded groups or “in terms of opposing classes, whereas closer examination can show a diversity of participants and alliances” (Mintz 1997:57). If issues of the interpretation of festivals were resolved on the basis of “a majority vote of scholars, the safety-valve theory would almost surely prevail” (Scott 1990:177). In her study of a pre-Lenten festival of carnival in Santiago de los Caballeros, in the Dominican Republic, Nancie Gonzales (1970: Abstract) argues that the festival “operates as a mechanism which reinforces class and ethnic boundaries, and assists in maintaining the whole cultural complex”. Thus,

festivals simultaneously emphasise social distinctions and bring “different segments of society together in play” (Gilmore 1999:28).

This plural character of festivals acts as a “safety-valve” that allows the forces of “order and disorder, respectability and licence” (Abrahams and Baumann 1978:206) to confront each other during a “controlled time and space” where participants create a unified productive event of harmony and enjoyment. Festivals are a place of cohesion, regardless of the inversions which they may or may not articulate, and they act to recreate an organic Durkheimian sense of social solidarity where the population are in constant need of renewal and rejuvenation in order to avert “life crisis”. As a result of uttering the same cry, pronouncing the same word, “or performing the same gesture in regard to the same object, they [communities] become and feel themselves to be in unison” (Durkheim 1915:230). In other words, the social system itself, mindful of its hierarchies and contestations, is being reaffirmed during festival as a “kind of secular deity in need of constant propitiation” (Gilmore 1999:29).

Charles Phythian-Adams (1972:68-69) argues that there is no question of completely altering the total social order during festivals. Moreover, by temporarily disfiguring the structure of the social order, participants are consciously and subconsciously accepting the *status quo*. During a medieval festival in Coventry, England, it is the “emphasis on preserving and enhancing the wholeness of the social order which most distinguished the ceremonies of the late medieval urban community” (Phythian-Adams 1972:67). Within the close knit structures of a medieval town, where various groups overlapped, “ceremony performed a crucial clarifying role” (ibid: 69). Festival acted as a mechanism to ensure public continuity

within the community by “promoting cohesion and controlling some of its inherent conflicts” (ibid: 70).

The inversion of social norms during such festivals is a key element within the process of reaffirming the existing hierarchical order. Regardless of the extreme nature of these social inversions, they are controlled and play a symbolic role within festivals. And while festival performances could be described as “anti-structure” (Turner 1970:44), they are not a total structural reversal or a mirror-imaging of profane everyday life. They are an inversion in the sense that there is an obligation from amongst all participants to control their “wild abandonment” within the strict rules of festivals mindful that reincorporation within the everyday realm is an imminent feature of festivals. Such “anti-structured” behaviour is prescribed, and while festivals can be viewed as a time of “play” in opposition to “work,” the rules of festival are directly transposed from amongst the prevailing social norms and act to reaffirm social solidarity. These types of events are inversions of social norms, but they are not a subversion of society.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is rather different from the topsy turvy nature of festivals that reverse social norms and engender social cohesion. Although alcohol, dance and public celebration form a significant part of the event, they are always controlled and never licentious or raucous. For this reason, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is for “everyone” and it is a family event. There is no inversion of norms and no violation of neutral behaviour during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Therefore, it cannot be interpreted as anti-social practice. Yet, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is all about local social cohesion and the articulation of social values. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is about social change as the “taste” and “flavour” of

the event articulate a subversive revision of the past with respect to national belonging.

### **The “Social Protest” Approach**

From the perspective of social protest, interpretations of festivals stress the conflict model rather than consensus and solidarity. The rebellious festival is a weapon of political struggle against class domination. Festivals may be seen as “a symbolic form of struggle” (Gilmore 1999:32). Rather than festivals being viewed as a political event that maintain the *status quo* and dissipate individual animosities, they are the source of class unity and an ideological defence against domination. They are resistance against the dominant hegemony—a veritable “counterhegemony” to use Hermann Rebel’s term (1989:357). As a result of prohibitions that banned public protest or public organisation, the proletariat appropriate festivals as a means to indirectly articulate resistance (Gilmore 1999:12). Although rebellious, resistance must take the form of a covert voicing of opposition and maintain the appearance of conformity.

Festivals not only provide the conceptual means of resistance, but they act as a unifying device for the proletariat and a potential challenge to the prevailing order. According to Scott (1987:311-312), they create a symbolic form of alternative social order as resistance to oppression is articulated in the realm of the imagination. Therefore, festivals are not only “*a* means of class struggle, but *the* means of class struggle” (Gilmore 1999:33). Festivals are a sublimation of class struggle in its purest form as an organised form of resistance against the elite. The fact that festivals are always contested and conflicted is not accidental, contestation and conflict are an inbuilt element within the structure of festivals, indeed class conflict

is “the very essence of the celebration” (Cohen 1993:131). However, the essential distinction between festivals articulating social change and ones that maintain social cohesion is the hidden indirect performance during festivals that articulate social change in opposition to the overt anti-structural performances during festivals that reinforce social cohesion. The performance of resistance during festivals that articulate social change takes the form of covert hidden transcripts that are not immediately obvious to the casual observer.

Rather than being licentious festivals full of wild abandonment, festivals that express a desire for social change perform the normative social order. Thus, they appear to be relatively peaceful events that do not overtly challenge the prevailing authority. If festivals that reaffirm social solidarity engender anti-structured behaviour during festival time, festivals that indirectly espouse social change engender structured behaviour during festival time. Therefore, the more licentious and transgressive the performance is during festival, the more it reinforces the existing social order. Conversely, the more normative the festival is, the more it undermines the existing social order and creates the potential for social change.

Dorothy Noyes (2003: 42-54) looks at the potential for social change during *la Patum* festival, in Berga. The hidden transcript behind this festival is one that seeks an independent Catalonia, and the festival acted as a platform for social change in the wake of the dictatorship. An overt expression of the aspiration to separate from Spain during the dictatorship would have been violently repressed. Therefore, overt political aspirations had to be disguised under the theme of “traditional” festival. In 1939 the Falange took over the organising of the festival, and its program was adorned with the Falange Yoke and Arrows symbol and emblazoned with the words “Arriba España! Franco, Franco, Franco” (Noyes 2003:172). All references to

the existence of Catalonia as an independent entity were removed from the festivities in Berga. The mock *moros y cristianos* battles, which so closely resonated with the Francoist nationalist-Catholic ideology, began to re-emerge. The pre-Civil War Republican government had de-emphasised the triumphalism inherent within *moros y cristianos* festivals.

Mindful of the ever-present potential for violent military repression, expressions of separate identity during *la Patum* were masked under the rubric of local Catholic traditions and performances. Consequently, an existing institution that formed one of the three pillars of Franco's Spain masked a shared sense of local identity. Nationalist-Catholic representations of the Virgin Mary as a "stiffly magnificent Spanish infant" (Noyes 2003:176) were locally reproduced with the same level of reverence. Yet, in order to implicitly mark local anti-Spanish sentiment, she was referred to as, "the girl of the village, a carpenter's wife" (ibid.). Thus, festivals that articulate loyalty to local traditions may be seen as clandestine performances of distinction, disassociation from national ideas of identity and an expression of a desire for social change. Yet these expressions of local identity must appear to fit within the permissible national parameters of local "traditions" and give the impression of social solidarity within a larger political unit.

Festival is the only place where "*undominated discourse* prevailed" (Scott 1990:175) as a space for dissident subculture. Social control, surveillance and the threat of violence prevents the hidden transcript from publicly expressing its aspirations (ibid.).<sup>79</sup> However, the realities of shifting social hierarchies and the stratification of classes impacts on who participates within festivals. According to

---

<sup>79</sup> Narotzky and Smith (2002) note that the threat of violence exists long after the regime ends. Based on the memory of repression, there is a fear that the military may take over again.

Scott (ibid.), citing Gilmore (1987), animosity between landowners and labourers in twentieth-century Andalusia significantly impacted upon public cultural performances. Both classes had initially participated in the festival yet, as agrarian conditions worsened, landowners withdrew to the safety of their balconies and assumed the exclusive role of spectators. Therefore, festivals are far from static events as they are more likely to “reflect the changing structures and antagonisms within a society” (Scott 1990:174) as subordinate groups grasp the occasion to covertly voice their disdain for the dominant social order.

It is therefore not accurate to assume that festivals were set up by dominant elites in order to “allow subordinate groups to play at rebellion lest they resort to the real thing” (Scott 1990:178). As Dorothy Noyes (2003:156-166) points out with respect to *La Patum* in Berga during the 1940s and 1950s, participation in the festival waned in the midst of the Franco regime despite attempts by the authorities to rekindle festivities in order to promote tourism. Festivals that express social cohesion always contain an element of forced obligation on the behalf of its participants in order to publicly demonstrate the superiority of one group above another. The element of control inherent within performances of social cohesion is not necessarily a self-imposed sense of restraint on behalf of the participants; it is more than likely the realisation by the population that the dominant elite will preserve their version of the social order, by violence if necessary.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is rather different from the clandestine nature of festivals suggested above that covertly express social change. It explicitly calls for the recognition and incorporation of its version of history within local heritage, tradition and culture. For this reason, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a considered political move and part of an organised long-term “war of manoeuvre” (Gramsci

1971) that will prepare the way for a “war of position” (ibid.). By gaining possession of the means to produce cultural performances, local intellectuals are gaining control of one of the existing institutions in the village and are reconfiguring traditional performances. They possess the right to articulate culture, and possession of the means to articulate culture in playful local terms is a key component within festivals that call for social change.

### **Festivals outside Everyday Time? Liminal to Liminoid**

Whether festival performances are interpreted as either public performances of social cohesion or performances of social change, one persistent trait common to most theoretical approaches is to place them outside the realities of everyday life. Festivals are frequently seen as existing in a space and time that is beyond the everyday seriousness of normal time. In short, festivals are presented and interpreted as play (Huizinga 1950) or spectacle (Debord 1967) in a time where “normative” social rules do not apply. Beyond the confines of “normative” social rules, roles and etiquette, festivals apparently exist in some sort of transitional public space where “popular culture is permitted to broadcast its commentary, mustering all its power through lowness and bad taste” (Goldstein 2003:11). Moreover, during festivals “bad taste is embraced” (ibid.). The illusion of festival is sacred, whereas the truth of everyday life is profane (Feuerbach 1843). Festivals engender “significant ritual or symbolic function” (Hobsbawm 1992:3) that is separate from mundane, habitual and everyday life.

An alternative reality appears to exist during festival time that renders them as part of a process of rites of passage during moments of life crises. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a non-verbal process as much as it is a verbal event. It creates new

relationships between the present and the past as it constructs a dynamic space for the performance of emergent concepts, feelings and values. Within this constructed space, cultural performances, sculpture, painting, music, dance, architecture and theatre transmit a series of symbols that are both social and psychological. The totality of the festival is a symbolic processual event rather than a symbolic thing. Festivals may be seen as an annual ritual or a distinct phase in a social process whereby groups become adjusted to idiosyncratic changes. These changes are social and cultural and relate to transforming the physical spaces during festivals as well as transforming the people. The festival is a form of ritual social action and a positive force within a symbolic field that is saturated with ambiguous and contradictory symbols. According to Victor Turner (1974:26), festivals and carnivals are the residue of religious rites of passage and are crucial elements within processes of societal change.

When viewed from within this framework, festivals in general, and *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* in particular, resonate closely with Arnold van Gennep's (1961:10) three stages of religious rites of passage: separation, transition and incorporation. Festivals reconfigure various groups within society. Ritual symbols have the character of dynamic semantic systems that gain and lose meaning over time, but this is not a closed system of fixed immutable symbols. Rather, ritual symbols are ambiguous and embody the complexities of everyday life. They "are both sensorily perceptible vehicles and sets of meanings" (Turner 1974:55) that creatively make use of disorder as a means to reinforce order. The innovative potential within symbolic performances enables human action that is free *to* invert social norms, but it is not free *from* the rules of everyday life. While "murky or glinting with desire and feeling" (ibid.), ritual symbols embody innovation, but it is

innovation that is determined and limited by social norms. Within a “tribal” context, rites of passage are fundamentally economic. At base, they are the obligatory work of the gods. No one individual is exempt from these religious ritual duties, “just as no one is exempt from economic, legal, or political duty” (ibid: 63). Without profane human work it would be impossible to conceive of the collective religious identity of the community.

Even though religious rituals are the serious work of the gods, they depend on an element of play, and their transformative capacity is reliant upon “ludic” possibilities that are flexible and malleable. During play there is something “at play” (Huizinga 1950:1) which imparts meaning into social action. “All play means something” (ibid.). Movement, transition and passage from one social status to another social status plays with multiple forms and multiple meanings that contextualise symbols within concrete historical fields constructed “by “men alive” as they act, react, transact, and interact socially” (Turner 1974:57). Even when symbolic practice appears to be the playful inversion of reality, “it remains intimately in touch with it” (ibid.) as the play of *homo ludens* is tightly regulated by the work of *homo faber* (Huizinga 1950:170). Inverted divine work of the gods, regardless of its observable anti-structured character, is the profane work of everyday society that reinforces social mores and norms. The normative structure represents the working equilibrium of everyday life, whereas “the anti-structure represents the latent system of potential alternatives from which novelty will arise” (Sutton-Smith 1977:18). But, potential alternatives arise if, and only if, the normative system requires it, and most importantly, if the normative system permits change. That is, the power of social movement and cultural action is dependent upon a shifting “political opportunity structure” (Tarrow 2011:18). Thus, while anti-structure may

be an inversion that reinforces social norms within religious ritual performances, “proto-structure” captures the subversive sense of the ludic components within festival performances that engender the potential to create alternative realities. Proto-structure is the precursor to innovative normative forms or as Smith-Sutton (1972:19) suggests, proto-structure is “the source of new culture.” Johan Huizinga (1950:1) puts this a little more forcefully when he states that “play is older than culture.”<sup>80</sup> Therefore, innovative and creative play is the vital component that engenders new culture. When framed within a commercial touristic event, play is free to subvert social norms and is neither limited, prescribed nor determined by normative social structures.

Playful symbols not only define and redefine the past; they dynamically redefine the present in a creative and innovative manner. Arnold van Gennep (1961) suggests that a “rite of passage” within small-scale societies may be about the change in social status of an individual, a cohort of individuals and about seasonal changes that impact on an entire society. Thus a rite of passage may transform a cohort of inept novices or initiands at a point of “life crises” into adept adults but, equally, a rite of passage may seasonally mark a collective transformation for an entire society. Separation, the first stage in a religious ritual process, demarcates sacred space and sacred time from profane space and profane time. This is more than a matter of physical movement and requires the “addition of a rite which changes the quality of time... or constructs a cultural realm which is defined as “out of time,” that is, beyond or outside the time which measures secular processes and routines” (Turner 1974:57). Festivals in post-industrial societies are the residue of these seasonal religious rites of passage, and *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* constructs a

---

<sup>80</sup> Regardless of how adequately or inadequately “culture” may be defined, it “always presupposes human society” (Huizinga 1950:1).

cultural realm that is medieval and therefore “out of time” and beyond secular processes and routines. Separation includes non-verbal symbolic behaviour and the symbolic reversal of secular relationships and processes. It involves a collective movement from all that is socially and culturally involved in a normative profane condition to a new sacred condition. For those taking part in a seasonal ritual rite, there may be no change in individual status, rather a whole series of changes in activities mark the collective movement to a sacred space.

Transition is the second stage of a rite of passage. Once out of secular space or secular time, a ritual activity marks a clear distinction between the sacred and the profane. During this intervening phase of transition, “the ritual subjects pass through a period and area of ambiguity, a sort of social limbo” (Turner 1974:57) that inverts their previous profane social status. Within the liminal phase of transition, situated at the edge or threshold of society, ritual initiations humble people before permanently elevating them to a higher social status. The humbling of initiands takes the form of mirroring or inverting both previous and forthcoming social statuses. Sharp symbolic inversions characterise liminality as initiands pass through a state of limbo where their previous social status is levelled.

During the liminal stage of religious rites of passage, initiands are thrust towards uniformity, anonymity and homogeneity. But within this sacred space, a special kind of freedom is acquired that charges initiands with licence to play with social norms. Thus, while initiands are humbled during liminal transition, they are simultaneously empowered with the ability to invert social norms, albeit a collective prescribed inversion. During a religious rite of passage novices are temporarily without social status. They are therefore weakened because their power comes from within a liminal structure, but it is limited because they have no power over the

normative structure. Liberated from social obligations, initiands are “betwixt and between” (Turner 1970:69) asocial places at the limits of society. Initiands are symbolically disconnected from the social world, but their performances are determined by it. They are in a state of orderly disorder that inverts but does not subvert normative order. While the normative order is a workaday equilibrium within everyday life, liminality is an upside down topsy turvy version of social norms where profane acts become sacred rituals and chaos prevails. In keeping with Tarrow’s (2011:18) “political opportunity structure,” anti-structured practice in a ritual context may represent latent potential alternatives “from which novelty will arise when contingencies in the normative system require it” (Sutton-Smith 1977:20).

Ritual liminal performances are disorderly and enable orderly reincorporation within society. While initiands are either subjugated or elevated during religious ritual rites of passage, they move towards a collective reincorporation and a collective subjugated or elevated social role. This elevation and reincorporated subjugation is really what is happening during *moros y cristianos* festivals. “Moors” occupy an elevated social status during these events, but it is a temporary status elevation and one that does not alter the status of Muslim migrants outside festival time. Structured separation followed by anti-structured performances at the threshold of society realises structured reincorporation. Regardless of the level of transgression performed at the edge of society, liminal processes are always connected with and determined by social norms. In short, liminality is an inversion and the compulsory work of the collective social.

Turner (1974:22) suggests that ritual rites of passage and liminal processes of transgression may be applied metaphorically to individual cultural practices in post-

industrial societies. Art, theatre, music, festivals and all manner of public cultural performances resonate closely with rites of passage. These performances move people from a profane to sacred space, perform transgressive acts that invert social norms and reincorporate the community who have been collectively altered by the experience. However, these artistic processes are entered into on a voluntary basis and are therefore neither the work of the gods nor the work of society. Rather, voluntary liminal cultural performances are leisure. They are of the liminal, but as Turner (1974:22-25) suggests, in a post-industrial society voluntary cultural performances are liminoid. The playful and ludic components within a liminoid performance are exaggerated and heightened, but not controlled by social norms. Liminoid performances are individual and idiosyncratic, but they are not an inversion of social order. In fact, they transmit the appearance of the existing social order. The playful elements within a liminoid performance are *the* powerful force for cultural change and *the* harbinger of latent potentials and alternative realities.

In contrast to the obligatory work of the gods, liminoid performances are voluntary and individual. They rely on the residue of a ritual frame, but liminoid performances are orderly and enable disorderly reincorporation within society. Liminoid performers are not subjugated during festivals, and they move towards individual reincorporation and an individual elevated social role. Liminoid performances are ludic, eccentric, superficial and experimental but not an inversion of social norms. Indeed, their transformative force is wholly reliant upon maintaining the appearance of being in concert with social norms. Or to put this differently, structured separation followed by structured performances at the threshold of society realise proto-structural reincorporation. Regardless of the level of cohesion performed at the edge of society, liminoid processes are never connected with or

determined by social norms. In short, liminoid performances are ultimately a subversion of social order and the voluntary play of the individual.

While liminal performances are free *from* and free *to* express inversion within a controlled space at the edge of society, liminoid performances are free *from* and free *to* express subversion within an uncontrolled reincorporated space. The force of liminal performers is realised at the edge of society; the force of a liminoid performance is realised within society. Most importantly, it is the superficial, commercial and touristic component within *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* that allows for creative proto-structural performances to emerge. It is precisely because the festival is a kitsch tourist event that there is licence to subvert social norms. Performances of culture within a commercial sphere are not prescribed. They are voluntary, innovative and designed to entertain.

Something akin to the character of ritual liminal phenomena emerges when discussing official festivals in Frigiliana as a mechanism to maintain social cohesion. The three religious festivals in the village reinforce an existing hierarchy and unequal social status. They are collective articulations concerned with social-structural rhythms or crisis. And they are public celebrations imbued with a forced obligation and the notion of work inherent within ritual performances. Conversely, something akin to the character of liminoid phenomena emerges when discussing festivals as a mechanism for social change in Frigiliana. The new festivals in the village are individual products that may have collective effects. They are plural, fragmentary and experimental performances developing at the margins of society. And they are idiosyncratic, quirky and voluntary activities void of ritual obligation.

Rather than view festivals as events that are outside ordinary time, their frequency of occurrence, vast variety of form and nonchalant local reception, place them firmly within the setting of the mundane and everyday—and this is just with respect to festivals in Frigiliana. When regional or province-wide celebrations are taken into account, it is difficult to find a time without festivals—to say nothing of festivals celebrated at a national level. The variety of forms that festivals take ranges from ones that are noticeable solely because they disrupt public transport or offer an opportunity for extended libations in honour of some saint or another, to full-blown public celebrations that either invert social order or espouse social change.

There is a plethora of festivals in Frigiliana that do not take the form of public performances and are only noticeable when an inept ethnographer attempts to get a bus to the next town only to be told by a polite passerby that, “there is no bus today, it’s a festival”. Or when questioned at 2am on a Wednesday morning as to why the local bar is uncharacteristically busy, the response is, “*hay una fiesta,*” (there is a fiesta). Which one? “*No sé.* [laughing] *Salud.*” (I don’t know. Cheers). Indeed, in the unlikely event that there is no “fiesta” in Frigiliana, there is going to be one in the nearby town of Nerja.

Festivals are everyday, but a version of the everyday that is extraordinarily theatrical. The technique of festival merges the mundane with the fantastical. It merges the sacred with the profane and illusion with truth. But it is not a comment *on* the social and not a comment *about* the social. Festivals are a comment *in* the social. The form that a festival takes directly impacts on its potential symbolic function. There are seven formal public festivals in Frigiliana, plus numerous informal ones. Some of them are exclusively religious, such as the Easter festival, and therefore resonate very closely to ritual liminal processes that reaffirm social

cohesion. Others, such as the *San Antonio de Padua* celebrations, take on an anti-social licentious character, a celebration of the expulsion of the “Moors” and “traditional” beauty pageants of the sort mentioned by Mintz (1997: 200) following the Francoist control of festivals. There are elements within each celebration in Frigiliana that fit, or to be more accurate, could be made to fit, within the approaches to festivals outlined above. Yet, the same people in the same village publicly perform all of these festivals. They perform cohesion and change, tradition and modernity and unity and distinction.

### **Other Festivals in Frigiliana**

Apart from *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* which will be discussed in detail in the next chapter, there are six other officially promoted festivals in the village. (1) *Festival Danza Oriental*. (2) *Carnaval*. (3) *El Día de las Cruces de Mayo*. (4) *Festival San Sebastián*. (5) *Semana Santa*. (6) *Feria de San Antonio de Padua*. *Festival Danza Oriental* and *Carnaval* festivals began since 2006, three are religious festivals and one sits somewhere in between.

#### ***Festival Danza Oriental***

*Festival Danza Oriental* is an indoor event performed on the last weekend of April every year. In short, this is a belly dancing show where a number of international and national dancers perform a series of belly-dances and modern dance based upon Arabic or Turkish themes. The festival began in 2006, the same year as *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, and is enthusiastically received by locals who applaud and cheer spontaneously throughout the performance. It is also worth pointing out that a peculiar form of reverence is evident during these performances that elevate its status towards an appreciation of “high cultural” practices. The audience at the festival are all locals and, for the most part, formally dressed. For the non-trained eye, and I

include myself within this category, the *Festival Danza Oriental* appears to be a rather repetitive spectacle, but the local audience see something else. They applaud and cheer following specific movements on the stage and appear to appreciate esoterically these performances. It appears as though the locals in Frigiliana are celebrating a component element of their way of life. They know why they are celebrating it and know when and where to applaud, and although this aspect of appreciation can be learned, the feelings attached to it elude the outsider. This festival was initiated in 2006, and while there is no direct or explicit local attempt to link it to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, it is “high cultural”. It is the front stage inspiration for the street theatre performed by “everyone” during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*.<sup>81</sup>

*Festival Danza Oriental* is the public performance of enjoyment that summarises the ideology behind *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The manner in which locals enjoy *Festival Danza Oriental* is difficult for the outsider to penetrate. This is a symbolic representation of the “other” Frigiliana, but one that is exclusively enjoyed by locals even though it is open to the public. Thus, *Festival Danza Oriental* is the foreground, front stage performance of local identity that complements and authenticates the idea of a plural local heritage. For all intents and purposes, *Festival Danza Oriental* is Frigiliana’s “high culture”.

### ***Carnaval***

The *Carnaval* festival in Frigiliana began in 2008. A young fiesta, it is celebrated on the first Saturday before the onset of Lent. While it frequently contains a Brazilian flavour and is supported by the town hall, the carnival depends on the participation

---

<sup>81</sup> The phrase “the festival is for everyone” was repeated to me on numerous occasions during my 18 months in Frigiliana with respect to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. When speaking about the San Antonio de Padua festival, I was often told, “It is not for everyone.”

of locals for its success, and their flamboyant and creative costumes add to the spectacle of the event. This is a procession that takes the form of a parade through the streets of the village. There are many varied and numerous themes expressed during the carnival, but as this is such a recent event, it does not quite reflect the upside down nature of carnivals experienced elsewhere. Groups of friends dress in themed costumes, such as Barbie dolls, American football teams, dancers and Egyptian pharaohs. However, there is no significant inversion of social roles or norms during *Carnaval*. This is a fun event as locals of all age groups dance their way through the newer section of the village heading towards la Plaza de las Tres Culturas where a marquee conceals a makeshift discotheque. Music, dance and merriment continue into the early hours of the morning.

#### *El Día de las Cruces de Mayo*

Nestling in between older festivals and the more recent inventions is *el Día de las Cruces de Mayo* (The Day of the May Crosses). The principal practice during this religiously themed festival involves placing elaborately constructed floral Christian crosses covered with vibrantly coloured flowers, predominantly red carnations, throughout the streets of the village. The town hall provides the music, food and local wine for all. Local understanding of the fiesta is somewhat inconsistent and one informant comes closest to explaining the fiesta by saying, “it is old and they made it again sometime ago.” This is similar to the Roman Catholic form of attending each of the Stations of the Cross on Good Friday, but there is no religious ritual held at the crosses during this festival. The public celebration disappeared completely during the Spanish Civil War and was reinstated by the local Agrupación de

Cofradíasen 1981.<sup>82</sup> “I always remember the fiesta when I was a child. Every house had a little altar, following Easter and up to Corpus Christi. There were always flowers and a cross decorated with flowers” (interview with Domingo 2011). Even though this festival was consistently celebrated during the Franco regime, in keeping with the form of public control exerted by the regime, its celebration was exclusively indoors (Mintz 1997). “We had altars in our houses when I was a child. And there was always a floral cross. It [the festival] moved outside a few years ago. It’s something to do with Lent and Corpus Christi, and the days in between them” (interview with Paco 2012).

Beginning at approximately 5pm, musicians perform at the first floral cross located in the Parque de Andalucía. Following a brief rendition of pasodobles and flamenco-styled songs, the audience sample some local wine and food. “*Es obligatorio*,” says Manolo, to take some of the wine and food offered, and it is considered rude not to participate. As there are twenty nine floral crosses located throughout the village, it becomes incrementally more difficult to comply with the obligation to drink the local wine as the procession moves from cross to cross. Three music groups begin to meander up and down a network of steps and streets stopping at each cross and singing for a few minutes before moving on to the next floral shrine. All the while, the amassing crowd becomes larger and louder and spends more time at each cross than the weary troubadours.

All three musical groups pause in front of the cross outside the Church and impromptu dancing and singing breaks out amongst the audience. Song choices become more eclectic as renditions of popular music intermingle with traditional

---

<sup>82</sup>*Agrupación de Cofradías* is a Catholic society of lay members that participate in an official capacity during public religious festivals.

pasodobles. After about an hour or so, the procession continues down the street, reaching its final destination conveniently located outside a bar. Dancing, singing and general merriment continue into the early hours. The folklorist would be disappointed with the *Cruces de Mayo* celebrations in Frigiliana. As Joseph Aceves (1971:51) notes with regard village celebrations in Castile, “For the folklorist, the fiesta will be a disappointment. No traditional costumes are worn and the music is more often standard pop and rock and roll than folk tunes.”

Food is a significant component within this festival. Moreover, “local” food is emphasised throughout the event. As participants sample the food on offer at each cross, the conversation turns to a discussion about how the food was prepared, what are the ingredients and, most tellingly, what is this particular dish called. That is, does it have a local label or could it be considered to have a generic label. These discussions turn in to small history lessons and reemphasise the inclusive nature of Frigiliana. As Stuart, from Scotland, tastes Consuela’s savoury tortilla served with a local sugar cane sauce (*miel de Frigiliana*), Consuela gives a full account of the history of the dish and why her mother made it in that way. Thus, the tortilla becomes localised and Stuart is considered similarly localised because he eats Consuela’s food.

### ***El Día de San Sebastián***

*El Día de San Sebastián* is a religious festival that celebrates the feast day of San Sebastián, patron saint of the village. It is held on the evening of 20 January every year. This is an almost exclusively religious celebration as a large procession follows a Holy Mass held in honour of San Sebastián through the older sections of the village down the street towards la Plaza del Ingenio. A statue of San Sebastián zigzags through the cobbled streets carried aloft by locals in tribute to their patron

saint. Crowds gather to enjoy the spectacle as the Banda Municipal Frigiliana (municipal band) entertains everyone. The procession culminates outside the Plaza del Ingenio and an elaborate fireworks display completes the procession. While everyone participates in the celebration, the form of the procession does not allow for spontaneous outbursts of song or dance. Notwithstanding the colourful music and spectacular fireworks, this is a subdued and sombre festival, and its religious components are emphasised throughout the celebration.

### *Semana Santa*

*Semana Santa* is one of the most solemn and explicitly religious celebrations in the village that marks the death and resurrection of Jesus Christ. Robed and hooded pallbearers carrying an assortment of different effigies walk through the streets of the village to the accompaniment of prayers and hymns. Celebrations begin with a ritual cleansing in the parish Church on Thursday evening, where the priest washes the feet of twelve locals, representing the twelve apostles. A covered cross is placed in front of the Church at 3pm on Good Friday signifying the hour and death of Jesus Christ. As evening falls, a candlelight procession of mourning local women carry an effigy of a deceased Christ up and down the narrow streets. Hymns, candles and the darkness of the village add to this sober religious occasion of faith. On Easter Sunday at midday, the Church bell rings out joyously announcing the resurrection as a more colourful procession carrying an effigy of Jesus is paraded through the streets.

Similar to Easter celebrations throughout Spain, this is a sombre and religious public celebration. There are no overt signs of tourism and no overt commercial displays. The entire procession is carried out in the streets without the involvement of any local cafés or restaurants. Unlike festivals in Toledo that celebrate Corpus

Christi, there are no national or regional flags held by the participants in Frigiliana.<sup>83</sup> Solemn hymns and prayers accompany the procession. This festival is a traditional event in the sense that its component parts have not been altered in more than 200 years. However, the content of the event is explicitly religious and constructed by the Catholic Church. So while this may be a “traditional” event, it is not one that naturally occurs in Frigiliana in isolation from the wider Catholic community.

### *Feria de San Antonio de Padua*

The June *feria* (fair) celebrating the feast of San Antonio de Padua contains many distinct and apparently disparate components. Yet all of these components combine into a five-day celebration that resonate closely with an interpretation of the re-emergence of festival in Spain following the Civil War. In particular, this festival privileges the appropriation of iconic regional symbols, such as bulls and flamenco. While they appear to be local symbols, they resonate closely with national symbols of Spain appropriated by the Franco regime (Parsons 2002:179-181; Santaolalla 2002:53). In addition, a beauty pageant that crowns the fiesta queen, licentious behaviour, nightly concerts and a religious pilgrimage all combine seamlessly during this five-day event.

A fairground is erected in the centre of the village where bumper-car rides, *churros* (doughnuts) stalls and shooting galleries pump out music day and night as they compete for business. This is a travelling fairground that can be seen in many parts of Spain during local *ferias*, and its components are typical of many fairgrounds throughout Europe. Local youths congregate around the fairground, and a large amount of alcohol consumption adds to the licentious aspect of the fiesta. There is a greater than normal Guardia Civil and Policía presence drafted in from the

---

<sup>83</sup> I attended the Corpus Christi Festival in Toledo in 2011.

surrounding villages and Málaga to police the event. They contain and control the more raucous elements within the celebration. Part of this celebration involves staying awake all night and drinking, and there are occasional scuffles amongst the crowd that require intervention by the Guardia Civil. This element of the fiesta resonates closely with notions of public licentious behaviour as a “safety-valve” mechanism that permits anti-social behaviour, up to a point, in a controlled and limited environment. Crowd safety and the international image of the village as a “tranquil” tourist destination are interrupted during the *Feria de San Antonio de Padua*, and a number of the locals do not enjoy this event.

A significant element of the *feria* is the bull running event held early on Sunday morning. Crowds gather to watch five or six *vaquillas* (small young bulls) chase an enthusiastic cross section of males draped in Spanish national flags up and down the slippery cobbles of the village. Culminating in the open space in front of Plaza del Ingenio, bare-chested males dressed in quasi-matador costumes perilously goad, prod and taunt the *vaquillas* under the watchful eye of a professional bullfighter. As these animals become more and more distressed, they are carefully removed from the cobbled arena and shepherded to the safety of a small pen. All the while music pumps out from the nearby fairground stalls as the Guardia Civil and Policía Local remove those deemed too inebriated to participate. While bull running has been part of the fiesta since its inception, its popularity has increased during recent years and over 2,000 people now come to watch the event.

The religious element of the fiesta centres on a celebration of San Antonio de Padua and a pilgrimage to a picnic site near the Higuera River, known as *el Pozo Viejo* (The Old Well). Beginning at the parish Church, a statue of San Antonio is placed in an oxen-drawn cart and followed by a procession of colourfully dressed

locals to the countryside where a picnic lunch, music and dance are celebrated by all. The pilgrimage is in honour of San Antonio de Padua and celebrates the Christian victory over Muslim forces during the final organised battle in the Muslim rebellion of 1569 at the Batalla del Peñón. Essentially, this festival is a celebration of the Christian victory, but this element of the event is not highlighted by the organisers or participants. The battles is not re-enacted, there are no mock battles, no triumphalism and no official attempt to publicise the battle. Indeed, the battle is rarely mentioned.

Finally, a concert stage is erected in the Plaza de las Tres Culturas where nightly renditions of flamenco dance and music are performed for the villagers. All of these elements within the fiesta, from beauty pageants to bull running, pilgrimage to flamenco, combine to create a “traditional” Spanish fiesta that fits neatly within a process Carrie. B Douglass (1991:126) calls the “fiesta cycles of Spain”. While certain elements of the *feria* may be practised in a slightly different manner in Frigiliana, the design of the fiesta resonates closely with major cultural themes articulated during numerous Spanish fiestas. The overall style of the *feria* articulates stereotypically Spanish themes as the religious and the secular seamlessly merge into a “traditional” manifestation of “folk” culture. Yet there is no evidence to suggest that these themes have emerged from the past; no evidence to suggest that they are “traditional” as they resonate closely with the construction of “folk” culture that emerged during the Franco regime. On the contrary, there is evidence to suggest that the Spanish elements within the *feria* were a conscious political appropriation and invention combined for convenient political ends throughout Spain. The *San Antonio de Padua* fiesta is brought to a close with a spectacular fireworks display and the party continues until the early hours.

Some of the cultural practices performed during *Feria de San Antonio de Padua* appear to be beyond the control of those who organise and practise them. This festival may be placed in direct contrast to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Specifically, locals often state that *Feria de San Antonio de Padua* is not for “everyone”. Some locals avoid or limit their participation in this public event. They complain about the noise, the drugs, the music, the drinking, the bullfighting and the crowds that the festival attracts. Some locals leave the village during the *Feria de San Antonio de Padua*. Privately, local politicians who organise this event articulate their discomfort with the licentious nature of the festival. Yet it continues. It appears as though a form of celebration that was devised locally no longer continues to represent the village, and yet it is the villagers who recreate the event each year and the villagers who participate in it. *Feria de San Antonio de Padua* appears to articulate an opposite narrative to the one being told during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, yet those who organise it appear powerless to cancel or even alter any of its unpopular components.

### *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*

The following chapter discusses the elements within *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The origins of this recent festival are known. It a new festival and its principal motivations are economic. It is reproduced because it is commercially successful. Yet its “social meaning” or “symbolic function” has nothing to do with its origins. Its meaning is a considered political move and directly linked to the writings of Blas Infante and the ideologies of Partido Andalucista— a fact that cannot be discerned from its historical origins. Its history is separate from its meaning, and although they are interdependent, its origins cannot be seen as more meaningful than its social meaning, or vice versa.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* reinforces local social cohesion by reaffirming the collective consciousness of the village, yet there are no anti-structured components within the festival. While informants suggest that the festival is for “everyone,” it is subverting a dominant monocultural narrative which suggests that it cannot be for everyone, not even the small Muslim migrant community in the village. Indeed, the *haram* and *treif* components within the festival exclude two thirds of the three cultures. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not an inversion of social norms, but it is a subversion of society. It is a considered political event and a considered form of recent cultural activism. From the perspective of social change, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*’ transcript does not appear to be hidden and therefore does not quite fit within interpretations of festivals that covertly articulate social change. Yet, as the next chapter will outline, the subversion of a dominant narrative is being articulated in indirect language that never reaches the level of explicit discourse. That is, the Franco regime or the dominant monocultural narrative that the festival opposes is never mentioned in those terms. Similar to *la Patum* festival in Berga, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* appropriates an existing institution of the state in order to oppose a dominant narrative. Similar to *la Patum*, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* plays with national terminology, national history and national traditions and presents them in local playful terms. Thus, the term “successive regime” is used as code for multiple Spanish regimes including *los Reyes Católicos*, Franco and the Francoist state, but these words are never expressed publicly. It is this playful component within festivals that espouse social change that is their powerful force. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* plays with a pervasive dominant narrative in a ludic and farcical manner dressed up for tourists and validated by commerce in the final

instance. The play within *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* always means something and, in this instance, commercially motivated play is the source of new culture.

# Chapter Four: Tarrying with the Positive “Other”

At the beginning of the last week in August, the process that transforms the village into a medieval theme park commences. Colourful floral displays are peppered throughout the village all year round but, in August, there is an exponential increase in colour and placement. Every nook and cranny of the village is filled with a variety of flowerpots and plants. All of the public spaces, roundabouts and parks are bursting with colour. The vibrant display is exaggerated by the brilliance of recently whitewashed façades, painted by local women, augmented with blue undercoats that intensify their white exteriors. The village is in pristine condition.

Maybe it's because it's a small town, I don't know. Maybe it's because of the village, it's just a feeling. Everyone keeps the village clean. Everyone puts flowers out to make the town look very cheerful and clean and beautiful for people to see it. And I think the locals enjoy everything they do. They are very proud of their town and of every single thing they can organise. (Tourist from Nerja 2010)

On Monday morning the formal front stage transformation begins. Small groups of workers gather and delegate upcoming tasks. Crews of workers begin to install colourful bunting on all of the main streets. A large concert stage, the centre piece of the festival, is erected in la Plaza de las Tres Culturas. All manner of lighting and sound equipment fills the square. Workers begin to install an extensive public address system throughout the village spaced approximately twenty meters apart and running from Parque de Andalucía to the end of Calle Real. The overall pace of the village appears to increase, and there is a sense that something is coming. The hustle and bustle of tourists arriving from Nerja adds to an impending sense of excitement in the village. August is always the busiest time of the year for tourism in

Spain, as it coincides with the traditional holiday period in much of Europe, including Spain. The streets are now decorated with buntings emblazoned with multiple Jewish, Christian and Muslim symbols. Red, yellow, purple and green buntings diffuse the penetrating August sun and offer some shade to the burgeoning crowds. Red, yellow and purple were the colours of the Republican flag (1931-1939). Green is the colour of Andalusia and Islam. While the colour choices appear to be significant, the organisers of the event insist that they are randomly chosen by the workers putting up the buntings. All of the cafés are readily installing outdoor counters, and workers are busily unloading boxes of food. A network of stalls is assembled on la Plaza de las Tres Culturas and all manner of goods and foods are being unpacked or set up for display. Stalls are also assembled in la Plaza del Ingenio and the initial 200 meters of Calle Real. With the artisan market hub of the festival in place, trade begins almost immediately. The festival used to be a three-day event, but because stallholders assembled their stalls on Thursdays and began trading as soon as they are ready, the town hall decided to turn it into a four-day event. When there is a lull in the din and hubbub, the sweet dulcet tones of medieval style music creep in from the background public address system. For the next four days, Sephardic, Andalusí and medieval style music broadcast from the sound system will fill up any empty soundscapes in the village.

The stalls and vendors in the artisan marketplace are dressed in faux medieval costumes. The design of the stalls is strictly controlled by the festival organisers. Stalls must appear to be medieval and special attention must be paid to the lights being used. Light bulbs should not be visible and should be low wattage bulbs emitting a low level of light. Cloth covering the stall frontage must look

medieval and capture the sense of a medieval market.<sup>84</sup> Attention should be paid to the overall effect created by the combination of lighting and cloth and every effort should be made to ensure that the overall display of goods for sale invokes “three cultures”. Stall holders dress in faux belly dancing costumes and/or kaftans to complete the North African style. All sorts of turbans, head scarves and hats add to the medieval theme. Appropriate clothing, must be inspired by the “three cultures” and the rules of the event suggest an Arabic, Jewish or medieval Christian style of clothing.<sup>85</sup> Locals apply an extremely loose definition to the “three cultures” dress code as they play with multiple styles of hats and costumes that appear to be medieval. Moreover, before an application for a stall permit will be accepted, applicants must outline their selected wardrobe choices.<sup>86</sup> In addition to the dressing up of market stalls and vendors, local children are the first to fashion themselves as medieval. As clowns, face-painters and magicians take their place amongst the crowds, bejewelled and bedazzled children join in the fun. Their costumes add an additional splash of colour to the event but also cause local adults to stop and admire the decoration. Unaccustomed to shying away from praise, local children happily engage in impromptu dance performances encouraged by the clinking and jangling sounds coming from their fake coin belts.

An eclectic mix of goods are prepared for sale, and in direct contrast to the goods offered at regular travelling markets, no “fake” football jerseys, toiletries,

---

<sup>84</sup> *Adecuación de la decoración y detalles a la época medieval y andalusí. Se pondrá especial atención a la adecuación de la iluminación (bombillas no visibles), de las telas, y de su conjunto.* (Appendix B)

<sup>85</sup> With respect to “clothing” in culture theme parks, Edward M Bruner (1994) observes that denim jeans once evoked the past in an Abraham Lincoln theme park, but as denim jeans became popular fashion items, actors in the New Salem theme park had to dress up in clothing that would appear to be more “authentic”. Consequently, the “authentic” past is not only a presentist “idea,” it is also directly influenced by what people are doing, and wearing, in the present.

<sup>86</sup> *No se aceptaran solicitudes en las que no quede claro el vestuario que se llevara a cada mercado.* (Appendix B)

watches or handbags are available. In their place, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* vendors trade medieval themed homemade sweets, herbs, spices, handmade soaps and wooden children's toys, which sit seamlessly alongside beer and hotdog stalls. "Modern" commodities on sale during the festival are either "medievalised" by way of costume, the visible artisan component within their production, the clothes worn by the vendor or a combination of all three. They must reflect and represent the character of the medieval era in design, quality or variety of products.<sup>87</sup>

Contemporary commodities on sale during the festival, such as beer, hotdogs and iPad covers, do not capture the medieval epoch. Yet, they appear to be authentic because they are served from a low lit stall dressed up in medieval cloth, made in front of the customer by a bejewelled belly dancing server or, in the case of the iPad covers, handmade. Some of the stalls sell wooden toys, spices and herbal remedies that could potentially be categorised as medieval. The iPad covers are handmade from suede or leather, and their material somehow manages to conjure up the past. The material used in the commodities for sale in conjunction with the visible handicraft or artisan component within their production authenticates them as "medieval".

Whether or not the festival is an "authentic" representation of a medieval village does not appear to be a significant concern. If a sixteenth-century villager were to walk through the artisan market hub, it would be clear that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a contemporary festival. Yet, this superficial dressing up of the village and its inhabitants has a transformative and dramatic effect on both locals and visitors. "I think it's part of the culture here. It's not something you learn, it's a

---

<sup>87</sup> *Productos. Se seleccionaran en función de su calidad, variedad de productos, adecuación a la época recreada, y presentación de los mismos.* (Appendix B)

way of life, and in Nerja it's totally different," says a tourist from Nerja. Within a matter of hours, the final touches that complete the stylisation of the village almost intuitively bring participants back to the past. Whether or not the festival is an "authentic" representation of medieval people in the village does not appear to be a significant concern either. The clothing chosen by participants evokes the past but does not distinguish the wearer as Jewish, Christian or Muslim. This of itself is quite interesting because actual medieval Jews, Christians and Muslims could not be distinguished as a result of their everyday clothing. This led to the imposition of clothing regulations that marked the wearer out as being Jewish, Christian or Muslim. Thus, the fact that the participants in the festival follow a medieval "theme" rather than an explicit rule to dress up "authentically" as a Jew, Christian or Muslim, probably makes the costumes more genuine. This is particularly evident if the mixed everyday clothing worn in Frigiliana is compared to the extravagant costumes worn during "traditional" *moros y cristianos* festivals that clearly mark distinctions between groups. There is an obvious distinction between dressing up in every day clothing and orientalisising the marauding "moor".

On Thursday evening as the numbers increase in the market place and commercial exchange is in full progress, it looks like the festival has begun. But at 5pm, with an attention grabbing burst of flame from a fire-eater, a street performer cries out a welcome to the village and formally opens the festival. The discordant tones of a zurna and a naqqara drum set the tone for the next few days as the street performers meander through the crowd. All of the cafés are full to capacity and most people are sitting outside in the sun watching the festival, chatting about the costumes and the food on sale. A traffic jam, which will last for the next four days, begins to form on the road from Nerja, and the Guardia Civil begin to shepherd

revellers across the road. A falconry display grabs the attention of visiting children as mothers pushing prams vie for vantage points. The occasional sound check booms out from the concert stage and a variety of street performers mingle amongst the throng of people.

As sporadic singing and dancing break out, prompted by the street performers, tourists line up to record and photograph the merriment. By 6pm the festival is in full swing and tourists pass by with T-shirts that say, “*Yo completé la Ruta de la Tapa. Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas 2012*” (I completed the Tapa’s Route 2012). Everyone squints to see if the T-shirt says “2012”. Following looks of disbelief and discussions about the impossibility of completing the *Ruta de la Tapa* in one hour, tourists are beckoned over in order to validate the claim adorned on their T-shirts. It transpires that even though the festival started just an hour ago, their claim to have completed the *Ruta de la Tapa* turns out to be true.

### **Ruta de la Tapa**

“I was a little bit afraid, let’s say, that because of the tapas route, there would be many drunken people,” says Anna who moved to Frigiliana from Nerja in 2011, “but that doesn’t happen, no no never,” she says. Despite the fact that the tapas route involves drinking a lot of alcohol, I have never seen any anti-social behaviour or drunkenness at this festival. That is not to say that I have not seen drunken anti-social behaviour at other festivals. During the San Antonio de Padua festival, locals can be seen getting drunk, falling about and acting in a violent manner. But *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* creates a different atmosphere in the village. “Nobody is rude or unfriendly, they’re smiling and happy. That is the point,” says a tourist from Nerja. Maria Jose says, “During the *Feria* [de San Antonio de Padua] we have the

bull-run. But, there is always fighting. That's the way it is with *Ferías*. If you go to Nerja or wherever it's the same. But that doesn't happen at the three cultures. Ok, the most you'll see is people smoking pot. So, it's very nice."

The *Ruta de la Tapa* is one of the central features of the festival. As much as this is a culturally themed festival, it is also a food festival. In order to disperse the crowds throughout the village, 18 cafés offer a small portion of food, *tapa*, accompanied by a drink for €1.50.<sup>88</sup> The drink is a 20cl offering of beer or wine or soda. At each participating café, which is identified by an official yellow "medieval" flag inscribed with *Ruta de la Tapa*, revellers present a printed card that is duly stamped in order to indicate participation. This is essentially a bar crawl and weary participants are rewarded with the aforementioned T-shirt when the *Ruta* (tour) is completed. In addition to collecting a T-shirt, participants vote on the best tapas offered. This not only allows for comments about participating cafés, but also allows the organisers to collect vital data about the "type" of tourist attending the festival. 635 people completed the *Ruta de la Tapa* in 2009 in eight participating bars generating €7,620 in revenue. In 2010, an unexpected 1,130 visitors and locals alike completed the event held in 11 bars and restaurants and generated just under €20,000 in revenue. The unexpected rise in participants in 2010 meant that for the first time ever the organisers had to order more T-shirts.

In 2011, 1,997 people completed the *Ruta de la Tapa* that was divided equally into two separate *tapa* tours. 18 participating cafés participated in the *Ruta Morisca y Ruta Mudéjar*. The footfall was distributed evenly amongst nearly double the amount of cafés, and the total income increased to just under €27,000. For the

---

<sup>88</sup> The price has increased to €2 per *tapa* for the 2013 festival. 23,562 were sold in 2013 generating €47,124 in revenue (Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas 2013).

2012 festival, the *Ruta de la Tapa* was dispersed between seventeen participating cafés, 9 on the *Ruta Morisca* and 8 on the *Ruta Mudéjar*. 1,723 people completed the tour and consumed 13,595 drinks and tapas, which generated recorded revenue of €20, 392.<sup>89</sup> These figures only account for those who have completed the *tapa* tour and do not factor in the many visitors and locals who do not complete the tour. Often, festival revellers stay in one café, especially if the food on offer is good. The festival is all about tolerance and an appreciation for lost heritage, but for contemporary Jews or Muslims, the pork and alcohol content within the *Ruta de la Tapa* prohibits them from participating. This appears to be an unusual and contradictory component within the event. While the festival is calling for religious inclusion, Jews and Muslims are conspicuously absent from the celebrations. For the medieval *moriscos* or *mudéjares*, the former may have been forced to participate in the public consumption of pork and alcohol in order to prove they were not crypto-Jews or crypto-Muslims. Similar to contemporary Muslims, medieval *mudéjares* could not participate due to their dietary restrictions.

For those who want to set up a stall, the town hall charge a fee of €50 for each meter of frontage and €150 for each meter of food stalls. There is a 50% discount for village residents.<sup>90</sup> In brief, the registration fee, stall fees and the small entrance fees charged for concerts in the Casa de Aperro finance the festival, pay for the performers and pay for the decoration of the village. While some of the café owners stress that they use the festival as a marketing tool to advertise their businesses, others use the festival to generate much needed income. The financial

---

<sup>89</sup> Information received from town hall. Last year's statistics are available on the official web site. (<http://www.festivalfrigiliana3culturas.com/en/news.html>)

<sup>90</sup> *Paradas artesanas: 50 € por cada metro frontal. Paradas de alimentación: 150 € por cada metro frontal (se debe pagar por el espacio que ocupen mesas y sillas). Para los residentes en Frigiliana Paredes artesanas: 40 € por cada metro frontal: Paradas de alimentación: 75 € por cada metro frontal (incluido mesas y sillas)* (Appendix B)

rewards for their efforts may appear a little low when the work involved in setting up a stall and the long hours are taken into account. Depending on the popularity of the goods on sale and the location of the stall, it is possible to make a profit/wage of approximately €2,000 during the four days, although this is usually divided between at least three or four people.

### **Mojitos: The Medieval Drink?**

Apart from the official *Ruta de la Tapa* establishments, there is a wide variety of food and drink for sale during the festival. Indeed, mojito stalls have been growing in popularity and number during the last few years to such an extent that they form part of an unofficial *Ruta del Mojito*. The Cuban cocktail is not an authentic medieval drink, but it receives the same stylisation as iPad covers and hotdogs. When dressed up in medieval production processes, mojitos can acquire the title of “authentic” medieval drinks.

It is not consumption that defines commodities as being authentic, for in Frigiliana, it is production that defines commodities as being authentic. It is the visible processes of production that define the values being attached to food that marks them out as being local and genuine. More than the flow of commodities from centre to periphery through numerous scapes (Appadurai 1986), the appearance of the production process in the commodity creates a corporeal attachment to commodities as they are somatically rather than symbolically consumed. “Postmodern society is now seen as being more or less synonymous with consumer society” (Ritzer 1998:1). Yet, the relations of production, central to the reproduction of social relations, appear to be neglected when exchange, consumption and the flow of commodities are the only lens through which society is determined (Dilley 2004).

The commodity produced for consumption in Frigiliana is the village itself, or rather, a sense of ethnicity that is engendered through the visible components of production on show during a cultural performance. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* brands all of the commodities during the festival by imposing rules relating to the theme, style or taste of products on sale, or the costumes worn by their vendors. The medieval authenticity within these commodities is made visible to all because the production process is made visible. No amount of packaging or branding could create the notion that somehow mojitos were the preferred choice of drink for medieval Jews, Christians and Muslims. Yet, packaging, branding and the visible production of these mojitos produces them as medieval and the two most popular stalls adopt this approach. Other mojito vendors pour a readymade mix into a large plastic cup, drop in a straw and serve the cocktail. The process of production is relatively invisible, and the readymade mixture is frequently positioned out of sight. The exchange of money completes the transaction and alienates any potential value that may be associated with its production.

The first is an African/Indian themed herbal tea stall. The vendor fills a plastic cup with ice and pours in a large quantity of rum. Then she pauses and looks up at the client in a process that authenticates the alcohol content of the drink. Following a nod of agreement, the production continues. Limes are sliced up and mint is ripped from an enormous pile of the herb and placed into a large pestle. Sugar is added and a wooden mortar crushes the mixture into a sweet sludge. Following another exchange of nods, the mixture is added to the cup of rum and ice and topped up with sparkling water, stirred and served with a smile. Many people stop to watch this performance and all agree that these are the best tasting mojitos on offer during the festival.

The second stall replicates the first during the production process but has an added ingredient that further enhances the value of production. Locally grown sugar cane stands in a large barrel at the side of the stall, and it is pushed through a hand press by the vendor before he serves each drink. Crowds gather just to watch the production process, and this is by far the most frequented mojito stall. Queues of 15 to 20 customers form to sample this locally produced mixture and crowds are drawn to the stall by the constant flash of tourists' cameras. While the mojitos taste nice, the sugar cane is sickly sweet and produces a cloudy mixture that sticks to everything. So, this is not necessarily the "best" mojito on sale because when compared with the taste of the African/Indian vendor's mixture, the sugar cane mojito is too sweet, sticky and leaves a sugary aftertaste. However, it is not the consumption of the commodity that adds value to it. Rather, it is the visible production process that distinguishes it from all other competing mojito stalls. The visible "production itself becomes an object of consumption... [and] the image and experience of the production process is consumed — even photographed" (Dilley 2004:804). As visitors have witnessed and photographed the production process for themselves, it forms a central component within the consumption process. The sense of authenticity is created for the consumer by participating within a production process that relates to "traditional" methods of production. These visible processes are in direct opposition to the invisible processes of production consumed in the readymade mojitos.

Some distinct interpretations of the meaning within the production process may emerge that charges products with authenticity. The products act as an objectification of the "interaction of skills, raw materials, and processes of technology" (Dilley 2004:805) that remain open to different cultural interpretations.

The tourist constructs a memento of experience, a memory, which they have witnessed and understood in terms of the authenticity within the product consumed. The authenticity of the product becomes manifest in the visible participation in the handicraft or traditional production processes. The producers of the mojitos objectify their “hereditary occupational craft” (ibid.) that set them apart from the mass production of premixed cocktails. As for the local consumer, they see tourists tasting locally grown sugarcane. They witness the potential to integrate multiple ethnicities within their village and observe the value of harmonious near interfaith utopia embodied in the somatic experience of production.

### **Food and Festival**

Initially envisaged as an exclusively gastronomic festival, food remains an essential element of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. There are a number of medieval “fast foods” prepared by street vendors throughout the market stalls. During the past few years, the *halal* kebab stall has gained a reputation for serving especially tasty and authentic food. Every evening during the four-day event, a large queue forms in front of the “themed” kebab stand as customers flock to enjoy sliced lamb spiced with turmeric, cumin and cinnamon. Smoke billows from a full leg of pork roasting on an open fire at another stall as two food vendors dressed in Moroccan “styled” clothing prepare a medieval themed platter of roasted pork. Beer and sizzling hot dogs are sold at the next stall, and the female vendors are dressed in faux belly dancing costumes as they rhythmically serve awaiting customers to the sounds of Arabian themed music. Although the food on sale originates from a global menu that includes bratwurst and tortilla wraps, typically Spanish foods for sale during the *San Antonio de Padua* festival, such as churros, are not on offer during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*.

Full “festival” menus are available in a couple of local restaurants each year that offer patrons the chance to taste medieval Spain. The €15 menus consist of a starter, main course and dessert and each dish must represent an authentic medieval experience. Thus, a Jewish-themed starter of almond soup or baked aubergine is available followed by a Muslim-themed lamb shoulder or Christian chicken dish. For dessert, the choice is a Muslim date dish or a Christian sweet fruit pie. None of these dishes are prepared in keeping with Muslim or Jewish dietary practices even though the main theme of the event is an acknowledgement of an interfaith heritage. If *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is articulating “living-togetherness” and *convivencia* (Castro 1971), it is minus *kosher* or *halal* considerations. Serving medieval food from three distinct religious groups apparently reinforces the harmonious aspect of medieval Frigiliana, but neither observant Jews nor Muslims can share in the experience. If the festival is an attempt to experience “living-togetherness,” some of its essential ingredients maintain segregation and do not include “everyone”.

Food flavours the intercultural encounter alongside an artisan medieval themed marketplace. “*Berenjenas y huevos al horno con espinacas.... el tajín de cordero con tabulé...el ajo blanco, el asado de carne con garbanzos a la antigua y el bacalao en ensalada de naranjas*” (aubergines and baked eggs with spinach .... lamb tajín with tabbouleh ... white garlic soup, roast beef with chickpeas and cod and orange salad) (El País 2006) spice-up Frigiliana’s festival and encourage participants to spread out beyond the music and artisan marketplace into the pueblo’s cafés, bars and restaurants where “*convivieron en armonía judíos, musulmanes y cristianos*” (Jews, Christians and Muslims lived together in harmony) (ibid.). Multicultural themed lunch is offered for €15 in three of the village’s restaurants:

“Three Cultural” menus offer a taste of medieval Jewish, Christian and Muslim dishes, but it is worth restating that should a patron happen to be either Jewish or Muslim, none of the food on offer is prepared in keeping with *kosher* or *halal* food practices.<sup>91</sup> Rafa brought a Tass, a silver Moroccan hand washing set, back from a trip to North Africa and used to ask patrons to ceremonially wash their hands before eating his medieval menu, but it took too long “as queues of people formed waiting to wash their hands rather than for the tables” (Interview 2010).

Many cafés in Frigiliana offer *tapas* throughout the year. Although there is a range of pricing policies with respect to *tapas*, there is an unwritten rule that they are free when they accompany a small beer, wine or soda. A refrigerated cabinet sits atop the counters in most cafés containing a selection of *tapas*. There are some similarities with respect to the type of *tapas* available within different cafés, but as a rule, the *tapa* menu changes on a daily basis. For €1.50, if a patron is sitting at a counter, a 33cl beer or large glass of wine is accompanied by a small dish filled with two or three bites of warm or cold food. All *tapas* are served with a small portion of bread. *Carne con tomate* regularly appears on café menus. This is a pork and tomato stew served warm. Russian salad frequently appears as a potential selection, as do *salchichas* (small boiled sausages) served warm in an onion sauce caramelised with *miel* (honey) made from local sugarcane. Tortilla features on almost every *tapas* menu, but there are regular guest appearances, such as chicken wings, *bombas* (deep-fried potatoes stuffed with sauce), *albóndigas* (meatballs), and *chorizo al vino* or

---

<sup>91</sup> *Kosher* and *halal* food preparation practices are extremely strict with the former containing more regulation than the latter. *Kosher* cooking and eating utensils, including the oven, must be ritually blessed by a Rabbi before being used. There is a complicated list of prohibited foodstuffs outlined in the Book of *Vayikra* (Leviticus). In short, pork, or any animal/crustacean that may have eaten pork is prohibited. *Halal* prohibitions are a little less restrictive where the principal prohibitions relate to pork, blood and alcohol. Pork, blood (*morcilla de Burgos*) and alcohol are used like condiments in Spain.

*gambas pil pil*. All of the *tapas* are produced locally and all have been ascribed local or national names. The food served during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is very different from the usual food available in the village. It clearly originates from outside Frigiliana and it is full of spices and different flavours.

Conversations throughout the year regularly begin with a lengthy discussion regarding the different food on offer each day. Compliments are passed on to the chef, who is usually the bar tender, regarding the quality of the food. These conversations can be quite lengthy, detailed and concerned with the intricate methods involved in the cooking process. For the most part, *tapas* are *por la invitación* (complimentary) and, as they are accompanied by bread, they are quite filling. Three *tapas* are sufficient for lunch, but they serve another purpose. They slow down or inhibit the effects of the alcohol. Lunchtime is the principal time of the day for consuming *tapas*, but they are served throughout the day. While all of the *tapas* are prepared freshly each day using local produce, they are often cooked without the addition of spices. Even salt and pepper are used sparingly during the cooking process. It is fair to say that the flavour of food in the village is rather mild. The addition of spices is a further cause for conversation as most of the *tapas* on offer adhere strictly to local cooking methods. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* brings a wide variety of different foods and spices to the village and provides the opportunity to taste “other” foods that would not normally appear in the village throughout the year.

### **“We are all al-Ándalus”: The Overt Transcript of the Festival**

Ok, so the part that’s commercial, with music and everything, is important. But fundamentally, the principal of the festival is culture. It’s an idea through which we can recognise, understand and look for the identity of the village.

Andalusian identity does not end here in one village, but we have to recognise that our identity is part Muslim and part Jewish. (Paco, interview 2012)

At 6pm each evening during the festival, public conferences are held in the courtyard in la Casa de Apero.<sup>92</sup> From amongst all of the other elements within the event, this one appears to be an unusual inclusion within the festival program. The conference is exactly as one would expect a conference to be. A formal table is placed on a platform in the courtyard and rows of seats are placed facing the stage. The formal register of the occasion does not appear to fit within the idea of a tourist festival. There are no public conferences during any of the other festivals held in the village. In 2010, following a brief apology about the heat and a unanimous, exasperated “*que calor,*” by the audience, the first speaker is introduced. Professor Antonio Manuel Rodríguez Ramos, Professor of Law in the Universidad de Córdoba, author of several monographs, poems, novels and music, winner of several literary awards, and member of Partido Andalucista. The list continues for a while as Antonio Manuel’s latest book, *La huella Morisca, el al-Ándalus que llevamos dentro* (2010) (The Footprint of Islam that we Carry Within) is presented to the audience. Antonio Manuel begins by thanking the villagers of Frigiliana for the opportunity to speak to them today. He thanks the organisers for inviting him during such a magnificent event and says he feels at home when he is in Frigiliana. It would be a little bit of an understatement to say that Antonio Manuel is an engaging orator. He mentions his political affiliation to Partido Andalucista and discusses some of the ideologies and writings of Blas Infante. Within a matter of minutes the audience are riveted to their seats. As the tone of his voice deepens and he becomes more and more animated, he paints a vivid picture of a lost and hidden history in the village that has been silenced. He uses the term “amputated” by “successive regimes”.

---

<sup>92</sup> The festival timetable changed in 2013, and the public conferences are now held at 12 noon.

See, before we didn't know 'exactly' what happened with our history. We had books talking about the other version and now we are hearing and reading about this version. Not only about Spain, but about Catholic missions, So, I think we were not the 'good people' that we were supposed to be, so that's changing now. Our children are learning a bit more. (Maria Jose interview 2011)

The impact of the term "amputated" is dramatically heightened when Antonio raises his hand clearly indicating his amputated finger. The metaphors continue: "History, identity and memory," he says, are three separate jugs of water. They are all different but when mixed together they are impossible to separate. "Identity is contextual," he says. Remembering for one moment that this is a culture/food festival, the tone of this talk is distinct from the fun/face-painting festival happening outside the courtyard. It is equally entertaining, but a rather different form of entertainment. Antonio goes on to explain how identity is dependent on context. With the audience engrossed, Antonio lowers and lowers the volume of his voice to an almost silent whisper.

"History is written by the victors," he says, to the hushed courtyard where you could hear a pin drop. "It is outside the individual," he says. Without need for explanation with respect to the identity of those "victors" the audience nod their heads in agreement. It is as if everyone is just noticing that the "good guys" may have been the "bad guys," and the history that they have been brought up on might be a fabrication. With the audience in his grasp, his voice and argument rise in a concordant crescendo. "History exists outside the individual. Identity is contextual and resides in the mind, but memory resides in the heart," he says. With the audience enthralled but slightly puzzled, Antonio explains that memory is protected from possible contamination or manipulation by outside forces because it lies deep within

the internal organs of the body. Memory is a collective concept and, with his voice now booming out, “if for any reason you doubt your memories, go outside, touch the buildings in this village and you can feel your hidden memories.”<sup>93</sup> With respect to the heart, it is a metaphor *par excellence* “because it expresses the inner self and an unchanging nature which endures with the full force of physical life even when silence is imposed” (Passerini 2009:24).

The crowd erupts into rapturous applause. It has taken just under two hours to get to this point, and it was exhausting to listen to in the blistering August heat, but it was an excellent unscripted speech made by a magnificent orator. Antonio signs copies of his book, chats with everyone in the crowd and relaxes as the evening becomes a little cooler. While there will be more to come from Antonio during the next two days, his initial speech was well received by the villagers. Without analysing Antonio’s argument, there a few things worth pointing out with respect to the audience’s reaction. It was as if they were hearing this information for the first time. This appears hard to believe, but Antonio’s use of metaphors seems to have strongly resonated with the crowd. Afterwards, everyone agreed that they were aware of the concepts being discussed by Antonio, but they had never thought about

---

<sup>93</sup> During the public conferences in 2013, Antonio Manuel was speaking about the origins of the Córdoba Mosque. In a dynamic and animated presentation that echoed his discussion about the place of memory, history and identity in 2010, Antonio Manuel fulfilled his now expected entertaining and emotive lecture. While summing up, he apologised for going over his allotted time. The conference was supposed to last for thirty minutes and it had taken two hours. He placed his hand on his heart and said: “I always speak from the heart first.” Then he slowly moved his hand over his mouth. “What is in my heart comes directly to my mouth.” He then placed his hand upon his forehead. “Then I think about what I’ve said.” The audience politely laughed as they acknowledged his time overrun. As an accomplished author, professor of Law, and known PA politician Antonio Manuel appeared to be humbling himself before the villagers. However, they, and particularly I, should have known better. He repeated the gesture, quickly this time, and put his hand to his heart, mouth and forehead. Then he bowed his head a little. “Islam teaches us to speak from the heart,” he said, and then he moved on to thanking the organisers for the festival and concluded his lecture. This subtle Islamic salutation went unnoticed by most of the audience. It is one of the few times during the festivals that an overt religious sentiment emerges.

the manipulation of their history, heritage, sense of identity, culture and tradition in that way before. Maybe it is better to say that they never had a public space to talk about their history before. Moreover, they had not considered that memory might be a collective concept and a true account of the past, as suggested by Antonio. Everyone picked up the cue with respect to the “successive regimes”. Everyone was aware that successive regimes were really the “bad guys” before Antonio told them. The manner in which Antonio delivered his argument, through personal stories, was illuminating for the audience.

Leaving Antonio’s argument aside, there is a more fundamental point to be made with respect to the *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. First, Antonio’s conference speech was delivered in Spanish, and therefore was not really for “everyone” attending the festival. Second, the transcript being delivered was not hidden. It was overtly political, explicitly aimed at Partido Andalucista members in the audience and a direct challenge to the myth of Spanish unity which continues to circulate throughout Spain. As such, the transcript behind *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is overt. For this moment, the transcript of the festival is not merely implied, in the manner that Scott (1990) suggests. The transcript articulated during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not invisible, it is by design, and it articulates social change. Whether or not Antonio’s argument is right, convincing or otherwise, it is explicit, overt and direct. It leaves the listener in no doubt about the meaning expressed during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, as long as the listener understands Spanish, understands what is meant by coded terms, such as “successive regimes” and understands recent Spanish history. In and amongst all the talk of tolerance, there is a public transcript of intolerance directed northward towards Madrid and central

Spain.<sup>94</sup> Yet, the kind of social change that is being called for remains unclear, as the reign of “successive regimes” is long past.

The following evening, Antonio Manuel introduces the next speaker, Sebastián de la Obra, Director of the library Casa de Sefarad Library, historian, archivist, and former President of the Human Rights Association of Andalusia, renowned for his activism and campaigns for the rights of migrants. The impressive résumé continues for a while. While Antonio Manuel had focused on the footprint of Islam within the local population, Sebastián de la Obra focuses on Sephardic heritage. Within all of the celebrations during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, the documented presence of Jews in the village gets the least attention. *Moriscos*, *mudéjares* and North African culture are given much more billing during the festival and throughout the year. Even though the Star of David is the most prominent symbol within the compounds of symbols in the village, Jews are subsumed within the overarching category of “three cultures”. Sebastián de la Obra redresses this imbalance. His unscripted speech is a little more measured than the previous night’s, less personal and minus the metaphors. Yet it is delivered with ferocious passion that captures the sense that Sephardic heritage has been systematically erased from Spanish history. Following two and a half hours of table banging exposition, shocked and stunned would be an accurate way to describe the audience’s reaction.

As I walked out of the Casa de Aperro, Anna agreed with Sebastián de la Obra’s assertion the too much emphasis had been placed on the village’s Muslim heritage. “We have to have something to remember it or else we’ll forget our heritage, said Paco. “So the symbol, the Star of David and the Crescent Moon, that’s the idea

---

<sup>94</sup> The mere mention of the “north” or “Madrid” is regularly received with a laugh or dismissive giggle during these public conferences.

behind the festival. We don't want to have a bad commercial festival. We want a cultural festival. Ok, for tourism, but the cultural part is more important. And we want a festival that emphasises our culture. And we have a history here of Andalusia where three cultures lived together in harmony, in peace. And, this is a village in Andalusia, so it represents the rest of Andalusia," said Paco.

Antonio Manuel and Sebastián de la Obra introduce the next night's speaker to a packed courtyard, Manuel Pimentel Siles, businessman, writer, ex-national politician, former president of the Partido Popular in Andalusia, former Minister of Employment and Social Welfare (1999-2000) in the PP national government (1996-2004). Pimentel resigned his ministerial post in 2003 because of his opposition to Spain's role in the Iraq War. He begins to talk with all of the confidence of a national politician accustomed to public speaking. "I'm Spanish," he says, "Catholic....," but Sebastián de la Obra interrupts and points out that he is probably Jewish. The audience laughs. "Spanish, Catholic and Andalusian. In that order," says Sebastián de la Obra. His credentials as a member of Partido Popular clearly precede him. Defused and with the audience in no doubt about his political persuasion, he continues. "But I have a problem. A question really," he says. "I don't want to change my identity. But I wonder. When I go to a museum in Madrid, where are all the Muslim Kings? When I open a book, where is all the Jewish history?" In a soft and gentle tone, Manuel Pimentel, flanked by Antonio Manuel and Sebastián de la Obra, engages the audience in a reflexive discussion about hidden histories. "Why are they being dismissed today?" he asks. "What is the point of denying the facts of the past?" he says. In a measured and calm tone, he probes the audience, asks questions, does not have all the answers, but thinks it very worrying that national discourse continues to perpetuate a myth.

As he makes his final reflexive comments, an audience member asks a question. “I’m confused,” she says. “Yesterday, you told me I was a Jew,” directing her question at Sebastián de la Obra. “The day before you told me I was a Muslim,” as she looked at Antonio Manuel. “What am I?” Silence engulfs the courtyard for what appeared to be an age as everyone looks around searching for an answer. Seizing on the opportunity to end with a crescendo, Antonio Manuel roars. “You are not a Jew”. Bang! As his fist punches the table. “You are not a Muslim.” Bang! Once again. “You are *al-Ándalus*, I am *al-Ándalus*.” With a pause as the audience waits with bated breath. Bang! His fist punches the table again. “We are all *al-Ándalus*!” The crowd erupts and a standing ovation ensues.

At this stage of my fieldwork, I am unsure about the use of the term *al-Ándalus* during these conferences. I thought it was a medieval Arabic term that referred to the geographical landmass called Spain. I realise that the etymology of *al-Ándalus* is contentious. It can be said to derive from Arabic and mean “the land of the Vandals.” Some informants say, “It means land of light,” and its etymology is Spanish. Either way, I had only heard it being used to describe a location, a contemporary park or a local bar. When attempting to connect an ideology with a landmass, the term “*Andalucista*” is used. The suffix “*ista*” can be translated as an “ism” in English. Therefore, *Andalucista* can be translated as the political mouthful that means “Andalusianist”. I double checked my recording of the conference in order to be sure that I had heard, “*somos al-Ándalus*” (we are *al-Ándalus*) and not “*somos del al-Ándalus*” (we are from *al-Ándalus*). Antonio was definitely using the term in a context that I had not encountered before. He was clearly stating that “we are *al-Ándalus*”. It was the first time that I had heard a new name, albeit and old

word, being used to refer to locals. It was the first time that I realised *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* was reconfiguring local ethnicity.

I think we are looking for something social for Andalusia and Spain. But whatever idea you have that's social, it's political too, no. So, the idea of the festival is that Left and Right can live together and improve society. That sounds political (laughing), and it is political, but it's inclusive. (Paco 2012)

Talk of the performances at the conference continues long into the night. It is now clear that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an explicitly ideological event regardless of its articulation of tolerance. It is directed at a specific group, *al-Ándalus*. This group are an emergent ethnicity. It is now clear that the writings of Blas Infante, father of Andalusian nationalism, and Partido Andalucista permeate the “idea” of the festival. But what is not clear is why a small village decided to redefine its identity. Nor is it clear how they managed to do this in a few short years. They have attracted some illustrious and well-known national intellectuals to their village who not only agree with the “idea” of the festival but add to the argument. Antonio Manuel and Sebastián de la Obra would win the award for most dramatic and entertaining speeches. Manuel Pimentel's calm, objective and reflexive tone wins the award for the most convincing argument. With the final words, “we are all *al-Ándalus*,” ringing in everyone's ears, the crowd moves out of the courtyard to make room for the next event, an acoustic performance of medieval Sephardic music.

### **The Music of the Festival**

Here in Frigiliana, when the town hall organise something, they always include all the people from Frigiliana, because they want to enjoy it... they are very proud of what they have here, In Nerja, for example, there are festivals and concerts and everything, but you see more foreign tourists going to them. Here, they have a festival with music for young people, and you see everyone going. All the locals, all the residents and the tourists enjoy it together. It doesn't matter how old or young they are. (Tourist from Nerja, 2011)

The musicians that perform during the festival are an eclectic mix that can be categorised within the emergent genre of “world” or indeed “ethnic” music. As Steven (Feld 2000:146-149) points out, the idea of “world or ethnic” music is to counter the dominance of commercial “one world” music that is homogenising music taste in a westerly, capitalist or commercial direction. This is in keeping with a persistent global trend to commercialise someone’s culture, or the search for anything cultural to sell, under the rubric of ethnicity incorporated in order to attract tourist capital. “World” or “ethnic” music is perceived of as being authentic or traditional, and, most importantly, it belongs to someone, although it is never quite clear exactly who that someone is. That is to say, it is the genuine music “of” someone’s “culture” somewhere. The diversity of world music is the antithesis to commercial “one world music”, and it promises plurality, tolerance and respect for all cultures, all heritages and all traditions—in a kind of reversal of the apparent globalising impact of commercial music. The fact that it may be commercially manipulated and marketed just as ferociously as “pop” music is masked by the perception that it belongs to someone who comes from somewhere. Even if “world” or “ethnic” music does not belong to Frigiliana, its message of plurality and its authentic performances of “someone’s culture” significantly resonate with the idea of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* as a meeting place for world cultures.

The concerts begin with free performances in the Plaza de las tres culturas and, since its inception have included a diverse range of musicians. In Frigiliana, the festival is “ a fusion of these culturas where The Star of David, Christian cross and the Crescent Moon merge into a single symbol” (El País 2006). Maria del Mar Bonet, who performed on the second night of the festival in 2006, encompasses the essence of “world” music with an eclectic mix of “ethnically” infused performances.

A Spanish singer, who studied in Paris, Maria del Mar Bonet recorded and performed with the Ensemble de Musique Traditionelle of Tunisia and performs a wide range of musical genres but won The Spanish World Music Award in 2002 for her album *Raxia* (World Music Central 2009). Radio Tarifa recreate medieval Sephardic and Andalusí themed music played on traditional instruments but augmented by rumba and flamenco rhythms. While they sing in Spanish, an Arabic flavour emerges through the haunting sounds of wind instruments, accordions, discordant tone and a half stepped phrygian and aeolian modes that are percussively supplemented by bongo drums laced with Cuban styled rumba offbeat syncopation. Finally, Chambao complete the line-up for the first festival with their Flamenco chill style of “fresh, ethnic sound [that] is infused with other influences” (Chambao 2012). Their music is “very difficult to define in words, or to give it a label, and as humans we have a tendency to want to put a label on anything our mind cannot understand” (ibid.). “The music is nice because people come here to listen to new music that they don’t know and it’s been not on the radio... and the people like it,” says Maria Jose.

The public address system pipes Sephardic, Andalusí and medieval themed music throughout the village for the four days of the festival. In addition, impromptu music breaks out as small groups of appropriately clad street performers meander through the crowds. They stop and play wherever they can find space, but their main contribution to the event is twofold. First, they play medieval musical instruments and discordant tunes that evoke a different sense of music. Second, they are regularly accompanied by dancers who encourage the crowds to join in. Those amongst the crowds who are dressed in costume are the first to get up and dance. The interaction between street performers and festival participants causes a near explosion of light as cameras and phones record the encounter. All manner of people meet during these

impromptu performances, and they appear to set the tone of the event. Thus, tourists, locals, performers and even the odd Guardia Civil join the fun.

There are two stages erected for the festival: the main stage is in la Plaza de las Tres Culturas and a smaller second stage is in the open courtyard in la Casa Apero. Concerts in la Casa Apero are formal seated affairs. In 2010, the town hall had to introduce a small entrance fee, usually €3 or €4, in order to maintain the quality of performers at the festival. Nightly concerts are held at 9.30pm and last for approximately one hour. While the styles of these performances vary from night to night and year-to-year, they could be categorised as acoustic renditions of “ethnic” music. The majority of these renditions are instrumental, although there are some vocal performers. It is mainly locals who attend these events, and these performances take the form of classical music recitals. The audience are dressed in formal clothing, and the appreciation of the musical genres resembles the performances during *Festival Danza Oriental*. The performances at la Casa Apero could be described as “high culture” because they are appreciated as much for the technique and style as they are for their musical content.

The free nightly concerts held at the outdoor stage in la Plaza de las Tres Culturas are the highlight of the festival. Here, international musicians perform to large crowds from 11pm until the early hours. While the style of music at these events is in keeping with the overall theme of a plural festival, this is also a fun event. Therefore, the style of music performed has a more “folk” feel than the music performed to the audience at la Casa Apero. There is a large seating area directly in front of the stage, but the majority of the audience are standing. To be more accurate, the majority of the audience are dancing. The audience is a mixture of young and old, locals and visitors, and even though some of the performers hail from as far

apart as Africa or Canada, there is a Celtic flavour to the event. Dancing often mimics Irish or Scottish set dancing. Indeed, my presence encourages jibes and comments about how similar the performances are to traditional Irish music.

As one would expect to see at any public concert, an elaborate sound system and lighting display adds to the professional quality of the event. Yet while this is a professional staging of internationally renowned musicians, this is also a rather intimate affair. Performers chat to the audience but in an informal manner. Most importantly, they become involved in the rest of the festival events. Many of the musicians attend all of the concerts throughout the festival, mingling with the crowds after their performances. This adds an unusual sense of familiarity between international musicians, who are often quite famous within their genres, and locals and visitors. Musicians regularly sit and chat following the end of the concerts and impromptu acoustic jam sessions can continue until the early hours of the morning. Included in the crowds who are enjoying the concerts are the mayor, local politicians and a host of local dignitaries. Yet, they are not sitting in the privileged seats with the best vantage point in front of the stage or in a reserved area for VIPs. They are mingling and dancing with the crowd.

### **The End of the First Day**

As the night formally ends at approximately 2am and the last bus brings tourists back to Nerja, all is quiet in the village. Some light acoustic music can be heard coming from la Plaza de las Tres Culturas, but the clamour dies down relatively quickly. All of the stalls are closed, and oddly most of their artisan goods are left on the stalls overnight, unsecured and covered only by plastic or cloth. Considering the numbers of people who attended the festival and the limited public transport, it is

difficult to see how they left the village so quickly. Talk turns to that night's music and dancing as the final stragglers disperse. The previous night's music will be discussed in minute detail the following morning, but for the moment, the public address system is switched off and Frigiliana is asleep, resting in anticipation for what is about to come tomorrow.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* frantically continues for the next three days. An astonishing amount of entertainment is organised for the festival. This ranges from cinema viewings, poetry readings, art exhibitions and numerous activities for children. In addition to cultural performances, there are always a number of arts and crafts classes where locals and visitors can learn how to make pottery, candles or medieval instruments. Every evening during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, the door of the Roman Catholic Church is covered by a white sheet in preparation for a fantastical light display upon its façade. The street lamps in the square are disconnected in order to stop their light polluting the show. Alternate images of a Synagogue, Christian Church and Mosque are projected onto the façade in a striking display framed against the black backdrop of the summer evening sky. As the images change, visitors explain the potential meanings to each other. It takes a while, but eventually, most of them get the point, and when nudged by the random appearance of a final coordinating image, the penny drops. Notwithstanding the projection of Hasidic Jews, Arabs mounted on horseback rising over desert hills and armour adorned crusaders complete with Saint George's Cross shields, when the image of a Crescent Moon, followed by the Star of David, and a Christian Cross, spell out  $\text{C} \circ \star \text{is} \dagger$ , all confusion rescinds. Although the present day significance of these symbols of the past may elude many of the visitors, they have learned what the festival is about.

I enjoyed the 2010 light show with an English family who had come to Frigiliana as part of their summer vacation. I was recording the sounds of the festival and paying particular attention to the shifting background noises. As the light show unfolded, their 12-year-old daughter began explaining the meanings of the symbols to her younger brother. The Saint George's Cross was initially identified as belonging to England as the enthusiastic young girl educated her parents about English history. Its place in a Spanish village caused a little confusion, and I offered to explain the symbols as soon as the show was over. The image of Arabs mounted on horseback rising over desert hills was clearly identified. Her parents, her brother and I were correctly assured that this represented "Arabs fighting with Spaniards" she said. The Hasidic Jews caused more confusion. "Maybe they are the Moors", she said, or "maybe they are the Muslims". Nobody was quite sure how the Saint George's Cross of the Hasidic Jews fitted into the festival narrative. The light show lasts about 20 minutes before it is repeated, and I was asked to explain the meaning of the symbols as images of Latin, Arabic and Yiddish scriptures were being projected on the façade of the church. Just as I began to explain the three different sets of symbolic symbols, the final  $\text{C}\circ\star\text{is}\dagger$  projection appeared on the church. At once, the young girl said "they're religious symbols," and her mother said "Jews, Muslims and Christians. They must have lived here in the past". As a result of the symbols being used to spell out the word "coexist," my contribution to the discussion became redundant.

Saturdays are the busiest days during the festival, and the night time concerts held in la Plaza de las Tres Culturas are the highlight of each day. Yet the pedagogical component within the public conferences cannot go unnoticed by villagers. It is not that they are unaware of the details of their past because the twelve

ceramic panels tell them their history; it is not that they are unaware of the levels of control meted out by the Franco regime that infiltrated every aspect of their daily lives. It is rather, that they have never thought about the manipulation of their history, culture and identity framed in this manner before and never had a public forum to articulate their concerns.

Following the final concert on Sunday night the festival is officially closed. Mondays after the festival are quiet. All the cafés are closed and the village takes a few days to recover from the event. The last day of the festival also marks the last day of the tourist high season.<sup>95</sup> The large crowds will not begin to return to the village until late spring next year. Yet the festival has left a mark on *el pueblo*. While the transformation from a fully fledged Spanish sense of identity to a fully fledged *al-Ándalus* sense of identity may not yet be complete, this explicit culture-building program raises numerous questions about the past and the present in the village. It raises numerous questions as a result of the intersection of multiple histories in the same public space. However, the answers to these questions were already known in the village, although they may not have been formulated in the manner in which they were during the public conferences.

### **Opposing Spanishness**

While the festival is commercial and invented in order to attract tourists to the village, its reach extends beyond the event. It appears to do more than allow locals to contemplate their identity or to question the truth or myth within either account of history. It appears to transform the things that locals enjoy. It reshapes their idea of “high culture,” but one that was only openly discovered recently. Many of the

---

<sup>95</sup> Tourist numbers have been increasing in the winter months during the last couple of years. Although the village is quiet after the festival, in 2013 many tourists could be seen arriving to stay in Frigiliana in early September.

transformations achieved are symbolic but reify a particular interpretation of the past by introducing new names into everyday speech. These concepts remain grounded in logic and reason and require a mental elaboration in order to think through the validity of contradictory values being articulated. However, there appears to be a more fundamental transformation at play during the event that recasts local ethnicity. Furthermore, the festival appears to reconstitute something that has the appearance of being more natural than tourism. It reconstitutes blood, *ethnie*. It defines and redefines Frigiliana and its people, *el pueblo*, into one homogenous ethnic compound, *al-Ándalus*. “Something strange is happening to the thing we call “ethnicity,” the taken-for-granted species of collective subjectivity that lies at the intersection of identity and culture” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:1).

The celebration of a footprint of Judaism and Islam within the village and population of Frigiliana is at odds with the unity of Spanish national identity. It is at odds with regionalist calls for the recognition of their primordial nationalities. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* disrupts the foundational “idea” that Spanish identity originated in Visigoth Spain. And in keeping with the facts of history, it disrupts the “idea” that Jews, Christians and Muslims did not marry and did not produce interfaith offspring. In opposition to the notion that an ethnic group belongs in one location defined by genealogical heritage, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a celebration of the people who arrived to the shore as much as it is a celebration of the people on the shore. But it is not a celebration of contemporary Muslim migrants. There is a complicated relationship between Spanishness and otherness. It is framed within modern European considerations as well as historical sensibilities based “on grounds of religion and notions of progress” (Green 2011:199-200). Specific histories play a central role within the configuration of Spanish identity from

Franco's praise for the Visigoths, dismissing cultural contact between Jews, Christians and Muslims (Sánchez Albornoz 1975), to damaging present day national discourse that conflates invading "Moors" with invading migrants (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003).

Many contemporary responses to "Spanishness" are influenced by false accounts of the past. Fact and fiction, myths and truths become muddled together in contemporary Spanish identity discourse. In particular, "both historical and fictional 'Moors' exist in the same symbolic paradigm in the Spanish cultural imaginary...conceptually collapsed into this category of the imaginary and threatening Moor" (Flesler 2008:4). Historically, the elites of Europe and Castile "stamped their outlooks and life styles, myths and symbols, on the state and traditions of the whole population" (Smith 1988:139). An orchestrated program of cleansing Spanish blood of "other" blood, encoded in the statutes of *limpieza de sangre*, secured "religious purity by purging the body politic (or at least that of the aristocratic Castilian *ethnie*) of 'contaminated' blood" (Green 2011:199). Contemporary concerns relating to its plural history heightens anxiety about Spain's place within modern Europe.

Negative national discourse in Spain relating to the "other" is framed within notions of "race" that deny non-whites access to "Spanish" status "and the opportunities contingent upon it" (Green 2011:197). *Moros y cristianos* festivals take on a more sinister role as the marauding invading "Moor" is conflated with a threat from North African migrants (Rogozen-Soltar 2007). Public cultural performances re-establish Christian and white dominance during *moros y cristianos* festivals as a "mechanism deployed to clarify, year after year, that the Christian side is the true "owner" of the territory of the Peninsula" (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:155).

Although representations of the “Moor” and the migrant are symbolic, they have real, negative and concrete consequences with respect to the status of migrants in Spain (ibid.). As an informant in Granada notes when he refers to xenophobic attitudes to migrants and festivals: “It looks like it is all about race, and it *is* all about racism. But it’s also about class” (Paco interview 2010).

The annual celebration of the “Moor” within *moros y cristianos* festivals is tempered by the known outcome that the Christians always win. An anti-structured celebration of the orientalist “Moor” allows for the structured reincorporation of a dominant Spanish identity. The consequences of conflating the “Moor” and the migrant are grave. However, this has more to do with the fear that Islam is within the local population rather than the fear of a threat from the external “other”. As Slovenian Žižek (1993) suggests with respect to maintaining distinctions between emergent national identities, they are tarrying with the negative “other”. Flesler (2008:9) suggests that: “Moroccans turn into a problem...not because of their cultural differences...as many argue, but because, like the *moriscos*, they are not different enough.” By performing the other during *moros y cristianos* festivals, participants are “enjoying” their dangerous, suppressed and hidden self. They are motivated by a fear that the “other” is encroaching on their national territory thereby threatening the way the locals enjoy themselves. By enjoying and celebrating the “other” within during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, the village is opposing foundational idea relating to primordial identities.

It is here that the celebration and corporeal production/consumption of “otherness” in Frigiliana is at odds with national identity discourse. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not tarrying with a negative “other”. On the contrary, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* appears to be tarrying with the positive “other”. But to

be clear, the “other” in Frigiliana comes from within. The “Moor,” marauding or otherwise, is not mentioned in the village during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*.<sup>96</sup> Whereas *moros y cristianos* festivals pejoratively orientalise the “other,” exotic costumes are not worn during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, and the preferred style of dress is a contemporary interpretation of the everyday past. Similar to the clothes worn at the festival, difference was not obvious in medieval Spain. This does not appear to romanticise the past in a nostalgic manner, nor does it question inequalities in the past. Rather, it is the people, that is to say, the subordinated classes, who are celebrated during the festival. Thus, the medieval Jew, Christian and “Moor” form the background to a celebration of sameness and not the foreground to a celebration of difference. It is culture that is celebrated during the festival, but it is not their culture. It is the inhabitants of Frigiliana’s version of culture that is celebrated and the culture of the people who lived here, in contrast to the culture of the people who ruled here. And while this is a sanitised, mythical, and imagined version of plurality performed by conflating numerous artisan products that originate from all over the globe, a plural worldview reflects the historical and contemporary character of the village and its population. This is the principal difference between the performance of identity in Frigiliana and the performance of nationalist and regionalist identity celebrated at other festivals in Spain. Neither the “Moor” nor the primordial individual is privileged in Frigiliana. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a celebration of the “other” within and a public acknowledgement of “sameness”. This is not an anti-structured performance of difference that will facilitate a structured

---

<sup>96</sup> If there were to be a place in Spain where the final victory over the “Moors” was to be commemorated, Frigiliana would be the perfect choice. Despite this known fact, there is no contemporary value attached to the Christian victory. On the contrary, it is the losers of the battle in 1569 that are being commemorated as the “good guys” and the winners who are being recast as the “bad guys”. Moreover, the process to redefine the Muslims as the “good guys” began in the mid 1960s during the dictatorship.

reincorporation. On the contrary, this is a structured performance that will facilitate a proto-structured reincorporation. In other words, by acknowledging the unity of a plural heritage and privileging the footprint of Judaism and Islam within, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* opposes a dominant monocultural narrative in a direct, explicit and voluntary attempt to reconfigure local identity in opposition to Spanishness.

The next chapter attempts to explore the background experience of the festival. While meticulous planning goes into the front stage “three cultural” themes expressed during the event, the background goes unnoticed. Nevertheless, a new sensorium is created in Frigiliana during the festival that significantly impacts upon the corporeal experience of the event. The somatic experience of a shifting festival atmosphere appears to occur passively and does not reach the level of discourse. But possibly, as much as the multiple histories of the village collide during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, multiple corporeal experiences of tradition, culture, history and heritage collide in a similar way. That is, maybe, the internal organs of the body consume the festival in a corporeal manner and the body might play a conscious role in reifying and redefining “authentic” village culture anew. Maybe Antonio Manuel was correct when he said that memory lies within the heart and is protected from the contaminating effects of the outside world, identity is a mental elaboration and history is open to falsification.

# Chapter Five: *Al-Ándalus*

## Ethnicity? A Historical Term *par Excellence*

I think people like the feeling of happiness here. It's colourful and with the music and the tapas and everything, it's wonderful...Maybe it's because Frigiliana has this flavour. It's a good coupling: Frigiliana, with its atmosphere, and this festival, with its old flavour. (Tourist from Nerja 2011)

Discussions relating to food, the origin of its ingredients and how it was prepared are a constant topic of conversation throughout the village. This may be because village life is lived on the streets and in the cafés and bars. As small portions of food are often served with drinks, some people may be eating while others have not yet ordered food. Anna, an English woman, works in one of the local bars, and while she serves drinks, one of her main roles is to prepare many of the tapas on offer. Anna speaks Spanish and for all intents and purposes is a local. Her food is delicious, but sometimes she plays with the ingredients and unintentionally removes their "local" label. She added too much garlic to a paella dish one day and was surprised by the response. The collective response, she said, was "it is not paella." "What is it then," she asked, "it's just a rice dish." Laughing she told me that this happens all the time. Her cooking is reduced to the lowly generic status of "a rice dish" if not prepared with the exacting standards that the label "paella" requires.

Arguments about potatoes may appear to be trivial, but on another occasion Domingo prepared a local dish for a party in his house. "Pobres," Domingo declared proudly as he presented his mother's recipe to the table. "There are tomatoes in it," said Manolo. "Yes," said Domingo, "it's my mother's recipe." "How did you cook it," asked Manolo. "Sliced potatoes, red peppers, onions, tomatoes and garlic," he

said, “all fried slowly in the pan. “Well,” said Manolo, the potatoes are exquisite. Not too oily.” Turning to me he said, “This is a very difficult dish to cook. It can often be too oily, but it’s not “Pobres.” “Why not,” asked Domingo. “Because there are tomatoes in it,” said Manolo. “But that is the way my mother made it. “Well your mother couldn’t cook Pobres then,” retorts a mischievous Manolo. “It’s Pobres,” said Domingo emphatically. “No it’s not,” said Manolo. “What is it then,” asked Domingo. “It’s potatoes, very nice potatoes, even delicious potatoes, but just potatoes.” Everyone laughed and the topic of conversation changed. When I finished eating Domingo asked if I enjoyed my food. When I said, “yes, it was delicious, “he whispered “Pobres” across the table and laughed at Manolo.

While these anecdotes may appear to be trivial and peculiar to specific individuals, the process of labelling food in this manner belies a village-wide concern with food. The unfortunate German proprietors of a pizzeria face an uphill if impossible struggle to convince the village that their pizzas are “local.” Yet, Mari’s pizzas, at one end of the village, and José’s at the other end, are always going to be considered to be local, even though José is not from Frigiliana. Their food is considered “local” because it appears to be prepared in keeping with local sensibilities regarding food labels. Clearly, these labels are fluid, but if “you are what you eat,” then eating Spanish food means you are Spanish. Eating food without a local label relegates it to the generic status of “food” and, as such, removes some of its potential symbolic value and diminishes its meaning.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a cultural event where local interpretations of history, identity and culture collide with national monocultural narratives. The creation of an event that articulates distinct local concerns is political and ideological but, in a less abstract sense, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a food festival. “It is an

anthropological truism that food is both substance and symbol, providing physical nourishment and a key mode of communication that carries many kinds of meaning” (Wilk 1999:244). The study of food and eating has a long history in anthropology. Food has been considered as an index of manners and etiquette where “brutes feed. The best barbarian only eats... [and] only the cultured man can dine” (Mallery 1888:195). Food and eating practices highlight global divisions as one half of the world starves “while people in another part are not only well nourished, but over-nourished” (Mead 1970:176). Food cooking practices delimit a semantic field of raw, cooked and rotten distinctions between nature and culture: “roasted is on the side of nature” (Lévi-Strauss 1997:29) due to the direct contact between food and fire. Boiled food is on the side of culture, “literally because boiling requires the use of a receptacle, a cultural object” (ibid.). Single food items, such as coffee, have been considered for the manner in which they highlight the emergence of a yuppie class and a market driven “shaping of taste” (Roseberry 1996:763). Sidney Mintz (1985) explicitly links Caribbean sugar production to seventeenth-century British industrialisation, colonialism, the growth of the working class and the mass production of “proletarian hunger killers” (1997:360), such as tea, coffee, tobacco, sugar and chocolate, which fuelled capitalism.

Food has been studied with respect to the manner in which potatoes illuminate “the changing *relations* of community and household within particular historical epochs and modes of production” (Roseberry 1991:20). Food taboos and notions of hygiene highlight the semiotic processes at play when food becomes “dirt as matter out of place” (Douglas 1966:35), or as food utensils classify distinctions and “[f]ood categories... encode social events” (Douglas 1972:61). In ritual and religious contexts, food reinforces community bonds and belief systems as bread and

wine are transformed into body and blood. Food defines categories of persons and relationships of power within groups where “foods are not inert objects...rather they possess the vitality and dynamism of living beings” (Meigs 1997:104).

Food marks distinctions between ethnic groups as Hispanics are stereotypically “hot and spicy food lovers,” (Dávila 2001:100) and thereby ascribed roles that “feminize Latinos in relation to Anglo men... leaving unchallenged the dominant representational hierarchies” (ibid.). Food restrictions within Leviticus mark religious concerns relating to potential abominations that threaten the unity of a community or group. “As part of the larger process of the construction of complex public cultures involving media, travel, and entertainment” (Appadurai 1988:22), cookbooks invent national cuisines to be consumed locally, nationally and internationally. This allows for a glimpse of the “culinary traditions of another” (ibid.) and reinforces representations of the ethnic other based on food characterisations. Food and the taste of food are “class culture turned into nature” (Bourdieu 1986:190) and a harbinger of class ideologies. Class ideologies in Spain are historically linked to notions of pure blood wholly connected to concerns about the suspect presence of Jews and Muslims; these ideologies are encoded within food. In Spain, eating Serrano ham and drinking wine link contemporary food practices to the medieval *edictos de fe* (edicts of faith) that punished “innocent acts such as avoiding pork and blood, or cleaning the house on Friday afternoons” (Alpert 2001:116). The foods that people eat “have histories associated with the pasts of those who eat them” (Mintz 1997:7).

Notwithstanding the earlier histories of food, food is ordinary. It has to be consumed every day in order to stay alive. A central feature of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is the opportunity to showcase local foods and to bring customers into local

cafés. The *Ruta de la Tapa* disperses festival participants throughout the village as they consume a variety of new and old foods dressed up in historical terms. Yet, new foods consumed at the festival are always considered for more than their taste, more than their history and more than their symbolic value. One food stall served Mexican enchiladas during the 2012 festival. While it would appear that the origin, ingredients and taste of these enchiladas would prohibit them from becoming local, a different set of considerations classified them as “foreign.” Sitting at a café, Mari bought some enchiladas from the nearby stall. “How are the enchiladas?” asked Juan. “They are delicious. Not too spicy. Very good,” said Mari. The conversation changed to a discussion about the seating arrangements and the crowds looking for somewhere to sit. After about 20 minutes, Mari said, “You know, they were delicious,” pointing to the empty plate, “but they were too filling. I don’t think I could eat anything else.” “Do you feel full,” asked Juan. “I feel sleepy. There was too much food.”

The taste of the enchiladas or their origin did not feature as part of the process that rejected them as a local food. On the contrary, Mari confirmed that they tasted great. The enchiladas had interrupted her digestive system to such an extent that they reacted on the body in a physical manner. It was this internal physical response that relegated the enchiladas to the status of “other” food. The enchiladas prohibited Mari from carrying out her social obligation to consume more food during the festival and made her sleepy. Thus the “weight” of the enchiladas, as they sat in her stomach, interfered with her participation in the remainder of the event. This significantly frustrated her attempts to fully engage with later conversations that evening which inevitably focused on food. And it significantly frustrated her enjoyment of that evening’s celebration. Indeed, the following day she reminded me

to “ten cuidado” (take care) with the food I eat at the festival because “it can spoil the fun,” she said.

While food alone does not capture the transformative processes which flavour the village, it is one of the central ingredients within the event that constructs a festival sensorium. Leaving aside the symbolic potentials within food categories for one moment, eating food directly connects the inner self to outer cultural objects. In doing so, the consumption of “other” foods during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is connected to local consumption practices where the inner organs of the body validate food as traditional and therefore authentic. Eating in Frigiliana is as much a somatic practice as it is a semantic one. Once food is consumed, the inner organs of the body decide if it is edible or not. If not, the outer body gives you away. It sweats, feels pain, reddens the face and expels “foreign” foods as quickly as possible. If food leaves a bitter aftertaste, the “[a]ffect gives you away... [and] the pumping of your blood, the quantity and quality of your perspiration” (Highmore 2010:118) are noticeable on the outer body. Food must not interrupt the neutral state of the body and must not interrupt the social obligation to consume more food. Consideration is always given to the origin of the ingredients and the manner in which they are combined and prepared. However, in order for food to be “local,” and by association “traditional and authentic,” it must not be felt in the gut, must not be seen to alter the outer body and must not disturb the bowel. Although the multiple potential ideologies associated with food significantly shape ideas about food, the organs play a similar role. Thinking and being may be distinct, “but at the same time they are in unity with each other” (Marx 1988:106).

The importance of food and the manner in which it is considered to be “local” cannot be overstated. During the *Cruces de Mayo* festival I walked from cross to

cross with Manolo, Domingo and Paco. Manolo's views on local food are a little more extreme than the others, but they all share the notion that the internal organs of the body validate food as being local. Paco argued that the wine offered in Calle Zacatin was the only "real" one being given out during the festival. He said that he had tried all of the wine on offer, but this one was the only wine that burned his oesophagus. The "take your breath away" reaction to the wine from Calle Zacatin authenticated it as being local. We all tried the wine and both Manolo and Domingo oesophagi played a significant contribution to the discussion. In fact, for a few minutes after drinking the wine as its burning sensation travelled lower and lower within the body, we all made hand gestures indicated the precise position and duration of the feeling within. Thus, it was not just the initial taste of the wine nor its initial burning sensation that authenticated it as being local. Rather, it was the continued communication between the internal organs of the body acting in communion that authenticated the wine as being local.

### **The Body as the Foundation of *al-Ándalus*?**

The impact of food on the body and the role that the internal organs play in constructing a sense of local identity were explained to me on many occasions. In truth, I did not really notice or pay much attention to them until my body began to feel uncomfortable. I was invited to Domingo's house for dinner but had to explain that my stomach was not going to allow me to participate in the consumption of food, as it was rather swollen and bloated. Manolo asked if I had consumed anything unusual recently. I confirmed that I had not eaten anything unusual, but had drunk two small bottles of beer in the afternoon. "Cold beers?" Manolo asked knowingly, and as I nodded in the affirmative, both he and Domingo grinned at each other and began to explain why I felt uncomfortable. This is not to suggest that their diagnosis

of my stomach ailments were medically accurate even though their treatment worked. Rather, it is to suggest that I had missed something obvious and fundamental during my fieldwork that forced me to rethink the role of the organs within the body during the processes that construct local identity. Their remedy was for me to drink a large glass of room temperature water followed by a glass of room temperature red wine. Their diagnosis was relatively simple. The beer I had consumed was too cold and therefore interrupted the neutral state of my body. Their remedy worked and allowed me to participate in the meal provided.

This led me on a journey with respect to how food might be considered “foreign” and what properties food must have for it to be considered “local”. Coming from a cold northern European country, I am accustomed to eating piping hot food and cold drinks which shape and inform my perception of food. That is, my perception of food and how it should be served “may be explained by alternating apperception” (Boas 1889:52) where my perception of food originates outside my field site. Accustomed as I am to eating all manner of food, I was not prepared for their explanations and the subsequent alimentary tours through the village where my bloated stomach was referred to, and I was warned not to consume anything “different”. Indeed, they taught me how to identify food considered to be different but from a corporeal perspective that I had not noticed before. While I had assumed that this may have had something to do with the ingredients of the food and the way it was prepared, I had not thought about food for the manner in which it interacts with the body and not thought about food as part of the body. Where I had assumed that food should be judged for its taste, they introduced me to some local considerations relating to more fundamental concerns.

As my stomach began to settle down, Manolo and Domingo explained why I had felt uncomfortable. They said that the temperature of food is a central concern. Food and drink must not be too hot or too cold to alter the neutral state of the stomach. As my stomach was in Frigiliana, its temperature was being controlled by the local weather. My taste buds may have been formed in Ireland, but my body was reconfiguring them based upon my location. Food served in Frigiliana is never hot enough. It is not cold, but never hot. According to Manolo and Domingo, this is a central consideration when eating in the village because if one consumes food that is too cold or too hot the body will react to a shift in temperature. Any shift in the temperature of the internal body will become manifest on the external body, such as the swelling in my stomach. This is not the desired effect of consuming food as a neutral state is the preferred state of the body. The neutral state facilitates full participation in all social events. All social events in the village require the consumption of food and alcohol. One must be mindful of the fact that any overindulgence will frustrate participation in social events. As I had drunk two cold beers, I had overindulged based upon my northern European apperception that cold beer will cool the body down. One beer should have been enough. I had forgotten that I was required to fully participate in a formal dinner-party thereby ignoring my social obligation. Now, because I am a *guiri* (foreigner), my social *faux pas* was forgiven, this time, but I was not to repeat my disrespectful error.<sup>97</sup>

In addition to the temperature of a particular dish, food must also be considered for its weight. Not only does the weight of food have to match the weight of the stomach, but it must not interrupt the digestive process to a significant degree. The first indicator that something has gone wrong with the digestive process is a

---

<sup>97</sup> The cry of “*ten cuidado*” was often directed at me during festivals as Manolo was frequently concerned that I might forget my alimentary obligations.

loosening of the bowel. Therefore, if nothing changes within the bowel for approximately one hour after eating, the food consumed is thought to be local. In addition, if for any reason the viscosity of one's stools alters, the category of the item consumed alters from "local" to "other". This should appear to be a topic that remains private but was often mentioned when "new" or "different" food was being enjoyed socially. In this instance, the routine workings of the inner organs act as a source of knowledge that reaches a level of public discourse. As most conversations in the village are concerned with food, it often appeared appropriate for the discussion to move beyond the taste of food and towards a discussion of how food sat within the body. It appears as though the logical mental elaborations that categorise food as edible and local were superseded by the actions and reactions of the internal organs of the body. Moreover, the internal organs within the body appear to make a conscious contribution to the process of labelling food as local in the form of rejection or acceptance, digestion or explosive expulsion.

A convincing environmental argument might be that because of the high temperatures in the village, consideration must always be given to the effect that food has on the surface of the body. It is difficult to walk quickly in Frigiliana during the summer heat and uncomfortable if the body sweats. Therefore, locals walk slowly in more of a side to side movement than a forward motion. As such, a utilitarian consideration must be given to food based upon local environmental factors. However, the winters in Frigiliana can be cold and the extreme heat is only experienced in July and August. As a result of the village's position above sea level, it rains a lot from November to February. Therefore, while an environmental explanation may account for food practices during the summer months, the argument

flounders because even though the weather throughout the year is changeable, food practices remain the same.

Ben Highmore (2010:135) suggests that the consumption of “other” food relies more on a sensorial experience as “the result of deep pedagogy” rather than a rational symbolic connection with the “other” realised through eating. Highmore (ibid.) also suggests that in order to expand people’s sense of different ethnicities, someone would have to construct an “affective counter pedagogy”. If this were to be the case and a politics of food were to be dedicated to “opening up the affective sensorial tuning and retuning of the social body – then it would need to be exorbitant” (ibid.). This suggests that it may be possible, in an abstract sense, to imagine the total control of food to such an extent that what is being eaten is not so much a cultural construction as a politically determined one. But could this abstract idea actually be the case? *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an affective counter pedagogy as it introduces “other” food into the body. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a politics of the gut as much as it is a politics of the mind.

Sitting on the toilet may offer some time for reflection, contemplation or a brief escape from the hustle and bustle of everyday life. The paradigm of the habitual everyday functions of the body “requires that the body be understood as the existential ground of culture—not as an object that is “good to think,” but as a subject that is “necessary to be” (Csordas 1993:135). The location, type and form of the toilet, or gate/technique, being used may index particular cultural rules, etiquette or index distinctions between cultural groups. The toilet may be made of porcelain; it could be a hole in the ground or a metal bar straddling a running stream. Rarely, if ever, is consideration given to the viscosity of excretions with respect to the part it plays in the process of validating membership of a group. Rarely, if ever, is the

process of digestion/indigestion, and its final outcome, viewed as a mark of identity. Ignoring habitual everyday bodily functions has a long tradition in Sociology/Anthropology. Durkheim (1982:1) suggests that, “each individual drinks, sleeps, eats, reasons; and it is to society’s interest that these functions be exercised in an orderly manner,” but these are not social facts. These natural things that bodies do are therefore of no interest to anthropology. These practices are not symbolic “tradition”; they are subjugated to the lowly status of habitual bodily “custom”. Yet, consideration is given to the bowel in Frigiliana throughout the year. Eating in public is a common convention. Discussing the ingredients and preparation of food is the principal topic of conversation, and how food sits within the body is an essential qualification if food is to be considered local.

There appears to be something more essential and fundamental occurring during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* that not only introduces locals to “other” culture, but also introduces them to “other” food. In the case of wine, the “take your breath away” experience of the extremely potent local variant is remarked upon as the oesophagus determines the purity of the wine. An authentic label is applied to the wine if the oesophagus reacts intensely. A similar set of notions is applied to spices during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The addition of curry powder to chicken wings causes a lot of debate and discussion. As the conversation flows back and forth, Antonio returns from the bathroom and informs everyone that the curry powder caused “no unexpected interruption” in the neutral viscosity of his stools. All agree that the addition of a small amount of curry powder can be considered “local” food.

The introduction of a new meaning making system in the village during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* relies on more than the construction of symbols and

mental elaborations relating to the transmission of a new ethnicity. It relies upon the construction of a new sensorium through which the body can experience difference. And while the individual front stage components of the festival appear to function at different levels, the corporeal experience of the festival is based on a combination of every aspect of the event. Furthermore, the shifting background sense of the festival is experienced by all of the body's senses as they combine and internally reform a new version of ethnicity.

### **The Things Colours Do**

During *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, the streets of the village are decorated with colourful flags and buntings. The main thoroughfare, running from Calle San Sebastian through to Calle Real, is decorated in multi-coloured flags emblazoned with the Star of David, Christian Crosses, Crescent Moons and a wide range of Hebrew and Arabic symbols and letters. Individually, all of these symbols contain a specific religious significance, but when they are all displayed together, in a random fashion, they emphasise the plural theme of the festival. Buntings decorate all of the surrounding streets, and although the organisers of the festival say that the colours of these buntings are arbitrarily chosen, red, yellow, purple and green are the dominant colour choices. It is possible to suggest that the prominence of red, yellow and purple buntings is representative of the colours of the Spanish Republican Flag (1931-1939). The green buntings could be said to represent Andalusia or Islam. Thus the red, yellow, purple and green, when combined, could suggest an association between the Spanish Republic, Blas Infante, Andalusia and its Muslim heritage. However accurate this interpretation of the significance of red, yellow, purple and green might be, it is limited to a specific meaning that lies outside the colours where "colour is understood as only connected with processes that take place in the head as mediated

through the eyes and brain/mind” (Young 2006:174). Clearly certain colours or combinations of certain colours emit certain meanings, but “these [meanings] are not the only things that colours do” (ibid: 179).

The effect of changing colours during the festival dramatically impacts on the buildings in the village by creating a significant contrast which alters the skyline of these streets. While the form of the buildings remains the same, their saturation with multiple hues alters the spatial perception and ambience of this place. The brilliance of the whitewashed houses normally merges seamlessly with the dazzling summer sky. Blindingly bright, the reflection of the sun on the top of buildings creates an effect that merges the village with the sky. Or rather, it appears that the buildings are as bright as the sun and no clear distinction is visible between sky and skyline. Although the sky is always blue and the buildings are always white, the sun appears to negate any contrast. As darkness falls in Frigiliana, white becomes the dominant colour vividly contrasted against a black sky.

The colourful buntings added during the festival act like a canopy between the village and the sky as they absorb the dazzling sunshine. Suddenly, the colours in the streets become more vibrant as the glare of the sunlight is defused through red, yellow, purple and green filters. When the context of a shift in colour is considered along with a shift in a social context, their relational effect manipulates the atmosphere of the village that stimulates “a specific impact” (Young 2006:176). That is to say, when there is a shift from the glare of everyday life to colour-saturated festival time, the impact of colour alters the background of the village.

The buntings specifically impact on the village as they deflect the sunlight away from the tops of the buildings. Thus, the reds, yellows, purples and greens are

amplified by the sun but act as a breaking point that mediates between the blue sky and white buildings. Once the buntings are in place, the colour in the streets appears to become more vibrant. Rather than view colour as merely a brain-based experience, colour saturates the objects and the people in the village simultaneously. The white buildings become a cooler shade of white as they absorb the newly installed hue from the buntings above. The colourful costumes worn by street vendors and locals are exaggerated by the partial shade of the buntings. Moreover, the once brilliantly white building tops now absorb and reflect the colour from the buntings tingeing everything within their ambit. The background colour of the village, which includes its buildings and its people, alters significantly and there is now a clear contrast between all of the colours in this place.

Buntings also affect the shift from light to dark at nightfall. Where white once dominated the background of the village, colour now dominates as the buildings act as a source of illumination and reflection. Normally dull colours, such as creams and tans, take on a vibrant tone at night. Greys, browns and creams that fade away during the daytime stand out at night as the hue of red and yellow reflects back from the buildings. The buntings again act as a break between the black sky and the white buildings and the light emanating from the buildings is trapped under a canopy of colour.

It is the contrast created by decorating the village in reds, yellows, purples and greens that significantly alters the background canvas of Frigiliana during the festival rather than any potential extractable meaning from within these colours themselves. Even though the resultant ocular shift is very dramatic, it does not overtly impact on the foreground of the event. While the colours have consciously been chosen as a means to liven up the village, their combined effect on place and

people has not been consciously considered by the organisers of the event. Yet, this combined effect does more than change the perception of this place: it creates a background atmosphere within the buildings and within the people simultaneously.

The colours of the festival remove the distinction between objects and people and animate a coexisting atmosphere. “[T]hey can structure space and create topographies of things” (Young 2006:180) rewriting the meaning emitting from Frigiliana during the festival. Young (idid.) suggests that the advent of “smart” buildings will bring about a mutual constitution of people and place as the colour of space reacts on the colour of people. I am suggesting that a simpler technology, colourful buntings, cause a similar effect that allows for objects and people to merge seamlessly into one throng of saturated celebration. And while it may be said that the shift in atmosphere is experienced visually, this shift impacts on both the perception and mood of this place as they become one—*el pueblo*. Colour alters the feeling of the village. Not only does the changing effect of colour allow the festival crowd to experience a background *convivencia* between Frigiliana’s past and present, it allows them to be at one with this place, in part because of their colourful experience.

### **Sounds of the Street**

Probably the most pervasive and yet least obvious stylisation of the village is the sound of Sephardic and Andalusí music piped via a public address system throughout the festival. From the beginning of Calle Sebastian to the end of Calle Real, a series of speakers are installed during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Running the length of the village, the dulcet tones of medieval music bridge the more recent section of the village with Barribarto creating a unified soundscape that reconfigures the environment in a rather subtle manner. The background music is

loud enough to hear, but not quite loud enough to drown out the front stage chat and clamour of 30,000 visitors. The music is periodically interrupted by announcements relating to the festival schedule. Sephardic and Andalusí music begin at approximately 10am each morning and end at midnight. When close to a speaker, it is possible to identify the artist or tune being broadcast, but as one walks through the village and in between the range of the speakers, individual tunes become unrecognisable thus creating a haunting effect that reverberates back and forth. This creates an unusual soundscape and makes it difficult to pinpoint the sources of the sound. Yet at the same time, every quarter of the village is filled with a background canvas of blurred and inescapable medieval sounds.

The sounds broadcast from the speakers reside firmly in the background. Yet they do so in a pervasive manner that is unavoidable. In addition, Sephardic and Andalusí music come in and out of earshot even when standing still, thus causing an effect that appears to wave back and forth uncontrollably. In the few sections of the village where crowds tend not to gather, the background music jumps into the foreground filling up any empty spaces in the process. The result is that it is impossible to avoid the event and impossible not to feel part of the total celebration, regardless of one's location in the village. Most visitors have never heard Sephardic and Andalusí music, and it is therefore not possible to suggest that the experience of the music automatically constructs a memory or a sense of the past. Yet, the reverberating sounds of the streets act in a coordinating manner that simultaneously combines all visitors, locals and the village into one enlaced soundscape which dresses up the festival in historical sounds.

*“As salaam alaikum”* and *“wa alaikum assalaam”* reverberate periodically and phenomenally punctuating the abundance of multilingual orations that can be

heard in the village. In and amongst German, French, Japanese, Dutch, English and rural Andalusian tones, laughing locals bellow Arabic salutations and an exaggerated *ojalá*. This is often accompanied by placing their hands upon their foreheads or hearts. All the while “world” music, pungent aromas, colour and whitewash, light and dark, create an overwhelming multisensory experience that engenders a totalising atmosphere.

A beaming and smiling young girl steps into the narrow doorway leading to her father’s small café. Dressed in an elaborate belly dancing costume and laughing exuberantly, she says: “*As salaam alaikum.*” All of the patrons in the café turn and look. “*Wa alaikum assalaam,*” responds her laughing smiling father from behind the bar as he busily serves an unprecedented number of clients participating in the festival. The barman is dressed in a kaftan and small skullcap and a Spanish tourist asks: “What did she just say?” “*As salaam alaikum,*” he responds. “What does that mean?” says the tourist. “It’s an Arabic greeting, a Muslim salutation.” Puzzled by his explanation the tourist has a brief discussion with her two friends. “Are you a Muslim?” she asks. “No, I’m Spanish,” he replies. More discussion continues amongst the visitors and the tone of the question shifts. “Why would you speak in Arabic if you are not a Muslim?” she asks. “Look, I’m a Mexican there,” says the laughing barman directing the visitors’ attention to a photograph on the wall where he is wearing a large sombrero and playing a guitar. “You are in a bar,” he says, in an attempt to point out the improbability of being a Muslim and a barman as he points towards the numerous Roman Catholic statues and Spanish symbols dotted around the room. “It’s a festival. *Festival 3 Culturas,*” he says laughing.

Following a brief pause and a short period of confusion, the three visitors begin to laugh at themselves as they realise they are participating in a themed event.

They are aware that they are still in Spain. This is a typically Spanish whitewashed village overlooking the Mediterranean Sea. Not having crossed any national borders, they are in an archetypal tourist resort full of international tourists merrily eating, drinking, chatting and laughing. Yet for one brief moment the sound of a particular foreign tongue interrupted their sense of place, though it is one language amongst many. The first hand experience of diglossia, in its classic use of two languages being used in a specific social setting to index religious difference, transported these visitors to an unknown place. The explanation of the phrase and its Islamic origins compounded this sense of confusion. Why would people speak Arabic in Spain? Why would this phrase, which directly and obviously links a person to a particular religion, cause confusion? Why would this phrase stand out and require explanation when there is a copious amount of symbols to draw upon and interpret during the festival?

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* takes a unique approach to answering questions of difference and the “other”. It avoids the issue of the “other” completely by seeking to understand the footprint of Jewish, Christian and Muslim heritage within the local community, thus negating any distinction amongst the remaining population. The festival does not suggest that the locals are Jewish, Christian or Muslim, nor does it suggest that they are Spanish or Andalusian. Rather it suggests that these religious categories are not historically mutually exclusive, and it amalgamates all three apparent opposites into one category, *al-Ándalus*. Use of the term *al-Ándalus* realises a new ethnicity and a harmonious notion of medieval *convivencia* in Muslim Spanish history. This is a unique approach to a public festival within the fiesta cycles in Spain and a unique approach to identity formation. The festival articulates a shared and common history amongst all religious groups within

and outside the region, be they Jews, Christians, or Muslims, in an attempt to understand their own identity by understanding “other” identities. By using the term *al-Ándalus* in order to express their identity, the notion of a plural history that has been silenced by successive regimes is invoked. And these silences are being filled in by the sounds of Sephardic and Andalusí music combined with the random sounds of “*as salaam alaikum*” and “*wa alaikum assalaam*” that pop in and out of earshot.

### **Un Beso, un Abrazo: Touch**

Touch and touching is a common occurrence in Frigiliana, as it is throughout Spain. All public greetings are accompanied by a small hug and a kiss on both cheeks. During festivals, this is exaggerated and complemented with comments relating to clothing and general appearance. *Guapo* and *guapa* punctuate these greetings. The costumes worn during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* encourage participants to touch each other’s clothing and comment upon the resultant tactile experience of medieval “feeling” velvets and metallic coins. The practice of touching clothing is common throughout other public celebrations in the village and is not exclusive to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*.

The sense of touch experienced during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* acts more like a coordinating sense rather than an individual sensorial experience. That is to say, touch during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a total corporeal experience. The body must be located within this place during this festival in order for it to experience the event. The body must touch the fabric of the village in order for it to touch an imagined medieval past. It must touch the food, feel the cloth, brush off a notion of monocultural history and feel a silenced and forgotten past. Conference

attendees are told that if they have any doubt about the plural heritage of this place, they can go outside and touch it on any of the village streets.

This appears to be a rather difficult claim to verify or indeed justify as it appears to be predicated upon a pre-existing awareness of the history of the village. More broadly, it appears to be predicated upon a pre-existing awareness of the politics of memory throughout Spain. I am tempted to terminate a discussion of touch by saying that apart from the physical reality of being in the village, there is nothing phenomenal about the sense of touch one derives from *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Yet, the terminology used by participants during the festival disagrees with my assumption. They “feel” something about Frigiliana, and that “something” is intensified during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. There is a “feeling of happiness here” (Tourist from Nerja 2012). They feel something magical about being in Frigiliana: something special while walking through these streets. “It’s like being in the scene of a movie” (Trevor). “I don’t know what it is. It’s just magical” (David). “You just feel something here. Something special” (Maeve). The physical location of the village and its medieval meandering streets add to this total corporeal experience. “You’ve got everything here. History, heritage, mountains, the sea. It’s a feeling” (Trevor).

As the incoherent Abrahamic symbols begin to become more coherent during the festival experience, reinforced and clarified by repetition, the sense of being able to touch the past is augmented by the background feeling of the festival. During other festivals, the village experiences a transformation. The village feels completely different during festival and non-festival time, but not to the same totalising degree that is sensed during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Similar to the backstage performances experienced unconsciously during the presentation of the self in

everyday life (Goffman 1990), the background of the village is unconsciously experienced during this festival. Yet, this is not a passive experience as the body must actively engage in the process. During *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, the background staging of the event appears to act as a source of validation for the front stage performances. Touching the past ranges from the tactile experience of medieval themed costumes to the handling of herbs, spices, soaps and all manner of “crafted” commodities for sale. The artisan market hub beckons participants to feel the visible aspects of production within their material construction. An augmentation of the sense of touch is constantly encouraged by rambling troubadours often surrounded by spontaneous outbursts of clutching dancers as strangers begin to touch each other during mock medieval dance enactments, bolstered by the courage derived from numerous alcoholic drinks. Locals and visitors, women and men, adults and children intermingle in something that can only be described as laughing, smiling, dancing fun as the crowds move in and out of these spontaneous festival touching zones.

Whether or not the past can physically be experienced, and touched, as a result of these corporeal experiences is difficult to verify. However, visitors and locals say that they “feel” something different during the festival and this sensation is a physical one influenced by touching the component parts of the medieval sensorium. This form of interaction does not occur to the same extent during other festivities in the village. The sheer number of people located in, and therefore touching, Frigiliana during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* unquestionably adds to the atmosphere and spontaneity of this particular celebration. Not all of them have bothered to attend the public conferences; not all of them are aware of the theme of the event. Moreover, not all of them are able to distinguish between the three

Abrahamic religions celebrated during the festival. Yet, everyone has experienced something special by physically touching Frigiliana during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*.

### **Sensing Something New: Common Sense to Good Sense**

While “common sense” is rarely included in the consideration of the role of the senses in constructing memory or environment, the assertion presented here is that “common sense” forms one of the integral elements required for the reconfiguration of ethnicity. Indeed, it may be seen as the mediator that initiates a process of linking the bodily effects of the five senses to the ultimate coordinator, “good sense”. Common sense occupies a curious position within academic discourse. According to Clifford Geertz (1975:8), “common sense is historically constructed and... subjected to historically defined standards of judgment.” Common sense is often dismissed and relegated to the lowly status of the habitual, technical or the everyday. According to Hobsbawm (1992:3), the habitual and technical aspects of everyday life perform no significant symbolic function. Worryingly, common sense may also be considered to be natural, uncoordinated and therefore not cultural. This thing called common sense is often labelled the “standard” view and placed in contradistinction to this thing called the “scientific” or “sociological” imagination.

For Gramsci (1971:330), common sense comprises the “diffuse, uncoordinated features of a general form of thought common to a particular period and a particular popular environment.” It contains “a healthy nucleus of good sense” which, he argues “deserves to be made more unitary and coherent” (ibid: 328). It is on this point that the argument presented here pivots. While the body might be the foundation of al-Ándalus ethnicity, it must move beyond the uncoordinated sensorial processes of validation and reach the level of discourse and reason. However, this is

not to suggest that a Cartesian dualism exists between the body and mind or politics and culture. It is to suggest the opposite and argue that the physical body is the source of combined knowledge of a world where the senses act in communion with the brain.

The public conferences held at 6pm in the Casa de Aperó every evening during the festival are overtly political, overtly coordinating and overtly organisational. The argument presented at the conferences is coordinated and draws from “a general form of thought common to a particular period and a particular popular environment” (ibid:330). It formulates “common sense” notions of local history, identity and culture into politically charged “good sense” ones. It organises and unifies local heritage into a coherent narrative. All organisation is political and “in any given society nobody is disorganised without the party” (ibid: 264). All participants within an organisation are within the party, and therefore, all organisations are potentially political, “provided that one takes organisation in a broad and not a formal sense” (ibid.). Regardless of the mundane or everyday topic of conversations, the coming together of two people — from amongst any stratum of society—organises political thought. While all conversations do not result in political change, as a result of engaging with “ideas,” the organisation of common sense allows for the possibility of change, organically or traditionally.

The conferences held in Frigiliana transform the common sense bits and pieces of the festival experience that have been jumbled up over time into one coordinated articulation of a “good sense” that is politically charged. Thus, it is the body that decides exactly what is to be called “our” culture, heritage, and tradition, but all of the sensorial experiences of being-in-the-world require organisation in order to transform common sense into a totalising good sense. As Isabel Santaolalla

(2002:55) points out, the Franco regime paid lip-service to the idea of cultural heterogeneity, but “the real force of the regime’s propaganda lay in its emphasis on a unifying concept of nationalism...stressing shared history and cultural legacies, and glossing over non-European ethnic and racial traditions.” In other words, the Francoist regime subordinated the common sense realities of Spanish history and culture. They organised their version of “good sense” based upon the control of the body and the control of the cultural sensorium through which Spaniards experienced their world. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is emphasising the common sense plural realities of Spanish history and culture. It is organising its version of “good sense” based upon the reconfiguration of a cultural sensorium through which locals and visitors experience the village.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is for “everyone” but not everyone experiences the organisation of “common sense” into “good sense”. The public conferences that act so pervasively to reconfigure the village and its people as something different, something not Spanish and something distinct, are open to the public. Yet, only the locals attend. Maybe it is better to say that only some locals attend. It is through these conferences that the messages about Blas Infante, Islam and Andalusian separatism are being disseminated. The new symbols dotted throughout the village are being filled up with meanings during non-festival times because of the organisational impact of the public conferences. So, while the body acts in a common sense manner that facilitates, validates and authenticates a transformation into politically charged “good sense,” not everyone experiences the transformative effect of the festival sensorium. And in a festival that expresses tolerance, inclusion and harmony, some people are left out, some do not agree and “others” are excluded.

Something more fundamental than a symbolic discursive system is required in order for the realities of everyday life to be transformed. The element which holds together a given community cannot be reduced to symbols and language alone. It requires the construction of a natural ethnic kernel through which culture and identity can intersect. In order for the ethnic kernel to become realised, it must manifest itself as routine and custom and form part of the technical base within everyday practices. In Frigiliana, the natural ethnic kernel is *al-Ándalus*, a historical term *par excellence* that has the ability to transform biologically pure blood into biologically plural blood. In keeping with Anthony D. Smith, *ethnie* is the core defining mark of identity in Frigiliana. Yet, *ethnie* is being redefined in Frigiliana based upon earlier and concurrent historic constructions of blood. Therefore, ethnicity and *ethnie* are both recent constructions that are labelled historical in order to articulate their natural authenticity.

The process that transforms biology requires a considerable amount of effort in order for it to move beyond symbols (Lacan 1998). It requires a reconfiguration of the internal workings of the body to realise its goal. Thinking might be enough to accommodate this transformation, but not language. Indeed, if thinking is to be enough, it must be a corporeal thinking that works in communion and engages the heart, where authentic memories reside, the liver, the stomach and the bowel. Moreover, this must be an active rather than habitual process that validates ethnicity. In opposition to Pierre Bourdieu's (1977:94) conception of habitus that is "placed beyond the grasp of consciousness, and hence cannot be touched by voluntary, deliberate transformation, [and] cannot even be made explicit," the corporeal transformation of blood must be conscious, voluntary, deliberate and explicit

(Comaroff 1982:5-7). In short, active bodily functions must reach a level of consciousness that enables them to be expressed in language.

A process that begins in the imagination of a few individuals initiated a transformation of the physical space of Frigiliana in a number of ways since 2006. Symbolically, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* recreates an ideologically motivated idea of the medieval past, thereby constructing a place for proletarian enjoyment. The *Danza Festival Oriental*, medieval acoustic music in Casa Apero and the cultivation of an appreciation for North African cultural performances, create a “high cultural” space for petit-bourgeoisie enjoyment. The naming and renaming practices in the village introduce the language of three cultures into everyday existing networks of convention and routine. The cultural practice of renaming the village appears to reinforce the convention and routine, which in turn reinforces cultural practice. In the process, specific interpretations of the past become concretised in mundane roundabouts. But thus far, the processes of transformation are symbolic and have not altered everyday realities or ways-of-being in Frigiliana.

The last stage in this process is a reconfiguration of the human body as it is redefined as *al-Ándalus*. This is an altogether more challenging project that requires a different set of tactics beyond symbolic formulations. It is premised upon the notion that “an idea of reason could be generated from the body up’ (Eagleton 1990:197). It is premised upon the notion that memory resides in the heart and not in the mind, and that the natural body will somehow determine identity, and that the internal organs will play a central role in defining authentic ethnicity. To borrow the language of Jacques Marie Émile Lacan (1998), something initiated in the “Imaginary Order” cuts into the “Symbolic Order” in the form of a festival combined with the symbolic components dotted throughout the village. Thus the “Symbolic

Order” is consciously redefined. However, the construction of a new sensorium enables the body to cut into the “Real Order” in a different manner which subsequently redefines the “Symbolic Order”. While nothing physically changes in the “Real Order,” the body has been re-imagined/reconstituted during a corporeal process based as much on production as it is on consumption. The changes to the “Real Order,” although imagined, recharge the “Symbolic Order” with new meaning. And the cycle from imagination, to symbolic, to real and back to symbolic continues indefinitely until *al-Ándalus* appears natural.

However, there remains one essential group missing from the process. And superficially, a group that are not aware that they are in the middle of a meaning making system: the unquestioning tourists. The following chapter discusses the role that the unquestioning tourist unwittingly plays in the endorsement of a new ethnicity. Thus far, the processes at work during the festival appear to be framed within local considerations. However the unquestioning tourist connects local particularisms within the festival to national and international ideas about festivals. While Spanish tourists in the village may or may not be aware of the issues being played out during the festival, the international tourists in unaware of the significance of the event. Yet, they play a pivotal role in unconsciously accepting the festival as “traditional” and thereby an “authentic” local performance of culture.

# Chapter Six: The Unquestioning Tourist is *the* Agent of Social Change

As I sat with two Spanish tourists from Madrid and one from Alcoy, they explained to me that I was making a mistake with respect to the theme of the event. In truth, they were being polite, accounting for my *guiiri* status and assuming that I had mistranslated the theme of the festival. “Yes, it is called “Three Cultures,” said Rosa, “but it’s a *moros y cristianos* festival.” “We have the same festival in Alcoy,” said Alvaro, “we celebrate it in a different way, but it is the same festival.” “And,” added Rosa, “*La Toma* festival in Granada is a celebration of medieval Spanish identity and the *moros* are a big part of that festival.”<sup>98</sup> Aida joined into the conversation: “They call it “Three Cultures, but it’s about *moros* and Christians. It’s not about Jews. There will be a battle celebration during the next few days,” she said, referring to the mock battles that she is accustomed to seeing at *moros y cristianos* festivals. I did not meet these three tourists again during the festival, and it is possible to suggest that they left Frigiliana with the same assumptions with which they arrived. That is, they did not wittingly or consciously engage with the multiple contradictory messages broadcast during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. They did not question the event and assumed that I had misinterpreted the “three cultural” theme. After all, they were used to medieval festivals in Spain, were aware that different villages performed medieval themes in different ways and were secure in the knowledge that

---

<sup>98</sup> *La Toma* (the Taking) is a celebration and re-enactment of the fall of Granada to Ferdinand and Isabella in 1492. Rosa’s use of “*moros*” referred to the participation of North African migrants during contemporary festivals. As noted previously, *La Toma* is a celebration of Christian dominance (Aidi 2006:80) and the *moros y cristianos* festival in Alcoy denies the presence of medieval Muslims within the city limits (Flesler and Pérez Melgosa 2003:153).

the festival must be about *moros y cristianos*. After all, they had come to enjoy a tourist festival in the village and they had no intention of questioning, or even interrogating, the theme of the event.

The creation of a culture park in Frigiliana relies upon a number of front stage systems that work in concert to transmit their messages. The medieval theme of the event evokes nostalgia and is a conscious attempt to dress up the village in historical terms. The village is veiled in colour and cloth during the festival in order to cover the present as much as to imagine the past. Thus Frigiliana is fashioned by cloth as something different, something old and something “traditional”. For the locals, the decoration in the village transforms it into a space that “everyone” can enjoy. For the tourists, the village is a genuine medieval village that is celebrating an authentic interpretation of its history, culture and tradition. The crowds, the artisan marketplace and the village merge into one festival compound during the event, and while locals may be aware of the contested meanings being articulated, the visitors are unaware of any contestation. Or they view this festival as being similar to the numerous *moros y cristianos* festivals held throughout the region. In fact, it is not unfair to say that the visitors are unaware that they are in the middle of an overt meaning making system. Yet without the tourists, there is no one to listen to this narrative of lost and hidden histories and no audience through which “traditions” can be reified.

“I don’t know if I can tell you what the festival is about,” says Stuart from London. “We came up from Nerja because everyone said it’s a good place to bring the family, and they are having a great time,” he says as his two face-painted children happily play outside a café. “I can see a lot of symbols on the buntings going down the street. But I don’t know what they mean,” he says as he points to a

copious amount of Yiddish, Arabic and Christian symbols that adorn the large multicoloured buntings running the length of Calle San Sebastián. “We were at a festival in Nerja,” says his wife, “but it was more like a fair ground. This one looks a bit different. I guess this is a traditional festival. I don’t know.” Overhearing my conversation, Carols says to me in Spanish, “It’s a myth this festival. It’s a tourist festival.” Dressed in a long kaftan and a small skull cap, he walks down the street, looks back, and places his hand on his heart and bows. Laughing, he bows again and bellows out, “*ojalá*.”

The locals enjoy the event, but they have never thought about the amputation of their heritage in those terms before. Moreover, they have never had a space to think about their contested past before. The visitors are oblivious to the origins of the festival and unclear as to whom the term “three cultures” applies. “I can count seven,” says one tourist when asked: Spaniards, Muslims, Jews, Africans, Moors, Christians and, of course, Catholics are but some of their explanations. It appears fair to classify *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* and all of its component parts as an overt cultural construction, a front stage cultural performance specifically invented for tourists. It is the invention of a new myth.

An “idea” that begins as the uncoordinated imaginings of a few locals is engendered by the performance of “three cultures” during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The renaming of public spaces routinely and habitually, in a technical manner, concretises a specific version of the past in ceramic plaques and steel monuments. In 2005, this village was called Frigiliana. Since 2006, it is Frigiliana: la villa de las tres culturas. All of the playful components within the festival potentially introduce new versions of culture to the village. Thus the symbolic and somatic components within the event combine and move beyond festival time. While

performed at a different time of the year, *Festival Danza Oriental* is the “high cultural” component of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The public conferences coordinate and organise an existing, but previously unarticulated, “common sense” notion of history. It is thus transformed into a “good sense” notion of history through discourse and organised discussion. The corporeal and internal acceptance of the “other” during the festival transforms an apparently pure object — blood — into a plural object — mixed blood. The body decides what is to be considered the “other” and what is to be considered the “local”. The final essential part in this process is the unquestioning tourist who validates *al-Ándalus* as an authentic local ethnicity. Culture and identity oscillate around and intersect with ethnicity (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:9). The unquestioning tourist is the international witness that views all cultural performances as “traditional”. The unquestioning tourist is the witness that wholeheartedly embraces the cultural performances as genuine “heritage”. The tourist actively tarries with the positive “other,” and the tourist accepts the claim of a primordial ethnicity/*ethnie* as “truth” The tourist is *the* agent for social change. Yet, tourism is all made up, and this tourist event was made up in 2006.

To suggest that kitsch, tacky and plastic international proletarian tourism is *the* agent of social change is to suggest a more declarative proposition. To be unequivocal, the cultural performances during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* reinforce the economy. There is no distance between *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* tourism and commerce in the village. In fact, the culture-building components within the festival are reproduced in a commercial habitual manner through routine and custom. In order for the festival to be repeated each year, “it must be commercially successful” (Paco interview 2010).

The first festival was really much more successful than we were expecting, the first one. It was incredible. So the second one, it was a problem, because when you do something very successful, the first one, you don't know exactly what to do for the second...It was fantastic. The third time, we tried to introduce some more commercial music, but it was not so good. We had to choose music that was not so commercial. (Maria José 2011)

The festival must become a routine annual event in order for it to be successful. Therefore, the festival is determined by commerce, and its reproduction is limited by commerce. Furthermore, if there are no tourists, there is no festival. If there is no festival, there is no vector to transmit hidden histories; indeed it is fair to say that histories would remain hidden without the tourists. If there are no hidden histories, there is no potential to imagine an ethnic/*ethnie* identity, *al-Ándalus*. And if there is no *al-Ándalus*, there is no mixed blood.

When I arrived in the village in May 2010, I began to make contact with the town hall. They were, and continue to be, some of my most helpful contacts. The very idea that someone wanted to research their village was seen as another potential advertisement for tourism.<sup>99</sup> I was afforded as much time as I wanted for interviews. I was given permission to record all conversations. Most helpfully, I was given access to figures and collected data about the numbers of people attending the festival, the strategies for forthcoming festivals, worries about public safety and the numbers of people using the local bus. I was given a personal guided tour of the twelve ceramic panels, brought for coffee to discuss my fieldwork, and asked if I needed any more information. The origins of the festival were explained. The history of the village was never left unspoken, but it was often mentioned in hushed tones or “off the record”. I was always reminded why there is a festival that celebrates tolerance in Frigiliana, but tolerance rather than conflict was emphasised. I was

---

<sup>99</sup> I returned to the village with 14 undergraduate students in 2013. One of the first comments made to me when I arrived by locals was, “Perfect. More free advertisement for Frigiliana.”

informed about all forthcoming cultural events in the village, and when I attended, I was always welcomed. Following a formal interview with Paco, the then councillor for festivals, I was asked a poignant question that has driven the majority of this thesis.

We sat together drinking coffee and Paco asked me about Ireland. Specifically, what might be happening in the news? I had no access to Irish news; there are no local or international newspapers sold in the village. But I mentioned the controversy surrounding a confirmed visit by the Queen of England to Ireland. Paco remained silent for a moment, and then he asked: “How long were the English in Ireland?” “Eight hundred years,” I replied. “Eight hundred years of contact? That is a about the same length of time that the Muslims were here,” he said as a beaming grin appeared upon his face. “You know, when you are finished here, you should go home and try to start a festival that celebrates your English heritage. See how far you get.”

The similarities between the phrases “800 years of contact” and a common phrase heard in Ireland with respect to English occupation, “800 years of oppression,” struck a chord. Paco laughed at my reaction and said, “It was 500 years ago when the Muslims ruled here, and it still causes disagreements about identity. The English have only just left Ireland. Maybe you should wait 500 years before starting a festival.” With questions about identity, culture, tradition and heritage swirling in my head, Paco had to leave. I had another introductory interview arranged with David, a local author, at the far end of the village. With the words of Daniel Defoe’s *True-Born Englishman* echoing back and forth in my mind as I walked through the village, I decided that the very notion of celebrating English heritage in Ireland would be unmentionable. Paco was correct, I would have to wait

about 500 years or so before I created a festival that celebrated English culture in Ireland. My next informant was waiting in a nearby café. Following initial salutations, I explained my research to David. “*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas?* You know it’s all made up? Some American came up with the idea. It’s a tourist event,” he said.

Travel in general and tourism in particular “generate ambivalent or contradictory representations” (Crick 1989:307). Claude Lévi-Strauss (1976:17) hates “travelling and explorers”. Tourism is tacky, neon and fake. Tourism is pseudo, spurious and inauthentic. Anthropologists are “loath to admit any relationship to the sandal-footed, camera-toting legions in our midst” (Stronza 2001:261). Anthropologists tend to “think of themselves as intrepid fieldworkers and so do not want to be identified with tourists in any way” (Nash 1981:461). Tourist culture is commercial, inauthentic and destroys local traditions (Greenwood 1977:135). Anthropologists are not “travel writers,” according to James Clifford (1997:64), and anthropologists “harbor a profound animus towards the very presence of such figures within the hallowed field site” (Douglass and Lacy 2005:120). Even though everywhere anthropologists go they will find tourists, “and even be categorized with them by locals” (Crick 1989:311), tourists are often unreported in anthropological texts (Nuñez 1963). Tourists corrupt traditional culture. Universal disdain for tourists is not confined to academics as even “[t]ourists dislike tourists” (MacCannell 1976:10). As a feature and a problem, tourists are “[a] horde of displaced persons on the move throughout the summer months” (Mitford 1959:3). Tourists are reproached not only because they travel in hordes, but because they are satisfied with the superficial experiences of other peoples and other places (Fussell 1980:39). For the characters in John Fowels’ (1978:598-599) novel, tourists are easily amused. With

their ubiquitous cameras at the ready and snapping a collection of locals, “[t]here was some kind of triple blasphemy involved; against nature, against humanity, against themselves”. Tourism, in its modern form, is not natural. Or to qualify that a little, proletarian tourism is not natural. Tourism is exploitive and, worst of all, mass tourism is a packaged commodity.

Much like festivals, tourism is fundamentally proletarian inactivity in opposition to the active “lost art of travel” (Fussell 1980:84-87) pursued by the petit-bourgeoisie. With its unbridled pursuit of idleness unfettered by moral restraints, proletarian tourism is encapsulated in Harry Matthews’ (1977:14) term, “four S’s of tourism—sun, sand, sea and sex.” The term “tourist” is used as “a derisive label for someone who seems content with his obviously inauthentic experiences” (MacCannell 1976:94). Tourism is plastic embodied in the kitsch souvenirs that summarise an invented nation for sale on the streets of Barcelona (Grau Rebollo 2013:101-105). From this perspective, tourism is commercial; it is a technical myth, routine and not tradition.

The stereotypical tourist is a pleasure seeker designed by the market. There is a distinction to be made between the explorer, the traveller and the tourist. “No traveler, and certainly no tourist, is ever knighted for his performances” (Fussell 1980:39). Although all three groups travel, the explorer seeks to uncover something new, the traveller seeks that which has already been discovered, but the tourist, accepts “that which has been discovered by entrepreneurship and prepared for him by the art of mass publicity” (ibid.). Travel is purposeful and educational. The travellers’ purposes were to “go about the world to encounter the natives” (Boorstin 1972:91). Tourism is meaningless travel designed to avoid “real” encounters and the “function of travel agencies [that cater for mass tourism] is to prevent this

encounter” (ibid: 92). Tourism is the idle purposeless pursuit of the proletariat. Work and work time are natural. It is idle time spent in the pursuit of nothing that is unnatural. Due to the corrupting effects of the mass market, “travel is now impossible and ...tourism is all we have left” (Fussell 1980:41).

While there are “far better data on...the world of cutlery and canned fish...than on tourism” (Edwards and Cleverdon 1982:15), all manner of attempts have been made to categorise the tourist. These range from, but are not limited to, “...organized mass tourist, individual mass tourist, explorer, drifter...ethnic, cultural, historical, environmental...” (Crick 1989:313). Although no two tourists are alike, a hippy, an independent traveller, a family on a package tour and “someone away from his/her residence for over 24 hours” (ibid: 312) can be labelled a “tourist”. Due to the heterogeneous character of tourism, there is no point in searching for a theoretical approach; moreover, “there is no point in searching for the conceptualization of the tourist” (Cohen 1979:31). Yet there exists an almost intuitive image of the tourist as a gaudy shirted, camera-toting brash interloper (Cohen 2004:18). According to Valerie L. Smith (1989:1), “[a] tourist is a temporarily leisured person who voluntarily visits a place away from home for the purpose of experiencing a change.” This ambiguous definition suggests that an individual tourist can be classified as someone distinct, but it includes everyone who has ever travelled anywhere, regardless of purpose, for work, leisure or family obligations. Ideas about tourism oscillate between extreme poles: “old myths of perpetual boom and the newer myths of pending doom” (Mings 1978:342). In addition to economic concerns, tourism is frequently presented as either a “godsend” or “evil” (Crick 1989:308).

## **Tourism in Spain**

During the 1960s, tourism was seen as the panacea to ailing “underdeveloped” regions of the world. Spain fell within the category of “underdeveloped”. The Spanish economy was in a critical condition at the end of the 1950s. Inflation stood at 12 per cent in 1958 (de Riquer I Permanyer 1995:250), and the Franco dictatorship could neither reduce its effects nor attract foreign investment. The implementation of a Stabilization and Liberalization Plan in 1959 initiated the construction of Spain as a tourist destination. During the early 1960s, numerous regions in the world, deprived and far removed from the great centres of industrial development, were simultaneously transformed into resorts for thousands of holiday-makers from the metropolises of the industrial world (Lanfant 1995:11).

A number of external and internal factors combined to construct Spain as a tourist location. Post WWII northern European labour laws included paid holidays which subsequently increased the demand for foreign travel. The end of the War saw an abundance of “second-hand turboprop aircraft that could be easily bought or leased by a number of European tour operators looking for bargains” (Aramberri 2009:244). Low prices in Spain caused by an unequal distribution of income between northern and southern Europe and by surplus-labour meant that Spain was “well adapted to the poor wages and job instability of the hotel sector” (ibid: 256). The emergence of new tourists coincided with the emergence of family-run hotels along the Spanish Mediterranean coast “looking for clients and offering decidedly competitive prices when contrasted with those of their French or Italian counterparts” (ibid: 251).

As the Spanish economy began to grow, “Spain imported machinery, technology, raw materials and energy resources on a massive scale” (de Riquer I

Permanyer 1995:260). Spain paid for its modernisation from foreign tourist receipts. In an interview in 2004, ex-Francoist Minister for Tourism, Manuel Fraga Iribarne, says: “Tourism was our Marshall Plan” (Sánchez Sánchez 2004).<sup>100</sup> Fraga was part of a new breed of “technocrats” in Franco’s Spain. While the Falange had rejected free market capitalism, the well educated “technocrats” embraced capitalism and the free market. With strong links to the lay Catholic organisation Opus Dei, the “technocrats” looked outside Spain for economic models to improve the economy. Despite the argument presented by the traditionally minded Falange that bikini wearing tourists would corrupt Spanish “morals,” Fraga successfully marketed, promoted and developed Spain as a tourist destination. While international integration and tourism played a significant role in shaping Spanish political discourse, “a momentous political game was being played against the backdrop of determining who would lead Spain and in what manner in another of its often frustrated attempts to enter modernity” (Aramberri 2009:244). Due to the overwhelming commercial success of tourism in Spain, the technocrats won out over the Falange for control of the Spanish economy.

International tourism fuelled the re-development of the Spanish coast on a grand scale as rural agricultural communities were dramatically rebuilt with high-rise low-density apartments. While the ownership of newly constructed apartment complexes remained in Spanish hands, the finance, bookings and the management of new resort towns was controlled by foreign tour operators. In both the construction and service sector, “the tourism miracle relied on the existence of surplus labor” (Aramberri 2009:256). Foreign tour operators not only dictated local pricing

---

<sup>100</sup> Manuel Fraga Iribarne: Minister for Tourism and Information from 1962-1967. Founding president of the contemporary Spanish Christian Democrat/Conservative political party, Partido Popular. As Minister for Information Fraga was responsible for state-sponsored censorship. Fraga was also *aperturista*.

policies; they controlled and profited from the tourist spending by pre-selling day trips and extracting large profits from local tourist attractions. The point of sale for local amenities was the country of departure and not the country of destination. In addition, foreign tour operators designed the new landscape of the Spanish coast and dictated the design of these tourist towns. Hotels had to be built close to the beach, thus occupying some of Spain's most beautiful natural resources. They also had to be close to shopping centres and local nightspots "and be near, though not too close, to other hotels and resorts, thus forming leisure clusters" (ibid: 252). Clients were encouraged to spend as much time as possible, and money, within the hotel complex,

running up a drink account at hotel bars; shopping at the hotel's commercial gallery; or using in-house services such as hairdressing, spas, beauty salons, foreign exchange, gambling, and other extras. (ibid.)

"Convenience Hotels," the industry preferred term, dominated the mass tourism market. Aramberri (ibid.) suggests that they should have been called "leisure factories that met the requirements of industrial tourism"

Tourism on an industrial scale saw visitor numbers to Spain increase from six million in 1960 to thirty million in 1975 (de Riquer I Permanyer 1995:260). Frigiliana, and nearby Nerja which fuels Frigiliana's tourism, missed out on this tourism boom. Geography and infrastructure played a significant role in Frigiliana being bypassed. In short, Frigiliana is on the wrong side of Málaga airport, as it is located in the east of the province. The principal tourist destinations along the Costa del Sol are located west of Málaga and continue to be the preferred destinations for mass tourists. In addition, Frigiliana's location five kilometres away from the beach and the absence of anything that could be described as "nightspots" precludes its inclusion within the mass tourism brochures. Similarly, there is relatively little land

in the village that is suitable for large-scale development.<sup>101</sup> Locals in Frigiliana own the small hotel and the cafés in the village and, for this reason, foreign tour operators could not control or profit directly from tourist spending in the country of departure. Frigiliana was eventually able to capitalise on its “authentic” character as it attempted to attract the apparently more discerning “cultural tourist.”

Frigiliana began a process of conserving the medieval architecture in the village as part of Spain’s national tourism and economic development initiative during the Franco regime. Moorish floor tiles and *revellines* (stepped entrances) were preserved in the older section of the village as part of an overall plan to modernise, that is to say transform, the village into a tourist destination.<sup>102</sup> In 1961, Frigiliana won second place in a regional beautification award (*Concurso de Mejora y Embellecimiento de los Pueblos de la Provincia*). It won first place in 1967 in the same award, first place in the national award in 1981 and first prize in the regional awards in 1988. The process of remodelling Frigiliana began as part of the overall national drive to construct Spain as an international tourist destination and “to improve the performance of the Spanish economy” (Aramberri 2009:243-244).

The original inspiration to conserve Frigiliana’s Muslim architectural heritage was initiated by mixed motivations. They were “not always cultural” (Navas Acosta 1999:15). There was a concerted effort to modernise the village “to let go some old life styles” (ibid.) and provide more useful services. Repaving the streets of the

---

<sup>101</sup> While large-scale apartment buildings are rare in the village, the surrounding countryside (*el campo*) is filled with newly built *cortijos* and “rural” houses that accommodate the village’s preferred “cultural tourist”.

<sup>102</sup> *Revellines* are steps that allow access to some houses in the village and date from the thirteenth-century. There are numerous examples of *revellines* in contemporary Frigiliana. They were banned and removed during the Spanish Inquisition because they obstructed the view from the street thereby potentially concealing crypto-religious practice. But much like the idea that all of the Jews and Muslims were removed from Spain, the medieval *revellines* in contemporary Frigiliana are a concrete testament to ineffective nature of the Inquisition, and its inability to remove all traces of Islam from Spain.

village, planning better access and planning new commercial centres “are a permanent demand of public interest which benefits our society” (ibid.). Even though “traditional values” had to be preserved, modernising the village and constructing it as a tourist destination was a central component of a drive that was a renewal of the past. Frigiliana’s past had been forgotten “and partly ignored by the people of this area” (ibid.). The eventual outcome had to be “functional,” that is to say, commercially viable, but it also had to be “aesthetically pleasing and artistic” (ibid.). According to Navas Acosta “the cultural factor appears” towards the end of the project to reinvent Frigiliana as a tourist destination, when profits from tourism begin to increase. Thus, while it began as an explicitly commercial project, cultural distinctions begin to emerge firstly as a potential marketing strategy and secondly as an ideological concern. This phase of the programme ended in 1982 when the twelve ceramic panels were installed in the village.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* emerged as a direct result of previous attempts to mark Frigiliana out as a distinct location with a distinct heritage for the purpose of luring tourists. The history of tourism in Frigiliana is based on contemporary concerns and builds upon earlier tourism projects in the village. Culture, art and aesthetics are the principal tools used to articulate the village’s plural heritage. Similar to previous attempts that constructed Frigiliana as a tourist destination, concerns about the economy and the commercial benefits of selling the village’s heritage dominate discourse surrounding *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The sale of heritage led to the ultimate construction of identity and *ethnie* as a marketable tourist object. While considerations about the cultural aspects of the village were not the initial motivational factors that drove a redefinition of local ethnicity, the commodification of culture realised distinctions within local culture,

heritage and tradition. In turn, the commercial success of tourism resulted in the redefinition of a new “natural” identity. Yet, Marie-Françoise Lanfant (1995:5) suggests that identity constructed for tourists is not natural and not worthy of anthropological study.

### **Inequality and the Price of Tourism**

According to the OECD (Erbes 1973), international tourism is “manna from heaven” (quoted in Crick 1989:314). The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (1967) highlight the “almost limitless growth potential in tourism” (quoted in Crick 1989:314). 1967 was declared the International Tourist Year and it was claimed that “tourism is a basic and most desirable human activity deserving the praise and encouragement of all peoples and all governments” (United Nations 1967:24). For developing countries, “tourism is reported as a relatively “easy” export to develop for earning scarce foreign exchange” (Jafari 1974:227) that requires little if any capital investment. By utilising existing natural resources and with little investment, tourism can transform small island economies that “may have no alternatives to tourism (Crick 1989:320). Entrance to the tourist market is dependent on the commodification of culture in order to achieve commercial success. This leads to local concerns relating to “their” ability to find a “culture” that can be sold within international tourism. But, what if there is no “culture” to sell? Or as a Tswana elder asks, “[I]f we have nothing of ourselves to sell, does it mean that we have no culture?” (quoted in Comaroff and Comaroff 2009: 10).

Tourism is not a secure growth industry with limitless potential for development. As a result of policies that see hotels, car hire companies, travel agents and airlines working together, foreign investment may never reach destination

countries. Even local excursions and day trips can be purchased at the point of departure. The luxury tourism industry often employs expatriate management teams. Luxury tourism spends significant sums of money importing foreign food stuffs to meet the demands of their affluent clientele. It also requires a substantial investment in airports, transport systems and road networks that may never be utilised by locals. Tourism requires a significant amount of external advertisement in order to promote local destinations. Thus, while it appears that tourism brings foreign exchange to impoverished regions, it may be the case that impoverished people are subsidising affluent foreign tourists, subsidising foreign industries and subsidising foreign governments, as a significant proportion of potential foreign exchange remains outside the host destination countries. International tourism benefits those who have existing access to land, capital and political influence, and the benefits from tourism “unlike water, tend to flow uphill” (Rivers 1974:7). In its most sinister guise, tourism legitimises right-wing regimes. Despite the moral dilemma that hedonistic semi-clad tourists introduced to conservative Francoist Spain, “it also significantly enhanced the regime’s sovereignty and vitality following a period of isolation and stagnation in the 1940s” (Pack 2006:2).

As much as tourism is made up, it appears to function in a number of different but significant ways. Leaving aside the unequal distribution of tourist income for one moment, tourism appears to be *the* catalyst for the redefinition of culture. Fundamentally, tourism appears to operate simultaneously at a local and supranational level significantly enhancing and legitimising political sovereignty. Wilderness tourism that “leaves no trace” on the natural landscape, not only reifies a version of nature as wilderness, but it defines and redefines the frontier spirit of an entire nation (Taylor 2013:75). The commercial success of tourism silences dissent.

Tourism not only transformed the Spanish economy, its success transformed the Francoist regime by diminishing the level of influence held by the Falange and augmenting the influence of the “technocrats”. Thus, tourism is a powerful force beyond its debatable economic benefits in that it not only transforms ethnicity and culture, but legitimises governments. As Daniela Flesler and Adrián Pérez Melgosa (2008:66) note, tourism in Spain was an organised form of political propaganda that legitimised a Franco regime “viewed with great suspicion by its European neighbors.” While the kitsch, gaudy and exploitative character of tourism relegates it to inauthentic, purposeless pleasure, it appears to facilitate national transformations and supranational processes that are conceptually beyond the plastic objects that embody tourism’s tacky nature.

By its very nature, tourism is fickle, faddist and beyond the control of the host country. It is dependent upon fashion, taste and class in the affluent countries. Tourism is one of the first luxury items to be dispensed with during an economic recession in affluent countries. Tourists do not choose holiday destinations because the locals are friendly, nor do they choose destinations because of a pre-existing knowledge about authentic “traditions”. Overall consideration, in the first instance, is given to price. Tourists choose cheap destinations and the cheapness of host destinations exposes the foundational premise upon which tourism is constructed, that is inequality. Tourism is “the conspicuous consumption of resources... rooted in the real world of gross political and economic inequalities between nations and classes” (Crick 1989:334). Tourism is “a ‘pot’ latch” in which the tourist tries to act the part of someone from a higher class, thirsting to squander his money, letting his whims determine his choice of things, and generally consuming for consumption’s sake” (UNESCO 1977:85).

Spain is a cheap destination within Europe. A low added tax system, low minimum wage and significant unemployment help to construct Spain as a cheap tourist destination. Their low added tax policy means that tobacco and alcohol, some of the “proletarian hunger killers,” may be one third cheaper in Spain when compared to northern European tax policies. Tourism perpetuates and reinforces low skill, low pay and a poor training mode of inequality that is entirely dependent on external factors. For the tourist, their host country is “the Garden of Eden”. For the local proletariat, “it is a Perverted Hell” (Tylor 1973:221).

Tourism is thus a new form of colonialism and leisure imperialism. It is “the hedonistic face of neo-colonialism” (Crick 1989:323) that exploits local resources. Public space is given over to affluent foreigners framed and defended within the rhetoric of “development”. While tourists are welcomed by local governments, tourism is a form of cultural imperialism that not only reinforces international class inequalities, but augments them. Sex tourism in Thailand perpetuates Japanese military imperialism, reinforces gender discrimination and dehumanises the local population (O’Grady 1982:35). “Issues of rape and sexual assault are also increasingly related to tourism” (Ryan and Hall 2001:x). The ugly side of international tourism supported by multinational airlines, travel agents and financed by governments is a continuous form of capitalist imperialism that exploits land, resources and people in an ever more insidious manner.

Tourism distorts local property values placing home ownership beyond the reach of locals. One of the benefits of the property market collapse in Spain is the abundance of now empty and once foreign-owned properties. When I first arrived in Frigiliana in 2004 as a tourist, it was possible to purchase a modest two-bedroom house in the village, for approximately €40,000. Due to their superior rental potential

and transport infrastructure, similar houses in Nerja were being sold for €60,000. In 2006, a modest two-bedroom house in Frigiliana cost €100,000 and €200,000 in Nerja. 2007 to 2008 saw an exponential increase in property prices as houses were realising €500,000, a figure beyond the means of locals. House prices in Frigiliana have fallen dramatically in the last six months. A modern two-bedroom apartment with an asking price of €120,000 in 2011 recently sold for €72,000 (confidential information received from the purchaser of the house in 2013). While the loss of exchange value for houses in the village has resulted in significant local indebtedness and forced repossessions of rental properties, price reductions ensure that locals can purchase homes in the village and benefit from their use value.

Yet, a negative consequence of sustained tourism in the village is the move away from agriculture towards tourism based services and industry. If the tourists keep coming, the local economy is secure. The logic of investing in rental properties has seen two generations move away from agriculture, causing devastating effects. There is an abundance of land that is suitable for small-scale farming; a subtropical climate that overproduces fruit and vegetables; and constant access to the most precious commodity of all in a hot climate, water. Yet, there are no labourers to work the land. And the cost of wages negates any potential profits from farming with market prices as low as 8 cents per kilogram of olives. Even if profits could be made from farming, no one wants to work the land, as two generations have become accustomed to less labour intensive tourism revenue and staggering profits that were achieved during the property boom.

## **It's Just a Commercial Event**

When asked about the origins of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, many locals say: “You know it’s all made up,” in an attempt to ensure that this ethnographer is not duped by its pervasive character. One of their first responses to questions about the festival is, “you know it’s a myth”. Yet, the very people who say it is a myth are the first ones to be seen dressing up in medieval clothes, dancing with each other in the streets and publicly celebrating *convivencia* with tourists. They may say it is a myth, but they perform the festival. By locating *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* within a primary economic base, these informants are suggesting that it is not a “traditional” event and not as “real” as the numerous other festivals held in the village. It is tainted and sullied because of its commercial origins. Yet, they also say that the festival is the best one held in the village, “because it’s for everyone,” emphasising the fact that locals and visitors alike enjoy it, and the fact that it is a family event which attracts large numbers of children. The festival is an opportunity for locals to display their village to an ever-increasing audience. They fully embrace this opportunity by actively decorating their homes and adorning their streets with vibrant floral arrangements. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is therefore an aesthetic spectacle that privileges the artistic endeavours of individuals. It privileges an appreciation of specialised artistic forms. It showcases artistic forms that augment the notion of a plural heritage and emphasise social tolerance between medieval Jews, Christians and Muslims. In a concrete manner, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* intentionally reinforces the economic base by privileging a particular version of cultural production.

It appears reasonable to forget that all of the other events in the village were made up and are explicitly associated with commerce. Few people in the village can

fully explain the origins of the *Cruces de Mayo* festival even though it originated in 1982. None can make the association between the Nationalist-Catholic agenda and the *Festival San Antonio de Padua*. No one appears to connect the elements of these festivals, such as beauty pageants and bull running, with the Franco regime. Some remember an indoor acknowledgement of the *Cruces de Mayo* festival and remember small floral displays in their homes, but they are not clear as to what the festival is about today. “It has something to do with Lent,” says Paco “and we had it before and now we have it again,” are the closest explanations offered. Yet, these festivals are apparently the “traditional” events in the village that have been inherited uninterrupted from the past. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not a “traditional” event because it is new and because it has been manipulated for tourists.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a cultural expression of a particular people in a particular place through their performance at an event that is essentially commercial. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* uses “high cultural” forms to articulate its cultural value in order for the festival to reproduce its commercial success. Words and ideas, such as tradition, heritage and identity play a significant role in constructing the notion that a “real” culture exists as an inflexible transmission from the past. When associated with economy, or worse still, when presented as a commodity infused with alienation dependent upon international tourism, “culture by the pound” (Greenwood 1977:219) becomes exploitative. According to Greenwood (ibid: 131): “The onlookers often alter the meaning of the activities being carried on by local people... culture is in effect being expropriated, and local people are being exploited.” Within this framework, the witness of a cultural event appears to be distorting cultural performances and exploiting local traditions.

Culture, when confronted with the kitsch realm of commercial tourism, reinforces hierarchical distinctions. Tourism, especially contrived mass tourism, is something the “others” do. The festivals “we” perform in “our” streets are a celebration of something “we” do. Yet, even though tourism is instantly recognisable and disparagingly assigned to the “other” as a commonsense certainty, it is rarely recognised in the self. Erik Cohen (2004:34) notes that we all know a tourist and moreover, we probably all are one, yet stereotypically, the gaudily dressed, camera-toting, gullible tourist is someone else. David Lowenthal (1998:5) notes a striking similarity within global tourist projects that sell distinct heritages in order to increase the pull factors for particular destinations. When “human circulation [is] considered as consumption” (Debord 1967: 2), most heritage/tourist endeavours create similarities within apparently different heritage sites. The authors of the catchphrase “Spain is Different,” coined during the Franco regime as a pull strategy, fail to see the irony of selling a constructed cultural unity that does not take account of the fact that “difference” is the very substance that threatens the regime from within and without (Pack 2006:3-5). “The economic organization of visits to different places is already in itself the guarantee of their equivalence” (Debord 1967:168) and economic rather than natural organisation diminishes the eventual outcome to something less than the real thing. Once associated with tourism, culture is at worst fake and at best something being sold as authentic to unsuspecting tourists.

Specific forms of culture have always been constructed for the single purpose of entertaining tourists. Yet, “the process of cultural commodification, and the incorporation of identity in which it is imbricated, is less linear, less teleological, more capricious than either classical economics or critical theory might suggest” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:20). Even though numerous interpretations of cultural

practices “for sale” have a diminishing effect on specific traditional ritual practices, tourism appears to establish cultural practices as “tradition”. The aura of personal notions of belonging, heritage, tradition and culture does not “disappear with their entry into the market” (ibid.). The people who practise cultural performances for tourists inscribe new meanings onto existing traditional forms. Rather than view culture as fixed or static that resists change, culture appears to be dynamic, flexible and open to multiple changes, from within and without.

### ***Al-Ándalus, Inc.***

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* expands upon the construction of its new found ethnicity by inscribing new meaning on existing practices. It allows for the experience of what life could have been like, with a significant emphasis on “could have been like,” by suggesting a sense of harmony in the village that is for sale on the international tourist market. During an event that transforms the village into a medieval culture park, or a themed “authentic reproduction” (Bruner 1994:397) that is neither genuine nor fake, ethnicity is wrapped up in a neat package—a commodity. Visitors and locals to *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* learn about a version of the past as they play with timeframes that swing back and forth between the past, present and future. They enjoy their coeval encounters. They consume nostalgia, corporeally and commercially, for a simpler bygone era, and simultaneously buy into the idea of progress. This is tourism as play and a voluntary “ludic” or “liminoid” experience of pleasure. But it is a form of play that closely follows social norms, and one that is without the anti-structured component of ritual transformation. It is therefore a proto-cultural subversion rather than an anti-structured inversion. It is not that visitors and locals believe in the past, on the contrary, everyone is aware that the festival is firmly fixed in the present. Rather, the

idea of the past articulated during the event is constantly inventing and reinventing Frigiliana. Visitors' experience of the festival goes beyond a search for authenticity, principally because they are tourists, they are not concerned with authenticity. The local cultural performances provide tourists with an unquestioned sense of local life and history. Yet, they are not fully conversant with local history and are unsure about exactly what the "three cultures" refer to. But, it is precisely because they are not fully conversant with local history that they, and only they, can authenticate local culture. It is their stereotypical characterisation as being superficial interlopers that enables them to unquestionably validate a local cultural performance as a "traditional" cultural performance. Were they to question the event, they would readily discover that all cultural performances are essentially made up.

Visitors are being taught about Frigiliana by experience rather than by the formal distribution of facts. Their experience of the village never achieves a level of discourse and, when asked, they are unsure of many of the details surrounding the festival and confused about exactly who the "three cultures" might be. "Are they the Jews, the Moors and the Muslims?" asks one confused English visitor. "And what about the Moroccans?" says his wife, followed by lots of laughter. When faced with the realisation that they do not understand the significance of the cultural performance during the festival, tourists are not overly concerned. I am tempted to say that this lack of understanding on the part of the tourist witness is irrelevant. However, it is precisely because of this lack of understanding that the tourist witness is relevant. Some tourists ask me to explain the festival, but they are not too concerned about the details. Of course, there are tourists who want to know all about the history of the village and find the festival fascinating, but these tend to be tourists who have been to the village before. There is every opportunity to learn about the

history of the village during the festival. The public conferences held each evening during the festival always begin with a brief recap of the version of history that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* seeks to disseminate. But, these essential ethnicity and culture-building components of the event attract locals rather than visitors. Besides, the tourist would not pick up on the relevance of coded terminology, such as “successive regimes.”

The public conferences are delivered in Spanish, often chaired by politicians, and while they act to focus the theme of the event and teach locals about their hidden past, they are not exactly “fun”—in the sense of a corporeal experience of drink, dance, food and festival. For the tourists, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is fun. Thus, for the most part, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* appears to be the same as a number of cultural experiences that tourists can enjoy in Spain. Many note their attendance at various festivals in different villages along the coast. Tourists say that while *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is one of the best festivals that they have attended, because it appears to include everyone, it is similar, in terms of enjoyment if not content, to other festivals in Spain. Many tourists note that the festival is “traditional,” without question or any knowledge of “traditional” festivals. Indeed, the very notion that the festival is recent comes as a surprise to tourists. The tourists believe that an authentic form of culture, tradition and heritage are being sold in Frigiliana. While it is exclusively constructed for tourists, they do not question its authenticity. Rather, they rejoice in the experience of the event oblivious to potential contestations.

As David Lowenthal (1998:1) points out, the world is rejoicing in a new popular faith: “the cult of heritage”. The commodification of heritage, tradition or culture as a brand offered for sale is not a new phenomenon. In fact “recourse to the cargo of cultural tourism...has become a universal panacea, an autonomic reflex

almost, for those with no work and little to sell” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:9). As part of the historical European led process of subjugating native and indigenous people, “[t]he colonialists made a “market” for ethnic identities, in which they have been traded as a commodity ever since” (Castile 1996:743). The corporatisation of the “tribe” takes many different forms. It takes the form of venture capitalism under the direction of the Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:6). It is seen in state sponsored heritage sites in New Salem created specifically for Americans in the US to celebrate “Americanness” and learn about their past when taking citizenship exams (Bruner 1994:398). Or as Lowenthal (1998:5) suggests, the international corporatisation of the tribe through heritage projects maintains difference through almost indistinguishable similarities found at a national level.

Ever increasingly, commerce is the driving force for the re-emergence of ethnic identities for sale in the form of Latino themed pizzerias (Dávila 2001:2) and the beating-bamboo dance on Hainan Island, China (Xie 2003:6). The local actors who perform as Kagga Kamma Bushmen (San) in the Western Cape of South Africa for an awaiting tourist audience become “genuine” San when they “exchange their loincloths for Western rags and go home to a shanty settlement” (White 1991). Hidden from the tourist gaze, all that remains is the memory of performing San identity for sale during tourist performances. And “the traces that lived on in the memory of those who had encountered them” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:10). Due to the repeated enactment of a lost local identity for tourists, “these San were not just shanty dwellers in Western rags” (ibid.). They recognised themselves as Kagga Kamma Bushmen: “a named *people* with a ‘tradition and a way of life.’ In other words, a culture” (ibid.).

The branding of a nation and ethnicity goes further than the construction of memory or the symbolic reinvention of tradition for sale (Handler and Linnekin 1984). The commodification of the nation and its dominant ethnic identity perdures through everyday commodities rather than relying on mere symbolic acknowledgement. It may be all about consumption, but not necessarily the commercial variant of the term. National branding may have begun as a commercial project initiated to protect national employment, but the branding of food has moved beyond the control of politicians and into the market—or into the supermarket to be more precise.

Amid the sale of everything, the culture industry, the commodification of everything and the heritage crusade (Lowenthal 1998:5), the pretence of difference manifests itself in the production of sameness. According to Meaghan Morris (1988:5), “the true (like the real) begins to be reproduced in the image of the pseudo, which begins to become the true”. In order to attain the real thing the imagination “must fabricate the absolute fake” (Eco 1986:7). From this perspective, it appears as though the fake becomes the real; moreover, it appears as though there exists, or once existed, a thing called culture, a real thing called tradition or a real thing called heritage. Yet, culture, tradition and heritage are continuously being invented and reinvented in both the present and the past, but not under self selected circumstances. The reproduction of culture for sale is based upon a construction that must create a believable and credible account of the past and not necessarily an original or immaculate simulation of it. As Bruner (1994:402) notes with respect to a US culture park, there is a clear distinction between someone from the twenty-first-century walking into a village and saying, “This looks like a genuine nineteenth-century village” and someone from the nineteenth-century walking in and saying, “This

looks like a genuine nineteenth-century village”. A similar logic applies to Frigiliana. Accordingly, it is highly improbable that a “genuine” medieval village could be reproduced.

It is therefore fair to suggest that rather than view the commodification of culture as a process that devalues its authenticity, this instance of culture-building for sale during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* has the opposite effect. Its raw material never runs out, and while classic economic theory suggests that its popularity should be diminished by its popularity, given the forces of supply and demand; its popularity actually increases because of its popularity. The fact that the festival is a commercial success means that it will be reproduced each year. The more successful it becomes the more genuine or traditional it becomes. Comaroff and Comaroff (2009:19-20) note that classic economic theory suggests that over supply will reduce demand and the over-production of culture for sale should diminish its returns.<sup>103</sup> With respect to the production of culture for sale, they note that the reverse is actually the case. And in keeping with their argument, the reverse is the case in Frigiliana where the over-production of culture actually increases demand. The commercial popularity of the festival not only ensures its reproduction and validates a plural reading of Spanish history, it silences dissent. For those who disagree with a plural reading of the past must defer to the power of capital being brought to the village each year.

---

<sup>103</sup> Classic economic theory suggests an ever-decreasing but always positive return from consumption. Banana consumption is frequently used as an example. 8 positive “util” values are gained following the consumption of one banana, 15 from the consumption of two bananas and 21 from the consumption of three bananas (Keen 2005). Therefore, overconsumption produces an ever-decreasing but always positive “util” value. Putting aside the arbitrary mathematics applied by economists for one moment, and the arbitrary use of the term “positive value,” eating 72 bananas will cause potassium poisoning and death, which by no stretch of the imagination could be considered a positive value. In opposition to classic economic theory, the over-production of culture during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* increases its positive value for participants. As the more people come to the village, the better the festival atmosphere becomes.

This kind of u-turn of a tourist event shifts the focus away from unhelpful oppositional categories that attempt to label cultural performances as being genuine or spurious. While acknowledging the fact the tourism can be exploitative, it can also act as a locally constructed mechanism for social change that fundamentally relies upon the engagement and approval of international tourism to realise its message. Indeed, it is dependent on the assumption that international tourists will not only validate cultural performances, but they will actively reinforce them as being authentic by not asking any questions.

As Philip FeNan Xie (2003:14) notes with respect to the invention of the bamboo-beating dance, as part of Li culture in China, “[t]he commodification of Li dance should be viewed as a positive mechanism in the pursuit of authenticity”. It is the process of commodification that actually strengthens the village’s sense of identity “which is vital for its survival and sustainability” (ibid.). Hylton White’s (1991) account of the process of involution during the San performance of the past has a similar effect, and Ben Hillman (2003:183) states that “ethnic tourism can serve as a force for cultural regeneration in positive ways”. “Mass circulation reaffirms ethnicity” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009:20) as greater supply engenders greater demand, which contradicts the notion that the over consumption of similar products results in an ever diminishing but always positive “util” value for the consumer.

Visitors attending *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* perceive it to be authentic in the first instance based on verisimilitude. Perception is all that is required to authenticate the festival for the tourists. They apperceive a general notion of what a festival might be and their apperception is confirmed by perception. A limited number of artefacts in the village are original, insofar as they date from medieval

Spain. The presence of original artefacts rubs off on contemporary artefacts during touristic performances and constructs an aura of authenticity (Bruner 1994:400). The festival is fun, enjoyed by “everyone” and this reinforces the idea that people can live together in harmony. Both the apperception and perception of a festival are augmented by the artefacts in the village. Therefore, the lustre of the past rubs off on the present. It is unquestionably and uncritically taken for granted that the locals must be the experts when it comes to performing their own culture, and the tourist experience is validated by the authority of local performers. Or rather, participating in public with the locals authenticates the experience for everyone.

The values of tolerance and harmony transmitted through performing a different version of the past are considered as facts by the tourists. Frigiliana is an authentic medieval village that can be witnessed by burgeoning number of visitors during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. The rewritten landscape reinforces the idea that this is a traditional festival. Even though the festival is clearly a recent invention, for all intents and purposes, the connection between the facts being expressed and their accuracy, or lack thereof, is never questioned. Similar to the Kagga Kamma Bushmen (White 1991), Frigiliana’s three cultural venture is “woven at the intersection of all these trails of myth, history, and money.” When the tourists leave the village a memento of their visit remains that reinforces the “idea” behind a cultural festival. In a similar manner to the way in which tourists confirm national sovereignty, justify dictatorships and recreate national narratives, international tourists confirm local culture. Thereby, the international tourist transforms fiction into fact, farce into reality and myth into truth.

## The Role of the Witness

Something that began in the imagination of one individual has transformed the realities of everyday life for the villagers in Frigiliana. It is not that they are constantly questioning, challenging or contemplating their local sense of heritage every day, but the streets in which they live, the village and the symbols they encounter all combine consciously and unconsciously to alter their sense of heritage in a mundane manner. The everyday interplay and interaction with a consciously rewritten landscape combine to create a conscious and unconscious reinvented notion of this place. This place is now called *Frigiliana: la villa de las tres culturas* and its explicit symbols counter the dominant narrative.

Yet a question remains. Is the only purpose of the festival to encourage more tourists to the village and increase profits? If so, where did the ethnic kernel come from? In order for something to be transformed, it must exist in a latent form before it is transformed into something new. Similar to White's (1991) argument that the San become San as a result of a tourist performance, I am suggesting locals in Frigiliana become *al-Ándalus* for a similar reason. However, do all of the actors employed in all culture parks become the characters they play when their performances are over? Do the actors in the Abraham Lincoln theme park in New Salem become something different as a result of their performances? Do the characters in a Walt Disney theme park become Mickey and Minnie when they go home at night? Is it enough to suggest that performance alone will engender a transformation, or should there be a pre-existing cultural argument that will be realised through farcical displays? There must be something present within the local population that requires transformation before the tourist sees it, for whatever reason. The ethnic biological kernel of a people that I am suggesting is culturally constructed

must exist before tourism, even though it is the tourists who will authenticate it. The question is where did this sense of *al-Ándalus* ethnicity come from? How long has it been in the village? And, as the Franco regime ended in 1975, why is a local sense of a medieval interfaith utopia that opposes a Nationalist narrative only being recalled now?

# Chapter Seven: The Hidden Transcript of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* transforms *el pueblo*. The multiple components within the event fundamentally alter public space, and the theme of the event redefines the village's history, culture and heritage. Festival themes move beyond the confines of the four-day celebration of tolerance, harmony and near interfaith utopia into the streets, roundabouts, car parks and monuments in a concrete manner embodied in ceramic and steel. While the front stage components of the festival are meticulously managed, the uncontrollable background sensorium combines in a somatic manner to realise the experience of the festival amongst locals and visitors. The theme of the event, which contrasts with a prevailing monocultural narrative, sits seamlessly within the village, and is unquestionably enjoyed by visitors who in turn authenticate a new ethnicity for the villagers. This is not to suggest that everyone in the village is aware of this transformation, nor is it to suggest that everyone fully accepts this new version of history. It would be foolish to assume that everyone agrees with every aspect of the articulation of tolerance in exactly the same manner. For Partido Andalucista activists in the village, the festival is a considered political move. For its detractors, it is a myth invented for commercial ends. But for many, it is a time of merriment, festival fun and time to dance. It is a time to enjoy the "other" in a positive manner and, as many locals say, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is for "everyone."

I have hopefully made a convincing argument thus far to state that a themed cultural event, which appears to be superficial, may act as a force to inscribe symbols

with meanings, to concretise a particular version of history and, ultimately, to transform something apparently natural — blood — into something equally natural — mixed blood. I have suggested that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* has uncovered a hidden heritage and a hidden sense of belonging that goes beyond the confines of the event. But some questions remain unanswered. What is being transformed, why is it being transformed and why now?

The festival is about social change, but it is unclear where the motivation for change is coming from and who it is directed against. The festival began in 2006, the Franco regime ended in 1975. It thus appears that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not opposing the Franco regime. Even though it has emerged within a national discursive field that calls for the recuperation of historical memory, the festival does not mention the Civil War, indeed the term is consciously avoided.<sup>104</sup> While it may have emerged within a shifting political opportunity structure, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is not a discursive field. It is not a set of symbolic actions. Rather, it is a subversive reconfiguration of a way-of-being-in-the-world. The theme of the festival articulates tolerance and a need to streamline different cultural influences that, apparently, currently exist in the village. Yet, there are no different cultural influences in the village that could be labelled medieval Jewish, Christian or Muslim cultures. The three separate “castes,” to borrow Castro’s term, are not present in Frigiliana. Nor are they living in an antagonistic state of *coexistencia*. Yet, the festival seeks to transform this non-existing group into a harmonious state of *convivencia*. While there are lost histories in the village that need to be recovered, there are no Jews or Muslims here, medieval or otherwise. Who are this ethnic group

---

<sup>104</sup> Luisa Passerini (2009) argues that the avoidance of language that refers to fascist regimes is a form of conscious resistance.

called *al-Ándalus* through which the festival seeks to integrate all of these diverse cultural elements into a near intercultural utopia?

There are thirty two Moroccan Muslim migrants living in the village, but the festival is not about integrating them within the local community. Silence, hushed tones and a dismissive “no” were the preferred forms of response to my naive attempts to broach the subject of the Civil War. As Narotzky and Smith (2002; 2006) point out, having “ideas” in Spain is code for being political and silence is the preferred method for talking about politics. According to Passerini (2009), silence is a conscious form of resistance. Yet, it first appeared to me to be too obvious a place to begin looking for the hidden transcript behind the festival. Additionally, I feared that I would be drawn in to a secure set of oppositional categories that would make sense in theory, but not work in practise. In particular, my questions about the Civil War, the Franco regime or the Law of Historical Memory were often answered with a curt “no” or a telling silence.<sup>105</sup> Thus I began to begin my research by looking at local practices. I began to look at what the villagers did in concert with what they said.

### **Contemporary Muslims in Frigiliana**

When I arrived in Frigiliana, I assumed that the best place to look for informants was amongst the small migrant community. I was still in the observation phase of ethnographic fieldwork and yet to make contact with locals in this part of the village. I was living beside a small park and playground. As darkness falls, groups of locals converge around the park relaxing in the cool summer evening air. They sit on the

---

<sup>105</sup> A resident in the village since 1972 noted: “Sometimes people would make little comments that were difficult to understand. But after years here, I began to notice that they were referring to the War or the regime. They were often just little comments about which side people were on, but nobody spoke about it in detail.”

walls, watch their children play together and chat amongst themselves. Men sit together in small groups shepherding young children in the playground, and Muslim women, identifiable because they are wearing *hijabs*, take care of younger children in buggies. As it transpired, locals and migrants were chatting together and, if there were to be a distinction made between groups, it would be gender based. Discerning the nationality of these groups should have been easier because they speak different languages. However, locals in Frigiliana clip and swallow most of their consonants. In truth, they clip and swallow most of their vowels as well. It is not always obvious that they are speaking Spanish.

I initially began my research by talking to these migrants most. As I lived in this section of the village for eight months, I spent many evenings sitting on the walls of the park. The migrants were very helpful, very accommodating, but they irrevocably disrupted my approach to the festival. I was able to see the irony in a festival that purports to be tolerant but, due to the significant amount of pork and alcohol, it excludes the very people it is aspiring to include. I was hoping that they could see the same thing. As some of these migrants are undocumented, they asked me not to record their conversations, take notes or use their real names within my thesis. They repeated this request to me throughout my field work and asked for reassurances that the personal content of our conversations would not be used in this thesis. This is a summary of an unrecorded conversation with Amreen (not his real name) from Morocco.

Amreen, who came to the village from Morocco in 2009, told me Frigiliana was a great place to live. He told me that he and his family felt extremely welcome in the village and pointed out the number of locals chatting with migrants dotted throughout the park. As we sat on the wall, he said he felt uncomfortable speaking

for the entire migrant community in the village. He pointed out that because most of the migrants were family oriented, they fit in with the village's lifestyle. Local families like to sit and chat with their children. Grandparents like to come out and enjoy chatting. And the migrants enjoyed doing the same thing. There is no alcohol being consumed, and therefore the practice of sitting and chatting is not *haram*. All in the small group nodded in agreement.

Amreen attends the mosque and buys his food in the *halal* store in Nerja. The migrants take turns going to the *halal* store and tend to cook and eat together. Amreen enjoys cooking but does not eat out in any of the cafés in the village because café food is not prepared in keeping with his dietary restrictions. Just as my point about Muslims being excluded from the festival due to its *haram* food was about to be confirmed, Amreen frustrated my approach. First, he said, not all migrants strictly follow Muslim food restrictions. While Muslims adhere to their food restrictions, not everyone practises Islam to exactly the same extent. Much like all groups of people, he said, "there are good and bad Muslims." Second, he said, while he does not participate in the festival, his wife brings his children and they love the clowns, magicians and fire-eaters. Third, he avoids any of the *haram* components in the festival but likes to walk through the festival with his friends and family and watch the Church changing into a mosque. Fourth, he thinks the carnivalesque representation of Islam acts to attract tourists to the village. And if tourists spend money in the village, the locals will benefit. If the locals benefit, he will benefit because he sits and chats to locals every night. In other words, economy is an essential component within notions of *convivencia*, but it exists beyond an apparently discrete economic sphere. Most importantly, Frigiliana is home for Amreen, and he sees any benefit for his new home as being a benefit for him.

Although the rest of the group's grasp of Spanish was limited, they all nodded in agreement. Amreen pointed out that some migrants worked on the stalls during the event. If anything, they felt completely included in the festival. Everyone joined in and pointed out that any festival in Spain would have to include alcohol were it to attract tourists and, therefore, the migrants made a personal/religious choice that they make every day.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* recreates a near interfaith utopian version of medieval Frigiliana as it explicitly attempts to integrate disparate Jewish, Christian and Muslim heritage within the contemporary population. Yet, to be clear, although there is a small migrant Muslim community in the village, there are no Spanish Muslims here. Nor are there any Spanish Jews here. That is, if the term is used to indicate descendants of medieval inhabitants within the contemporary village who continue to practise Judaism or Islam. The discourse relating to inclusion, tolerance and harmony appears to be directed at non-existing religious groups. It appears as if new cultural differences are being created during the festival conferences, and old cultural differences are being redefined. This raises some fundamental questions with respect to the aims of the festival: who is being included, who is being excluded and why? It appears as though Frigiliana is a divided community, and the festival seeks to reconcile antagonistic elements within the community. Jews, Christian and Muslims are the suggested lines upon which divisions are drawn in the village. If religion is to be a mark of distinction, there is only one religious group in the village, the Roman Catholics, who are the descendants of Christian Frigiliana.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* explicitly calls for the recuperation of lost memories in the village and the integration of medieval Jewish and Muslim identity within the contemporary population. It consciously draws from the past in order to

alter the present. By dressing up the village in medieval terms, the festival is actively attempting to enhance the social and cultural development of the community. According to the festival's mission statement, it is an attempt to "streamline the different cultural influences that currently exist in Frigiliana, using them as the basis for cultural and tourist development" (Appendix B). Yet many of these medieval cultural influences were not present in the village before 2006. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* encourages "knowledge and the enjoyment of one's own roots as a system to learn values, such as tolerance, respect and the recognition of the origins of local identities" (ibid.). Yet this suggests that different cultural influences *currently* exist in the village and suggests a contemporary presence of intolerance that is directed at medieval Jews and Muslims. Yet there are no such people living in Frigiliana. The festival calls for locals to "learn from cultural diversity in order to make progress in the everyday social environment" (ibid.). And while this is a reasonable aspiration, half of the core population in the village are foreign residents. They say that this is one of the most tolerant places that they have ever lived in. If the numbers of visitors who come to the village are considered to impact upon local life, Frigiliana can only be described as a culturally diverse village.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* seeks to "provide the people and the village with an image that integrates the village's natural space within its cultural space" (ibid.). This integration of nature and culture has a specific aim. That is, "to convert Frigiliana into an international landmark as a model for integration" (ibid.). Yet, Frigiliana does not currently appear to be a model of disintegration. By internationalising a tolerant image of Frigiliana, the festival is "proving that local action can now achieve global recognition" (ibid.). Yet, Frigiliana appears to be a rather tranquil rural village that does not require such organised "local action" to

transmit its message on an international stage. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* seeks to “promote the conservation and recovery of traditions and heritage” (ibid.). Yet it remains unclear why.

### **The Contemporary Hidden Transcript**

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* appropriates the genre of “festival” in order to disseminate its message on a local and global scale. It constructs a space to articulate a public message about the village. While there may be a hidden transcript behind the event, it cannot remain hidden and must be made public in order for it to become realised. Moreover, in order for a hidden transcript to become realised publicly, it must engage with civil society, thereby engaging with the state idea. But, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* does not engage with the state idea as it subverts the state. The images, symbols and histories that the festival uncovered were not constructed out of thin air and must connect with the history of the village. But, while they connect to and arise from traditional practices, they must not subvert the form that traditional practices take. In other words, the festival must subvert the state idea by appropriating an existing institution.

The lone Andalusian flag standing on the lookout near the Polish café conceals a hidden history behind *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* that is rarely if ever mentioned. Installed in 2010, the plaque on the flagpole makes a general statement about the recent Civil War history of the village, but it is a rather vague, all-inclusive statement about unnamed loss. The power and emotive force within a public monument derives from its unknown and empty character (Anderson 1991:10). Consequently, not knowing the names of the people that the monument celebrates augments its commemorative value. The monument attempts to pay homage to

“everyone” who died during the Civil War. Recounting a conversation about the erection of the monument, one local informant suggested to a former right-wing mayor that a simple monument that “named” all of those who died might be appropriate. “Impossible” was the defiant response. The sense that anyone who resisted Franco was a delinquent, and was therefore labelled a criminal, persists today. For similar reasons, those who died on the Nationalist side cannot be commemorated alongside those who died on the Republican side. Resistance to Franco’s regime is seen by many as the work of uncoordinated and apolitical criminals. The propaganda of the regime that demonised the Republic and its supporters persists long after the regime ended. Bestselling titles, such as Pío Moa’s (2006) *Los mitos de la Guerra Civil (The Myths of the Civil War)*, encapsulate and perpetuate the regime’s propaganda.<sup>106</sup>

There is a little more than banal sentiment expressed in the inscription happening on the plaque. The date at the end of the inscription is significant. It says: “*En Frigiliana, a 22 de abril 2010.*” In other words, the monument was officially opened at a ceremony on 22 April, 2010. The year is important as it indicates contemporary concerns relating to the Civil War, but the day and month belie the hidden transcript. On the day that the Civil War monument was unveiled, a large crowd of local inhabitants attended the ceremony, but “none of the right-wingers came” (David 2010). The date relates to events in the village during the 1950s at a time when resistance to the Franco regime was based in the Sierra Almirajara that surround Frigiliana.

---

<sup>106</sup> 1996 marked the sixtieth anniversary of the Civil War and the “reappearance of the ideologically charged narratives of the Franco decades” (Boyd 2008:141) led by journalist Pío Moa.

On 20 April 1950, a member of *los Regulares*, Mohamed Ben Abdela, was washing himself in an irrigation channel at the edge of the village when he was attacked from behind with an axe. He received three blows to the “head and clavicle and fell to the ground spurting blood” (Baird 2008:69). He later recovered from his injuries. The Guardia Civil named the culprit as Antonio Platero Martín and when news reached Antonio, he fled to the Sierra along with his two companions, José Castillo Moreno and Antonio Sánchez Martín. A large force of Guardia Civil and *Regulares* surrounded the village and combed the Sierra for the runaways, but to no avail. The Guardia Civil began to harass local family members or associates of the three runaways. On 22 April 1950, three young men who had nothing to do with the incident were randomly arrested: Antonio García, Antonio Triviño Cerezo, and Manuel Martín Ruiz. Their families and survivors continue to insist to this day that they were not involved in the attack. They were killed at la Loma de las Vacas in the Sierra Almirajara. On the morning of 23 of April 1950 their mutilated bodies were loaded onto donkeys and delivered to the cemetery – according to the parish records they were all, “shot by the Guardia Civil” (Baird 2008:xix).

All of the inhabitants of Frigiliana were shocked by the ferocity of the reprisals meted out against these three young locals. In an act of solidarity and grief, everyone in the village attended the funeral. The Church bell rang out “amid a tension that was almost tangible” (Baird 2008:70). All of the villagers, including the local parish priest, teacher, mayor and the local doctor, filed past the Guardia Civil barracks in silent procession towards the cemetery. This was an unprecedented act of solidarity and defiance that incensed the Guardia Civil. Their Captain, Fernández Muñoz, summoned influential residents who had attended the funeral. They were accused of being hypocrites and were beaten. Apparently, these same influential

inhabitants of the village had recently encouraged the Guardia Civil to “get tough” with the *Maquis*, and thus the Guardia Civil felt betrayed by their disloyal attendance at the funeral. Even the priest was accused of “organising an ‘anti-patriotic’ demonstration” (Baird 2008:71).

While there was an inquest into the death of these three young men, the proceedings were never made public. Their families have always proclaimed their innocence and continue to seek justice. The official version states that the actions of the Guardia Civil “do not constitute an offence,” and they acted in compliance with their orders (Baird 2008:73).

In another twist of events that exposes deep divisions within the village, Virtudes Martín Ruiz, sister of Manuel Martín Ruiz, was summoned to the Guardia Civil barracks to discuss a letter that had been sent from Madrid regarding the death of her brother.

The sergeant said: Look at this...and took a very yellow sheet of paper out of a box. What bad fellows the Civil Guards are and how good is Frigiliana! All of Frigiliana signed this so they would kill them.

Virtudes: They [the villagers] went about asking for signatures in order to kill my brother and the others. And all the rich folk signed.

Virtudes: *Los ricos* signed and then washed their hands of it.

Sergeant: See how fine Frigiliana is and how bad we guards are!

Virtudes: Everybody went to the funeral. If you go to the funeral, don't sign to have them killed. (quoted in Baird 2008:170)

The monument was erected as the result of the efforts of the families of the three young men who died on 22 April 1950 at la Loma de las Vacas in the Sierra Almirajara. Their deaths are seen as an act of reprisal by the local Guardia Civil, but the official version absolves the Guardia Civil of any wrongdoing. The date that the

Civil War monument was officially opened on 22 April 2010 coincides with the anniversary of their deaths. This is the only public acknowledgement of the event, and it is not obvious to anyone from outside the village. Frigiliana may be a divided community, and one that requires integration, but it is divided based on recent rather than medieval histories.

### **“Photos of Family and Friends”**

A café/restaurant sits at the peak of the hill leading up from Calle Real. Similar to other cafés in the village, a small sign outside indicates a terrace offering magnificent views of the region. A menu sits behind glass in a wooden frame outside the entrance. The sign outside the café reads, “*el Casino.*” A narrow bar leads clientele towards a large open seated area at the back of the restaurant. Patio doors open out onto a small terrace offering views of the lush valley leading down to a glistening Mediterranean Sea. A roof terrace provides the opportunity for even more spectacular panoramic views of the village, the surrounding countryside and the sea.

While there are tourists in the café, the majority of people chatting at the bar are locals. This is a bright, friendly and airy café staffed with amiable and attentive employees. They offer delicious freshly made complimentary tapas with every drink purchased. Spanish is the dominant language spoken at the bar. Given that this is a Spanish village, it may appear odd to state that Spanish is the dominant language spoken. However, due to the substantial foreign population and large amount of tourists in the village, English may often be the dominant language heard in public. There is a small alcove at the end of the bar just beside the entrance. The open door

at the front of the café obscures it. Upon leaving, a couple of photographs that decorate the wall become visible.<sup>107</sup>

The collection of photographs date from the 1950s to the early 1990s and are essentially images of friends smiling in the bar, making funny faces or celebrating family occasions. They are “photos of family and friends,” says the bartender when asked. One stands out. A group of men all look up and smile for the camera while sitting around a table at what appears to be some sort of committee meeting. Draped on the wall behind them is a flag emblazoned with the Yoke and Arrows of the Falange.

In order to secure a civil service job, one had to be a supporter of the Franco regime. And the most public way to demonstrate that support was to become an active member of the Falange. The photograph of the Falange meeting is surrounded by images of Guardia Civil and local dignitaries merrily enjoying diverse social events in the bar. It dates from the early 1960s. What is to be made of a photograph mounted on the walls of a public café in 2012 that commemorates an oppressive fascist party? What does this say about the memories of the regime that persist in the village? Are these the “good guys” on display for all to see? Are they the “bad guys” for others to remember silently?

In truth, my principal reason for frequenting *el Casino* was the excellent and cheap tapas. Most Spanish towns have a café called *el Casino*, and they were the traditional meeting place for the *latifundistas* and right-wingers (Narotzky and Smith 2006:196). That is, they were the clubs where the right-wing elite met before, during and after the Spanish Civil War. An assertive, “yes,” or a puzzled, “no,” were the

---

<sup>107</sup> *El Casino* was decorated in 2013. Photographs containing *Falange* symbols were removed the same year.

two responses I received when I asked, “have you tried the tapas in *el Casino*? They have a new chef.” Some villagers said, “I’ve never been to *el Casino*.” Others just remained silent when I asked. Silence is the preferred form of public discourse when discussing the divisions engendered by the Franco regime. Silence may indicate conformity or dissent. It may be the result of cultural tradition or a mark of shame. But as Passerini (2009:198-202) points out, silence may represent conscious estrangement from fascist institutions. It is not fair to suggest that the clientele in *el Casino* are all right-wingers, or that certain members of the village are excluded from entering the café. It is fair to suggest that certain members of the community choose not to enter the café. A 75 year-old local says, “It’s strange, but I’ve never been in that bar.” Another younger local says, “It looks nice. I pass it every day, but I’ve never gone in.”

These two anecdotes point to current concerns in the village relating to the Civil War. While the photographs in the café are not official, they demonstrate an unusual reverence for a violent and repressive regime. Additionally, they indicate a level of legitimacy afforded to one of the violent arms of the regime. They point to existing divisions in the village and, to be frank, a lack of remorse, shame or compassion on behalf of the owners of the bar. I cannot help but think what it might be like to walk into a café in Berlin and look at a wall of photographs that commemorate a Nazi Party meeting. I cannot help but think of the pain and hurt that images of laughing, smiling faces framed by a Swastika might cause to survivors of the holocaust in general and Jews in particular. Yet, it appears to be acceptable to commemorate those who committed numerous crimes against humanity and goad those who suffered and still live in Frigiliana.

## The Spanish Civil War and the Franco Regime

Rarely, if ever, are the words “the Spanish Civil War” or “the Franco regime” mentioned in the village. If they are mentioned, it is with a hushed voice. In place of the terms Civil War or the Franco regime, the term “successive regimes” is used as code to index the Spanish state from 1492 to the present day. “Successive regimes” is a coverall term that includes all political formations in Spain up to and including the Franco dictatorship. The propaganda of the regime and the myth that it represented the “true” Spanish character has persisted long after the regime ended. While it may appear normal for opposing sides to present contradictory accounts of the past, I was surprised when individual informants offered contradictory versions of the regime.

“Franco wasn’t all bad,” says Domingo. “I had a great childhood. We were brought on tours, school trips. I had a great childhood. All of my teachers were Falange members.” On another occasion, he says, “my father was beaten every day by the Guardia Civil.” On another occasion he says, “you see those drain pipes out there,” pointing to concrete pipes in the hillside, “they used to send my father up them, because he was small, looking for the *Maquis*.” On yet another occasion he says with respect to the discussion surrounding the forthcoming municipal elections in 2010: “You were with Franco, he was with Franco. Franco has been dead for more than 30 years. Enough with Franco.” And Domingo used to be a member of Partido Andalucista, a separatist party, who oppose the ideology and cultural legacy of the Franco regime.

In another contradictory twist that indicates a distinction between what people do and what people say, Domingo made a symbol for his new front door. It is a crescent moon and a six pointed star. He insists that the symbol has nothing to do

with the “three cultures” and emphatically denies any association between the practice of decorating every corner of the village with stars, moons and crosses during the last six years. He says they are “Taoist symbols of the sun and the moon that represent yin and yang.” And I have no reason to disbelieve him. Even if the symbols have nothing to *say* about the “three cultures,” they have something to *do* with the practice of situating religious symbols in public places. As a result of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, Domingo has the right to put anything he likes on his front door. In other words, his symbols deserve their rightful place along with any other symbols in the village. The contemporary divisions in the village are not always made obvious by what people say, as they are more often than not left unsaid. The divisions in the village are made obvious by what people do, and what they don’t do. They avoid a café that is inextricably linked to the Francoist fascists. They meet at the lone Andalusian flag to publicly commemorate Bas Infante, and silently commemorate the death of three villagers at the hands of the Guardia Civil. They dress up the village in historical terms and create a new identity and a new culture that hinges around a new ethnicity. They place coded symbols in public. All manner of events from the recent past and the oppression suffered at the hands of the Franco regime explain why *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a form of cultural activism that attempts to recuperate lost and forgotten memories. But why did this begin in 2006, more than 30 years after the end of the dictatorship?

### **Francoist Control of Culture**

The Francoist regime’s “idea” of culture was always tempered by a fear of all things foreign and all things public. The control of public space was an essential weapon in their arsenal. Life is lived out and enjoyed on the streets of Spanish towns and villages (Aceves 1971:33). Thus it is through the management of public life that the

regime reinforced its version of Spanish culture. Nationalist propaganda leading up to the Spanish Civil War delegitimized all other ideologies “by denying their right to be considered Spanish” (Preston 2012:5). Liberals, Socialists, regionalists, anarchist and communists were branded as “foreigners” as the threat to the unity of the Spanish state was apparently being orchestrated by an external “other”. The “others” were an imagined secret alliance: a compound of Jews, freemasons, Soviets, communists and Muslims. Right-wing Catholic publications, such as *Garcia y Justicia* and *Los Hijos del Pueblo* and *El Debate*, disseminated its anti-Semitic/anti-Masonic propaganda in publications that sold by the tens of thousands with the intention of creating the notion that “the Second Republic was foreign and sinister and must be destroyed” (ibid: 10). Wherever the threat to an imagined unified Spain may have come from, for Nationalists, it was external. This made the possibility of constructing two Spains a reality following the Civil War.

Religion nourished right-wing violence in the years leading up to the Civil War as opponents to the Nationalist version of the Spanish state were “neither really Spanish nor even really human” (ibid.). They were not Spanish because they were not Catholic, as the anti-religious ideology of the Republic and violence perpetrated against priests and nuns demonstrated. Even though violence in the Republican zone was a controlled measure and extreme acts were denounced by the High Command (Reig Tapia 1990). It is clear that both sides committed atrocities, but “they had adhered to radically different conceptions of representation and justice during the Spanish Civil War” (Ryan 2009:123). While the legitimate Republican government condemned attacks perpetrated in its name on civilians, the same could not be said of the Nationalists. At the outbreak of the Civil War, victims of violent Nationalist repression “vastly outnumbered those killed by the revolutionary left” (Boyd

2008:137). The prohibition of Church bell ringing, the removal of crucifixes from schools and the removal of religious statues from public hospitals fuelled right-wing propaganda that emphasised the non-Spanish character of the Republic. They were not Spanish because they were of mixed blood and a particularly virulent and bilious form of Nationalist propaganda dehumanised the landless labourers of Andalusia and Extremadura by calling them, “Berbers, savages, bloodthirsty savages and Marxist hordes” (*ABC* quoted in Preston 2012: 22).<sup>108</sup> The only conclusion was that the rural population should be punished and disciplined in the same manner as the colonial enemy in Morocco because they were “ethnically” not Spanish.

The repressive apparatuses of the Nationalist state continued to violently police the population of Frigiliana after the Civil War as the army intervened in their everyday lives. While Louis Althusser notes that state apparatuses act “directly as a supplementary repressive force in the last instance” (Althusser 2006:137), Nationalist Spain relied on repressive force in the first instance. The Francoist state can therefore be defined as an absolute state of force, a state of “repressive execution and intervention” (*ibid.*) that exerted its power through the Guardia Civil, the Army and the Falange. The regime controlled access to work, introduced pervasive censorship and manipulated popular “folk” culture for its own ends. And while it may appear that the Nationalist state used violence and the threat of violence “in the last instance” to control its opponents, the state practised violence in the name of Spanish unity on a daily basis in Frigiliana in the first instance. This explains a lack of ongoing resistance, organised or otherwise, private or public, against the regime, or as David says with respect to those who opposed the regime in Frigiliana: “Well, “Franco just shot them,” (interview 2009) during a systematic program to

---

<sup>108</sup> *ABC* is a right-wing newspaper in Spain.

exterminate, exile or starve anyone who challenged Franco's "idea" of Spain.

The Guardia Civil in Francoist Spain publicly delineated the ruling classes from the rest as they violently repressed dissenting voices, and shot starving landless labourers scavenging for food (Richards 1998:199). In the first instance, the Guardia Civil acted as "a 'machine' of repression, which enables the ruling classes ... to ensure their domination over the working class" (Althusser 2006:90). Silence, in the home, in the schools, in the churches and in public becomes the norm throughout the dictatorship (Narotzky and Smith 2002:192). As Passerini (2009:198) notes, silence predicated on fear may be interpreted in numerous ways.<sup>109</sup> It may indicate compliance on behalf of the people, or it may be seen as a form of resistance. Equally, silence may be a form of conscious disengagement that maintains a distance between the individual and an absolute state. By keeping silent, individuals may be engaged in an active form of estrangement from a fascist regime (ibid.).

Acting in the first instance through the constant presence of the Guardia Civil and persecution meted out through the Church, the ideological state apparatuses operated through a combination of the state-family, Church-family and school-family or a conflation of all three. While Althusser stresses a distinction between the repressive state apparatuses and their ideological apparatuses, they worked together in Nationalist Spain through education, media and propaganda controlled by the state. Arguably, the state was concerned with demonising its imagined enemies by controlling access to food and encouraging the black market (Narotzky and Smith 2006:21) as a means of control and oppression. In the years following the Civil War, the daily struggle for food and shelter diverted the population's attention away from politics. Lack of food, meagre subsistence rationing and the black market

---

<sup>109</sup> Following a silent reception by workers at a Fiat car plant in Turin, Italian dictator Mussolini is reported to have said: 'If, in twelve months, I have succeeded in making them listen to me, next year they will be applauding me' (quoted in Passerini 2009:186).

institutionalised the Civil War victory (Graham 1995:328).<sup>110</sup> Conversely, the regime endorsed and encouraged the *estraperlo* (black market) “to such an extent that one might refer cynically to the *estraperlo* as Franco’s land reform” (Narotzky and Smith 2006:21).

The regime was concerned with the control of the “disposition of things, arranged as to lead to a convenient end” (Foucault 2006:132). But not in the same sense that indexes a shift away from the government of territory. On the contrary, land was the basis for Nationalist-Catholic ideology, and the control of things in order to reinforce the definition of government that refers to territory maintains the link between the dictatorship and the land. Thereby maintaining an explicit Machiavellian (2003) link between divine authority, *los Reyes Católicos*, the land, the people and “Franco the Prince”. The regime designated all “things” that did not conform to their idea of the unity of Spain as “foreign”. However, Foucault’s notion of “a sort of complex composed of men and things...wealth, resources, means of subsistence and territory...customs, habits and ways of acting and thinking” (2006:132) were the means through which Francoism enforced the unity of the *pueblo*. Culture that maintains the ideology of the state through everyday consumption, that is to say, a compound of “high culture,” “popular culture” and everyday cultural practices reinforce the Spanishness of Spaniards. From this perspective, Spanish culture is opposed to the corrupting influence of all “things” foreign. The regime attempted to exercise its homogenous version of culture “through the dissemination of what could be called an archaizing vision” (Graham 1995:237). Sanitised folklore, “traditional” festivals/fiestas, the glorification of the crusades against the “Moors,” and a national film industry produced “folkloric

---

<sup>110</sup> Food rationing continued until 1952 (Graham 1995:238).

spectacles, religious dramas, and historical epics” (ibid.). Consequently, the ideology of the state not only masked the maintenance of the elite classes, it used culture as a weapon to subordinate the subaltern proletariat.

### **Historical Memory “¡Presente!”**

20 November is a significant date in recent Spanish history. First, José Antonio Primo de Rivera, leader of the Falange, was executed on 20 November 1936. The date is etched into Frigiliana’s collective memory as every 20 November they were marched to the Guardia Civil office, “encouraged” to sing *Cara al Sol* and shout “¡Presente!” in commemoration of the Nationalists who died in the Civil War. Those who died on the Republican side were commemorated in silence or not at all. Second, on 20 November 1975, Francisco Franco died in his hospital bed, further memorialising the date and conflating Franco with José Antonio. Third, on 20 November 2002 the Spanish Parliament unanimously condemned the 1936 military coup.

The Francoists perpetuated the schism of the Civil War by controlling public memory for the duration of the regime. Francoist Spain “was characterized by mass executions and the implementation of a legal framework that guaranteed the economic and political punishment of those who had lost the war” (Cenarro 2002:167). Those who were not dead or in exile were marginalised, isolated and excluded from society through the severe imposition of the “traditional” social order. The “traditional social order” included, but was not limited to, the control of cultural performances and the removal of any potential symbolic components of the legitimate Republic. Fascism must attempt to wipe out an existing culture or heritage that is “most directly related to the ‘subversive memory’ of the pre-fascist world”

(Passerini 2009:115). For the majority population, the only way to survive was to submit to the Francoist myth and accept their subordinate status as the defeated. Consequently, they had to “renounce their past, experiences and identity. The Francoist coalition’s triumphalism pervaded the whole public space” (Cenarro 2002:167). There was no space for the public preservation of memories or for “recognizing or endowing them with any value or significance” (ibid.).

In 1977, during Spain’s transition from dictatorship to democracy, the *pacto de olvido* (pact of forgetting) was a political agreement to forget the divisions of the Civil War, but it was “a product of elite negotiations from which actors in civil society were excluded” (Blakeley 2005:57). It can thus be seen as a process of political conciliation rather than a process of social reconciliation. Although labelled a “pact of forgetting,” it was a political decision not to focus on the divisive past, but instead to build an inclusive future. In this sense, the 1977 pact may be seen as “forward looking in nature” (Blakeley 2008:316) as there was a clear line drawn between the past and the future. Looking forward “does not necessarily mean forgetting the past. On the contrary, it means remembering the past in order not to repeat the same mistakes”(ibid.).

As an informant Paco (2010) notes with respect to repeating the mistakes of the Civil War: “My brother was a right-winger and I’m a left-winger. We argue all the time, as brothers do, and we get quite heated, it often appears to be violent, but in 1977, we remembered the horrors of the War. Nothing is worth killing each other over.” During an apparently peaceful transition to democracy, “without bloodshed,” Paloma Aguilar (2001:97) notes that “more than 460 violent deaths for political purposes were registered between 1975 and 1980 and about 400 people died in right and left-wing terrorist acts.” The transition process was marked by the widespread

fear of a return to violence, “a fear given credence by the high levels of violence throughout the transition period” (Blakeley 2005:47). The attempted military coup of 23 February 1981 realised the belief that the new Spanish democracy would not be able to withstand public memories of the past. On the evening of 23 February 1981, David was travelling to Málaga for an arranged meeting:

I arrived at the office to find it closed. There was no one in the streets. There was a strange atmosphere in the empty streets. I passed a Police station. Even it was closed. So, I drove back to Frigiliana. All the streets were empty and all the doors were closed. My neighbour peeped out of her window when I opened my front door and gave me a look. I knew by her look that the bastards were at it again.

José was listening to the BBC World service in his bedroom trying to improve his English:

I was listening to Queen, or someone, when the music changed. All I could hear was military marching music. I knew what was happening and just turned the radio off. I didn't even look out the window. I just knew it. They talk about two Spains, Left and Right, but that was a Franco myth. Besides, there is another Spain: “us” the people. It was not a transition to democracy for us.

Fear permeated a political transition and stifled any potential social reconciliation because the institutions within the Franco regime were left intact. But for José, he chose to estrange himself from discourse surrounding the transition and “just turned the radio broadcast off.” He consciously decided that the transition was not for “us the people.” As much as the *pacto de olvido* was about forgetting, everyone remembered the victims of the regime, albeit in private. Fear was the hallmark of the Franco regime, and it was not content with the mere surrender of the Republican side. Terror, exclusion and humiliation continued to be used long after the War ended. The fact that the fear of repression “still exists after all this time also reminds us of the brutality of Franco's regime, in stark contrast to his own self-image...as a paternalistic, benevolent dictator” (Blakeley 2005:47). Repression was

used as both a military and ideological weapon that would achieve the submission of the entire population—a terror tactic that was perfected by the *Regulares* under the command of Franco during the early stages of the Civil War. Terror, exclusion and humiliation were not only used to intimidate those accused of involvement with the Republic, but to intimidate their families and their descendants. While fear forced the population to forget the past, they privately remembered the brutality of the regime.

Omar G. Encarnación (2008:39) notes that numerous international stories on Spain “marvel at the stunning transformation of a country” known for its ethnic conflicts, military coups and civil wars. Scholars have tended to view the “Spanish transition to democracy as a ‘model’ transition because of its consensual, nonviolent character and positive outcome” (Boyd 2008:135). This is to say nothing of the dramatic economic transformation that dispels Spain’s “reputation as an economic backwater” (Encarnación 2008:39). Spain has emerged quickly from a repressive dictatorship “built a successful economy and established an effective democracy” (The Economist 2004). According to Newsweek International, Spain is “the new princely peacock, after being looked down on by the northern Europeans as a poor Mediterranean country” (quoted in Encarnación 2008:39). Yet in an amongst international praise and integration with the European Union, a bitter 60 year-old feud rages that “threatens to destroy the political consensus generally credited with the remarkable transformation of the last three decades” (ibid.). The Law of Historical Memory has reopened Right and Left debates framed in Civil War terms. Within an international “political opportunity structure” (Tarrow 2011:18), current memory discourse in Spain is charged with memories that tell two tales: “killing by ‘Fascist insurgents’.... [and] murder by ‘Marxist hordes’” (Encarnación 2008:39).

The Spanish campaign to recuperate historical memory “necessarily contests some of the terms on which the elite-led transition took place” (Davis 2006:253).

History and memory are often used interchangeably or in a neutral sense in popular discourse, despite the large body of literature that distinguishes between them. Amid “*una fiebre rememorativa*” (a fever to remember) (Erice 2006), history and memory discourse in Spain is frequently presented in opposition to the unwritten transitional *pacto de olvido* and its codification in the 1977 Amnesty Law. Yet as Santos Juliá (2007) argues, “amnesty” should not be confused with “amnesia.” Nor is the conscious act of forgetting the same thing as “failing to remember” (Boyd 2008:135). Or as Friedrich Nietzsche (2005:8) puts it, “We must know the right time to forget as well as the right time to remember.” In a Spanish context, history and memory are politically charged terms. For the Left, memories in general and historical memory in particular inform the subjective processes through which official history must be revised. “Memory is selective” (Passerini 2009:128). And because memory is subjective, it “presents another face of dissent” (ibid.). For the Right, an objective chronological account of history maintains a common “Spanish” historical trajectory, removes subjective memory from public debate and maintains the *pacto de olvido*.

Individual and group memory is the process by which “people construct personal narratives” (Boyd 2008:135) that support and maintain integrated identities in the present. Through memories of the past, individuals and groups make sense of the present and plot the future. “Memory ... becomes meaningful in a contemporary context, depending... on the period and events being recalled” (Passerini 2009:128). Memories are not passively received from the past rather they are actively created in the present through both selective remembering and selective forgetting. Memory is

especially affected in dictatorships “in which everyday life was subjected to increasing control and surveillance” (ibid.). Therefore, conscious forgetting is an important component within memory discourse as much as conscious remembering attempts to recuperate lost or hidden memories. An essential first step towards reconciliation and democratic consolidation is a revision of official memory that includes previously silenced individual memories (Winter 2007:365-367). In post-war Germany and France, the silences that had eased the reconstruction of democracy “were increasingly intolerable to younger generations untainted by wartime complicity” (Boyd 2008:142). Similarly, victims of official repression in Eastern Europe, South Africa, and Latin America demanded a public/legal forum that acknowledged their suffering. While the Spanish case for the recuperation of historical memory is different (Davis 2006:253), it is framed within these international calls for justice, truth and reconciliation (Encarnación 2008:39).

Although remembering is a process that occurs in the mind of one individual, “memory” is a metaphor for socially “mediated knowledge of past events” (Boyd 2008:134). As such, collective remembering suggests an actual event, or set of events, experienced by a group. In contrast, collective memory suggests an event, or set of events, that were not directly experienced by a group. Remembering may be seen as being unique to an individual, whereas memory is a socially framed construct. Memory refers to the transmission of stories “handed down and kept alive through small-scale social networks” (Passerini 2009:19). Notwithstanding the individual’s role in remembering events, memory is always constituted through the social groups to which one belongs. Moreover, collective memory is structured and sustained through a matrix of “sacred texts, rituals, commemorations, monuments, museums...or a set of narratives about the past, that are typically not based on direct

experience” (Boyd 2008:134). Collective memory adjusts in response to shifting political and social circumstances thereby altering the manner in which individual experience is understood.

Historical memory is thus a form of collective memory through which a group constructs a selective representation of the past. It is mindful of subjective human emotions and seeks to incorporate people within chronological accounts of events. From this perspective, historical memory discourse in Spain alters the manner in which the experience of the Franco regime is understood rather than alters the manner in which the regime is remembered. Thus, historical memory is a subjective process that redefines historical facts based upon an emotive interpretation of the past in concert with social interpretations of history.

Spain’s transition to democracy consciously attempted to share the responsibility for the War amongst Republicans and Nationalists. The motivation for “forgetting” the atrocities of the past derived from a genuine fear of a return to violence. Slogans, such as “never again” and “we were all guilty,” reinforced collective culpability and summed up the War and the 1930s as a fratricidal tragedy (Aguilar 1996). Democracy “rested on a de facto ‘pact of silence’ that avoided confrontation” (Boyd 2008:135), but it also avoided apportioning responsibility to the Franco regime or purging state institutions of Franco loyalists. As Passerini (2009:67) notes with respect to the end of fascism in Italy, the past is consciously forgotten because of a combined “sense of shame, guilt, silence and injury” (Passerini 2009:67).

Thomas Carothers (2002:6) notes five core assumptions through which transition to democracy is achieved. The first overarching assumption is that “any

country moving away from dictatorial rule can be considered a country in transition toward democracy”. Once labelled “transitional democracies,” the political realm of any state, regardless of the realities of everyday life, is automatically analyzed in terms of a movement towards a free market economy. “The second assumption is that democratization tends to unfold in a set sequence of stages” (ibid.). Following a period of opening up and democratic liberalisation, a new democratic system emerges, and it is rapidly reinforced by democratic national elections and a new constitution. The regularisation of elections and an emergent civil society consolidate a purposeful but slow transition. Third, it is assumed that regular elections “are not just a foundation stone but a key generator over time of further democratic reforms” (ibid: 7). A fourth assumption, and one that is particularly relevant within a Spanish context, is that the underlying structural features in transitional countries “will not be major factors in either the onset or the outcome of the transition process” (ibid.). In other words, the economy, political history, institutional legacy or regionalist ethnic identity will not influence the transition to a free market democracy.

Finally, these paradigms rest on the assumption that democratic transitions emerge from within coherent functioning states. The process is “assumed to include some redesign of state institutions” (ibid) but does not require radical reform because of an underlying assumption that existing institutions will naturally move towards democracy. As Luisa Passerini (2009:132) notes with respect to Italy, “Fascism is presented as normal, as if it changed nothing fundamental.” In other words, there is an assumption that dictatorships function as quasi-democratic states prior to a transition to democracy. Carothers (2002:7-9) argues for the abandonment of these teleological transition paradigms and calls for a conceptualisation of democratisation

as a dynamic and unpredictable process. In keeping with current historical memory discourse in Spain, Carothers (ibid.) calls for a “back and forth or sideways process rather than a linear one” (Davis 2006:253).

The *pacto de olvido* may therefore be seen as a mechanism that reinforced the teleological assumption that the Francoist state was a functioning democracy-in-waiting. The Law of Historical Memory disrupts this notion and it was therefore resisted by the right-wing Partido Popular. By privileging chronological history over memory, right-wing discourse maintained the assumption that the Francoist state was representative of a unified Spain. In other words, contemporary Spain does not have a political history, an institutional legacy or regionalist ethnic identities that will negatively influence the transition to a free market democracy. While regular elections should enable reform, Georgina Blakeley (2005:53) argues that reform and reconciliation is limited to the political sphere. She suggests that political reconciliation is distinct from social reconciliation. While social activists have emerged within civil society in Spain, the existing institutions of the state continue to thwart and limit the extent to which the Law of Historical Memory can be interpreted. That is, the actions of the Franco regime continue to enjoy amnesty under the protection of the 1977 Law. Finally, Spain’s place within the European Union, the G8 and its dramatic economic booms during the 1980s and ‘90s mark the foundational goal of transition: movement towards a free market economy. However, as a result of the unstable nature of European economic systems, Spain’s current economic crisis, and a shift of economic power towards northern European countries, it is difficult to argue that this is the democracy envisaged by the *pacto de olvido*.

Georgina Blakeley (2005:44) notes a “current desire by many in Spain to recover the bodies of their relatives who disappeared during and after the Civil War...and, by so doing, to honour their memories.” However, this desire to recall the suffering of the illegal War and condemn the Franco regime is not shared by all in Spain. Nor is there a current desire by all to honour the memories of the illegal murder of civilians. In the aftermath of the dictatorship, the transition to democracy brought the beginnings of a process of political conciliation, but not a process of social reconciliation (Blakeley 2008; 2005).

The preamble of the Law of Historical Memory “insists that memory is a private matter” (Labanyi 2008:120), but the Law has allowed for collective memories to be made public. While falling short of criminalising the regime or allowing for either investigation or prosecution of the perpetrators of crimes, the Law has brought silent memories into the public sphere. Combinations of the exhumation of graves, presentations to the United Nations and public discourse relating to the past have codified in law the search for justice. The recovery of historical memory is motivated by a desire “to achieve the public acknowledgement and recognition that the winning side of the Civil War has always enjoyed” (Blakeley 2005:49). That is, there is a requirement to acknowledge the suffering of victims and their families, but there is also a need to recognise that “their defence of the legitimately elected Republican government was a fight for the values of democracy and freedom that Spain now enjoys today” (ibid.).

A professor of public policy in Barcelona, Vicenç Navarro (quoted in *El País* 2001) notes “there cannot be an authentically democratic culture in Spain until there is a counter-Francoist culture, for which we need a vivid historical memory. It is within this framework of national historical memory discourse that *Festival*

*Frigiliana 3 Culturas* emerged as a form of counter-Francoist culture. But not as a comment *on* the social, rather it is a comment *in* the social. For it is *in* the social that the festival challenges the Francoist falsification of history that has been performed on the streets of Frigiliana since the regime's inception. It is impossible to discount the significant impact of a decade of national discourse that surrounded the creation of a historically themed event which opposes a long-standing Francoist myth. While the Law of Historical Memory consists of legislation to provide for compensation payments to various categories of victims of the regime, it also includes "the removal of Francoist symbols from public places" (Blakeley 2008:319). In other words, the Law allows for the rightful reclamation of the streets "in the very space that so emblemized the power of the old elite" (Narotzky and Smith 2006:196). Therefore, as much as *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is about the articulation of a distinct version of the past that recalls historical memories, it is about reclaiming the right to control festivals, a right which the Nationalists have always enjoyed. It is about the control of collective memories and the right to share contested histories in public. Collective memory is concerned with events that were not and could not have been experienced by everyone, yet they shape a sense of community, a sense of heritage and a sense of identity. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* embodies a local sense of lost, hidden and amputated memories.

The renaming of the village, the installation of monuments to "three cultures" and the naming of new streets not only introduces a new lexicon within local discourse that articulates a particular version of history, it gives equal status to the "idea" of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Thus, naming of streets, removing monuments to the Franco regime and installing monuments to the Civil War publicly

acknowledges the rights of the victims of the regime. In doing so, their stigmatising labels are rewritten with notions of justice and status.

### **The Festival as Cultural Activism**

Civil society is seen as a relatively recent actor within the process of Spain's transition to democracy. Viewed in terms of opening up a space for contestation, civil society appears to construct a final component within Spain's transition to democracy. Thus, while state policies and laws may have changed as a result of pressures from civil society, they are determined by the existing institutions of the state. The Amnesty Law precludes any investigation into criminal activities perpetrated by the Francoist regime. The Spanish government currently resists pressure from the UN to investigate human rights abuses during the Franco era. Furthermore, attempts by individual judges to investigate the regime are met with forced retirement and disbaring.<sup>111</sup> Therefore civil society is not a revolutionary practice, as it is fundamentally sanctioned and restricted by the state and the political rulers of the day – with their distinct Civil War baggage.

On the other hand, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a radical form of cultural practice because it is not limited or determined by the state. In fact it is a total appropriation of a stratum within the existing hegemonic order of festivals which were once within the sole control of the state. Therefore, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a form of cultural activism that bypasses the state and takes control of an

---

<sup>111</sup> In October 2008 a Spanish judge, Baltasar Garzón, began a controversial inquiry into crimes against humanity committed by the Nationalist government during and following the Spanish Civil War. The 1977 Amnesty Law barred investigations related to criminal offenses with a political aim prior to 1976. Garzón was suspended from judicial activity as the result of legal action taken by Manos Limpias, a right-wing trade union. In April 2010, Garzón was indicted by the Spanish Supreme Court for changing his juridical criteria to engineer the case in order to bypass the 1977 Law.

existing institution from within. While civil society may give the appearance of contestation, it is a state restricted form of contestation. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* does not give the appearance of contestation; indeed, it looks like many other festivals in Spain. But it is advancing a new form of culture in defence of local ethnicity.

While it may be clear that the political dimension of the festival is its transcript, political discourse alone does not illuminate the disparate interpretations of the past articulated during the festival. Yet this introduces another contradiction, as *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* promotes an exclusively pluralist notion of local culture, heritage and tradition, “it must shut out the enemies of pluralism” (Eagleton 2000:42). Thus, when local author Pablo Rojo Platero attempted to launch his volume, *Frigiliana Árabe y Morisco: La cabalgada de Frigiliana* (2012), his book launch was cancelled and removed from the official festival calendar. It was cancelled because of scheduling concerns. However, others say it was cancelled because his volume disrupts the “idea” of a locally derived population of mixed religious origin and suggests that there was no significant Muslim population in the village. An alternative venue was found for his book launch during the festival, but the event was not included in the official festival calendar. One informant says that regardless of the content of Pablo Rojo’s volume, his explicit association with the PSOE meant that he could never have participated “officially” in a politically sanctioned Partido Andalucista/Partido Popular *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* event. Another suggests that the content of his volume so accurately interrupts the notion of locally originating tolerance that it did not fit within the “idea” of the festival. José, more cynically, stresses the continuity between the political censorship of culture during the dictatorship and this new form of silencing that opposes interpretations of

local culture, tradition and heritage.

As Terry Eagleton notes, “culture... is no longer the means of resolving political strife...instead it is part of the very lexicon of political conflict itself” (2000:38). Culture is performed in the streets of Frigiliana based upon extraordinary events held during festival time. The theatre of festivals is where these political and ideological causes engage with each other. As Edward Said (1993:xiii) avers, “Far from being a placid realm of Apollonian gentility...culture can even be a battleground on which causes expose themselves to the light of day and contend with one another.” The voluntary habitual reiteration of the “idea” of *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* ritually performed on the streets of the village each year reinforces its position within competing festival forms. As such, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* takes its rightful place amongst all other festivals.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is more than a tourist event, more than a point of intersection between contested versions of the past and more than a public celebration of tolerance. It is more than a point of intersection between economy and culture. It is a unique form of cultural activism that takes back the streets of the village that were once dominated by the Francoist elite. It situates the “idea” of a plural local heritage at the same level as other festivals in the village that continue to perform Nationalist versions of Spain. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is therefore a unique phase within historical memory discourse in Spain as it moves beyond a discursive field and into the everyday cultural lives of the locals.

# Conclusion

This thesis focused upon the recent construction of a tourist event. Its origins are known. The idea for the event came from the imagination of one individual, was motivated by commerce and was developed into a festival by a small group of locals. When I interviewed David Riordan about the name he chose for his guidebook, he joked about the fact that he had considered a couple of options. His second choice was *Frigiliana: the Jewel of Andalusia*. He laughed when he recalled this fact and asked, “Do you think if I had named it the Jewel of Andalusia there’d be a jewellery festival now?” I laughed too, but I think there is every potential to suggest that there might be a jewellery festival now had this title been chosen for his guidebook. Yet, to be clear, even if it were not a jewellery festival that celebrated the village’s shared Jewish, Christian and Muslim heritage, it would not be a festival that celebrated national Spanish identity. Whatever form such a festival may have taken, it would be one that articulated local identity, local culture and local history.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* may not be a “traditional” event because it has been consciously invented in order to increase tourism in the village. But I argue that it is precisely because of its commercial components that the festival is a source of new culture. Commerce constructs the space required for innovative and dynamic performances that are fundamentally creative in character. Commerce presents the festival as myth and fantasy, and once within the realm of myth and fantasy, the liminoid elements of the festival are free to subvert existing social norms. That is, assuming that the political opportunity structures and a political desire permit such an overt subversion of social norms. Rather than view this particular festival as a “safety-valve” that reinforces social norms, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*

reconfigures social norms framed within a process of national discourse that seeks to recuperate hidden historical memories. This festival is a considered political move and a form of cultural activism. While it may be kitsch, superficial and commercial, its plasticity transforms the natural characteristics of a monocultural narrative into a plural reading of the past.

Commerce and the tourist are never far away from considerations relating to public cultural performances in Frigiliana. The 2007 festival was not commercially successful, and the town hall seriously considered cancelling the event. They decided to give it one more chance in 2008 and altered the format of some of the elements within the festival. They moved it onto the streets and moved the concerts to a central stage in the Plaza de las Tres Culturas. That year's festival was a commercial success because of the numbers of tourists that attended, and the festival has been reproduced every year because of its commercial success. Moreover, the commercial success of the event silences its detractors. Everyone appears to be happy to say that the festival is a myth or that it is "just a commercial event". Yet those who express this sentiment most forcefully are the ones who dress up in medieval clothing, can be seen at every event and are the ones who fully embrace the "idea" of the festival.<sup>112</sup>

---

<sup>112</sup> I returned to Frigiliana in 2013 as the organiser of a ten-day ethnographic summer school with fourteen undergraduate students. As the students began to ask locals about the festival, the first thing they were told is that "it is a myth". This was followed by a variety of different accounts relating to the origins of the festival and who started it and why. It is not that long ago since this festival was created, but its origins are already being dressed up as being part of a traditional and mythical process. One student was told, "A group of local artists were the first to come up with the idea." Thereby shifting the festival out of the "spurious" commercial realm and fixing it within the "authentic" realm of art. The informant went on to say that, motivated by commerce, the town hall employed a professional company to do all the preparatory work relating to the festival. "It's a pity," the informant suggested, "that the festival has become commercial and does not provide more opportunities for local employment." What the informant omitted to say was that the group of "authentic" local artists who came up with the idea of the festival are the same people who own the "spurious" management company responsible for *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Authenticity, in the form of myth and tradition, are never far away from discourse relating to the festival. Spurious commerce is always at the centre of this discourse.

While many of the components within the *San Antonio de Padua* festival appear to contradict the articulation of tolerance during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, those that resonate closely with the Franco regime are being de-emphasised or removed altogether. Notwithstanding numerous comments about the *San Antonio* festival “not being for everyone,” complaints about the noise and the anti-social nature of the event, it appears as if locals are powerless to cancel the event. Yet in 2013 the bull running element of the event was removed. Privately, locals told me that tourists felt uncomfortable watching such a cruel spectacle, and locals complained about not being able to sleep during the *San Antonio* festival. Moreover, the Guardia Civil were concerned with drunken behaviour and crowd safety. Publicly, commerce was the excuse used to remove the bull running from the event. Simply put, the town hall just said that they do not have the resources to include bull running in the 2013 festival.

Even though commerce plays a significant role in constructing a space for liminoid sources of new culture, politics is being played out in a dynamic and innovative manner during these cultural performances. Moreover, culture is the principal means through which political arguments are being made compelling. Play, as Huizinga (1950) notes, always means something, and I would add, liminoid play always means something significant. When *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* plays with the past and invents new myths, it is significantly reconfiguring the present and opposing a pervasive version of history. Culture, heritage, tradition and history form the language through which ideologies are being articulated during *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, and the language through which the dominant narrative is being contested. Rather than producing similarities as part of the “culture crusade” where culture is being “sold by the pound,” *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is

producing a new ethnicity by redefining the village's plural past. Once dressed up in historical terms, a plural reading of the past makes a compelling argument relating to the potential to construct a new ethnicity, *al-Ándalus*.

It might be fair to suggest that the manner in which ethnicity is chosen for a particular people appears to be arbitrary, but these choices are always motivated by political concerns. Furthermore, ethnic authenticity is derived from dressing up the present in historical terms and naturalising ethnicity during a contemporary process that imagines a primordial heritage. The Visigoths were Roman Catholics for just over seventy years during the late seventh and early eighth-century, yet they are the preferred choice for the foundational myth upon which Nationalist-Catholic and Spanish identity is constructed. It would be reasonable to suggest that due to centuries of contact between Jews, Christians and Muslims, a pluralist version of the past may indeed be a more accurate account of the historical circumstances through which contemporary Spanish identity is formulated. However, as Gerard Delanty (2002:56-59) notes, mythical thin descriptions of national identity that present the nation-state as a homogenous mass are much easier to maintain than the realities of a heterogeneous past and present. Besides, notions of plural religious identity, specifically Muslim identity, do not fit within the contemporary European Union (Fra-Molinero 2009:149). The history of the nation, as Gramsci (1971) notes, is an imagined history of unity between nation states and not a history of the people who actually lived within these recent political constructions.

As much as dates like 711 and 1492 recur in the contemporary Spanish memory, Manzano Moreno and Sisinio Perez Garzon (2002:260-265) fix the conscious political construction of these dates firmly between political poles during the nineteenth-century. Most importantly, while political debates about the

construction of an emergent Spanish nation swung between political poles, the right-wing construction of culture, in the form of commissioned art and theatre that glorified Spain's primordial Catholic heritage, has endured into the present. Or at least it is fair to say, the nineteenth-century myths endured long enough for the Francoists to violently impose their version of the past on the entire population. And it is the memory of this violent traumatic experience that has persisted the present.

Civil War memories are never far away when discussing *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*. Yet oddly, the Civil War is never mentioned, nor is the Franco regime or the Law of Historical Memory. Silence, as Narotzky and Smith point out (2002:192), is the norm when discussing the Franco regime in contemporary Spain. Silence, hushed tones and coded terminology is the preferred way to skip over the recent past in Frigiliana. But as Passerini (2009:27) argues, silence may be more than a veil that masks fear. Silence may indicate conformity or dissent. Equally, it may be the result of result of cultural tradition, a sense of shame nurtured by "collective responsibility" propaganda during the transition or a deliberate attempt to distance oneself from Francoist discourse. Many commentators argue that the introduction of the Law of Historical Memory may be seen as a final chapter in Spain's transition to democracy because it has opened up a public space for contestation. Yet this is a space that continues to be controlled by the institutions of the state, and a space that requires the permission of the state for its very existence. While it appears that social activists can apply enough pressure to compel the state to alter its policies, the emergence of historical memory discourse in Spain was reliant on shifting international legal frameworks and international truth and reconciliation commissions as much as it was a response to Spanish social activists. Notwithstanding pressure from the United Nations, the contemporary Spanish state

has not gone as far as criminalising the actions of the Franco regime. Indeed, the contemporary Spanish state continues to use the Francoist 1977 Amnesty Law to ensure that no one investigates the regime within a criminal framework.

The control of discourse continues to significantly shape overt condemnation of the regime and continues to rely upon a top-down control of social activists. The control of culture, however, appears to be shifting out of the hands of central government and onto the streets of Frigiliana. In 1937, the Nationalists renamed the village with suitable reminders of dominance. As Michael Billig (1995:17; 38) points out, the nation must be remembered in a mundane manner on an almost daily basis for fear that the population will forget their national myths and their loyalties. Thus, street names act as a pervasive banal symbol of the nation through which dominant narratives become reified within everyday speech (Azaryahu 1996:311). forget their national myths and their loyalties. Thus, street names act as a pervasive banal symbol of the nation through which dominant narratives become reified within everyday speech (ibid.). The Second Republic used state sponsored cultural performances, *las Misiones Pedagógicas*, to disseminate its ideologies.<sup>113</sup> The Francoist state controlled culture and used street names to threaten and remind the population, and to naturalise its ideology. The new transitional democracy fashioned a symbolic compromise aimed at ending the “cycle of victors and vanquished” (González Faraco and Dean Murph 1997:123). It could be argued that the town hall in Frigiliana is continuing an existing practice by renaming virtually every new construction in the village with a “three cultural” theme, but there is a subtle difference. State control of the names of the village is a top-down version of culture

---

<sup>113</sup> In 1931, the Second Republic created the Patronato de Misiones Pedagógicas in order to bring libraries, cinemas, theatres and puppet shows to rural communities. *Las Misiones Pedagógicas* included travelling art exhibitions and travelling museums that brought “culture” to rural isolated communities (Afinoguénova 2011).

that articulates a thin narrative. Conversely, local control of street names is a bottom-up version of culture that articulates a thick narrative.

Within national discourse that seeks to recuperate lost memories, Frigiliana sidesteps the social activists, sidesteps the Franco regime and sidesteps the Civil War. In doing so, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* creates a more effective form of cultural activism that wrestles the control of local identity away from outside influence. By side-stepping recent history in the village, it could be suggested that the festival is perpetuating silence. Yet, in a Spanish context, silence can imply many things. It may indicate compliance or be the result of a threat of fear. However, silence may also be an explicit form of resistance. In keeping with Luisa Passerini (2009:128), I contend that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* an example of conscious estrangement. By not mentioning the Civil War, avoiding the Franco regime and dismissing the Law of Historical Memory, locals are deliberately snubbing and ignoring their external recent history. In short, they are performing their own version of history, culture heritage and tradition. I contend that the festival moves the argument beyond a discursive field. In doing so, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* overtly and consciously purports its opposition to monocultural narratives. While the festival appears to be concerned with the past, it is firmly fixed in the present. It creates a space where locals have claimed ownership of their culture. It creates a space where they can perform their myths and their legends. The festival elevates local readings of history, culture, heritage and tradition to the same status as national celebrations. Arguably, the remnants of national cultural performances in the village are in a dramatic process of transformation because their component parts, that do not fit this new image of culture, are being de-emphasised or removed completely. Thus, through the management of culture, playful myths and legends appear and

disappear during public performances of local heritage. Ownership and the possession of the means to produce culture enable Frigiliana to create its own myths and its own legends. This allows for the construction of a space where conflict and consent become reified through cultural performances. Myths and legends are being used in Frigiliana to support political claims, and Frigiliana has a contested and mixed population. As Audrey Richards (1960:177) notes with respect to African oral traditions, “since myths and legends are used to support political claims it follows that they are most numerous and complex where the claims are contested or the population mixed.” But the distinctions in Frigiliana are not informed by medieval religious affiliation. Rather, the recent history of the village and, most importantly, the aftermath of the pact to forget the past, continue to divide the local population’s opinions about their heritage. Regardless of the stable or balanced character of contemporary politics in Spain, it contains opposing factions that are bound together by different myths which validate the particular rights of different groups. As Edmund Leach (1965:278) notes with respect to claims for rights and status expressed through myth and legend, they are articulated through “a language of argument, not a chorus of harmony.” Cultural performances are not the means to resolve political disputes. Rather culture is the very lexicon of political conflict itself (Eagleton 2000:38). Far from being a passive cohesive force that clarifies harmony and engenders social cohesion, culture is the battleground on which claims for rights and status expose themselves and contend with one another (Said 1993).

As *as-salam alaykum* and *wa alaikum assalaam* reverberate through the festival throng, the event has moved beyond its stage managed components and blends seamlessly with a new ethnic identity, *al-Ándalus*. The festival plays with the past but, most importantly, it plays with the present. It allows locals to claim

ownership of their public spaces, and it allows them to express local myths and local legends. As history repeats itself in the form of festival farce, the village becomes a total system to express local “ideas”. Through cultural performances, values extracted from the medieval past become a weapon that opposes the dominant monocultural narrative. This superficial, ludic and tourist event contests versions of history and challenges Spanish identity. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is an overt subversion of Spanishness and a reinterpretation of Spanish history.

I argue that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* may be seen as a more powerful form of activism because it creates a new ethnicity. While it is argued that the Law of Historical Memory may be the beginning of “real” democracy, it is a “real” democracy that is limited by existing legal institutions. Although *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* emerged within the same timeframe as discourse relating to the recuperation of historical memory, it appears to be a powerful force that moves beyond discursive fields and beyond national symbolic processes. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* creates an ontological reality for the villagers. It creates a new way-of-being for the villagers that moves out of the symbolic order and cuts into the “Real Order”. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* goes beyond the “juridification of the past” and claims the right for locals to celebrate their culture and identity with all of its contradictions. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* counters the notion that Christians led Spain through a centuries-long process of *Reconquista* and counters the Francoist myth of national purity. It counters the political construction of a national eternal community and celebrates centuries of contact with Judaism and Islam. It reverses the moral success story within a dominant history and enjoys the virtues of the bad guys. The festival overtly stresses that *convivencia* and *coexistencia* are contemporary distinctions.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* dresses up contemporary notions of identity in historical terms. It uses these terms in order to redefine the present. It creates a new “truth” in the village that counters the lies of successive regimes. Regardless of the impossibility of discovering the mental state of a medieval population, *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a celebration of the village’s contemporary collective consciousness. Thousands of years of national history intersect with this tourist festival, and the tourist acts as the unquestioning witness that authenticates the festival as being genuine.

While the festival exposes a version of medieval local *convivencia*, it is shaped by the oppressive enforcement of Spanish identity and the classification of opponents of the Franco regime as the foreign “other”. As Stuart Green argues (2011:197-199), contemporary Spanishness is wholly dependent on “pure” Spanish hereditary blood. Yet, blood is being consciously recast within Frigiliana, and the international “foreign” tourists are the essential component within this transformative process. Indeed, I argue that without proletarian tourism, the festival would not have a forum to disseminate its message. In short, in order for reconfigured blood to become realised, it requires an unquestioning audience. Choosing the past is the most effective way of generating authenticity, even if this new version of the past is at best an “authentic reproduction”. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* has appropriated a once state controlled institution in order to press for the limited claims of a subaltern group. The festival is a genuine example of culture-building that is bolstered because of its explicit commercial character. And the festival is an example of the potential for locals to take control of their history, memory and identity.

*Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* contains true and new things. It relies on myth and legend to make its argument compelling. The fictitious is performed as a farce and during the festival local identity is reconfigured, Spanishness is challenged and the losers are considered to be the “good guys”. With respect to the formation of local ethnicity, most unusually, the festival rejoices in a plural set of social, political and cultural processes. While the landscape of the village has not changed much since Luis de Mármol y Carvajal’s sixteenth-century account, the political, social and cultural landscape of the village has gone through dramatic changes during the last 100 years. Since 2006 a staggering number of monuments, names, sculptures and symbols have been inscribing new meanings onto the village that all transpose the theme of the festival onto non-festival spaces and non-festival time. As a result, a new version of history becomes reified in everyday language and the “three cultures” becomes a banal reminder of local ethnicity.

Many different people have populated this region, yet the Visigoths are presented as the pure harbinger of Spanish primordial identity. While *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* articulates a more plausible version of Spanish history that appears to be based upon local historical particularisms, it is a remarkable culture-building exercise. Paco’s remark about constructing a festival in Ireland that celebrates British culture is a reminder that ethnicity is often regarded as being a local concept that is bounded by geographical borders. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a rare example of the conscious inclusion of “other” identity within the local population. While the festival may sit within a local, regional and national cycle of fiestas, it is a form of social subversion that sits outside numerous other festivals. It calls for an acknowledgement of local identity, but it is not claiming that the villagers were “the first people” in the region. On the contrary, it is consciously

including the “other” within the formation of local ethnicity. *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a rare example of tarrying with the positive “other” within.

The staged components of the festival fashion the village, the locals and the visitors as medieval, but it is the overall effect of the totalising management of culture that enables the “ideas” of the event to move beyond festival time. As much as the festival is a commercial cultural theme park, it is a genuine articulation of local identity that has been formulated as a direct result of oppression, violence and loss. Unlike the actors who act out a role in a Disney theme park, *al-Ándalus* ethnicity in the village has arisen because of an uncoordinated common sense notion of plural heritage in Frigiliana. The public conferences held during the festival act to pedagogically introduce locals to the realities of their hidden histories and, in the process, transform common sense into organised good sense. Moreover, the internal workings of the body act to transform the “other” into the “local” and are viewed as the repository of subjective feelings about local plural heritage. In short, once “foreign” food is consumed, the gut decides if it is local.

Although the festival appears to exclude the local migrant population, the migrants do not feel excluded. While the festival excludes Spanishness from a local construction, it is arguably justified in excluding the ideologies of Franco and arguably justified in claiming ownership of an ideological state apparatus. It could be suggested that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is Civil War “politics as usual” dressed up in festival terms. It could be argued that the festival is a kitsch recent construct initiated as part of a tourist pull strategy. However, I contend that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a genuine example of local culture-building based upon myth and legend. It fundamentally relies on the playful ludic freedom within the tourist realm to press for claims of a limited and partial character which assert the autonomy of the

subaltern group, but within an old framework (Gramsci 1971). Although this study has moved back and forth through contested histories in an attempt to unpack the ideologies upon which *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is contingent, the central concern here is the manner in which locals have decided to take ownership of their culture. This is a relatively small rural community, but locals have capitalised on the growing tourist audience and made dramatic changes to the village during the last few years. Frigiliana is an example of a place where the villagers are determined by their own history, but it is also an example of a place where villagers are determining their own history. It is because *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a commercial event, that it is a considered political move and a powerful form of cultural activism. It is because *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas* is a tourist event that it is the source of new culture.

Although the festival is for “everyone,” not everyone enjoys it to the same extent. For the town hall and Partido Andalucista, the festival is a considered political move and a conscious culture-building program that distances the village from monocultural narratives. For its opponents, it is just a commercial event that creates new myths and new legends, none of which are “traditional.” Yet, there are another group involved in the festival, the audience. They might be unsure about the detail of the history of this place; they might be unsure about the political significance of the festival, but they appear to enjoy the event.

During the 2012 festival I stood at the side of the stage in la Plaza de las Tres Culturas. In the midst of thousands of dancing and singing people, Javier was looking at the crowd rather than the musicians performing on the stage. As the crowd began to dance in unison, he looked at me and said, “You know the history of the place?” This was a rhetorical question that I was not expected to answer. It was one

of the rare occasions when a direct and explicit reference to “recent” history was mentioned. I nodded in agreement. “You know the history of this place. Look at the crowd dancing and enjoying themselves.” Clearly emotional, Javier was proud of his village. He was proud that thousands of people had come from all over the world to enjoy Frigiliana. And remembering the history of this place, he was proud that “everyone” was free to enjoy themselves within this fun festival atmosphere. He was proud of the social transformation that *Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas*, a recent tourist invention, has accomplished

“Welcome to Frigiliana, the Village of Three Cultures, where men and women of different faiths lived in harmony for hundreds of years, and continue to do so today” (Riordan 2004:3).

# Bibliography

Abrahams, Roger D. and Richard Baumann 1978. "Ranges of Festival Behavior." Pp. 193-208 in *The Reversible World: Symbolic Inversion in Art and Society*, edited by Barbara A Babcock and Victor Turner. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press.

Aceves, Joseph. 1971. *Social Change in a Spanish Village*. Cambridge: Schenkman Publishing Company.

Afinoguénova, Eugenia. 2011. "Leisure and Agrarian Reform: Liberal Governance in the Traveling Museums of Spanish Misiones Pedagógicas (1931–1933)." *Hispanic Review* 261-290.

Aguilar, Paloma. 1996. *Memoria y olvido de la guerra civil española*. Madrid: Alianza.

Aguilar, Paloma 2001. "Justice, Politics and Memory in the Spanish Transition." Pp. 92-118 in *The Politics of Memory: Transitional Justice in Democratizing Societies*, edited by Alexandra Barahona de Brito, Carmen González-Enríquez, and Paloma Aguilar. New York: Oxford University Press.

Aidi, Hishaam D. 2006. "The Interference of a-Andalus: Spain, Islam and the West." *Social Text* 24(2):67-88.

Alpert, Michael. 2001. *Crypto-Judaism and the Spanish Inquisition*. New York: Palgrave.

Althusser, Louis 2006. "Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses (Notes Towards an Investigation)." Pp. 86-111 in *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*, edited by Aradhana Sharma and Akhil Gupta. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

Amnesty International. 2008. "Spain: No Global Exception when Investigating the Crimes of the Past." Amnesty International. Retrieved November 13, 2009 (<http://www.amnesty.org/en/for-media/press-releases/spain-no-global-exception-when-investigating-crimes-past-20081113>).

Anderson, Benedict. 1991. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and the Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.

Appadurai, Arjun. 1988. "How to Make a National Cuisine: Cookbooks in Contemporary India." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 30(1):3-24.

Aramberri, Julio 2009. "The Sociology of Tourism in Spain: A Tale of Three Wise Men." Pp. 244-273 in *The Sociology of Tourism: European Origins and Developments*, edited by Graham S Dann and Giuli Liebman Parrinello. Bingley: Emerald.

- Azaryahu, Maoz. 1996. "The Power of Commemorative Street Names." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 14:311–330.
- Baird, David. 2008. *Between Two Fires: Guerilla War in the Spanish Sierras*. Málaga: Maroma Press.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. 1984. *Rabelais and His World*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.
- Baón, Rogelio. 1975. *La cara humana de un Caudillo*. Madrid: Madrid.
- Barth, Fredrik 1998. "Introduction." Pp. 9-19 in *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries: The Social Organization of Culture Difference*, edited by Fredrik Barth. Longrove.
- Baxter Wolf, Kenneth. 2010. "Christian Martyrs in Muslim Spain." The Library of Iberian Resources Online. Retrieved November 22, 2010 (<http://libro.uca.edu/martyrs/martyrs.htm>).
- Billig, Michael. 1995. *Banal Nationalism*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Blakeley, Georgina. 2005. "Digging up Spain's Past: Consequences of Truth and Reconciliation." *Democratization* 12(1):44-59.
- Blakeley, Georgina. 2008. "Politics as usual? The Trials and Tribulations of the Law of Historical Memory in Spain." *Entelequia. Revista Interdisciplinar* 7:315–330.
- Blanco, Almirante C. 1974. *Discursos y escritos 1943-1973*. Madrid: Madrid.
- Boas, Franz. 1889. "On Alternating Sounds." *American Anthropologist* 2(1):47-54.
- Boas, Franz. 1966. *Race, Language and Culture*. First Free Press Paperback Edition ed. New York: The Free Press.
- Boorstin, Daniel J. 1972. *The Image: A Guide to Pseudo-events in America*. New York: Atheneum.
- Borges, Jorge L. 1965. "Tlön, Uqbar, Orbis Tertius." Pp. 17-34 in *Fictions*, edited by Antony Kerrigan. London: John Calder.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. *Outline of Theory and Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1986. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. New York: Routledge.
- Bowes, Kim and Michael Kulikowski 2005. "Introduction." Pp. 1-30 in *Hispania in Late Antiquity: Current Perspectives*, edited by Kim Bowes and Michael Kulikowski. Leiden: Brill.

- Boyd, Carolyn P. 2008. "The Politics of History and Memory in Democratic Spain." *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 617:133-148.
- Bruner, Edward M. 1994. "Abraham Lincoln as Authentic Reproduction: A Critique of Postmodernism." *American Anthropologist* 96(2):397-415.
- Burns, Robert I. 2000. "Mudejar Parallel Societies: Anglophone Historiography and Spanish Context, 1975–2000." Pp. 91-124 in *Christians, Muslims, and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain: Interaction and Cultural Change*, edited by Mark Meyerson and Edward English. Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press.
- Butler, Alban. 1894. *Lives of the Saints: With Reflections for Every Day in the Year*. New York: Benziger Brothers.
- Caro Baroja, Julio. 1965. *El carnaval: análisis histórico-cultural*. Madrid: Taurus.
- Carothers, Thomas. 2002. "The End of the Transition Paradigm." *Journal of Democracy* 13(1):5–21.
- Castile, George P. 1996. "The Commodification of Indian Identity." *American Anthropologist* 98(4):743-749.
- Castro, Américo. 1971. *The Spaniards: An Introduction to Their History*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Cazorla-Sánchez, Antonio. 2010. "Revisiting the legacy of the Spanish Civil War." *International Journal of Iberian Studies* 21(3):231-246.
- Cenarro, Angela. 2002. "Memory beyond the Public Sphere: The Francoist Repression Remembered in Aragon." *History & Memory* 14(1/2):165-188.
- Cohen, Abner. 1993. *Masquerade Politics: Explorations in the Structure of Urban Cultural Movements*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Cohen, Anthony P. 1985. *The Symbolic Construction of Community*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Cohen, Erik. 1979. "Rethinking the Sociology of Tourism." *Annals of Tourism Research* 6:18-35.
- Cohen, Erik 2004. "Who is a Tourist?: A Conceptual Clarification." Pp. 17-36 in *Contemporary Tourism Diversity and Change: Collected Articles*. Oxford.
- Collins, Roger. 2006. *Visigothic Spain 409 - 711: A History of Spain*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Comaroff, Jean. 1982. *Body of Power Spirit of Resistance: The Culture and History of a South African People*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

- Comaroff, John L. and Jean Comaroff. 2009. *Ethnicity, Inc.* Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Comaroff, Jean and John L. Comaroff. 2012. *Theory from the South: Or, How Euro-America is Evolving Toward Africa.* Paradigm.
- Costa, Xavier. 1998. "Las fallas de Valencia: El arte de la consagración del fuego." *Monográfico sobre Sociología del Arte* 84:275-89.
- Crick, Malcolm. 1989. "Representations of International Tourism in the Social Sciences: Sun, Sex, Sights, Savings, and Servility." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 18:307-44.
- Csordas, Thomas J. 1993. "Somatic Modes of Attention." *Cultural Anthropology* 8(2):135-156.
- Dávila, Arlene. 2001. *Latinos, Inc.: The Marketing and Making of a People.* Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Davis, Madeleine. 2006. "Externalised Justice and Democratisation: Lessons from the Pinochet Case." *Political Studies* 54:245-266.
- de Mármol y Carvajal, Luis. 1897. *Historia del rebelion y castigo de los Moricos del Reyno de Granada.* 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Madrid: Sancha. (<http://ia600402.us.archive.org/0/items/historiadelrebel02mr/historiadelrebel02mr.pdf>).
- de Mata Carriazo, Don J. 2002. *En la frontera de Granada.* Universidad de Granada.
- de Miguel, Amando. 1976. *Franco, Franco Franco.* Madrid: Madrid.
- de Riquer I Permanyer, Borja 1995. "Social and Economic Change in a Climate of Political Immobilism." Pp. 259-221 in *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity*, edited by Helen Graham and Jo Labanyi. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Debord, Guy. 1967. "Society of the Spectacle." Marxist.org. Retrieved December 29, 2010 (<http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/debord/society.htm>).
- Defoe, Daniel. 1855. *The Novels and Miscellaneous Works of Daniel De Foe.* London: Henry G. Bohn. (<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/30159/30159-h/30159-h.htm>).
- Delanty, Gerard. 2002. "Models of European Identity: Reconciling Universalism and Particularism." *Perspectives on European Politics and Society* 3(3):345– 59.
- Dilley, Roy M. 2004. "The Visibility and Invisibility of Production Among Senegalese Craftsmen." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 4(10):797-813.

- Douglas, Mary. 1966. *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concept of Pollution and Taboo*. London: Routledge.
- Douglas, Mary. 1972. "Deciphering a Meal." *Daedalus* 101(1):61-81.
- Douglass, Carrie B. 1991. "The Fiesta Cycle of "Spain"." *Anthropological Quarterly* Vol. 64(3):126-141.
- Douglass, William A. and Julie Lacy. 2005. "Anthropological Angst and the Tourist Encounter." *NAPA Bulletin* 23:119-134.
- Durkheim, Émile. 1915. *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life*. New York: Simon & Schuster Ltd.
- Eagleton, Terry. 1990. *The Ideology of the Aesthetic*. London: Blackwell.
- Eagleton, Terry. 2000. *The Idea of Culture*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Ebersole, Alva J. 1963. "Los "Sanfermines" de Pamplona en 1628." *Hispania* 46(1):77-80.
- Edwards, Anthony and Robert Cleverdon. 1982. "International Tourism to 1990." *Economist Intelligence Unit*.
- El Estado Español. 2011. "Acuerdo de cooperación del Estado con la Comisión Islámica de España." mbarral. Retrieved October 12, 2013 (<http://mbarral.webs.ull.es/islam.html>).
- El País. 2007. "Elecciones municipales 2007." El País. Retrieved January 2, 2012 (<http://resultados.elpais.com/elecciones/2007/municipales/01/29/53.html>).
- El País. 2011. "Elecciones municipales 2011." El País. Retrieved January 2, 2012 (<http://resultados.elpais.com/elecciones/2011/municipales/01/29/53.html>).
- Encarnación, Omar G. 2008. "Pinochet's Revenge: Spain Revisits its Civil War." *World Policy Journal* 24:39-50.
- Entrikin, J. N. 1991. *The Betweenness of Place: Towards a Geography of Modernity*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.
- Erbes, Robert. 1973. "International Tourism and the Economy of Developing Countries Paris." *OECD*.
- Erice, Francisco. 2006. "Combates por el pasado y apologías de la memoria, a propósito de la represión franquista." *Rivista Nova: Revista de Historia Contemporánea*. Retrieved October 15, 2013 (<http://hispanianova.rediris.es/6/dossier/6d013.pdf>).
- Eriksen, Thomas H. 2001. *Small Places, Large Issues: An Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology*. London: Pluto Press.

- Eulogius. 884. *Memoriale Sanctorum*. Oviedo.
- Feld, Steven. 2000. "A Sweet Lullaby for World Music." *Public Culture* 12(1):145–171.
- Fernandez, J.W. and Roberto Fernandez. 1976. *El escenario de la romeria asturiana*. Madrid: Centro de estudios sociales "Valle de los Caidos."
- Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas. 2006. "Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas, 1ª Edición." Solocortos. Retrieved July 23, 2010 (<http://www.solocortos.com/NoticiasGacetillasVerNoticia.aspx?IdNoticia=60&paginactual=319>).
- Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas. 2013. "Resultados VIII de la Ruta de la tapa." Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas. Retrieved September 26, 2013 (<http://www.festivalfrigiliana3culturas.net/>).
- Feuerbach, Ludwig. 1843. "The Essence of Christianity." Marxist.org. Retrieved December 29, 2010 (<http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/feuerbach/works/essence/index.htm>).
- Flesler, Daniela. 2008. *The Return of the Moor: Spanish Responses to Contemporary Moroccan Immigration*. West Lafayette: Purdue University Press.
- Flesler, Daniela and Adrián Pérez Melgosa. 2003. "Battles of Identity, or Playing 'Guest' and 'Host': the Festivals of Moors and Christians in the Context of Moroccan Immigration in Spain." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 4(2):151-168.
- Flesler, Daniela and Adrián Pérez Melgosa 2008. "Marketing Medieval Convivencia: Tourism and the Recuperation of Spain's Jewish Past." Pp. 63-84 in *Spain is (Still) Different*. Plymouth: Lexington Books.
- Forrest, Andrew. 2000. *The Spanish Civil War: Questions and Analysis in History*. New York; London: Routledge.
- Foster, George M. 1960. *Culture and Conquest: America's Spanish Heritage*. Chicago: Quadrangle Books.
- Foucault, Michel 2006. "Governmentality." Pp. 131-143 in *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*, edited by Aradhana Sharma and Akhil Gupta. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Fowles, John. 1978. *Daniel Martin*. London: Panther Books.
- Fra-Molinero, Baltasar 2009. "The Suspect Whiteness of Spain." Pp. 147-170 in *At Home and Abroad. Historicizing Twentieth-Century Whiteness in Literature and Performance*, edited by La Vinia Delois Jennings. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.

- Fra-Molinero, Baltasar 2009. "The Suspect Whiteness of Spain." Pp. 147-170 in *At Home and Abroad. Historicizing Twentieth-Century Whiteness in Literature and Performance*, edited by La Vinia Delois Jennings. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.
- Freeman, Dave and Neil Teplica. 1999. *100 Things to Do Before You Die: Travel Events You Just Can't Miss*. Lanham, Maryland: Taylor Trade Publishing.
- Fussell, Paul. 1980. *Abroad. British Literary Travelling Between the Wars*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Geertz, Clifford. 1973. *Interpretations of Cultures*. Basic Books.
- Geertz, Clifford. 1975. "Common Sense as a Cultural System." *The Antioch Review* 33(1):33.
- Gibson, Ian. 1997. *Federico Garcia Lorca*. New York: Random House.
- Gillis, John R. 1994. "Memory and Identity: The History of a Relationship." Pp. 3-26 in *Commemorations: The Politics of National Identity*, edited by John R Gillis. Princeton: Gillis, John R. 1994. 'Memory and Identity: The History of a Relationship', in John R Princeton University Press.
- Gilmore, David. 1999. *Carnival and Culture: Sex, Symbol and Status in Spain*. New Haven & London: Yale University Press.
- Goffman, Erving. 1990. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. Penguin.
- Goldstein, Donna M. 2003. *Laughter Out of Place: Race, Class, Violence, and Sexuality in a Rio Shantytown*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- González Faraco, J. C. and Michael Dean Murph. 1997. "Street Names and Political Regimes in an Andalusian Town." *Ethnology* 36(2):123-148.
- González Jiménez, Manuel 2002. "Peace and War on the Frontier of Granada. Jaén and the Truce of 1476." Pp. 160-175 in *Medieval Spain: Culture, Conflict and Coexistence*, edited by Roger Collins and Anthony Goodman. Palgrave Macmillan.
- González López, Francisco M. 2008. *República y Guerra Civil: El caso de Colmenar*. Patrocinado por la Junta de Andalucía Consejería de Justicia y Administración Pública.
- Goody, Jack. 2005. *Islam in Europe*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Goytisolo, Juan. 1999. *Reivindicación del conde don Julián*. Madrid: Alianza Editorial.

- Graham, Helen 1995. "Popular Culture in the 'Years of Hunger'." Pp. 237-244 in *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity*, edited by Helen Graham and Jo Labany. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Graham, Helen. 2005. *The Spanish Civil War. A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gramsci, Antonio. 1971. *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. London: Lawrence and Wishart.
- Grau Rebollo, Jorge 2013. "Oh, That's So Typical!' Discussing Some Spanish 'Authentic' Essential Traits." Pp. 91-107 in *Debating Authenticity: Concepts of Modernity in Anthropological Perspective*, edited by Thomas Fillitz and A. Jamie Saris. Berghahn Books.
- Green, Stuart. 2011. "(Re)Casting the Spanish Nation: The Othering of Emilio Buale." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 12(2):197-215.
- Greenwood, Davydd J. 1977. "Culture by the Pound: An Anthropological Perspective on Tourism as Cultural Commoditization." Pp. 129-138 in *Hosts and Guests: the Anthropology of Tourism*, edited by Valene L Smith. London: Blackwell Publishers.
- Halsall, Paul. 1998. "The Jews of Spain and the Visigothic Code, 654-681 CE." *Jewish History Sourcebook*. Retrieved May 12, 2011 (<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/jewish/jews-visigothic1.html>).
- Harris, Max. 1994. "Muhammed and the Virgin: Folk Dramatizations of Battles between Moors and Christians in Modern Spain." *The Drama Review* 38(1):45-61.
- Harvey, Leonard P. 1992. *Islamic Spain 1250 to 1500*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Heather, Peter. 1998. *The Goths (The Peoples of Europe)*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Herbert, Jean L. 1997. "Prólogo." Pp. 11-27 in *El islam en las aulas: contenidos, silencios, enseñanzas*, edited by Josep Maria Navarro. Barcelona: Icaria Antrazy.
- Hertzfeld, Michael 2007. "Senses." Pp. 431-442 in *Ethnographic Fieldwork: An Anthropological Reader*, edited by Antonius C.G.M. Robben and Jeffery A. Sluka. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Highmore, Ben 2010. "Bitter After Taste: Affect, Food, and Social Aesthetics." in *The Affect Theory Reader*, edited by Melissa Gregg and Gregory J Seigworth. Duke University Press.
- Hillman, Ben. 2003. "Paradise Under Construction: Minorities, Myths and Modernity in Northwest Yunnan." *Asian Ethnicity* 4(2):175-188.

- Hobsbawm, Eric 1992. "Inventing Traditions." Pp. 1-14 in *The Invention of Tradition*, edited by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger. Cambridge; New York; Cape Town; Madrid: Cambridge University Press.
- Hooper, John. 1995. *The New Spaniards*. London: Penguin.
- Huizinga, Johan. 1950. *Homo Ludens*. London: Beacon Press Books.
- Hurtado de Mendoza, Diego. 1627. *Guerra de Granada*. Imprenta de Jijan Oliveres.
- Ibn el-Hakem, Abd. ca.860. "The Islamic Conquest of Spain." *The Medieval Sourcebook*. Retrieved November 13, 2010 (<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/conqspain.html>).
- Jafari, Jafar. 1974. "The Socio-economic Costs of Tourism to Developing Countries." *Annals of Tourism Research* 1(7):227-262.
- Jefatura del Estado. 2007. "La Ley por la que se reconocen y amplían derechos y se establecen medidas en favor de quienes padecieron persecución o violencia durante la Guerra Civil y la Dictadura." Agencia Estatal Boletín Oficial del Estado. Retrieved October 26, 2013 ([http://www.boe.es/diario\\_boe/txt.php?id=BOE-A-2007-22296](http://www.boe.es/diario_boe/txt.php?id=BOE-A-2007-22296)).
- Juliá, Santos. 2007. "De nuestras memorias y de nuestras miserias." *Hispania Nova: Revista de Historia Contemporánea*. Retrieved October 11, 2013 (<http://hispanianova.rediris.es/7/dossier/07d018.pdf>).
- Junta de Andalucía. 2013. "Sistema de Información Multiterritorial de Andalucía." Junta de Andalucía. Retrieved May 23, 2013 (<http://www.juntadeandalucia.es/institutodeestadisticaycartografia/sima/htm/sm29053.htm>).
- Keen, Steve. 2005. *Debunking Economics: The Naked Emperor Dethroned*. London and New York: Zed Books.
- Korsmeyer, Carolyn and David Sutton. 2011. "The Sensory Experience of Food: Memory as a Sense." *Food, Culture & Society* 14(4):461-475.
- Kris, Ernst. 2000. *Psychoanalytic Explorations in Art*. International Universities Press.
- Labanyi, Jo. 2008. "The Politics of Memory in Contemporary Spain: Confronting Exhumations from the Civil War." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 9(2):119-125.
- Lacan, Jacques M. É. 1998. *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis*. New York.

- Lanfant, Marie-Françoise 1995. "Introduction." Pp. 1-23 in *International Tourism: Identity and Change*, edited by Marie-Françoise Lanfant, John B Allcock, and Edward M Brunner. London: Sage.
- Le Roy Ladurie, Emmanuel. 2003. *Carnival in Romans: Mayhem and Massacre in a French City*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.
- Leach, Edmund R. 1965. *Political Systems of Highland Burma: A Study of Kachin Social Structure*. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. 1976. *Tristes Tropiques*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude 1997. "The Culinary Triangle." Pp. 28-35 in *Food and Culture: A Reader*, edited by Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik. New York: Routledge.
- Linger, Daniel T. 1992. *Dangerous Encounters: Meanings of Violence in a Brazilian City*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Lowenthal, David. 1998. *The Heritage Crusade and the Spoils of History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lowney, Chris. 2006. *A Vanished World: Muslims, Christians and Jews in Medieval Spain*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- MacCannell, Dean. 1976. *The Tourist. A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. New York: Schocken Books.
- Machiavelli, Nicolò. 2003. *The Prince*. London: Penguin Classics.
- Malefakis, Edward E. 1971. *Agrarian Reform and Peasant Revolution in Spain: Origins of the Civil War*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Mallery, Garrick. 1888. "Manners and Meals." *The American Anthropologist* 1(3):193-207.
- Manuel Rodríguez Ramo, Antonio. 2010. *La Huella Morisca, el Al Andalus que Llevamos Dentro*. Almuzara.
- Manzano Moreno, Eduardo and Juan Sisinio Perez Garzon. 2002. "A Difficult Nation? History and Nationalism in Contemporary Spain." *History & Memory* 14(1/2):259-284.
- Marcellinus, Ammianus. 1952. *Res Gestae XXXI*. London and Cambridge: Loeb Classical Library.
- Marx, Karl. 1913. *The Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Bonaparte*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr & Company.
- Marx, Karl. 1988. *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844 and The Communist Manifesto*. New York: Prometheus Books.

- Matthews, Harry G. 1977. *International Tourism. A Political and Social Analysis*. Cambridge: Schenkman Publishing Company.
- Mauss, Marcel 1992. "Techniques of the Body." Pp. 454-515 in *Incorporations*. New York: Zone Publications.
- Mead, Margaret. 1970. "The Changing Significance of Food: A discussion of the interrelationship between the diet of Americans and their capacity to provide for the poor and starving at home and abroad." *American Scientist* 58(2):176-181.
- Medieval Sourcebook. 2006. "Professions of Faith Extracted from Jews on Baptism: Visigothic Professions of Recceswinth, from Leg. Vis. 12.2.17." Internet Medieval Sourcebooks. Retrieved April 30, 2010 (<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/jewish-oaths.html>).
- Meigs, Anna 1997. "Food as a Cultural Construction." Pp. 95-106 in *Food and Culture: A Reader*, edited by Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik. New York: Routledge.
- Mings, Robert C. 1978. "The Importance of More Research on the Impacts of Tourism." *Annals of Tourism Research* 5(3):340-344.
- Mintz, Sidney W. 1985. *Sweetness and Power: The Place of Sugar in Modern History*. New York: Viking.
- Mintz, Jerome R. 1997. *Carnival Song and Society: Gossip, Sexuality and Creativity in Andalusia*. Oxford: Berg Publishers.
- Mintz, Sidney W. 1997. "Time, Sugar, and Sweetness." Pp. 357-69 in *Food and Culture: A Reader*, edited by Carole Counihan and Penny Van Esterik. New York: Routledge.
- Mirmidón Producciones. 2010. "Mirmidón Producciones." Mirmidón Producciones. Retrieved July 12, 2010 (<http://mirmidon.com/>).
- Mitford, Nancy. 1959. "The Tourist." *Encounter* 13:3-7.
- Móreno Gómez, Francisco 1999. "La Represión En La Postguerra." Pp. 270-350 in *Víctimas De La Guerra Civil*, edited by Juliá Santos. Madrid: Temas de Hoy.
- Morris, Meaghan E. 1988. "At Henry Parkes Mote." *Cultural Studies*, Vol. 2, 2(1):1-47.
- Narotzky, Susana and Gavin Smith. 2002. "'Being politico 'in Spain: An Ethnographic Account of Memories, Silences and Public Politics." *History & Memory* 14(1/2):189-228.
- Narotzky, Susana and Gavin Smith. 2006. *Immediate Struggles: People, Power and Place in Rural Spain*. University of California Press.

- Nash, Dennison. 1981. "Tourism as an Anthropological Subject." *Current Anthropology* 22(5):461-481.
- Navarro, Vicenç. 2001. *Los costes de la desmemoria histórica*. El País, 16 June 2001.
- Navas Acosta, Antonio. 1999. *Moorish Life and Diaspora in the Axarquía of Vélez-Málaga: Told in the Mosaics of Frigiliana*. Málaga: Málaga.
- Nietzsche, Friedrich. 2005. *The Use and Abuse of History*. New York: Cosimo, Inc.
- Nora, Pierre. 1989. "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire." *Representations* 26:7-25.
- Noyes, Dorothy. 2003. *Fire in the Plaça: Catalan Festival Politics After Franco*. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- O'Grady, Ron. 1982. *Tourism in the Third World: Christian Reflections*. New York: Orbis Books.
- Omaar, Rageh. 2005. *An Islamic History of Europe*. London: British Broadcasting Corporation.
- Pack, Sasha D. 2006. *Tourism and Dictatorship: Europe's Peaceful Invasion of Franco's Spain*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Parsons, Deborah 2002. "Fiesta Culture in Madrid Posters, 1934-1955." Pp. 178-205 in *Constructing Identity in Twentieth-Century Spain: Theoretical Debates and Cultural Practice*, edited by Jo Labanyi. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Partido Andalucista. 2012. "Introducción - Ideología." Partido Andalucista. Retrieved July 18, 2012 (<http://www.partidoandalucista.org/index.php/presentacion/historia/historia1>).
- Passerini, Luisa. 2009. *Fascism in Popular Memory: The Cultural Experience of the Turin Working Class*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Peterson, Mark A. 2003. "Language Ideology and the Politics of Performance." *Teaching Anthropology: Society for Anthropology in Community Colleges Notes* 9(2):20-38.
- Phythian-Adams, Charles 1972. "Ceremony and the Citizen: The Communal Year at Coventry 1450-1550." Pp. 57-85 in *Crisis and Order in English Towns, 1500-1700: Essays in Urban History*, edited by Peter Clark and Paul Slack. Routledge.
- Pío Moa, Rodríguez. 2006. *Los mitos de la Guerra Civil*. Madrid: Celesa.
- Pitt-Rivers, Julian. 1977. *The People of the Sierra*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

- Preston, Beth 2000. "The Function of Things: A Philosophical Perspective on Material Culture." Pp. 22-49 in *Matter, Materiality and Modern Culture*, edited by Paul Graves-Brown. London: Routledge.
- Preston, Paul. 1993. *Franco: An Autobiography*. London: HarperCollins.
- Preston, Paul. 1994. *The Coming of the Spanish Civil War: Reform, Reaction and Revolution in The Second Republic*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Routledge.
- Preston, Paul. 1994a. "General Franco as a Military Leader." *The Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 6(4):21-41.
- Preston, Paul. 1996. *A Concise History of the Spanish Civil War*. London: Fontana Press.
- Preston, Paul 2010. "The Theorists of Extermination: The Origins of Violence in the Spanish Civil War." Pp. 42-67 in *Unearthing Franco's Legacy. Mass Graves and the Recovery of Historical Memory in Spain*, edited by Carlos Jerez-Farrán and Samuel Amago. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Preston, Paul. 2012. *The Spanish Holocaust: Inquisition and Extermination in Twentieth-Century Spain*. London: Harper Press.
- Rebel, Hermann. 1989. "Cultural Hegemony and Class Experience: A Critical Reading of Recent Ethnological-Historical Approaches (Part One)." *American Ethnologist* 16(1):117-136.
- Reig Tapia, Alberto. 1990. *Violencia y Terror: Estudios sobre la Guerra Civil Española*. Madrid: Akal Editorial.
- Reyero, Carlos 1992. "Lostemas históricos en la pintura española del siglo XIX," in idem, *La Pintura de Historia del siglo XIX en España* (Madrid, 1992), 50." Pp. 37-63 in *La Pintura de Historia del siglo XIX en España*, edited by José Luis Díez and Museo del Prado. Madrid: Madrid.
- Richards, Audrey. 1960. "Social Mechanisms for the Transfer of Political Rights in Some African Tribes." *RICHARDS, AUDREY I. 1960 Social Mechanisms for the Transfer of Politica* *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland* 90:175– 190.
- Richards, Michael. 1998. *A Time of Silence: Civil war and the Culture of Repression in Franco's Spain, 1936–1945*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Riordan, David. 2004. *Guide to Frigiliana: The Village of Three Cultures*. Nerjs, Spain: Aguanoso S.L.
- Rivers, P. 1974. "Misguided Tours." *New Internationalist* (February):6-7.

Rodriguez Becerra, Salvador 1982. "Metodos, tecnicas y fuentes para el estudio de las fiestas tradicionales populares." in *Tiempo de Fiesta. Ensayos antropológicos sobre las fiestas de España*, edited by Honorio Maillo Velasco. Tres-catorce-diecisie.

Rogozen-Soltar, Mikaela. 2007. "Al-Andalus in Andalusia: Negotiating Moorish History and Regional Identity in Southern Spain." *Anthropological Quarterly* 80(3):863-886.

Rojo Platero, Pablo. 2012. *Frigiliana Árabe y Morisco: La cabalgada de Frigiliana*. Málaga: Pablo Rojo Platero.

Roseberry, William 1991. "Potatoes, Sacks, and Enclosures." Pp. 19-47 in *Golden Ages, Dark Ages: Imagining the Past in Anthropology and History*, edited by Jay O'Brien and William Roseberry. Oxford: University of California Press.

Roseberry, William 1994. "Hegemony and and the Language of Contention." Pp. 355-366 in *Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico*, edited by Gilbert M Joseph and Daniel Nugent. Durham and London: Duke Univrsity Press.

Roseberry, William. 1996. "The Rise of Yuppie Coffees and the Reimagination of Class in the United States." *American Anthropologist, New Series* 98(4):762-775.

Roseberry, William and Jay O'Brien 1991. "Introduction." Pp. 1-18 in *Golden Ages, Dark Ages: Imagining the Past in Anthropology and History*, edited by Jay O'Brien and William Roseberry. Oxford: University of California Press.

Ryan, Lorraine 2009. "For Whom the Dominant Memory Tolls: The Suppression and Re-emergence of Republican Memory in Contemporary Spain." Pp. 119-134 in *The Essence and the Margin: National Identities and Collective Memories in Contemporary European Culture*, edited by Anna Saunders and Laura Rorato. Amsterdam and New York: Editions Rodopi B.V.

Ryan, Chris and C. M. Hall. 2001. *Sex Tourism Marginal people and liminalities*. New York: Routledge.

Said, Edward W. 1979. *Orientalism*. 1<sup>st</sup> ed. Vintage.

Said, Edward. 1993. *Culture and Imperialism*. London: Chatto & Windus.

Sánchez Albornoz, Claudio. 1975. *España: un enigma histórico*. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española.

Sánchez Sánchez, Esther M. 2004. "Turismo, desarrollo e integración internacional de la España franquista." European Business History Association. Retrieved July 12, 2012 ([www.ebha.org/ebha2004/papers/7C2.doc](http://www.ebha.org/ebha2004/papers/7C2.doc)).

- Santaolalla, Isabel 2002. "Ethnic and Racial Configurations in Contemporary Spanish Culture." Pp. 55-71 in *Constructing Identity in Twentieth-Century Spain: Theoretical Debates and Cultural Practice*, edited by Jo Labanyi. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Schrauf, Robert W. 1997. "¡Costalero Quiero Ser! Autobiographical Memory and the Oral Life Story of a Holy Week Brother in Southern Spain." *Ethos* 25(1):428-53.
- Schrauf, Robert W. 1998. "La compra y el concurso: Andalusian carnival on-stage." *Anthropological Quarterly* 71(2):74-88.
- Schwartz, Barry. 1982. "The Social Context of Commemoration: A Study in Collective Memory." *Social Forces* 61(2):374-402.
- Scott, James C. 1987. *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press.
- Scott, James C. 1990. *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Seremetakis, C. N. 2009. "The Memory of the Senses Part I: Marks of the Transitory [1996]." Pp. 206-218 in *The Design Culture Reader*, edited by Ben Highmore. London and New York: Routledge.
- Smith, Anthony D. 1988. *The Ethnic Origins of Nations*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Smith, Valene L. 1989. "Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism." Pp. 1-20 in *Introduction*, edited by Valene L. Smith. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Smith, Anthony D. 1998. *Nationalism and Modernism*. London: Routledge.
- Smith, Anthony D. 2008. *The Cultural Foundations of Nations: Hierarchy, Covenant, and Republic*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Smith, Anthony D. 2009. *Ethno-symbolism and Nationalism: A Cultural Approach*. London: Routledge.
- Soifer, Maya. 2009. "Beyond Convivencia: Critical Reflections on the Historiography of Interfaith Relations in Christian Spain." *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 1(1):19 — 35.
- Stoller, Paul. 1989. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Stronza, Amanda. 2001. "Anthropology of Tourism: Forging New Ground for Ecotourism and Other Alternatives." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30:261-283.

Sutton-Smith, Brian. 1977. "Games of Order and Disorder." *The Association for the Anthropological Study of Play* 4(2):19-26.

Tarrow, Sidney G. 2011. *Power in Movement: Social Movements and Contentious Politics*. Cambridge University Press.

Taylor, Lawrence J. 1995. *Occasions of Faith: An Anthropology of Irish Catholics*. Dublin: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Taylor, Lawrence J. 2013. "Authentic Wilderness: The Production and Experience of Nature in America." in *Debating Authenticity: Concepts of Modernity in Anthropological Perspective*, edited by Thomas Fillitz and A. Jamie Saris. New York: Berghahn.

The Economist. 2004. "The Second Transition." *The Economist*. Retrieved October 21, 2013 (<http://www.economist.com/node/2764840>).

The Library of Iberian Resources. 2010. "The Visigothic Code: Forum Judicum." The Library of Iberian Resources. Retrieved June 3, 2012 (<http://libro.uca.edu/vcode/visigoths.htm>).

Turner, Victor W. 1969. *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-structure*. Chicago: Aldine.

Turner, Victor. 1970. *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*. New York: Cornell University Press.

Turner, Victor. 1974. "Liminal to Liminoid in Play, Flow and Ritual: An Essay in Contemporary Symbology." *Rice University Studies: The Anthropology of Human Play* 60(3):53-92.

Turner, Bryan 1997. "The Body in Western Society: Social Theory and Its Perspectives." Pp. 15-41 in *Religion and the Body*, edited by Sarah Coakley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Taylor, Frank F. 1973. "The Tourist Industry in Jamaica, 1919-1939." *Social Economic Studies* 22:205-228.

UNESCO. 1977. "The Effect of Tourism on Socia-cultural Values." *Annals of Tourism Research* 4:74-105.

United Nations. 1967. "International Years." United Nations. Retrieved July 11, 2013 ([http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\\_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/2148%20\(XXI\)](http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/2148%20(XXI))).

United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. 2012. "Spanish judge should not be prosecuted for doing his job, says UN rights office." UN News Centre. Retrieved July 19, 2013

(<http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=41202&Cr=judges&Cr1#.Ueo99I1wr2M>).

van Gennep, Arnold. 1961. *The Rites of Passage*. Chicago University Press.

Velasco, Honorio M. 1982. "A modo de introducción: Tiempo de fiesta." in *Tiempo de Fiesta. Ensayos antropológicos sobre las fiestas de España*, edited by Honorio M Velasco. Madrid: Tres-catorce-diecisé.

Vinge, Louise. 1975. *The Five Senses: Studies in a Literary Tradition*. Lund: The Royal Society of the Humanities at Lund.

Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1983. *Historical Capitalism with Capitalist Civilization*. London: Verso.

White, Hylton. 1991. "The Homecoming of the Kagga Kamma Bushmen." *Cultural Survival Quarterly*. Retrieved February 11, 2013 (<http://www.culturalsurvival.org/ourpublications/csq/article/the-homecoming-kagga-kamma-bushmen>).

Wilk, Richard R. 1999. "'Real Belizean Food': Building Local Identity in the Transnational Caribbean." *American Anthropologist* 101(2):244-255.

Winter, Jay. 2007. "The Generation of Memory: Reflections on the "Memory Boom" in Contemporary Historical Studies." *Archives & Social Studies* 1:363-397.

Wolf, Eric. 2010. *Europe and the People Without History*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Xie, Philip F. 2003. "The Bamboo-beating Dance in Hainan, China: Authenticity and Commodification." *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 11(1):5-16.

Young, Diana 2006. "The Colours of Things." Pp. 173-185 in *Handbook of Material Culture*, edited by Webb Keane, Susanne Kuechler-Fogden, Mike Rowlands, Patricia Spyer Christopher Tilley. London, Thousand Oaks and New Delhi: Sage Publications.

Zemon Davis, Natalie. 1971. "The Reasons of Misrule: Youth Groups and Charivaris in Sixteenth-Century France." *Past and Present* 50:41-75.

Žižek, Slavoj. 1989. *The Sublime Object of Ideology*. London: Verso.

Žižek, Slavoj. 1993. *Tarrying with the Negative: Kant, Hegel, and the Critique of Ideology*. Durham: Duke University Press.



## **Appendix A: Festival Frigiliana 3 Culturas Mission Statement**

- *Potenciar el desarrollo social y cultural de la comunidad.* (To enhance the social and cultural development of the community)
- *Agilizar las diferentes influencias culturales que conviven actualmente en Frigiliana, utilizándolas como base de su desarrollo cultural y turístico.* (To streamline the different cultural influences that currently exist in Frigiliana, using them as the basis for cultural and tourist development)
- *Garantizar el conocimiento y disfrute de las raíces propias como sistema para aprender valores como la tolerancia, el respeto y el reconocimiento de las raíces e identidades de cada uno.* (To ensure knowledge and the enjoyment of one's own roots as a system to learn values, such as tolerance, respect and the recognition of the origins of local identities)
- *Aprender de la diversidad cultural para avanzar también en el entorno social cotidiano.* (To Learn from cultural diversity in order to make progress in the everyday social environment)
- *Proporcionar al pueblo una imagen que integre la calidad de su espacio natural con su calidad como espacio cultural.* (To provide the people and the village with an image that integrates the village's natural space within its cultural space)
- *Convertir a Frigiliana en un lugar de referencia en el ámbito internacional como modelo de integración, demostrando que actualmente una acción local puede alcanzar también una proyección más global.* (To convert Frigiliana into an international landmark as a model for integration: proving that local action can now achieve global recognition)
- *Promover la conservación y la recuperación de las tradiciones y el patrimonio.* (To promote the conservation and recovery of traditions and heritage)

## Appendix B: Rules of the Festival

### REGLAMENTO DEL FESTIVAL

Se convoca el Mercado para el VII FESTIVAL FRIGILIANA 3 CULTURAS. Las bases de participación son las siguientes:

1. El Mercado funcionara los días 23, 24, 25 y 26 de agosto de 2012.
2. Podrán participar en este mercado los artesanos, mercaderes y taberneros que preferentemente elaboren productos realizados de manera artesanal.
3. El plazo de inscripción finalizara el día 1 de junio de 2012.
4. El precio del metro lineal será:
  - Paradas artesanas: 50 € por cada metro frontal.
  - Paradas de alimentación: 150 € por cada metro frontal (se debe pagar por el espacio que ocupen mesas y sillas)

*Para los residentes en Frigiliana:*

*- Paradas artesanas: 40 € por cada metro frontal.*

*- Paradas de alimentación: 75 € por cada metro frontal (incluido mesas y sillas)*

5. El **montaje** de los puestos se realizara:

Día montaje paradas de alimentación: 22 de agosto de 18:00 a 21:00

Día montaje paradas venta de artesanía: 22 de agosto de 9:00 a 5:00

Día desmontaje: a partir de las 24:00 el domingo 26 de agosto.

6. El horario de apertura al público() será el siguiente, se exigirá puntualidad en ellos:

\* Jueves 23 de agosto: 18:00 a 1:00 aprox.

\* Viernes 24 de agosto: 11:00 a 15:00 — 18:00 a 1:00 aprox.

\* Sábado 25 de agosto: 11:00 a 15:00 — 18:00 a 1:00 aprox.

\* Domingo 26 de agosto: 11:00 a 15:00 — 18:00 a 24:00 aprox.

### **Normas de Participación:**

Parada. Adecuación de la decoración y detalles a la época medieval y andalusí. Se pondrá especial atención a la adecuación de la iluminación (bombillas no visibles), de las telas, y de su conjunto.

Productos. Se seleccionaran en función de su calidad, variedad de productos, adecuación a la época recreada, y presentación de los mismos.

Vestuario. Indumentaria adecuada, al ser un evento inspirado en las TRES CULTURAS el vestuario se puede ambientar en la época árabe, judía y cristiana, no se aceptaran solicitudes en las que no quede claro el vestuario que se llevara a cada mercado.

Instalación eléctrica. Debe ser la que marca la ley y las bombillas para iluminar la parada han de ser de bajo consumo

Es un punto a favor el estar dado de alta correctamente bien como autónomos o bien como empresa.

Los artesanos y mercaderes de bares, tabernas y alimentación deberán ir convenientemente acreditados con el carné de manipulador de alimentos.

Hostelería llevar grifos y manguera para agua.

Puntualidad en los horarios de apertura y cierre del mercado.

### Información

Los interesados deben enviar el formulario debidamente cumplimentado, mas 2 fotografías de la obra a exponer (si no se ha enviado anteriormente o no están actualizadas) así como del montaje de la parada, a la siguiente dirección:

Vía mail:

Vía correo postal: